



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF THE

ISLAND OF ALDERNEY

HANSARD

The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 24th July 2019

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Alderney website www.alderney.gov.gg*

Volume 7, No. 7

Present:

Mr William Tate, President

Members

Ms Annie Burgess

Mr Mike Dean

Mr James Dent

Mr Kevin Gentle

Mr Christian Harris

Mr Louis Jean

Mr Graham McKinley

Mr Steve Roberts

Mr Alexander Snowdon

The Deputy Greffier of the Court

Ms Sarah Kelly

Business transacted

Tribute to Lieutenant-Colonel Peter Walter MBE, MC & Bar.....	3
Apologies for absence	3
Convener’s Report of the People’s Meeting held on 17th July 2019.....	4
Procedural – Apology regarding the last sitting.....	4
Billet d’État for Wednesday, 24th July 2019	4
I. Alderney Football Association Lease Extension – Item approved	4
II. Single-use plastics – Debate without resolution.....	7
III. Questions and Reports – Five questions for verbal reply	18
Progress and position of negotiations with Guernsey regarding the 1948 Agreement	19
Alderney matters raised in Guernsey States of Deliberation	20
Update on the swimming pool.....	25
New public service obligation process.....	25
Tax on CBD products	28
Update on the Nunnery	28
Update on extending Alderney’s territorial waters	30
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 7.04 p.m.</i>	<i>33</i>

States of Alderney

The States met at 5.30 p.m.

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Deputy Greffier

Tribute to Lieutenant-Colonel Peter Walter MBE, MC & Bar

The President: Thank you. I would like to say a few words about Lieutenant-Colonel Peter Walter MBE, MC and Bar, who died on 28th June aged 91. He was a soldier of exceptional bravery, who served his country well, was decorated for it and had the sort of military career
5 which one can only describe as legendary.

He came to the Island and he committed himself to public service in very much the same way as he had done in his military service and in his time here he served on these States for 23 years, he was the Vice-President for six of those years and he was also a Guernsey Representative.

10 He served his country and this community with distinction, and might I ask you now please to just observe one minute's silence in his memory.

Member stood in silence.

The President: Thank you very much.

ROLL CALL

The Deputy Greffier

The President: Madam Greffier, could you please start with the roll call and whether we have any apologies.

15 **The Deputy Greffier:** Yes, sir. This is the Meeting of the States for 24th July 2019.

Apologies for absence

The Deputy Greffier: Sir, we have apologies from Mr Earl this evening.

The President: Thank you, Madam Greffier.

**Convener's Report of the People's Meeting
held on 17th July 2019**

20 **The President:** Mr Jean, might I call upon you please to deliver the Convener's Preliminary Report in terms of the number of people who attended the People's Meeting and their make-up?

Mr Jean: Thank you very much, sir.

25 The meeting consisted of myself, assisted by the Chief Executive and Acting Head of Finance; States Members were four, excluding the Convener; President; Minute Secretary; members of the public, 14; and Press, five, sir.

Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Jean.

**Procedural –
Apology regarding the last sitting**

30 **The President:** On that subject there is a matter that I feel I should raise because at the People's Meeting somebody raised the point, rightly so, that at the swearing-in ceremony, the Convener was not asked to give his Report to the States and for that I apologise. It – in the heat of the moment, I suspect – was overlooked. But I do not think in the circumstances, given that
35 the People's Meeting had taken place at six o'clock, so all those that were present at the swearing-in at 6.30 p.m. had been present and so they would have known exactly what was said. But I do apologise on behalf of the States.

**Billet d'État
for Wednesday, 24th July 2019**

**I. Alderney Football Association Lease Extension –
Item approved**

Item I.

The States of Alderney is asked:

To approve that the current lease for the Alderney Football Association be extended by 17 years to provide a term of 25 years.

The President: Could I now ask you, Madam Greffier, please, to turn to Item I on the Billet?

The Deputy Greffier: Yes sir.

40 Item I is the Alderney Football Association Lease Extension. The States of Alderney is asked to approve current lease for the Alderney Football Association be extended by 17 years to provide a term of 25 years.

The President: Mr McKinley, I believe you are proposing this motion?

45 **Mr McKinley:** I am indeed sir, yes.

The President: And Ms Burgess, you are seconding it?

Ms Burgess: I am.

50

The President: Oh, it was such a good start! *(Laughter)*
Mr Jean, could you, belatedly –

Mr Jean: I also must apologise.

