



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF THE

ISLAND OF ALDERNEY

HANSARD

The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 11th January 2017

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Alderney website www.alderney.gov.gg*

Volume 5, No. 1

Present:

Mr Stuart Trought, President

Members

Mr Tony Barnes
Mr Matthew Birmingham
Mr Mike Dean
Mr James Dent
Mrs Norma Paris
Mr Steve Roberts
Mr Alex Snowdon
Mr Ian Tugby

The Greffier of the Court

Mr Jonathan Anderson

Business transacted

Apologies received	5
Billet d'État for Wednesday, 11th January 2016	5
I. Opening of the States of Alderney Annual Meeting.....	5
Welcome to new States' Members.....	5
Convener's Report of the People's Meeting.....	6
II. Election Procedure – Verbal voting approved.....	6
III. Appointment of Vice President– Mr Tugby elected	6
IV. Appointment of States' Auditors – KPMG Channel Islands Limited appointed	7
V. Committee Mandates – To be adopted until amendment is tabled – Item approved	8
VI. Policy and Finance Committee– Mandate approved	9
VII. General Services Committee – Mandate approved	11
VIII. Building and Development Control Committee – Mandate approved	13
IX. Appointment of Committee Chairmen – Mr Dent, Mrs Paris and Mr Birmingham elected.....	13
X. Appointment of Members of the Policy and Finance Committee – All 10 States' Members elected.....	16
XI. Appointment of Committee Members of other Committees – Four Members elected to General Services Committee and three Members elected to Building and Development Control Committee	18

XII. Other Appointments: Commonwealth Parliamentary Association – Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Mrs Paris elected	22
XIII. Other Appointments: Code of Conduct Panel Members – Five persons reappointed	24
XIV. Other Appointments: St Anne’s School Management Committee – Mr Snowdon elected as representative	25
XV. Election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation – Mr Jean and Mr McKinley elected; Mr Roberts and Mr Dean elected alternatives	26
XVI. Transfer of ownership of The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited from The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem (‘The Commandery’) to The Alderney Foundation – Item not approved	27
XVII. Questions and Reports.....	31
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 6.25 p.m.</i>	<i>31</i>

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Alderney

*The States met at 5.30 p.m. in the presence of
Col. Colin Mason, a representative of His Excellency Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE, CB,
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Greffier

Apologies received

The Greffier: Good evening, Mr President.

5 **The President:** Good evening, Mr Greffier.

Before we proceed any further, I would like to give apologies from Mr McKinley and Mr Jean, who are currently attending the States' meeting in Guernsey, where they feel the interests of Alderney will be best served.

If you would like to proceed with the roll call, please.

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

Billet d'État for Wednesday, 11th January 2016

I. Opening of the States of Alderney Annual Meeting

10

The Greffier: Thank you, sir. With eight Members present, we are quorate, and I confirm that deals with Item 1 this evening, Opening of the States of Alderney Annual Meeting.

The President: Thank you very much.

Welcome to new States' Members

15

The President: Before we go to Item 2, I would like to welcome our new States' Members, and I wish you a very full and productive session with the incumbent States' Members.

Convener's Report of the People's Meeting

20 **The President:** Before we go any further, Mr Roberts, would you like to give us the Convener's Report, please.

Mr Roberts: Yes, sir. There were no questions on this opening Item.

25 **The President:** It is the number of people who were there.

Mr Roberts: Yes, sir. At the People's Meeting, I was the Convener, assisted by the Chief Executive and Treasurer. There were six States' Members. There were 19 public and there were three press.

30 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
Monsieur Greffier, could we move to Item 2, please.

**II. Election Procedure –
Verbal voting approved**

Item II.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve that the following elections should be by verbal vote, otherwise Rule 20 of the Rules of Procedure of the States Alderney shall come into operation, i.e. voting shall, unless the States otherwise resolves, be carried out by written ballot.

The Greffier: Yes, sir. Item II this evening is Election Procedure.

35 The States of Alderney is asked to approve that the following elections should be by verbal vote, otherwise Rule 20 of the Rules of Procedure of the States Alderney shall come into operation, i.e. voting shall, unless the States otherwise resolves, be carried out by written ballot.

The President: Thank you very much.

40 Mr Roberts, were there any comments on this at the People's Meeting?

Mr Roberts: There were no comments on this Item.

The President: Thank you very much.

45 Is anybody against this Election Procedure? In that case, the Election Procedure is approved.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

The President: We move to Item II please.

**III. Appointment of Vice President–
Mr Tugby elected**

Item III.

The States of Alderney is asked to elect a Vice President for 2017.

50 **The Greffier:** Item III this evening is the appointment of the Vice-President, and the States of Alderney are asked to elect a Vice-President for the year 2017.

The President: Thank you very much.
Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this at the People's Meeting?

55 **Mr Roberts:** There were no comments Mr President.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.
Do we have any proposals for the position of Vice-President?
Mr Roberts.

60 **Mr Roberts:** I would like to propose Mr Tugby, please.

The President: Thank you very much.
Do I have a seconder?

65 **Mr Birmingham:** Yes, I will second Mr Tugby for the role.

The President: Thank you very much.
Do we have anybody else who wishes to stand for the position of Vice-President of the States
70 of Alderney?
In that case, Mr Tugby, you are duly elected, and many congratulations.

Mr Tugby: Thank you.

75 **The President:** Could we move to Item IV, please.

IV. Appointment of States' Auditors – KPMG Channel Islands Limited appointed

Item IV.

The States of Alderney is asked to appoint KPMG Channel Islands Limited to be the States' Auditors for 2017.

The Greffier: Yes, sir. Item IV this evening is the Appointment of Auditors. The States of Alderney are asked to appoint KPMG Channel Islands Limited to be the States' Auditors for the year 2017.

80 **The President:** Thank you very much.
Mr Roberts as the Convener, were there any comments on this?

Mr Roberts: There were no comments on this Item, Mr President.

85 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
Does any States' Member wish to make any comment with regard to Item IV?
In that case, Monsieur Greffier, you can take Item IV as approved.

90 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

The President: Can we move to Item V please.

**V. Committee Mandates –
To be adopted until amendment is tabled –
Item approved**

Item V.

The States of Alderney is asked to adopt the mandates of the Committees, to be approved at the 2017 Annual Meeting, for such period until a submission is tabled before the States of Alderney to amend them.

