



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 15th March 2019**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 7, No. 2**

**Present:**

**Mr Stuart Trought, President**

**Members**

Ms Annie Burgess

Mr Mike Dean

Mr James Dent

Mr David Earl

Mr Kevin Gentle

Mr Christian Harris

Mr Louis Jean

Mr Graham McKinley

Mr Steve Roberts

Mr Alexander Snowdon

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr Jonathan Anderson

## Business transacted

Convener’s Report of the People’s Meeting held on 6th March 2019 .....	5
<b>Billet d’État for Wednesday, 13th March 2019 .....</b>	<b>6</b>
I. Chief Pleas – None received .....	6
II. The Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019 – Item approved.....	6
III. The Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019 – Item approved .....	8
IV. Building and Development Control Committee Mandate – Item approved .....	10
V. Questions and Reports – Two questions for verbal reply: Alderney matters raised in Guernsey States of Deliberation; Update on PSO process .....	22
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 6.34 p.m.</i> .....	27

*PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK*

## States of Alderney

*The States met at 5.30 p.m. in the presence of  
Lieutenant G T Workman RN (Rtd), a representative of  
His Excellency The Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

### PRAYERS

*The Greffier*

**The President:** Before we go any further, will you please remain standing. I would like you to join me in a minute's silence in remembrance of the three States Members who have died since the January meeting.

Those three States Members, for those of you who do not know, are Rev. Arthur Mignot; Jackie Main, and Rowland Neal.

*Member stood in silence.*

**The President:** Thank you very much.

### ROLL CALL

*The Greffier*

**The Greffier:** Good evening, Mr President. If you are ready, I will proceed with the roll call.

**The President:** If you would be so kind.

**The Greffier:** All 10 Members are present this evening.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

### Convener's Report of the People's Meeting held on 6th March 2019

**The President:** Before we go any further, could we proceed with the Convener's Report, please? Mr McKinley.

**Mr McKinley:** Sir, it was held in the Island Hall at 19:00 on 6th March. I was Convener, assisted by the Chief Executive and Acting Head of Finance. There were eight States Members present, and the President, the Minutes Secretary, 11 members of the public and six members of the press.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

25

## Billet d'État for Wednesday, 13th March 2019

### I. Chief Pleas – None received

*Item I.*

*Persons whose names are included on the Register of Voters and who have given due notice will address the States on matters of public interest.*

**The President:** If we could move to Item I, please, Monsieur Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

30 Item I this evening, is Chief Pleas. Despite notice, sir, no Chief Pleas have been lodged in readiness for this meeting.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

### II. The Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019 – Item approved

*Item II.*

*The States of Alderney is asked:*

*To resolve that 'The Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019' not be annulled.*

**The President:** We will move to Item II, please.

35 **The Greffier:** Thank you. Item II is the Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019.

A letter has been received from Mr Dent as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to resolve that 'The Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019' not be annulled.

40

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr McKinley as Convener.

**Mr McKinley:** There were no comments on this Item, sir.

45

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this.

50 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, these Regulations do no more than repeal the Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) Regulations 1961, as amended in 1990, and are the result of a discovery consequent upon the UK's impending withdrawal from the EU and the necessity for international driving permits to be issued by the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure in Guernsey on behalf of Alderney.

55 The Ordinances now being repealed were issued under a 1956 piece of Bailiwick legislation and the Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Guernsey) Law, and were, I am informed, drafted at a time when Alderney was a separate jurisdiction for the purposes of driver licensing. They made provision for international drivers' permits to be issued by our Treasurer.

60 A new set of regulations – the Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Guernsey and Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations – to be made by the Guernsey P&R Committee will repeal the 1956 Law and incorporate the enabling powers into a 1987 Guernsey Law – the Motor Taxation and Licensing (Guernsey) Law – and will also provide that the Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Guernsey) Ordinance, 1974 will also apply in Alderney.

This may all seem a little complex and Kafkaesque, but as you will see from the legislation, the legal remedy tonight is a mere 60-word Ordinance.

65 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.

Mr Earl, I believe you wish to second this?

70 **Mr Earl:** Mr President, fellow States Members, I have got nothing to add to Mr Dent's comments.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Earl.

Does any Member wish to speak on this Item? Mr Snowdon.

75

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President and fellow colleagues.

I support this and I think it is just that everyone should be aware that you do need quite a few international driving licences when driving in Spain and France and other countries, so you do not get caught out when Brexit does happen.

80 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

Does any other Member wish to speak on this? Mr Jean.

85 **Mr Jean:** I have one concern and I am worried that for the few, the many might pay for this. In other words, what my concern is about is MOTs for vehicles.

I do not think I would like to see that brought to Alderney. I think it would be an unnecessary expense on the community and I would like to see if it is possible for the Chairman to cover this before I vote for it, because what I am trying to say to you is my concern is that perhaps for very few people requiring an international driving licence, we could find ourselves in a situation where we are freighting cars over to Guernsey to have them MOT'd, and I do not think that is on. It is an unnecessary expenditure for members of the community and I would like the point covered if you could, sir.

95 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Jean.

Does any other Member wish to speak on Item II? No other Member wishes to speak.

Mr Dent, would you like to exercise your right to reply?

100 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, I will say very briefly that this legislation has nothing to do with the MOTs that Mr Jean refers to. If these are introduced, I am sure he will have the opportunity to express his views when such legislation comes before the Chamber.

Not relevant, sir.

105 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.  
Monsieur Greffier, would you please put this to the vote?

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.  
The States of Alderney are asked to resolve that 'The Motor Vehicles (International Circulation) (Alderney) (Brexit) Regulations, 2019' not be annulled.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Jean	None	None
Mr Roberts		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Dent		
Mr Snowdon		
Mr Dean		
Mr Gentle		
Ms Burgess		
Mr Harris		
Mr Earl		

110 **The Greffier:** Sir, that is 10 votes in favour.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
Could we move to Item III, please.