55

Apologies were given for Messrs Roberts, Snowdon, Earl, Dent and Gentle, and there were no comments on this Item sir.
Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

60

Mr McKinley, would you like to propose this Item, please?

Mr McKinley: Thank you, sir.

65

Very little to say, other than the football club have done a wonderful job in advertising the Island in the Muratti Vase. I know they only won it once in 1920. Let's hope they win it in 100 years' time or in one year's time in 2020. They have done very well, and also the Rugby Club which was recently formed and plays there as well.

So all I can say is I do think that we should extend their lease to 25 years and wish them the best of luck.

Thank you, sir.

70

The President: Thank you, Mr McKinley.

Ms Burgess, do you have anything to add to that as the seconder?

Ms Burgess: Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

75

Not really, because it is self-explanatory, in the sense of we are really proud of what has been going on down there with both the Rugby and the Football Clubs and it is just a very good thing that we can do for them.

Thank you.

80

The President: Thank you.

Would any Member like to speak on this Item?

Mr Jean: I would if I may.

85

The President: Mr Jean, please.

Mr Jean: Thank you.

90

I just really want to say that these have been very exciting times for the Alderney Football Club and the new Rugby Club, and the last four or five years have been nail-biting for us, year after year as they get nearer and nearer and I knew originally some of the original Muratti team that won the cap and the medals those years ago, and I am really excited by it and I hope that it is getting ever nearer because it really is about time we won again.

That is what I am hoping, thank you. And well done them!

95

The President: Well, with that level of enthusiasm, Mr Jean, I can see it is just around the corner. *(Laughter)*

Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir, fellow colleagues.

100 I would just like to say that I think the Football Club has done a fantastic job and I was quite interested in the recent film by Mr Hill that did that documentary, it was very, very interesting.

Just a point of clarification from Mr McKinley, have the Rugby Club moved to the school now or are they still using the Football Club? I think it is important that we support both of those organisations fully, because it is very good for the Island.

105 Thank you.

Mr McKinley: I am afraid I cannot answer that question. I thought I had seen the rugby posts still at the Football Club, but maybe I am wrong. Maybe they have moved to the school.

Does anybody know?

110

The Deputy Greffier: Well I do sir, as President of the Rugby Club. *(Laughter)*

We are covering the fact that when the Football Club play at home for their six or eight home matches on a long stretch, we are using both facilities at the moment because obviously that then enables the Football Club to have a proper pitch that has not been ruined by the Rugby Club. So we are covering our options.

115

Mr McKinley: Thank you very much for that.

The President: Thank you very much, Madam Greffier. *(Laughter)*

120

Would anybody else like to ... ? Mr Gentle.

Mr Gentle: Since we are going down the jokey route – I played football there. I played 18 Murattis and I also played in the game that got beaten 18-0. The closest we got to they got recently is the kick-off and it was 0-0.

125

So I am all for this. *(Laughter)*

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Any other Member wish to speak on this Item?

Would you like to exercise your right to sum up, Mr McKinley?

130

Mr McKinley: I am not sure there is much that could be said, sir. I just ask everybody to support the proposal.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

135

Madam Greffier, could we move now please to a vote on this Item?

The Deputy Greffier: Yes sir.

A vote was taken and the results were as follows:

FOR	AGAINST	ABSTAINED
Ms Burgess	None	None
Mr Dean		
Mr Dent		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr Jean		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Roberts		
Mr Snowdon		

The Deputy Greffier: Thank you.

**II. Single-use plastics –
Debate without resolution**

Item II.

The States is asked:

To debate the subject 'single-use plastics' without resolution

140 **The President:** May we now please Madam Greffier move on to Item II?

The Deputy Greffier: Thank you.

Sir, Item II is the single-use plastics, and this is a debate without resolution and a letter was received from Mr Dent, the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee in relation to single-use plastics.

145

The President: Thank you.

Mr Dent, you are to propose this Item, and I think Mr Roberts, you are to second.

150 **Mr Roberts:** Yes I am, sir.

The President: Mr Jean.

Mr Jean: Thank you.

155 **The President:** Thank you.

160 **Mr Jean:** On Item II it was noted that the issue is with the disposal of plastics. There was a request to make recycling easier for residents by considering doorstep collection. This would make recycling easier, practical and more available and especially a point was made for older people. It was stated that some of the public bins have been moved or removed from certain areas.

A comment was made stating, why debate this issue without a resolution? And we should start banning plastic bags and wet wipes.