The Greffier: Item V this evening is Committee Mandates. A letter has been received from Mr Birmingham on behalf of the Policy and Finance Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to adopt the mandates of the committees, to be approved at the 2017 Annual Meeting,
95 for such period until a submission is tabled before the States of Alderney to amend them.

The President: Thank you very much.

Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this?

100 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, there were comments on this one, Mr President.

The comments included: the mandates are comprehensive and include, for example, issue of stamps and the camp site. However, they do not specify which Committee is responsible for monitoring FABLink, negotiations with the States of Guernsey and Aurigny to safeguard the interests of Alderney and its citizens.

105 The Convener stated that the new Committees will be formed across the board, and these important issues will be discussed at the next P&F.

The President: Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.

Mr Birmingham, I believe you wish to propose this Item.

110

Mr Birmingham: Yes, thank you, Mr President, fellow Members.

Our tradition has dictated that after an election, at the first meeting of the new States, the mandates for the three main States' Committees – which are Policy & Finance, General Services and the Building and Development Control Committee – are presented for ratification by the States' Members.
115

However, there is a problem, in that this does not allow the incoming States time to consider those mandates and decide if they wish to re-task some of those responsibilities, before they actually adopt them. It is clear that some of the mandates need consideration, and certain tasks and responsibilities do need reallocating.

120 So rather than adopt the current mandates for the entirety of the States' two-year terms, this Proposition enables the States time to consider the mandates and then bring forward a submission to full States to adjust those mandates, or not, as the States consider appropriate.

In the interim, the existing mandates as laid out in this Billet will continue in order for the States to continue to conduct its business as normal.

125 This Proposition will also mean than once new mandates are agreed and adopted by full States, there will be no requirement to readopt the mandate biannually. Instead they can be adjusted as needed by submission of a change of mandate to full States at any time.

I think this is a sensible proposal, that allows flexibility in the mandates when the States need them, and I commend the Proposition to the States.

130

The President: Thank you, Mr Birmingham.
Mr Roberts, I believe you wish to second this.

Mr Roberts: I do, Mr President.

135

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does any Member wish to comment on Item V? No? Monsieur Greffier, you can take Item V as passed.

140

The Greffier: Thank you.

The President: We move to Item VI, please.

VI. Policy and Finance Committee– Mandate approved

Item VI.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve the mandate of the Policy and Finance Committee, as follows:

To formulate and make recommendations to the States on all policy matters.

To be accountable for the financial management of the States.

To operate within the policies, guidelines and resolutions of the States.

To liaise and negotiate with the States of Guernsey on all matters relating to the provision of transferred services and finance.

To liaise with the General Services Committee and the Building and Development Control Committee in relation to their budget and legislative requirements.

To perform the following functions:

Finance:

To present to the States the annual budget and audited accounts and, where necessary, report to the States thereon.

To monitor the income and expenditure of the States, its Committees and Trust Funds and, where appropriate, to add comment and recommendation to all applications to the States for money, votes and/or submissions to the States where public income and expenditure is involved.

To deal with all borrowings as authorised by the States, loans and the administration of all monies accruing to the States for specific purposes under the terms of various Trusts and Funds.

To be responsible for recommending to the States, whether by Ordinance or otherwise, the fees, dues and charges levied by the States for the provision of any service required to be provided under legislation and to approve the rents payable for States' land and properties.

To be responsible for recommending to the States the level of Occupier's Rates.

To advise on the rents, premiums (if any) and duration of leases to be granted by the General Services Committee for all other States properties.

To submit leases to the States for approval in accordance with the Budget Rules and Procedures.

To be responsible for:

a. dealing with States borrowings authorised by the States for specific purposes

b. all States insurances

- c. postage stamp and coin issues and design approvals*
- d. dealing with grants not exceeding £5000*
- e. dealing with Hawkers Licences.*

The Economy:

To initiate, pursue and report to the States upon matters relating to the economy of the Island, including immigration, population, social services (financial aspects only), the development of an economic plan, employment, industry and e-commerce.

To deal with external authorities in fiscal and commercial matters.

To be responsible for public relations and the promotion of the Tourist Industry.

To monitor the economic policy of the States and to report and make recommendations for such amendments as deemed necessary.

To liaise with the Commerce and Employment Department on matters relating to economic planning.

Constitution and Legal Matters:

To be responsible for all matters affecting the Constitution and all legislation (other than legislation falling specifically within the responsibility of the General Services and the Building and Development Control Committee).

To be responsible for all matters relating to International Conventions, Treaties, Agreements, EU Directives and extended legislation from the United Kingdom.

To liaise as necessary with the Court of Alderney.

To be responsible for and the leasing and use of all States-owned Forts.

To be responsible for matters affecting:

- *Elections*
- *Census*
- *Import and Export Control*
- *Telecommunications*
- *Postal Services, Philately and Currency*
- *Gambling*
- *Emergency Fuel Control (The Energy (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 1978)*
- *Dangerous Weapons*
- *Civil Aviation*
- *Youth Training and Adult Education*
- *Youth Services and activities*

To be responsible for all matters relating to welfare.

To be responsible for all matters not specifically falling within the mandate of the General Services Committee and the Building and Development Control Committee.

Staff and Offices:

To be the States Employment Board with responsibility for all matters relating to the employment of Established Staff and Public Service Employees (PSE's); and the management of office accommodation; to be the Civil Service Board referred to in the Terms and Conditions of Service for Civil Servants and the Terms and Conditions of Employment for Public Service Employees as agreed between the Board and Unite, the Union.

In particular to be responsible for the appointment of staff and the preparation and review of the Terms and Conditions of Service of all salaried staff (subject to the relevant provisions of The Government of Alderney Law, 2004) and to liaise with the Association of Guernsey Civil Servants.

To control establishment numbers.

To be responsible for staff pensions.

To liaise with Trades Unions on matters relating to the Terms and Conditions of Employment for Public Service Employees.'

145 **The Greffier:** Item VI is the Policy and Finance Committee Mandate. The States of Alderney are asked to approve the mandate of the Policy and Finance Committee as tabled in the Billet, sir.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

150 Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this at the People's Meeting?

Mr Roberts: Yes, there were, Mr President.