### **III. The Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019 – Item approved**

*Item III.*  
*The States of Alderney is asked:*  
*To approve "The Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019".*

115 **The Greffier:** Item III this evening is the Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019.  
A letter has been received from Mr McKinley as Chairman of the General Services Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve 'The Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019'.

120 **The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
Mr McKinley as Convener, would you care to make the report?

**Mr McKinley:** There were no comments on this at the People's Meeting.

125 **The President:** Thank you. Would you like to remain on your feet to propose this?

**Mr McKinley:** Yes, sir. Thank you.  
It is a very simple request – an annual request. The Guernsey Kart and Motor Club come here each early autumn for the Hillclimb at Tourgis Hill and also out by the War Memorial and the



130 Lighthouse. They are coming on from 12th to 14th September. Their presence is always welcome.  
They obviously stay in hotels or private accommodation or bed and breakfast, bring a small income  
here, some small money here, and we should very much support them and hope that they will  
continue to come in years to come.

Thank you, sir.

135 **The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley.  
Mr Gentle, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr Gentle:** Yes, sir. I second this.

I have nothing further to add, apart from to endorse Mr McKinley's comments.

140 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.  
Does any Member wish to speak on Item III? Please.

145 **Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow colleagues, I would like to thank Mr McKinley for bringing and  
tabling this Agenda Item. Like him, it is a welcome addition to Alderney, and I look forward to  
welcoming the Guernsey Kart and Motor Club here in September.  
Thank you.

150 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.  
Does any other Member wish to speak on Item III? Mr Jean.

155 **Mr Jean:** Just to say thank you to the Guernsey Kart and Motor Club company for coming to  
Alderney. It is a very important event and many local people actively participate in it and enjoy it.  
Long may it continue. A very important part of our calendar.

160 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.  
Does any other Member wish to speak on Item III? No other Member wishes to speak on Item  
III.  
Mr McKinley, do wish to exercise your right of reply?

**Mr McKinley:** No, thank you, sir. There is nothing to reply to.

165 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Monsieur Greffier, as no one has spoken against that, can you please consider that passed.

**The Greffier:** Yes, sir.

**IV. Building and Development Control Committee Mandate –  
Item approved**

*Item IV.*

*The States of Alderney is asked to approve the adoption of the new mandate for the Building and Development Control Committee, as follows:*

*“Building and Development Control Committee Mandate*

- To administer The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, (the Law) as amended.*
- To be the Authority for approving plans in both the public and private sector.*
- To be the Committee for the preparation, maintenance and operation of the Land Use Plan as per Part IV of The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002 as amended.*
- To administer Building Regulations made under the provisions of part of The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, as amended and any other law or laws by which they may be replaced.*
- To be the body responsible for reviewing the levels of fees chargeable for both planning and building regulations.*
- To be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for housing.*
- To be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island.*

**The President:** We will move to Item IV, please.

170 **The Greffier:** Item IV this evening, sir, is the Building and Development Control Committee Mandate.

A letter has been received from Mr Dean as Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the adoption of the new mandate of the Building and Development Control Committee, as set out in the Billet.

175 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr McKinley as Convener.

180 **Mr McKinley:** There were a number of comments on this Item, sir, if I could just read them out. It was noted that policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island overlaps with the mandate of the General Services Committee. Mr Dean, Chairman of BDCC, stated that this was not a view shared by the BDCC.

Mr Dent stated that advice was being sought on this section of the BDCC mandate.

185 Mr Dean advised that the Land Use Plan (LUP) deals with housing numbers and policy and strategy, as section 15 of the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law has now been removed.

It was noted that BDCC’s mandate to cover the ecology and conservation on Island does not include marine ecology and conservation up to the 12-mile limit when it is implemented.

Clarity about the definition of the public and private sector in respect of planning applications was requested. It was also queried as to what was classified as an exemption.

190 Mr Dean advised that where any works which might constitute development are to be carried out by utilities – in other words, Alderney Electricity or States of Alderney – applications are required for BDCC approval. Many, but not all, of the exemptions that used to cover utilities and the SoA have now been removed. Any ecological or conservation issues can be considered during the process of considering planning applications, and the BDCC has the option to place conditions on planning consents to address ecology or conservation issues.

It was noted that Environmental Impact Assessments are included in the Land Use Plan and Archaeological Surveys can be required which mirror requirements in the United Kingdom.

It was noted that permission from both the General Services Committee and a planning consent from BDCC may need to be sought in some cases.

200 Those were the comments, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr McKinley.

205 **Mr Dean:** Can I just make a point of correction.

**The President:** A point of order? Would you give it to me, please.

**Mr Dean:** A point of order.

210 The environmental impact assessment is actually taken care of under the BDCC Law.

**The President:** Mr Dean, have you had a copy of the comments from the People's Meeting?

**Mr Dean:** I have.

215 **The President:** Did you object to anything that was written down there at the time?

**Mr Dean:** I did, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

220

**Mr McKinley:** Excuse me, sir.

**The President:** Is this a point of order?

225 **Mr McKinley:** This is a point of order.

This is the final report which includes Mr Dean's comments. It came from the Island Hall, so it includes his final comments.

**The President:** It includes his final comments.

230 Do you concur with that?

**Mr Dean:** I obviously missed that, sir.

235 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed. So there was no point of order to be made because your comments have been included. Is that correct?

**Mr Dean:** No, sir.

240 On the bottom, I obviously had not commented on that. I had not noticed that it stated it was from ... It was not in the Land Use Plan. It stated it was in the Land Use Plan, but it is not the Land Use Plan. So it is a point of order. It is actually in the Law.