165 It was noted that recycling is a challenging issue for the elderly people and those without transport. For example, rather than doorstep collection, there could be a main collection point with colour-coded bags for the collection on certain days.

Thank you, sir.

170 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Jean.
Mr Dent, would you like to propose this Item, please?

Mr Dent: Mr President, yes I would like to propose it, but I would like to reserve my right to speak later in the debate.

175 **The President:** That is your right. But you still, do you not have to open?

Mr Dent: I believe under the rules of Mr Trought, that was sufficient for me to say and move on to the seconder, but –

180 **The President:** But how do the rest of your colleagues know what the Proposition is, if you do not – ?

Mr Dent: There is no proposition, it is a debate –

185 **The Deputy Greffier:** There is not a proposition.

The President: Well, if they do not know what the debate is?

Mr Jean: Just get up and open the debate, throw it open to everyone.

190

Mr Dent: Mr President, I should be very pleased to fill the Chamber in.

At its meeting on 13th November, the Policy and Finance Committee agreed that the States of Alderney should be represented at the first Blue Islands Environmental Conference. This conference was scheduled to be held in Gibraltar earlier this month; but this has now been postponed.

195

In March 2019, the Policy and Finance Committee further agreed that Alderney should sign up to the Blue Islands Environmental Charter, and for reference purposes, I will read out what the Draft Charter is. There are 10 points:

1. To control and reduce the environmental impacts of the island's activities on the environment
2. To control the risks and impacts associated with activities on the island
3. To promote a rationale of continuous improvements
4. To factor the environment into every day practices

200 This is the one that is relevant to tonight's discussion:

5. To move towards a complete ban on single-use plastics entering the island and its local environments

Then:

6. To increase self-knowledge in order to improve and communicate
7. To contribute to the development of scientific knowledge with regards to the unique local island marine environments
8. To support other islands through open communication and education
9. To protect native, terrestrial and marine, species and enhance biodiversity
10. To enhance terrestrial and marine natural environments.

205 Mr President, colleagues, at its meeting on 14th May, the Policy and Finance Committee agreed that at its July Meeting, the States of Alderney should debate single-use plastics. Members would be invited to provide their views on the steps that Alderney could take in order to reduce Island-wide use of such items.

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Dent.

210 Now I think all the people who have come to the Meeting are also aware of the nature of that debate.

You want to second this debate?

Mr Roberts: Yes, I do sir.

215 **The President:** Thank you.

As you wish to reserve your right, then ... Madam Greffier, does the seconder need to – ?

Mr Roberts: I do not mind carrying on, sir, if you wish.

The President: Okay, thank you very much indeed, Mr Roberts.

220

Mr Roberts: This is a subject the whole world has to wake up to and take forward to head on. And yes, Alderney does accept that its responsibilities go beyond our own borders.

225

Two years ago I was in Vietnam on holiday and I took a boat trip out of Phú Quốc to another island. As we motored out, we passed neighbouring islands and I looked down at the sea surface and I was astounded by the amount of floating plastic bags and other items that there were. Without exaggeration, every single square metre had a piece of floating plastic debris littering the waves. It was the worst instance of man's ignorance to the planet that I have ever seen and it really changed my view of just how our small Island, with a population of just 2,000, must set an example for the rest of the world to follow. We must lead the way, not with debate, but firm resolution now and I propose the time for debate has ended and a time for action is now needed.

230

Alderney does very well and our local shopkeepers voluntarily contribute. The farm shop is the prime example, with reusable bottles, paper bags, and many other types of degradable packaging. McAllister's Wet Fish Shop uses biodegradable polyurethane to bag its fish. Please forgive me if I have not mentioned all our shopkeepers that have followed this path, but they have to be commended and perhaps the States should issue an award for doing so in recognition of setting that very example.

235

Alderney does know the very fact that it has achieved much without formal regulatory frameworks, but it is my view that we should get all retail outlets to follow this high standard that I have quoted, and to do this across the board we do need some form of regulation. Science may come up with an answer, in fact I am pretty sure they will in time, but it is what it is and we have to deal with it and we have to deal with it now.

240

So please, Mr President, thrash out a tailored plan. Bring it back to the States and vote on it. The rest of the world will take notice and it will become the norm. Debates are views and our views never seem to get into action. Indeed I would welcome an open debate on our dreadful air-links, so the public can see the States openly doing something, as this cannot continue and the PSO must not be used as an excuse for delay –

245

The President: Mr Roberts –

250

Mr Roberts: Sorry sir, I have finished.