155 Under Constitution and Legal Matters: during the Committee's 2016 Asset Management Review, significant changes were identified as being necessary in respect of this Island's relationship with the Guernsey's Philatelic Bureau. Also a five-year contract has just been signed with a 25-employee private mint in Bristol, to replace the Royal Mint as the issuer and producer of Alderney's commemorative coins. The Convener advised that these matters would be referred to the P&F for further discussion.

160 The Chief Executive clarified that it is a formality for the mandates to be approved in the January States each year in accordance with Alderney Law. However, these mandates can be amended within the given year if Members agree.

Can we have the feedback on the reform of the Committee Mandates?

The Chief Executive stated that they will indeed provide feedback at the next People's Meeting.

165 In order to stimulate the economy by generating new ideas, to save taxpayers' money on hiring outside consultants, would the Policy and Finance Committee consider adding to its mandate the re-establishment of an Island Advisory Board to utilise the intellectual resources of the island residents?

The Convener agreed that this would indeed be a good idea, and it will be discussed at the next P&F meeting.

170 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.

Does any Member of the States wish to comment on the Policy & Finance Committee mandate?

175 Monsieur Greffier, you can take that mandate as being adopted,

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

The President: We will move to Item VII, please.

VII. General Services Committee – Mandate approved

Item VII.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve the mandate of the General Services Committee, as follows:

'To be accountable to the States for the provision and implementation of all Government services provided and/or required by legislation, resolution or policy of the States within agreed budgets.

To liaise with the Policy and Finance Committee in relation to budgetary and legislative requirements.

To operate within the policies, guidelines and resolutions of the States.

In particular, to perform the following functions:

To be accountable for the administration of the harbour and its functions and to make recommendations to the Policy and Finance Committee on all fees, dues and charges required to be levied by legislation.

To deal with shipping and all matters relating to the sea.

To be responsible for the continuing investigations into a marina in Alderney.

To deal with all matters relating to the railway.

To administer and maintain all States' buildings including offices; to be accountable for all public works; to place contracts for public works; to be responsible for refuse collection and its disposal.

To be responsible for the Fire Brigade; for emergency services; for sewage disposal; and for traffic control.

To be accountable for all States' properties which are not the responsibility of the Policy and Finance Committee.

To be responsible for recreation and sports activities.

To be responsible for the Saye Beach Camp site.

To be responsible for all matters relating to the allocation of States key worker housing.

To be accountable as the Water Board for the provision of water supplies on the Island in accordance with the legislation applicable thereto.

To be responsible for the leasing of all States Properties, other than Forts, in the ownership of the States; to deal with all matters relating to agriculture, livestock, other animals, birds and vermin; to administer the Island of Burhou; to be responsible for forestation and fencing and management of all States land including the consolidation of parcels and not to reduce the area of such land without the authority of the States; and be responsible for the slaughterhouse.

To be responsible for all matters relating to sea fisheries.

To be responsible for environmental monitoring and for the co-ordination of public services in the event of a civil emergency.

To be responsible for the establishment of a working party to be known as the Civil Emergency Working Party which shall include amongst its members the following people:

- the President of the States*
- the Chief Fire Officer*
- the Manager of the Water Board*
- the Technical Services Officer*
- the General Manager of Alderney Electricity Limited*
- the resident Sergeant of the Police in Alderney*
- the Harbour Officer*
- a Medical Practitioner*
- a representative of St. John Ambulance (unless otherwise represented);*
- a Communications adviser(s)*
- the person appointed as Co-ordinator of the emergency services*
- the Officer Commanding the Junior Militia if in existence*

The Working Party shall appoint a Chairman from amongst its members.'

180

The Greffier: Item VII is the General Services Committee mandate. The States are asked to approve the mandate of the General Services Committee, again as tabled in the Billet.

The President: Mr Roberts as Convener.

185 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, there was comment this which included: who is on the Civil Emergency Working Party? The Convener clarified that there are currently no members of the Civil Emergency Working Party. This will be formed shortly.

The President: Thank you very much.

190 Does any Member wish to speak on Item VII, the General Services Committee mandate? Monsieur Greffier, you can take that mandate as being adopted,

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

195 **The President:** We will move to Item VIII, please.

VIII. Building and Development Control Committee – Mandate approved

Item VIII.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve the mandate of the Building and Development Control Committee as follows:

'To be the Authority for approving plans in both the public and private sector; to administer The Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, as amended; to be the Committee to make recommendations to the States on the maximum number of dwellings to be permitted in any given period in accordance with Section 15 of The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002; to administer Building Regulations made under the provisions of The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, and any other law or laws by which they may be replaced.

To be responsible for the preparation of a policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island.'

The Greffier: Item VIII is the Building and Development Control Committee mandate. The States are asked to approve the mandate of the Building and Development Control Committee, again as tabled in the Billet.

200 **The President:** Thank you very much. Mr Roberts as Convener.

Mr Roberts: There were no comments.

205 **The President:** Does any Member wish to speak on the mandate of the BDCC? Monsieur Greffier, you can take that mandate as adopted.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

The President: We will move to Item IX, please.

IX. Appointment of Committee Chairmen – Mr Dent, Mrs Paris and Mr Birmingham elected

Item IX

The States of Alderney is asked to elect the Chairmen of the following Committees:

1. *Policy and Finance Committee*
2. *General Services Committee*
3. *Building and Development Control Committee*

210 **The Greffier:** Item IX is the Appointment of Committee Chairmen. The States of Alderney are asked to elect the Chairmen of the following Committees: firstly, the Policy and Finance Committee; secondly, the General Services Committee; and finally, the Building and Development Control Committee.

215 **The President:** Thank you very much. Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments?

Mr Roberts: There were no comments.

The President: Thank you very much.

220 Right, we will start with the Policy and Finance Committee. Do we have anybody who wishes to stand for this position?

Do I have a proposer?

225 **Mrs Paris:** I would like to propose Mr Dent for the role of Chairman of the Policy and Finance, please, sir.

The President: Thank you very much.

Do I have a seconder for this position?

230 **Mr Birmingham:** Yes, Mr President. I would be delighted to second Mr Dent for the role.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Do we have anybody else who wishes to be proposed for this position? That is, Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee.

235 In that case, Monsieur Greffier, Mr Dent is approved as the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee. Congratulations.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

240 **The President:** We now move to the General Services Committee. Do I have anybody wishing to propose somebody as the Chairman of the General Services Committee?

Mr Roberts: I would like to propose Mr Ian Tugby, please, Mr President.