**The President:** Okay, thank you very much.

Mr Dean, would you care to propose Item number IV, please?

245 **Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow colleagues, I will read sections of the Building and Development Control Committee mandate to propose it. This is a slight revision. It is just a tidying-up exercise from the mandate that was approved in 2017.

I would like to speak on it. Mandates are not normally spoken about. However, I feel the need to just clarify a couple of points.

250

**The President:** You do realise that if you speak now ... ?

**Mr Dean:** I do, sir.

255

**The President:** Okay, that is fine.

260

**Mr Dean:** The Building and Development Control Committee have tabled a revision to our 2017 mandate. This revision is merely a procedural exercise in bringing the mandate in line with the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law as revised and in line with the adoption of the 2017 Land Use Plan which both were formally approved at the States Meeting on 14th March 2018. This is all it is – nothing more nothing less.

265

Some of my fellow colleagues might not fully understand the revised version of this mandate and the role of the Building and Development Control Committee and the quasi-judicial role it has in administering its functions. With that in mind, obviously a detailed explanation might be helpful to them to explain how we have arrived at this moment in time today.

Arup were commissioned in 2013 to carry out a full review of the planning process and to advise and assist in the most comprehensive review ever undertaken; and also set about implementing a detailed framework for the next Land Use Plan. This is a requirement in law that has to be taken every five years.

270

On 20th April 2016, the Housing Strategy debate took place without resolution in the form of a green paper. This debate took place in this Chamber, sir, and was tabled by the BDCC.

275

On 20th July 2016, phase 1 of the Land Use Plan was passed, which included the Housing Strategy requirements. In January 2017 the States, that included six of our current serving States Members, approved a motion that rather than each January mandates being approved annually, mandates would continue to be in operation until such time as the Committee brought forward a revised version to their mandate. The mandate which the BDCC currently operates under was passed unanimously at the 2017 January States Meeting.

280

Let me be crystal clear: there is no confusion whatsoever from the BDCC on our responsibilities, the mandate, the Land Use Plan and ultimately the Law which we operate under. The line in the mandate which states the BDCC be responsible for, I quote:

‘preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island’,

for clarity, this is not new. So there can be no doubt, the BDCC have been administering this function for the last 17 years. This has been a responsibility for the BDCC since 2002. It has been included on each and every mandate with the exact same wording, and I have with me, sir, a copy from the 23rd January 2002 Billet, and I thank the Civil Service for tracking that item down for me.

285

For the avoidance of doubt, this does not duplicate matters currently in the responsibility of any other Committee mandate, because it is not their responsibility to set policy or strategy for land use. It never has been.

290

I would like to deal with some specific wording that is currently in the Land Use Plan. Section 3 deals with Land Use Plan Strategy; section 4 deals with the agricultural zoning in a designated area. Section 5 deals with the built and natural environment areas. We also have Chapter 6, Island-wide policies, with a subgroup of section 6 – whilst not wanting to go into great detail, that deals with environment and amenity.

295

If I was requested, I would be more than happy to list the 57 policies of the Land Use Plan and explain them in far greater detail and why we have and need them. The Committee has to take into account the various policies when dealing with applications. On top of that, we have specific statutory guidance to be used in conjunction with these policies. These form the key cornerstones

on which we now operate, and it is of the utmost importance. The Government, and specifically the Building and Development Control Committee, need to have the necessary framework and policies in place to deal with proposed development, not only now but also the developments of the future.

300

The only variation to the 2017 mandate is the wording with a revision. The reason for the revision is that the text supporting the Billet items, as explained, part of the review and subsequent amendments to the Law, section 15 relating to the maximum number of dwellings allowed to be built on Island. This was revised as it was no longer applicable, as the Housing Strategy was first published in 2016. It was further amended at the Phase 1 Land Use Plan Inquiry and fully adopted at the States in July 2016. But it did not come into full force until January 2017. This again was after a full consultation process.

305

Let's be very clear: this removal also went through the full States on 14th March 2018, when the Law was amended to facilitate the revisions that were necessary, specifically relating to the introduction of the Phase 2 part of the Land Use Plan. The Law changes also passed unanimously and went through the same extensive consultation. Those revisions now underpin the whole planning system on which we operate.

310

The Committee has a fully transparent process before any policies or statutory guidance are formulated and adopted. Nothing – and I repeat, nothing – is adopted by this Committee without going through consultation.

315

Over time, the mandate has been adapted to reflect the changes of the Land Use Plan policies and also the changes to the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law as amended. The BDCC do not make changes to their mandate on a whim or without extensive consultation. Everything the Building and Development Control Committee does goes through extensive consultation – consultation with Committees; consultation with stakeholders; consultation with organisations; consultation with the general public; extensive input from the Law Officers; extensive input from the Planning Law Officer; and finally a Land Use Plan every five years.

320

The Land Use Plan is an independent inquiry chaired by an independent inspector. The report is published and revised with the inspector's recommendations as necessary. This mandate is no different, and as I previously stated, the 2019 mandate reflects all the changes that have been through a rigorous process in 2018. There has been plenty of time and numerous opportunities, not only to engage with the process but also have an input at every stage.

325

The BDCC Law gives the Committee the powers to insist on environmental impact assessments on applications. We have policies and criteria to assess whether that be partial, full or no need for the inquiry. I would like to point out there are also specific responsibilities under the Law for which the Building and Development Control Committee is responsible. If you wanted to change that, you would have to make a change in the primary Law.

330

The Land Use Plan does not belong to the Building and Development Control Committee. It belongs to the whole Island community, as they have contributed so much to it and that is why it is as good as it is. It is the envy of the other islands, because it is so comprehensive.

335

It is so comprehensive, sir, that we have actually been nominated for an award in London in April. That award is for processes and planning, which demonstrates how good the processes are, and we need to follow them.