The President: Would you please restrict your observations to the question of single-use plastics?

255

Mr Roberts: It slipped out sir, it slipped out. Sorry.

The President: Thank you.

260

Mr Roberts: Sorry, I apologise.

Thank you though, Mr President, for bringing this environmental issue forward and I hope this is only the start of Alderney's response to what some call an emergency and we now have an opportunity to get some 'street cred' as Alderney leading the way.

Thank you.

265

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Roberts.

Would any other Member like to speak on this issue? Mr Harris.

Mr Harris: Thank you. Mr President, fellow States Members.

270 I have got quite a few pages here, so I do apologise. If you will excuse the pun, I will try not to recycle too many talking points.

275 Since 1950, humans have made 8.3 billion tons of plastic and only a third of that is in use today. That means that approximately 5.6 billion tons are either in landfill littering the environment or in the sea wreaking havoc on wildlife. Some of it will be in my body, your body, your children's bodies and infiltrating the food-chain, creating an endless cycle of pollution. I think we have all seen the damage that plastics and single-use plastics in particular are causing around the world, and whilst Alderney is a mere speck on the map, we should all play a part in contributing to helping protect the environment and wildlife that a lot of us can take for granted.

280 We have all seen the photographs, the Attenborough documentaries on a Sunday night, or even the odd Le Cocq's bag sadly decorating a gorse bush on the South Cliffs. You are also no doubt aware that gannets are now nesting in plastic, inevitably feeding fragments of this plastic to their young. This affects 100% of our nesting gannets and I am sure that if autopsies were to be carried out on those that do die, plastic might be a contributing factor. The implications of plastic pollution reach far and wide, and as one of our main tourist attractions must be protected from this increasing problem as well as exercising a moral standpoint to protect those that inhabit our Island and surrounding environment from these pollutants.

285 Alderney has a real future in embracing self-sufficiency and sustainability, and we should be encouraging on-Island production and growing of vegetables and so forth where we can. We should promote loose produce in our shops where possible, but unfortunately due to the remoteness of Alderney and the need to import a majority of our produce, we are never going to be able to eradicate all packaging.

290 There are those that will argue that we must rally the sources of this packaging and urge them to consider other greener alternatives. Unfortunately that is not as easy as one might hope. But the world, with a few countries as the exception, is coming to understand the plight of pollution in general and the resulting issues and climate change problems that are accelerating at an unprecedented rate. So a major step forward would be to ban the single-use plastics where we can. It is something we are even able to do. I understand it is nearly impossible to ban all of these items outright but we must encourage all local businesses and users to act responsibly and try to reduce their usage as much as we can.

300 We have all been encouraged by the milk machine in the farm shop and that is indeed a positive step. However most other produce is in a disposable plastic container or wrapper, and I am sure there are other steps that can be taken by all Island businesses to reduce their use of these plastics considerably, even if we reward those taking the initiative where we can. I believe we should have a ban in place in line with the UK and the EU for the coming years, and that covers plastic cutlery, straws, cups and cotton buds. Single-use plastic bottles also need to be removed from use and we as a States needs to install water top-up stations around the Island – preferably not near the airport – and promote their use for locals and visitors alike.

305 The bottled water industry is nothing but a scam unfortunately and in fact when you are paying a pound for what is an already available resource, then you are only supporting the single-use plastic bottle industry. This is both ridiculous and completely unacceptable. A blanket ban on single-use plastic water bottles to begin with would be a huge step in the right direction and Alderney can really make an impact environmentally and promotionally if we agree on outlawing this product entirely as soon as possible.

310 Wet wipes are a major issue so we need to take a look at whether these can be banned. They are often comprised of manmade fibres, so shed micro-plastics into the marine environment if flushed and cause great problems for sea-life, as well as putting great strain on our sewerage system. Flushables in general, as there was no filtration system at Platte Saline, anything flushed ends up in our sea. Sanitary products, wet wipes and cotton buds are regularly found on Platte Saline and the addition of a filtration system and better public engagement from the States would help, as well as banning plastic-stemmed cotton buds.

Plastic packaging in general, with the opening of The Guernsey Weigh shop and a similar shop in Jersey last year: Alderney lacks a plastic-free option for buying groceries and produce. If there was the possibility for green grants, perhaps issued by the States, this might encourage new or existing businesses to go plastic-free and encourage environmental awareness.