245 **The President:** Do we have a seconder for Mr Tugby?

Mr Barnes: I would like to second Mr Tugby.

The President: Does anybody wish to propose anybody else for this position? Mr Dent.

250

Mr Dent: I wish to propose Mrs Paris.

The President: Is there a seconder for Mrs Paris?

255 **Mr Birmingham:** Yes, I am delighted to second Mrs Paris.

The President: Does anybody wish to propose anybody else for this position? No?

In that case, I would like to give first of all Mr Tugby, followed by the other candidate a chance to convince the rest of the States' Members as to why they should hold this position.

260 Mr Tugby, seeing as you were nominated first, would you like to start, please.

Mr Tugby: Yes, sir.

The reason I would like to carry on being the Chairman of the General Services Committee is because I have been Chairman for the past couple of years, and previously when I have been in the States as well, I have worked with the new engineer and we have a good working relationship. It has been a very difficult two years, because we have had a number of engineers come in to the scene and each one has had different ideas, so trying to adapt to each one has been very difficult. I have had the experience of doing that type of work for the last 50-odd years, and it helps when somebody is leading a team to have experience in what they are doing,

270 We have had a number of issues, which needed sorting out. If you have a number of civil servants, that is fine, because you get different ideas coming from them. But if you have somebody leading the team that does not understand the type of work, when you talk to the engineer ... At least if you understand the work, you can talk to the engineer and understand where he is coming from, and that is why I believe that I should carry on.

275 Some people say that I have difficulty because of the type of work I do, but all I can say to that is that I must be a very strong Chairman if I can never be outvoted by four of the Members on my Committee.

So I get outvoted on a number of occasions, and if there is anything that I have a conflict with, I leave the room, and it is left to the Vice-Chairman and the rest of the committee to decide, and I take no further part in that discussion.

280 Basically, sir, that is all I can say.

The President: Thank you, Mr Tugby.

Mrs Paris, would you wish to address the States' Members?

285

Mrs Paris: Yes, thank you, sir.

I have served on the General Services Committee now for nearly three years, the last two of those years as Deputy Chairman, so I have an appreciation of the challenges that the Committee faces.

290 For the last two of those years, as Mr Tugby has said, he has been in the Chair, and I want to emphasise that I have absolutely no quarrel with the integrity or the experience or the sheer hard work that he has brought to the role.

However, the recent election of four new Members has taught us at least one big issue: the States is perceived by the electorate as not being sufficiently transparent, especially about potential conflicts of interest in its management of Alderney affairs.

295 Therefore, sadly, Mr Tugby's role as Chairman is increasingly incompatible with his position as a major supplier to the Committee.

During the last two years, as Mr Tugby has pointed out, we have had four States' engineers and two changes of the name for the job as well, but I hope we are now entering a period of more stability and we can lift our heads from the achievement of day-to-day minutiae. We need to start spending our budget in a more timely fashion, and to meet some of the major policy challenges facing General Services. As a matter of priority, I should wish to pursue the implementation of a modern waste disposal strategy, consult on how we can better handle some traffic issues, such as parking, pursue the development of the Marine Park, and make another attempt perhaps on a slightly less grandiose scheme for a marina.

305 I hope that my fellow States' Members will feel able to support me.

Thank you.

The President: Thank you, Mrs Paris.

310 There being no other Member proposed for this, Monsieur Greffier, would you please ask the Members to vote on their preferred candidate?

315 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. The States of Alderney are asked to elect a Chairman of the General Services Committee. If they could indicate if they intend to vote for Mr Tugby, Mrs Paris or abstain.

A vote was taken and the results were as follows:

MR TUGBY	MRS PARIS
Mr Tugby	Mr Birmingham
Mr Roberts	Mrs Paris
Mr Barnes	Mr Dent
	Mr Snowdon
	Mr Dean

The Greffier: Sir, with 5 votes, Mrs Paris takes that place.

320 **The President:** Congratulations, Mrs Paris. Commiserations, Mr Tugby.

Mrs Paris: Thank you, sir.

325 **The President:** We now move to the Building and Development Control Committee. I would like now if anybody wishes to propose anybody for the Chairman of BDCC.

Mr Roberts: I would like to propose Mr Birmingham, please.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.
Do I have a seconder for that please?

330 **Mrs Paris:** I should like to second Mr Birmingham, please.

The President: Thank you very much, Mrs Paris.

335 Does anybody wish to propose anybody else for the position of Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee? It appears not.
There only being one person put forward, congratulations Mr Birmingham.

Mr Birmingham: Thank you, Mr President.

340 **The President:** We now move to Item X, please Monsieur Greffier.

X. Appointment of Members of the Policy and Finance Committee – All 10 States' Members elected

Item X

The States of Alderney is asked to elect a minimum of two Members in addition to the Chairman, to the Policy and Finance Committee.

The Greffier: Thank you. Item X is the Appointment of Members of the Policy and Finance Committee. The States of Alderney are asked to elect a minimum of two Members in addition to the Chairman, to that Committee.

The President: Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this Item?

345

Mr Roberts: Yes, there were, Mr President.

Item X: it states that a *minimum* of two members must be elected in addition to the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee. This is ridiculous, and a risk that the Policy and Finance could be reduced to only three States' Members.

350

The Chief Executive clarified that the number three is in accordance with the Government of Alderney Law, and there is no proposal that the P&F Committee is reduced to three members.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Do we have any proposals for members of the Policy and Finance Committee?

355

Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Mr President, I would like to propose that all present Members of the States of Alderney are members of the Policy and Finance Committee.

360

The President: You are proposing that all present Members are made members of the Policy and Finance Committee?

Mr Dent: And absent Members.

365

The President: So you are proposing that all the Members of the States are made member?

Mr Dent: I am proposing that, sir.

The President: Do I have a seconder for that proposal?

370

Mr Roberts: Yes, I would like to second that please.

The President: Thank you very much.

Does anybody wish to speak on this? Mr Birmingham.

375

Mr Birmingham: Thank you.

Mr President, fellow Members, I do not think it comes as any surprise to anybody that I do not support a 10-man Policy and Finance Committee. I think I have made many speeches on this in the past. I still do not support a 10-man Policy and Finance Committee.

380

However, I think it is very important that the first P&F meeting that we have, all Members are there because there are a number of issues that have to be discussed, such as subcommittee. But longer down the line, the P&F Committee does not require all 10 States' Members upon it.