It came in at £453,000. Some of that was detailed specific work to deal with certain requirements that became evident when the process was embarked upon. A fair chunk of that money was to deal with FAB Link. That was not a process that was seen when it first started.

340

The completed process which ended after being adopted on 14th March 2018 at the States Meeting. Changes had been approved through the land use process and the mandate was passed by the 2018 Committee but it could not be tabled on the Billet for January 2019 because there were actually no members of the BDCC. So when the new Committee formed it was again tabled with a resolution to bring it to the States.

345

It is *fundamental* that we must go through all these procedures properly, which is what we have done with the mandate that has been tabled here tonight. It takes into account the Land Use

350 Plan and everything the Land Use Plan process showed us. The mandate is essential to complete the whole planning procedure and make it fully fit for purpose before the BDCC embarks on its next round of work. If this mandate is not passed and adopted, the BDCC will be unable to operate fairly and legally in the best interest of the Island.

Thank you very much.

355 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.  
Mr Gentle, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr Gentle:** Yes, sir. I would like to second this, thank you, and reserve my right to speak.

360 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Gentle.  
Monsieur Greffier, I believe we have an amendment to Item IV.

**The Greffier:** We do, sir. An amendment has been received from Mr Dent, seconded by Mr McKinley.

365 **The President:** Would you care to read the amendment out please, Monsieur Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Yes, sir. The amendment reads as follows:

*After the words 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for housing' to add the words 'to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002'.*

*After the words 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology' to add the words 'to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002'.*

*This will clarify that the new mandate does not impinge on, or duplicate matters currently the responsibility of the General Services and Policy and Finance Committees.*

370 **The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this.

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, thanks.

Mr Dean may be a little surprised: I have very little quarrel with the things that were said and I support his interpretation of the mandate.

375 Mr President, colleagues, this amendment adds just a few words that if adopted tonight will prevent misunderstandings in the future.

I have no wish to interfere in the operation of the BDCC. I believe the BDCC have worded their mandate in good faith but they did not consult with P&F, nor I believe with GSC, nor I believe the Law Officers, and as a result I believe we could have some potential problem.

380 The final two bullet points in the draft mandate and as currently written are, I believe, a little dangerous. Legal texts should not be ambiguous. The BDCC has never exercised control over all policy and strategy issues connected to housing, environment, conservation or housing, and nor should it. For the BDCC mandate to in any way imply that this is the case is simply wrong.

385 The amendment tonight rectifies the problem by adding a few simple words to each of the last two bullet points. These words are 'to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002'.

The first bullet point will now therefore 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy of the housing to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002.'

390 The second bullet point will now read, 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002.'

As Mr Dean has pointed out, this Law provides the BDCC with responsibility for control of development, land use planning, building regulations, conservation of buildings, registration of conservation areas registration of historic buildings and ancient monuments, cliff paths, caravans and camping, the removal of motor vehicles and the removal of bikes.

I have no quarrel with any of that.

Let me reiterate, I am not seeking to interfere in the operations of the BDCC, but simply to protect the mandate of our other two main Committees.

400 So now let me just say a few things about housing, the environment and ecology and why these additional words are needed.

First housing: P&F has controlled many aspects of financial policy in regard to housing policy. Just last month we dealt with an approach from the Alderney Housing Association to convert their overdraft into less expensive bond financing. P&F is also responsible for forts, and therefore has certain responsibilities in regard to any incorporated housing.

405 P&F is also responsible for occupiers rates and hopefully will soon have the responsibility for the Single Property Tax. It is important that P&F retains control over all aspects of these taxes, including for housing. Only then will it be able to exercise its responsibilities and regard to the manner in which these taxes might be adjusted in the future.

410 My colleague, the Chairman of GSC will, I hope, go on to outline some of the housing matters that GSC has responsibility for.

Now, the environment and ecology: P&F is currently responsible for marine master planning and renewable energy policy. These are not matters for the BDCC.

415 The GSC is currently responsible for coastal erosion, sewerage and waste disposal, air pollution, noise pollution, possibly even light pollution, and I am sure my colleagues may be able to mention other areas. These are not areas that BDCC should have *carte blanche* responsibility over.

Myself and the Chairman of GSC sought to explain our position to the Chairman of BDCC on Tuesday, 26th February. We had hoped that he would understand and indeed he appeared to, offering to consult forthwith the Law Officers and let us know the outcome.

420 I do not know whether he did consult with them. I suspect perhaps he did not, but I *have* done so and if I may, I would like you to know that we have been advised as follows. I will read from the advice. This is what she said:

Her Majesty's Procureur has reviewed this matter and provided the following feedback.

(1) To the best of my knowledge the Chair of the Building and Development Control Committee has not sought advice from the Law Officers' Chambers in connection with the Building and Development Control Committee's mandate.

425 **The President:** Is this a point of order?

**Mr Snowdon:** I think it is, President.

Is Mr Dent allowed to read ... is that private correspondence from the Law Officer to yourself in public?

430 **The President:** Any legal advice given to any individual here can be shared with anybody by the person who it is given to. It is privileged information to that person. It means you cannot ask them for it, but it does not stop them from giving it to you.

**Mr Snowdon:** So he is allowed to share it?

435 **The President:** Yes he is.

**Mr Snowdon:** Okay. Thank you.

440 **Mr Dent:** I shall start again, because I do not want to be interrupted because I think this is very important. This is what she said:

Her Majesty's Procurer has reviewed this matter and provided the following feedback.

(1) To the best of my knowledge the Chair of the Building and Development Control Committee has not sought advice from the Law Officers' Chambers in connection with the Building and Development Control Committee's mandate.

(2) I have considered the revised draft mandate and agree that the last two bullet points to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for housing and to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island are very broad. In my view, it would be helpful to link those bullet points with the appropriate functions of the Committee in relation to the Building and Development Control Law.