Packaging swaps: we can have a regular event where businesses with lots of bubble wrap and boxes and so forth can drop off for others who want it to use and that could reduce some areas of waste. There are fishing-line recycling schemes being set up around the UK. We in the Alderney Wildlife Trust would be happy to look into this, but we would need to have it clear that the States would support the shipment and collection of the line – I would hope that we would do.

Plastic recycling is very unclear. Nobody seems to know what is going on in terms of what can be accepted and where it goes. Better recycling facilities are required and a public awareness campaign should be implemented to encourage the use of these facilities. It has been mentioned that there should be regular recycling collection, but it is clear from Guernsey's current waste collection issues that this may do more harm than good, and the key to any success is education and public awareness.

Targeting the manufacturers and source of the packaging is key to removing it entirely, but we as an Island need to make positive change and we can all play our part in doing so. It was not so long ago that we just tipped everything into the sea. Thankfully we have improved somewhat, but still fall short individually and as a population in major ways.

Is there a long term or even a five-year strategy for planning for waste? Will the recycling centre be moved? Will it be improved? Will we move the airport? Will we continue to pour paint into a hole in the ground? What are our ultimate green waste plans? We could create a community composting programme, in turn encouraging Islanders to grow their own vegetables and so forth. What are our main targets for a reduction in waste? Many of these topics should be considered, if there was a proper waste strategy to be implemented.

A focus on the reusable products, as seen with the milk machine, would be the most environmentally sound option. 402 people signed the AWT petition between December and April asking for a ban on single-use plastics. So it is clear that the Island realises the issues that this is causing to Alderney and the world as a whole.

However, with the rapidly growing industry of hemp production, for example, there are many possibilities to move towards a more eco-friendly method of packaging and with interest in this sector in Alderney, there are alternatives that can be looked at for the future, should this industry become successful on-Island.

Sorry, I am still going!

Should the complete ban on single-use plastics proved impossible to implement fully, then the key to any successful reduction is education: education for us as a States and education for us all as lucky inhabitants on this beautiful Island. We all know the harm that our reliance on plastics cause and perhaps it is only us as individuals that can make a change to how we live our lives. Convenience is not always the answer, and before you throw yet another dog poo bag into a tree, think what you doing. Yes, it might be convenient now but what is the bigger picture here. Think for tomorrow and not just for the moment.

It cannot be left unstated, however, that plastics are not the only environmental problem that we as a States and an Island need to address, and there is a much bigger picture that we all need to consider for ours and our children's future. Plastics are an extremely harmful marine pollutant but there are so many more important and damaging impacts for the environment. We as an Island must take these more seriously. For example, Jersey have recently declared a climate emergency and committed to become carbon neutral by 2030, and Guernsey are discussing a Climate Action Plan at this time.

We in Alderney need to be making these steps also as much as we can, because this home is all we have. The repercussions of mankind's behaviour mean that there will most likely always be an Alderney, but there might not be anybody left to enjoy it. Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Harris.

375 Would any other Member ... ? Mr Gentle.

Mr Gentle: Mr President, colleagues.

My speech will not long because Mr Harris has actually just given half of it, bless him!

(**Mr Harris:** Sorry Kevin.) That is alright.

380 As world oil prices go up, the price of plastics go up and we therefore all spend more money
harming our own environment. Quite ironic really. Mr Roberts mentioned biodegradable
plastics. We do not have the facility for it on Alderney. They do not break down in the
environment, certainly not in the ocean where they cause as much harm to wildlife as any other
plastic and a majority of biodegradable plastics need a commercial machine which reaches a
385 high temperature and they need to be in there for over 12 weeks.

I certainly would not want to encourage any businesses to swap a conventional plastic carrier
bag or coffee cup or food tray for a biodegradable one and have them think they are taking a
positive step for the environment. And the exception – sorry Mr Harris – would be dog bags and
bin-liner bags which get burned either way, so they are producing chemical emissions. As an
390 added complication, there are oxo-degradable bags. They are not biodegradable at all, but break
into micro-plastics. They often have a picture of flower or a planet on, and they are widely used
here. They have been banned in many EU countries.

Plastic items can take up to 1,000 years to decompose in landfills; plastic bags, 10 to 1,000;
395 plastic bottles as much as 450 years more – but they never degrade. They are never gone. They
just break down into smaller and smaller pieces every year and become so microscopic they may
go on to become one of the 50,000 plastic particles every one of us ingest annually. We need to
be aware, as a community, of the need to push to teach from a young age about the effect the
plastic has on the environment. Has anybody ever bought a pair of scissors and need another
pair scissors to cut the packaging off?