All States' Members are entitled to attend any Committee meeting of the States. They just do not have voting rights, and they do not have the ability to participate, unless the Chairman of the Committee lets them take part.

385

So there is not actually really a need for all 10 Members to be on the P&F. That is an argument I am going to have to continue to try to make, because I think the 10-man P&F does the Island a massive disservice, in that the whole point of having Members who are not on P&F is that they can act as checks and balances. The whole idea of Members who do not serve on a committee is that it is up to them to hold that committee to account, and by having all 10 States' Members on P&F, that means P&F does not really get held to account in the way that it probably should.

390

I will not support the proposal for 10 Members, because I do not believe it is the right thing.

395

The President: Thank you, Mr Birmingham. Does any other Member wish to speak on this?

Monsieur Greffier, there being ... I do apologise. Mrs Paris.

Mrs Paris: Thank you very much.

400 I would just like to say that whilst I agree with Mr Birmingham in theory, I do feel that as we have four new Members, this is not the time to make the change.

I think that it would be better if everyone got the chance to see how P&F either works or does not work, and then could bring more sensible and thought-through suggestions to the table as to what we should do next.

405 **The President:** Thank you, Mrs Paris.

Does any other Member wish to speak on this subject? Mr Roberts.

410 **Mr Roberts:** I would just like to concur with what Mrs Paris said. I believe that no voting rights like my good friend, Mr Birmingham has said is wrong. Everybody should have equal voting rights. They have been voted in by the people of Alderney, and they should be entitled to cast their vote on very important issues.

The President: Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Does any other Member wish to speak on this?

415 That being the case, Monsieur Greffier, would you please put this to the vote?

The Greffier: Thank you, the Proposition is that the States of Alderney appoint all 10 Members to the Policy and Finance Committee.

A vote was taken and the results were as follows:

FOR

Mr Tugby
Mr Roberts
Mrs Paris
Mr Dent
Mr Snowdon
Mr Dean
Mr Barnes

AGAINST

Mr Birmingham

420 **The Greffier:** Sir, that motion carries, that all 10 Members stand on the Policy and Finance Committee.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

We move to Item IX, please. (**The Greffier:** Item XI, sir?) Item XI, I do apologise.

**XI. Appointment of Committee Members of other Committees –
Four Members elected to General Services Committee and
three Members elected to Building and Development Control Committee**

Item XI

The States of Alderney is asked to appoint the members of the following committees, in addition to the Chairmen:

- 1. A minimum of two Members to the General Services Committee*
- 2. A minimum of two Members to the Building and Development Control Committee*

425 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item XI is the appointment of Committee Members of other Committees. The States of Alderney are asked to appoint the members of the following committees, in addition to the Chairmen: firstly, a minimum of two Members to the General Services Committee; and secondly, a minimum of two Members to the Building and Development Control Committee.

430

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item?

Mr Roberts: There were no comments on this Item.

435

The President: Thank you very much.

Does anybody wish to propose anybody as a Member of the General Services Committee?
Mrs Paris.

440

Mrs Paris: I would very much like to propose Mr Tugby as a member of the Committee.

The President: Thank you, Mrs Paris.

445 **Mr Tugby:** Sir, because there is a feeling apparently, according to Mrs Paris, there is not enough clearance in the committees with me as Chairman, I do not see how I can possibly sit on that Committee.

The President: So you are ruling yourself out as a member of that Committee? (**Mr Tugby:** Yes.) Thank you very much, Mr Tugby.

450

Does anybody else wish to propose anybody as a member of the General Services Committee?

Mr Tugby: I propose Mr Roberts, sir.

455

The President: Mr Roberts?

Mr Roberts: Yes, thank you.

Mr Birmingham: I am happy to second Mr Roberts.

460

The President: Okay, so you are proposed and seconded.

Does anybody wish to say anything about the proposition for Mr Roberts? No? Mr Roberts, you are duly elected as a member of the General Services Committee.

465 Does anybody else wish to propose anybody else as a member of the – ? (*Interjections*) Yes please, Mr Tugby.

Mr Tugby: Mr Barnes.

470 **The President:** Mr Barnes. Before we go any further after what has just happened, Mr Barnes, are you willing to stand?

Mr Barnes: I am willing to stand, yes.

The President: Thank you very much. Do we have a seconder?

475

Mr Birmingham: I would like to second Mr Barnes.

The President: Thank you very much.

Does anybody have anything to say about appointing Mr Barnes? Mr Barnes, you are duly elected as a member.

480 Mrs Paris, I believe you wish to propose somebody?

Mrs Paris: I do. I should like to propose Mr Dean; and I do understand that Mr McKinley was quite interested in staying on the Committee, but I am not quite sure how that works as he is not here.

485

The President: You can propose him. We will do it one at a time. So you would like to propose Mr Dean first.

Mr Dean, are you willing to stand as a member of this Committee?

490 **Mr Dean:** I am, yes.

The President: Do we have a seconder?

Mr Birmingham: Yes, I would be delighted to second Mr Dean.

495

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody wish to say anything about appointing Mr Dean? No? Mr Dean, you are duly elected.

Mrs Paris.

500

Mrs Paris: Sir, I should like to ask if Mr McKinley could join as well, please.

The President: So you are formally proposing Mr McKinley as a member?

505 **Mrs Paris:** I am.

The President: I have seen written evidence that Mr McKinley is willing to stand as a member. Would anybody care to second him?

510 **Mr Roberts:** I would be happy to.

The President: Thank you very much indeed. So Mr McKinley is voted as a member.

Does anybody else wish to propose anyone else as a member of the General Services Committee?

515

Mr Barnes: I would like to propose Mr Roberts.

The President: Mr Roberts, are you willing to stand?

520 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, I am.

The Greffier: Sir, Mr Roberts has already been elected. *(Interjections)*

The President: He has already been elected.

525

Mr Roberts: Twice. I get two votes now, sir! *(Laughter and interjections)*

The President: You cannot propose him again.

530 Does anybody else wish to propose anybody else who has not formally been elected to position?

Monsieur Greffier, there does not appear to be anybody else for nomination. Could you read out the results of the members who have been elected to the General Services Committee please.

535 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

The membership will consist of the Chairperson being Mrs Paris, with membership of Mr Roberts, Mr Barnes, Mr Dean and Mr McKinley.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

540 We now move to the members of the Building and Development Control Committee. Does anybody wish to propose anybody for the BDCC?