Mr President, colleagues, that is all we have sought to do, and with these wise words from Her Majesty's Procureur, I rest my case.

Thank you.

445 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.  
Mr McKinley, I believe you wish to second this.

**Mr McKinley:** Yes, I do, sir, and I reserve my right to speak.

450 **The President:** Are you seconding it?

**Mr McKinley:** Yes indeed, sir.

455 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Who would like to speak on this amendment? Who am I going to take first?  
Mr Gentle.

**Mr Gentle:** Mr President, fellow colleagues.

460 There is no confusion on the part of the members of the Building Development Control Committee in regards to the their mandate, the very costly Land Use Plan and ultimately the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, as amended – to quote the amendment before us, 'to the extent provided for the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002' – which we, the Building and Development Control Committee will react to.

465 There seems to be confusion with Messrs Dent and McKinley, who have somehow managed to mix up Policy and Finance and General Services Committee responsibilities with those of the Building and Development Control Committee. The Policy and Finance mandate does not give them the right to interfere or review any Building and Development Control Committee policies, particularly at this late stage, because they have had every opportunity through an extensive consultation during the last three years.

470 The General Services Committee mandate gives them responsibility for environmental monitoring and for co-ordination of public services in the event of a civil emergency. Quite why



any Chairman of either Policy and Finance or General Services, or in this case the two of them together, would want to try and micromanage the responsibilities of another Committee that operates within its own quasi-judicial system is beyond me.

475 For those unsure as to what I mean by 'quasi-judicial', let me explain. The Building and Development Control Committee has powers and procedures which oblige it to objectively determine facts and draw conclusions so as to provide the basis of official action. The powers are limited to the very specific area of expertise of land use. They depend on a predetermined set of guidelines or criteria and can be challenged in a court of law.

480 I urge all Members to put this amendment in the nearest bin.  
Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Gentle.

Does any other Member wish to speak on the amendment?

485 Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you President.

490 Firstly, going on to Mr Dent's speech, I am still a little bit concerned that he has quoted from the Law Officer. I thought with data protection, you could not actually do that, but I might bring that up with him at a later date.

495 You have talked about quite a lot of stuff under P&F, like renewable energy policy. How is that connected to the environmental policy that the LUP has? I am getting a bit confused. You seem to be getting confused between one and the other. Renewable energy is a little bit different about what the Renewable Energy Group is doing and environmental policy. I do not quite see how we are connecting them together at all, Mr Dent.

500 Then we go on to the housing policy. I think Mr Dean explained quite well how the Land Use Plan came about. Phase 1 was housing and that was with the old Committee – I cannot remember all the names, but Mr Simonet, Mr McDowell, Mr Birmingham and a few others who took Phase 1 on. That got passed, that went through a whole public consultation and we have actually got very hard policies in the LUP to deal with housing. So I do not see how P&F has got any policies at all.

505 You might say you support this and that at P&F level, but you have not really got any policies at all to deal with the housing. So for you to say that you want housing back, I think is a bit ridiculous.

510 Going on to the environmental side of it, I would be interested to see what Mr McKinley says about it. Phase 2 of the LUP worked very hard with stakeholders and input to make sure that environmental aspects were taken into full consideration when we went through that process. I do not know what environmental policy GSC has. I do not think you really have. You may have views or ideas about some of your projects you to put forward, but what are your actual policies?

515 I think the danger of what you are actually trying to achieve now is to completely undermine the Land Use Plan. So what do we do? Do we pull the Land Use Plan and go to another the Land Use Plan, another land use inquiry? I do not see what you are trying to achieve on this at all. It is a wrecking amendment and I think it is really disgraceful that both of you have brought this today.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

Does any other Member wish to speak on the amendment?

Mr McKinley.

**Mr McKinley:** Could I just speak very briefly, sir, if I may?

520 I think that we are getting muddled up. Mr Dent did actually congratulate Mr Dean on the work that he has done, congratulated him over the whole of the whole of the BDCC, and did so several times.

525 All we are trying to do with this amendment is to limit the amendment to be within the bounds of the BDCC – in other words that ‘to the extent provided for the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002. That is what we are trying to do. We congratulated him, but we are trying to make sure that it does not overlap, or is perceived to be overlapping, with the interests and responsibilities of other Committees.

Thank you, sir.

530 **The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley.  
Does any other Member wish to speak on this?  
Mr Jean.

**Mr Jean:** Smoke and mirrors. You have heard about the Heinz 57 varieties – wonderful.  
535 My view is: not necessary. ‘To the extent of; to the extent of; to the extent of’ – three times, I say. I cannot see this as necessary.

I think the Committee has done a very good job of defending themselves. I think they are right. I do not see any reason to abridge this or abbreviate it – any necessity at all for it. It is wrong and we should not do it.

540 We should also remember that a lot of money was spent on this process that has got us here today, and these mandates are very important. To me, an interesting by-product of the thing like this: if you start to undermine and weaken something that cost so much money and heavens above, you all know that I raised my own concerns with this process and I have never been entirely happy! But the point is *now it is done*. Now the die is cast, and that is how you leave it, and you  
545 leave this Committee to get on with its work. You do not interfere with petty, fiddling amendments like this.

There is nothing at the end of this to be achieved; it is just not going to do anything. So *no*. And I say to the rest of you and I urge you *not* to vote for this. And you know that I have always been very sceptical about the plan itself and have raised quite a loud voice against certain parts of it.  
550 But there we are, I did not succeed in that but now is not the time for this, it is wrong.

So let’s vote for the mandate, support the Committee and do the work that is right and do the job properly.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.  
555 Does any other Member wish to speak on the amendment?  
Mr Dean.

**Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow colleagues, I thank Mr Jean for his kind words. Last March, he got a right dressing down from the former Chairman of this Committee, so to see a U-turn from Mr Jean is quite noble of him.  
560

There does seem to be some confusion. Like I said, it is not the confusion of the BDCC. GSC’s remit is for environmental monitoring. I think they are getting a little bit confused. Environmental monitoring is you monitor for pollution, contaminated soil and that has got nothing to do with environmental impact assessments or anything that is the responsibility of the BDCC.

565 So I hope my last speech was not too long and boring, but now I can see, after listening to this amendment, it was totally necessary. In my speech I explained to you all that the proposed mandate was a result of a long and complex consultation process – a consultation process in which, as I explained, Mr Dent and Mr McKinley had every opportunity to suggest changes. They did not. But now they do so after the whole process has been completed. I would suggest that this  
570 represents a fundamental breach and an abuse of the integrity of the process, and a complete misuse of the procedures, laws and rules that we have applied –

**The President:** Mr Dean, I would remind you to be very careful of what you are saying.

575 **Mr Dean:** I will just go back to that bit again, sir.

I would suggest this represents a fundamental breach and an abuse of the integrity of that process – a complete misuse of the procedures, laws and rules that we have applied from the very start process. What they are attempting to do is to pass what would look like a simple amendment of just a few words. It looks quite harmless. However the consequence of that simple amendment, if it is adopted at this late stage of the process, could be far-reaching and severe.

580 What we risk doing, if we pass this amendment without all the necessary scrutiny and consultation that the rest of the mandate has been subject to, is to undermine the credibility and the legality and the transparency of the whole planning system. I am not sure what Messrs Dent and McKinley hope to achieve with their amendment, but by introducing doubt as to which Committee deals with what and when, this amendment actually does that, they are opening up the whole planning procedure to some abuse.

585 It says on their amendment, let's be very clear, the BDCC mandate does not impinge on or duplicate matters currently the responsibility of the General Services and the Policy and Finance Committee. So why then are the Chairs of those two Committees trying to change the BDCC mandate?

590 At best, it could suggest that Messrs Dent and McKinley are trying to empire-build and grab a bit of the BDCC action. At worst, some people on the Island might suggest they have ulterior motives and may wish to take control or promote certain other projects.

595 Please be assured I am not suggesting that for one moment, that this might be the case. I simply say it to demonstrate why the correct procedures and consultations must be followed before such an amendment is adopted. Such an amendment cannot be introduced on a whim and rushed through in one States Meeting in one evening. It has to be analysed and scrutinised, the full implications of what it might be used for be understood and identified – otherwise the system could be abused or misused.

600 This is why we have the procedures that we have. This is why we have the laws. This is why we have the consultations, to make sure our planning procedures are fair, transparent, legal and as definitive as possible.

605 As I have said before, this proposed amendment undermines the credibility and the integrity of the planning system, quite simply because I feel it has not been properly tabled, not properly researched and not properly scrutinised and it has not been through the necessary procedures. If it were adopted, it would open up the members of the BDCC and the rest of the States to criticism, loss of public confidence, abuse of the system.

610 As Chair of BDCC, I therefore strongly recommend to you all that you vote against this amendment. We must try and maintain the confidence and trust that the public have in our planning procedures.

I thank you all for your careful consideration.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.

Does any other Member wish to speak on the amendment?

615 Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please. Just a short statement, sir.

620 I see nothing in this amendment that advances the Item. All this was planned when Mr Birmingham was Chairman, along with our good friend and States Member in Jersey, John Young. I was on that Committee at that time and endured the long and sometimes tedious and complicated transition for the Land Use Plan.

This mandate, I might remind you, also comes to the States every year, remember. So it can be challenged at that time – so it can be challenged in a year's time.

625 The wording seems fine, so I cannot support the amendment. For me, it would make little difference, sir.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Do either of the two remaining Members wish to speak on this?

630

**A Member:** No, thanks.

**The President:** Mr Dent, do you wish to exercise your right of reply on the amendment?

635

**Mr Dent:** Yes, Mr President, and I shall be brief.

I just wish to reiterate the fact I have no intention or wish to micromanage anything through the BDCC. I simply wish the BDCC to operate under the law. I believe that the amendments make it clear. I think the wording as the mandate stands at the moment, which is 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for housing' could be interpreted by many people to include the taxation and other matters which I referred to earlier. I believe the wording at the moment, which says, 'to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island' is far too all-encompassing. It is fine that it takes into account what is in the BDCC Act, but there are certain things that both P&F and GSC have been responsible for –

640  
645

**Mr Dean:** Point of order, sir.

**The President:** You realise what points of order are: you have three things to make a point of order about. If it is an opinion, I would ask you not to make it. If it is a valid point of order, which is to draw attention to a breach of any of these rules, to correct an inaccurate or misleading statement or to explain any statement previously made by you which is being misinterpreted, then please rise and do so.

650

**Mr Dean:** The BDCC have operated –

655

**The President:** Can you tell me which point?

**Mr Dean:** Yes, the bit about the ecology and that on the Island. We have been looking after that for 17 years, sir.

660

**The President:** This is to correct an inaccurate statement. Thank you very much indeed. Please carry on, Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** I will just make the final point that we did consult with the Law Officers and I think the Law Officers' advice was very clear. If this Chamber chooses to ignore it, well, so be it. But I think we have made the point.

665

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.

670

Monsieur Greffier, would you please put the amendment.  
Mr McKinley?

**Mr McKinley:** I just wonder if we could vote on each separately? There are two amendments ... Well, there is one amendment but there are two paragraphs –

675 **The President:** Mr McKinley, you are quite correct: there is one amendment. Please be seated.