Mr Birmingham.

545 **Mr Birmingham:** Yes, if I may, would it be possible for me to propose three individuals? Or would you like me to do them individually?

The President: I would like you to deal with them one at a time, if you would, please.

550 **Mr Birmingham:** Okay, certainly. So in that case, in no particular order, I would like to propose Mr Dean.

The President: Mr Dean, are you willing to stand?

Mr Dean: I am.

555

The President: Do I have a seconder for this position?

Mr Roberts: Yes, I will second that.

560 **The President:** Mr Roberts, you are seconding that proposal. (**Mr Roberts:** Yes.)

Does anybody wish to speak against this gentleman standing? In that case, Mr Dean, you are now a member of the BDCC.

Does anybody wish to propose – ? Mr Birmingham.

565 **Mr Birmingham:** I would like to propose my erstwhile colleague, Mr Roberts.

The President: Mr Roberts, are you willing to stand?

Mr Roberts: Yes, I am, sir.

570

The President: Thank you. Do we have a seconder to Mr Roberts?

Mr Tugby: I will second it, sir.

575 **The President:** Mr Tugby seconds that. Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Roberts standing? No?

Congratulations, Mr Roberts.

Mr Roberts: Thank you.

580

The President: Do I have any more proposals? Mr Birmingham.

Mr Birmingham: Yes, certainly, I would like to propose Mr Snowdon.

585 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, are you willing to stand?

Mr Snowdon: I am, yes, thanks.

590 **The President:** Thank you very much.
Do I have a seconder for Mr Snowdon?

Mr Barnes: I will second Mr Snowdon.

595 **The President:** Thank you very much.
Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Snowdon being on that Committee? Congratulations,
Mr Snowdon, you are duly elected as a member of that Committee.

Do we have any further nominations for members of the Building and Development Control
Committee?

600 Mr Roberts, do you wish to say something?

Mr Roberts: No, sorry ...

605 **The President:** Okay, there being no further nominations, Monsieur Greffier, could you
please read out the membership of the Building and Development Control Committee.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

The Building and Development Control Committee will be chaired by Mr Birmingham along
with the committee of Mr Dean, Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon.

610 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
In which case we will move to Item XII, please.

XII. Other Appointments: Commonwealth Parliamentary Association – Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Mrs Paris elected

Item XII.

*The States of Alderney is asked to elect three members to sit on the Management Committee
in the affairs of the Alderney Branch of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (the
President being Ex-officio Chairman).*

615 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir, Item XII this evening is the Commonwealth Parliamentary
Association. The States of Alderney are asked to elect three members to sit on the Management
Committee in the affairs of the Alderney Branch of the Commonwealth Parliamentary
Association, yourself being *ex-officio* the Chairman.

The President: Mr Roberts, as Convener?

620 **Mr Roberts:** There were no comments on this Item, Mr President.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody wish to propose an individual as a member of the CPA? Mr Birmingham.

625 **Mr Birmingham:** Could I propose Mr Dent.

The President: Mr Dent, are you willing to stand?

Mr Dent: I am.

630 **The President:** Do I have a seconder for Mr Dent?

Mr Snowdon: I am happy to second Mr Dent.

The President: Mr Snowdon, you second that position.

635 Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Dent taking up that position? In that case, congratulations Mr Dent, you are now a member of the CPA.
Does anybody wish to propose anybody else? Mrs Paris.

640 **Mrs Paris:** I would like to propose Mr McKinley, who I understand has ...

The President: I understand the same. Do I have a seconder for Mr McKinley?

Mr Roberts: Yes, I would like to second.

645 **The President:** Thank you very much.

Does anybody wish to speak against Mr McKinley standing for that position? In that case, Mr McKinley is duly elected as a member of the CPA.
Does anybody wish to propose a third member? Mr Birmingham.

650 **Mr Birmingham:** Yes, I would like to propose Mrs Paris.

The President: Mrs Paris, are you prepared to stand for that position?

Mrs Paris: Yes I am, thank you.

655 **The President:** Do I have a seconder for Mrs Paris, please? Mr Roberts.

Mr Roberts: I second Mr Paris, yes.

660 **The President:** Does anybody wish to speak against Mrs Paris taking that position? In that case you are duly elected. Thank you, and congratulations to Mrs Paris.
We are only doing three here, aren't we?

The Greffier: That is right, sir, yes.

665 **The President:** If you would like to read out the membership for the CPA, please.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir. The members of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Management Committee are Mr Dean, Mr McKinley and Mrs Paris.

670 **The President:** Thank you very much.
We move to – *(Interjections)*

675 **The Greffier:** Oh sorry, my apologies, that is Mr Dent, yes. My typographical error there, sir.

The President: Have you finished making your corrections, Monsieur Greffier?

The Greffier: Just about!

680 **The President:** Good, when you are ready, could we move on to Item XIII, please.

**XIII. Other Appointments: Code of Conduct Panel Members –
Five persons reappointed**

Item XIII

Under Part III, Item 23 of the Code of Conduct, The President shall appoint 5 members of the population on the electoral roll to form the Members' Conduct Review Panel.

It was resolved unanimously by the Policy & Finance Committee to confirm the appointment of the following persons to the Members Conduct Review Panel as referred to in Part III of the States Members' Code of Conduct.

Mrs Rosemary Hanbury

Mr John Russell

Mrs Helen McGregor

Mrs Pamela Pearson and

Mr Peter Cunningham.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve that the five persons listed above be reconfirmed as Members of the States Members' Code of Conduct Review Panel until the next Annual January Meeting of the States of Alderney.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

Item XIII this evening is the Code of Conduct Panel Members. Under Part III, Item 23 of the Code of Conduct, the President shall appoint five members of the population on the electoral roll to form the Members' Conduct Review Panel.

685 It was resolved unanimously by the Policy & Finance Committee to confirm the appointment of the following persons to the Members' Conduct Review Panel as referred to in Part III of the States Members' Code of Conduct. Those individuals are Mrs Rosemary Hanbury; Mr John Russell; Mrs Helen McGregor; Mrs Pamela Pearson; and Mr Peter Cunningham.

690 The States of Alderney are asked to approve that the five persons listed be reconfirmed as Members of the States Members' Code of Conduct Review Panel until the next Annual January Meeting of the States of Alderney.

The President: Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.

695 Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please, at the People's Meeting.

700 **Mr Roberts:** There was some concern. The Chief Executive clarified that any letters of concern should be made to the President. It was queried how long the Panel has been in situ – which has since been confirmed: the members were appointed on 27th May 2014 – and whether they have ever dealt with any issues.

The President: Thank you very much.

This being a statutory Item, it is not required to have a proposer or seconder.

Does anybody wish to comment on this before we vote on it?

705

Mr Roberts: I would like to make a small comment.

The current structure of the Code of Conduct Committee has been in existence for the last two years and not six as suggested. Either that or my memory has been eroded by my lifestyle!

710 We currently have six good people, good and true to rely on, should they be needed to adjudicate any question arising from the States Members' matters and behaviour. I personally believe this to be a vast improvement, for it shows clarity and transparency within, and I support this system wholeheartedly.

The President: Thank you very much.

715 Does any other Member wish to speak on this before we vote on it?

Seeing as we have only had one person speaking, Monsieur Greffier, in favour, and nobody has spoken against, take that motion as carried.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

720

The President: Could we move to Item XIV, please.

**XIV. Other Appointments: St Anne's School Management Committee –
Mr Snowdon elected as representative**

Item XIV.

The States of Alderney is asked to resolve to appoint, for a period of one year renewable at the next Annual January Meeting, one member as a Representative on the Management Committee of St Anne's School.

The Greffier: Item XIV is the St Anne's School Management Committee. The States of Alderney are asked to resolve to appoint, for a period of one year renewable at the next Annual January Meeting, one member as a Representative on the Management Committee of St Anne's School.

725

The President: Thank you very much. Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this Item?

730 **Mr Roberts:** There were no comments on this Item, sir.

The President: Thank you very much.

Does anybody wish to propose someone as a member? Mr Birmingham.

735 **Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President.

I would like to propose Mr Snowdon.

The President: Mr Snowdon, are you prepared to stand for this position?

740 **Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you.

The President: Do I have a seconder for this position?

Mr Dean: Yes, I will second that.

745 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dean.
Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Snowdon taking up his position?
Do I have any other nominations for this position? Mr Snowdon, congratulations. You are
duly elected as that member.
Monsieur Greffier, could we move to Item XV, please?

**XV. Election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation –
Mr Jean and Mr McKinley elected; Mr Roberts and Mr Dean elected alternatives**

Item XV.

*Following the procedure as laid out in the Resolution of The States of Alderney dated
18th October 2006, the States of Alderney is asked:*

*(a) To elect two members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation for 2017, and
(b) To elect two other members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation as Alternative
Representatives for 2017.*

750 **The Greffier:** Yes, Item XV is the election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey
States of Deliberation. Following the procedure as laid out in the Resolution of The States of
Alderney dated 18th October 2006, the States of Alderney is asked: firstly, to elect two members
to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation for 2017, and secondly, to elect two other members
to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation as Alternative Representatives for 2017.

755 **The President:** Thank you very much.
As is normal at the moment, part (a) is a formal acknowledgement of the Plebiscite which
took place. So that is that Mr Jean and Mr McKinley, who were the only two members on the
Plebiscite, are returned as the two Alderney Representatives in the Guernsey States of
760 Deliberation.

Does any Member wish to speak on this matter?

In which case, Monsieur Greffier, they are confirmed by the States as the two Alderney
Representatives to the States of Guernsey.

765 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

The President: We now move to section (b). There were only two people who put their
names forward for the Plebiscite, so it is now up to the States to vote in two people to be
Alternative Representatives as the Alderney Representatives in the States of Guernsey.

770 Does anybody wish to put anybody's name forward for nomination for this position?
Mr Birmingham.

Mr Birmingham: I would like to put forward the name of my erstwhile colleague, Mr Roberts.

775 **The President:** Mr Roberts, are you prepared to ... ?

Mr Roberts: Yes, I am, sir.

The President: Do I have a seconder for Mr Roberts?

780 **Mr Tugby:** I will second it, sir.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Roberts being elected to this position?

Well, you are the first one in, Mr Roberts – congratulations.

785 Mr Birmingham, you seem to wish to be on your feet again?

Mr Birmingham: Thank you. I would like to propose Mr Dean.

The President: Mr Dean, are you prepared to stand for this position?

790

Mr Dean: I am.

The President: Is anybody prepared to second Mr Dean? (**Mr Snowdon:** Yes.) Stand up and say so.

795

Mr Snowdon: I am prepared to second Mr Dean.

The President: Thank you, Mr Snowdon

800 Does anybody wish to speak against Mr Dean taking this position? Thank you very much. That is it, that is the two members in.

So the two Alternative Representatives are now Mr Snowdon and Mr Dean. Thank you very much – (*Interjection*) Sorry, Mr Roberts, I do apologise. We have had a lot of names being read out this evening!

Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier, if you would like to move to Item XVI.

**XVI. Transfer of ownership of The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited from The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem ('The Commandery') to The Alderney Foundation –
Item not approved**

Item XVI.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve the transfer of the share in The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited held by The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem ('The Commandery') to The Alderney Foundation.

805 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item XVI this evening is the transfer of ownership of The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited from The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St. John of Jerusalem ('The Commandery') to The Alderney Foundation.

810 A letter has been received from Mr Tugby in his capacity as Vice-President, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve that transfer of the share in The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited held by The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St. John of Jerusalem ('The Commandery') to The Alderney Foundation.

The President: Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.

815 Mr Roberts as Convener, were there any comments on this Item?

Mr Roberts: Yes, Mr President.

The comments on these items included: why is it coming back to Alderney? Mr Les Stuart, Chairman of the Board of the Alderney Ambulance Service, stated that Alderney has had control

820 over its Ambulance Service since 2001, and the Guernsey St John Commandery proposed to give the control back to Alderney.

825 The 'golden share' of the Alderney Ambulance Service will be placed in the Alderney Foundation. The Alderney Ambulance Service has control of the service. It was noted that Alderney owns all its own ambulances, and the last ambulance was purchased by the States of Alderney.

It was also clarified that if you pay your ambulance subscription in Alderney, this also covers transport in Guernsey, and there will be no changes to the current services provided.

830 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.
Mr Tugby, I believe you wish to propose this Item.