**Mr McKinley:** Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

680 Monsieur Greffier, would you please put the one amendment to the vote.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. The amendment reads as follows:

*After the words ‘to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for housing’ to add the words ‘to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002’.*

*After the words ‘to be responsible for the preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology’ to add the words ‘to the extent provided for in the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002’.*

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr McKinley	Mr Jean	None
Mr Dent	Mr Roberts	
	Mr Snowdon	
	Mr Dean	
	Mr Gentle	
	Ms Burgess	
	Mr Harris	
	Mr Earl	

**The Greffier:** Sir, 8 votes against, only 2 for. That amendment does not pass.

685

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. In that case, the amendment has failed and we will now revert to Item IV as it was originally proposed by Mr Dean and seconded by Mr Gentle, who exercised his right to reserve his remarks.

Does any Member wish to speak on Item IV as proposed?

690

Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Only that I fully support this Item.

Thank you.

695

**The President:** Thank you.

Does any other Member wish to speak on Item IV?

Mr Gentle.

700

**Mr Gentle:** Mr President, colleagues, since the Building and Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002 came into force, the responsibility for preparation of policy and strategy for environmental conservation and ecology on the Island has already been in force in every single mandate in the last 17 years. For 15 years from 2002, that item has been approved at the January States Meeting every year until 2017, when the mandate was approved and remained in force until such time as like today, when the Building and Development Control Committee tables a submission to amend their mandate.

705

What the BDCC is not doing is trying to mend something that they have not already been administering successfully for the past 17 years. I implore all Members to vote in favour of this now unamended mandate.

Thank you.

710

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.

Does any other Member wish to speak on Item IV? No other Member wishes to speak on Item IV.

Mr Dean, do you wish to exercise your right of reply?

715

**Mr Dean:** Thank you, sir.

Rather than go over it all again, I have nothing really to add. I think I have explained myself quite clearly.

Thank you.

720

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dean.

Monsieur Greffier, would you please put Item IV unamended to the vote.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

725

The States of Alderney are asked to approve the adoption of a new mandate for the Building and Development Control Committee as set out on page 4 of the Billet.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Jean	Mr McKinley	Mr Dent
Mr Roberts		
Mr Snowdon		
Mr Dean		
Mr Gentle		
Ms Burgess		
Mr Harris		
Mr Earl		

**The Greffier:** Sir, 8 votes for; 1 against; and 1 abstention.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

**V. Questions and Reports –  
Two questions for verbal reply:**

**Alderney matters raised in Guernsey States of Deliberation; Update on PSO process**

*Item V.*

*The following questions had been received:*

1. Question from Mr Dent for the two Alderney Representatives, Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon:

*‘Can you briefly summarise the matters of importance to Alderney that were debated during the January and February SOG meeting and any subsequent dealings with Guernsey Politicians or officers?’*

*I would be particularly pleased if you could highlight any outcomes and the relationships we are establishing with Guernsey politicians?’*

2. Question from Mr McKinley for Mr Dent:

*'Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee provide any update on the situation with regard to the Public Service Obligation tenders?'*

730 **The President:** In that case, can we move to Item V, please.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item V this evening is Questions and Reports. I understand that two questions have been received, sir.

735

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr McKinley, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

**Mr McKinley:** No, there were none, sir.

740

**The President:** Thank you very much.

The first question that I have received for this evening is from Mr Dent as Chairman of P&F to the two Alderney Representatives in the Guernsey States of Deliberation.

Mr Dent, would you care to rise and ask your question, please.

745

**Mr Dent:** My question is to Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon. Can you briefly each summarise the matters of importance to Alderney that were debated during the January and February States of Guernsey meetings and any subsequent dealings with Guernsey politicians or officers. I would be particularly pleased if you could highlight any outcomes and the relationships we are establishing with Guernsey politicians.

750

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Mr Snowdon, would you care to rise and respond?

755 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President; thank you, Mr Dent.

So, Guernsey matters I think are very positive at the moment. We were kindly invited to sit in and attend the Policy & Resources Committee meeting. As you may know, Deputy Yerby asked I think 11 or 12 questions to Deputy Al Brouard about the 1948 Agreement. There was quite a lot of questions that came from the Assembly afterwards. I feel the general feeling is that there seems to be support – however, I might be talking a little bit too soon – for hopefully an independent chair when we get to that stage. Fingers crossed. Al Brouard said in reply, to most of his answers that it was a little bit too early to answer those questions and in four to six months' time, he may be a little bit wiser about the situation.

760

We had various talks to with Deputies and I feel there is support. We have also had talks with the Civil Service. I think there is a general feeling that Alderney needs to achieve a little bit more and we discussed maybe a rehabilitation programme, maybe something that P&F should discuss next Tuesday?

765

As you know, TRP will be coming back to Alderney as a single property tax. So I think that is something that we will be working on and that gives us the opportunity to set the rates. However, the end figure still needs to be the same. I think the date may be 2021 for that, because of the Brexit time taking up the Law Officers at the moment. We had the visit from Deputy Barry Paint, who came over and talked to us about fishing, as you know. I am quite pleased that that press release was submitted this week regarding fishing rights for Bailiwick fishermen, which was very good.

770

775 I think that is most of the items. There was also a speech from a Deputy about a code of conduct  
which he received and support for when you have a code of conduct code, and well-being and  
stress related to that. So that may be something that the States of Alderney should be looking at  
as well, when we have these items, about how we support that item. I think that the Assembly  
780 was very supportive of her when she made that public statement. It was a very good public  
statement.

I am happy to answer any questions or anything that you feel I might have missed on this item;  
and Mr Roberts may have some other items to add.

Thank you.

785 **The President:** Mr Roberts, would you care to rise? Do you want to add anything to that?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, there are a few things.

**The President:** Please do.

790 **Mr Roberts:** I concur with everything Mr Snowden has said. I think they were two very  
successful meetings.