Mr Tugby: Yes, sir. I would like to propose this. It is straight forward really, and I would reserve my position to speak on the Item.

835 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Tugby.
Mr Roberts, I believe you wish to second this.

Mr Roberts: Yes, I would like to second it, please.

840 **The President:** Thank you, very much.
Does any Member wish to speak on Item XVI? One at a time.
Mr Dean.

845 **Mr Dean:** I would just like some points of clarification, actually.
The purpose of the Foundation is to receive, hold, manage and acquire the assets of the Foundation or their proceeds, and to provide support, advance or promote charitable projects and activities in Alderney, as the Council deems to be in the public interest or benefit for residents of Alderney.

850 I think it would be better, rather than it going into the Foundation, to have its own charitable trust, because if people are donating to the St John Ambulance Alderney, they are specifically donating for that purpose. If there was any funding left over at the end of the financial year, it benefits them; whereas if it goes into the Trust it can get diverted to other places. I think that is not correct.

855 I would ask my fellow Members to ask this to be withdrawn and re-tabled at the next P&F meeting, where a better solution could be investigated and implemented as a stand-alone entity and not go into the Trust.

The President: Thank you very much.
Mr Dent.

860 **Mr Dent:** I would like to support what my colleague has just said. I do question whether the Alderney Foundation is the best vehicle for the St John Ambulance, but I do welcome its transfer to Alderney. I just want to make sure that this is in fact the best way to do it.

865 **The President:** Thank you very much.
Mrs Paris.

Mrs Paris: Thank you, sir.
I too am concerned and a bit confused about this transfer of ownership. My understanding, as with Mr Dean's, is the reasoning behind the creation of the Alderney Foundation was that it should hold assets to be used to support projects which are in the local interests of the Island.

875 There seems to be rather a chicken-and-egg situation. The Ambulance Service, obviously a very worthy cause, requires funding by the States of Alderney, and is unlikely ever to be a position of having funds surplus to its own requirements, I would have thought. Therefore, to be used by the Trust. Indeed, I think it is more likely to be seeking funds and I am not convinced, if it were part of the Alderney Foundation, that this would be appropriate.

880 I would ask, have the trustees agreed to the transfer? I would assume that they have, but I feel that maybe we are trying to hand over them the equivalent of a storage box which is labelled 'pieces of string: too short to be used'. Some further explanation I feel is required before I can vote in favour of this.

The President: Thank you, Mrs Paris.
Does any other Member wish to speak on this?

885 **Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow Members.

I would just make a point: this is at the request of the board of the Ambulance Service. They are the people who have the responsibility and this is a request that they are making of the States to place the share in the Foundation.

890 I have spoken to the Chairman, Mr Stewart, who has convinced me, after looking at a number of options was the option that they chose as the best option. I see no reason not to support the board in its decision.

The President: thank you, Mr Birmingham.
Does any other Member wish to speak? Mr Snowdon.

895 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President,

900 I think the problem is that it opens up maybe a potential conflict of interest with the Alderney Foundation, whose main purpose may not be the ambulance station. I think it should be charity. So I do not think the ambulance station, which should be seen as a charity, should be put into the Alderney Foundation, which really should have another objective, not for the ambulance station.

Thank you.

The President: Does anybody else wish to speak on this?

905 Mr Tugby – but before you do, to assist Mr Dean, what you are effectively doing is making an amendment. You probably did not intend to do that. If your intention is merely to vote against this, everything is fine.

910 In other words, if you vote against this now, this is going to be taken away and be considered at length and something else brought back. But you do not actually have to make that ... To actually do that now, you actually have to make an amendment. So if you just vote against this, if that is the way you feel, then you can bring it back to the States in another form at another time. Otherwise you have to lay an amendment. It is just a matter of procedure.

Mr Dean: I am not quite sure what you mean by that.

915 **The President:** Let me try and clarify it for you.

What you were suggesting was that it was taken away and brought back in a different form – which actually technically is an amendment, right? (**Mr Dean:** Okay.)

920 If you do not agree with this, then you can vote against it – there is nothing to stop you doing that at all – and if it is voted against by the majority of the States Members, it is then dealt with. But that means you can go back and deal with it, bring it back to the States in a different form at another time. It is just a procedural issue.

925 But if you are trying to make an amendment now, then we have to go through another procedure. The easiest, cleanest thing for you to do, I think, to achieve what you want, is to vote against it, and if you are successful, bring it back to the States at another time.

Does that clarify it at all? (**Mr Dean:** Yes.) Good.

Mr Tugby, do you wish to exercise your right to reply?

930 **Mr Tugby:** Yes, sir. This is straight forward, basically. Their management committee requested this Item, and at the end of the day, for simplicity, it is going into the Alderney Foundation with one share. It will have no effect on the finances of the Alderney Foundation, because it will be totally separate, and the Alderney Foundation will not be putting any money into it, so it is just a matter of it is simpler to just put that one share with the Alderney Foundation, instead of setting up a different organisational company to carry it through.

935 I do not see any problems with the management. It will make no difference to the Ambulance Service. It will still be run in exactly the same way. It will just be ... well, basically, it might be better, because Alderney will have total control. They can still get any expertise they want from Guernsey, and also just carry on as normal, and it will not cost any members of the St John Ambulance any extra money to be carried in Guernsey from what it already is at the present time.

940 So I just ask my fellow members to support what the management committee is asking for.

The President: Thank you, Mr Tugby.

Monsieur Greffier, will you please put that to the vote?

945 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. The States of Alderney are asked to approve the transfer of the share in The St John Alderney Ambulance Service Limited held by The Commandery of the Bailiwick of Guernsey of the Most Venerable Order of the Hospital of St John of Jerusalem to The Alderney Foundation.

A vote was taken and the results were as follows:

FOR	AGAINST	ABSTAINED
Mr Tugby	Mrs Paris	Mr Barnes
Mr Birmingham	Mr Dent	
Mr Roberts	Mr Snowdon	
	Mr Dean	

950 **The Greffier:** Sir, 4 votes to 3, that motion fails.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

We now move to Item XVII, Questions and Reports.

XVII. Questions and Reports

955 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.
Item XVII, Questions and Reports – I confirm I have not received either.

The President: I can confirm that I have received no questions and reports either.
That being the case, I would ask you to close the meeting, please.

960 **The Greffier:** I am grateful, sir.

PRAYERS

The Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 6.25 p.m.