The January meeting is mostly history now. The amendment from P&R to delay the runway  
was defeated namely by every other vote in the House. Many speeches in Alderney's favour saw  
795 a humiliating defeat and led me to believe that Alderney is now in a good place to defend itself.  
Relationships need to be maintained and built upon, but upon leading to our coming Financial  
Review, it is essential and imperative to maintain further good relationships.

That was the January meeting.

A bit more on the February meeting: both Alex and myself went down to Guernsey on 26th, a  
800 day early, on an invitation to sit in the P&R Committee. Of course, we were not allowed to  
participate but we were invited to make a comment. This, I am pleased to say today, is now a  
standing invite and we intend to attend the meetings each quarter. Any opportunity to sit around  
a table and have a discussion is in my view a positive one and a great change.

We also meet with the Chief Minister each Thursday of our visit, in the morning before the  
805 day's business, and this is going to be ongoing. These meetings can only be helpful in furthering  
Alderney's case.

Alex and myself then the next day attended the Guernsey States Meeting on 27th February.  
There were six reports from various Committees and subsequent questions.

810 Deputy Yerby then tabled 11 questions for the President of P&R, which were answered by Al  
Brouard, on the proposed review of the financial relationship between Guernsey and Alderney.  
These questions were answered by Deputy Brouard in turn. Many of these questions were  
increasingly searching.

815 There was much support within the House for Alderney, coming from many Deputies with  
secondary questions. My own question to Mr Brouard was: would the President of Policy &  
Resources agree with me that any changes to the relationship between Guernsey and Alderney  
need to be sustainable in the long term for both Islands and that we will only reach that goal if  
both Assemblies are involved? And then: would he also agree that a third party mediator would  
be needed to ensure an equal footing between the Islands? He answered, he agreed with it all –  
except the last bit. However, there was much support within the House that it would be a good  
820 idea for parity, with fairness to Alderney, to have a third party.

It was a good debate for Alderney. It was reported in the media as round one for Alderney in  
the *Guernsey Press*. I was encouraged. Alex and myself were also elected to two Committees.

825 Road speed changes were passed and we voted in the name of school and certain small road  
safety. Other Guernsey matters followed, until the repatriation of TRP and Occupiers' Rates. I took  
the view brought forward by P&F that this would be a good thing and allow Alderney to bring  
some changes to our structure and importantly it is cost neutral for both Islands. This raises some



£800,000 on TRP and £500,000 on the Occupier's Rate. This differs slightly with the figures voiced by Mr Brouard. So I said I did not like too many statistics. We were told we could reverse it, should we want to join in the future. I said statisticians use numbers like lampposts, rather to lean on than illuminate.

830

We are building good relationships with as many Deputies as we can, and this is the only way forward to build bridges. With bridges will come open discussions and support for Alderney. Alderney has many friends in Guernsey and Alderney is respected in their concern. There's many a slip between cup and lip, but in all, a great start to what could be a turbulent year.

835

**The President:** Mr Roberts, before you sit down, just for the sake of clarity, you said that 'Alex and I were elected to two Committees.' (**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir.) Does that mean you have two Committees each or one to – ?

840

**Mr Roberts:** One each, sir.

**The President:** So one to one Committee. Just to clarify what you said, that is all.

**Mr Roberts:** Okay, yes sir.

845

**The President:** Thank you.

The next question we have is from Mr McKinley to Mr Dent with regard to the PSO.

850

**Mr McKinley:** There is a lot of concern on the Island at the moment concerning air links, especially regarding the lifeline route to Southampton. Mr Dent updated those who attended the open forum following the People's Meeting last week, but there has been much talk on BBC Radio Guernsey these last few days about the Aurigny route from Guernsey to Southampton, about the Aurigny route from Guernsey to Jersey, and about the Flybe route from Guernsey to Heathrow. But surprisingly there has been nothing about ... There has also been talk about the Guernsey runway, but there has been nothing about the Public Service Obligation (PSO) for us in Alderney, and the routes to and from. Surely this is long overdue.

855

Would you be able to provide us with the present situation and perhaps offer some reassurance to a lot of worried Islanders?

860

**The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, Mr McKinley.

I referred your question to the procurement officers dealing with the tenders. Basically I was informed that there was nothing more that could be added to the statement that I read out in the People's Meeting.

865

So let me just say again that the invitation to tender submissions for the Public Service Obligation routes are still being evaluated. The evaluation team is still awaiting answers to follow-up questions regarding the detail of bidders' submissions which are critical for that evaluation. It is therefore not yet in a position to recommend any preferred solution – that is, the procurement officers are not yet in a position to recommend any preferred solution.

870

Once all of the necessary information has been received and analysed, the evaluation team will submit a report as soon as possible to the relevant Committees. For the avoidance of doubt, no decision has been made about a preferred solution, supplier or aircraft type for either route.

So I would reiterate that the procurement officers are saying no decision has been made about a preferred solution, supplier, or aircraft for either route.

875

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

880 Does anybody have a supplementary question for Mr Dent as a result of the answers which he has just given? If you have, please rise and ask it.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues.

Can I just ask Mr Dent what timeline we have when this will be presented to the States and the public domain? When will actually the outcome of the PSO be public? And when will we decide how our position is on this at P&F?

885 Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, I wish I were able to answer your question. I really do. I have been pressing for results. On the one hand, I feel pressing ... we do not want them to mess up the evaluation in any way. But yes, I think it would be good if we did have some indication of timeline.

890 But I cannot advise you on that, I am sorry.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Does any other Member have any supplementary question for Mr Dent as a result of the responses he has just given? No? No further questions for Mr Dent.

895 In that case, Monsieur Greffier, that concludes this evening's business. Would you please close the meeting.

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 6.34 p.m.*