400 Wet wipes – the housewife’s favourite – are an awful example of single-use plastic. They are
made partly of polyester, which is a form of plastic that does not deteriorate. They are behind
80% of blockages in UK sewers, and if you ask the States workers here, you will discover that
they are the bane of their life. People insist on flushing them down the toilet, oblivious to
405 the fact that only three things should go in the toilet – pee, poo and paper. Wet wipes can take
100 years to break up. Surgical and medical use seen as vital accounts for only 3% of their use in
Europe.

A doctor will tell you that you should put nothing smaller than your finger in your ear and
certainly never a cotton bud. Mr Harris mentioned a simple filtration system possibly, but so
could banning wet wipes or cotton buds, or if we as a States have a campaign on not flushing
410 them at the very least.

There are plastic-free communities out there that tourists visit. Jersey is on the list of the top
ten. But if you look at the actions we in Alderney have taken, they are nothing in comparison to
the numbers and commitments elsewhere. Is it a case of us playing the blame game and blaming
somebody for the lack of incentive for businesses to go plastic-free, or do we need to bigger a
415 driving force behind it all? We have lots of businesses, already mentioned, that have made small
changes or got rid of a couple of minor products. But the fact that none can bring themselves to
get rid of disposable coffee cups and only serve in the usual cups says a lot to me.

In the UK there are many that just said no and taken the hit in profits so they can do the right
thing for the environment and, at the risk of repeating what Mr Harris has said, is it now time for
420 us to investigate some form of green grant scheme or something similar to help with this?

Does anybody know where our recycling ends up? I certainly do not. I doubt I am not the only
person to have put cling-film in with plastic recycling, totally unaware that it is not recyclable.
The chemicals and resins added to it to make it clingy and stretchy cannot be removed, making it
too complex a plastic to recycle.

425 And on that point, I will say thank you and sit down.

The President: Thank you very much, Mr Gentle.
Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Mr President, fellow colleagues.

430 I would like this evening to tackle this problem from a slightly different angle. The question I want you to think about tonight is this: is it better to ban or better to tax? Banning will be almost impossible and certainly very difficult to police. And in Alderney, even though most of us have really good social consciences, we are usually not too keen on restrictions placed on our freedoms, even when those restrictions offer sound social or other reasons.

435 As you all know, I am not an environmentalist, but I have spent most of my professional life working in the field of practical economics – though I do have to say not in the economics of waste management. Nonetheless, I am a great believer in the use of price as the best mechanism for steering social behaviour.

440 But can I start with a look at the main reason single-use plastic is so popular? It is quite simply because plastic is cheap to buy and because it is lightweight. A plastic bottle costs about half that of its glass equivalent. A 330ml plastic soft drinks bottle weighs about 20g. Glass equivalent weighs about 200g. Transporting things in glass containers therefore costs more – in the case of soft drinks, and by some estimates, up to 50% more.

445 But it is not just cost that we have to think about. It pays to look at the wider picture, and when we talk about subjects like this, the law of unintended consequences sometimes rears its head.

450 Let me for just a second be a bit of a devil's advocate. Glass bottles also require much more energy both to manufacture and then to transport and because of this their carbon dioxide footprint is actually higher than for plastic bottles. Even more surprising, the American Chemistry Council and the environmental accounting firm, Trucost, estimate that if the soft drinks industry use alternative packaging like glass, tin or aluminium instead of plastic, the ultimate financial cost of dealing with the waste could be five times higher than it is now.

455 But enough of this speaking for the devil. The American Chemistry Council and Trucost calculations are good food for thought, but do no more than give us a need to take into account two other very important methods. These are, firstly, the extent that we are able to recycle different forms of packaging and secondly, the social and environmental cost imposed on others when plastic is used, and these matters are of course key.

Let me say as an aside, this latter matter is also one of the reasons economists do not rely on finance-based-only calculations.

460 Let us consider these social costs. When we use plastic, the social costs associated with its disposal are rarely charged to ourselves. The stuff that ends up on the beaches and in the ocean is in fact a problem for every single one of us. We who drank the fizz, who wanted a plastic straw or who took away our takeaway in a Styrofoam container do not pay any charge for the damage these bits of plastic do in the world after we have finished with them. After we have had our five minutes of use, we simply chuck them in a bin, and maybe sometimes not even into a bin and we let others pick up the disposal costs.

470 By chucking this stuff away so readily, we make sure that these social costs are not ours. And do you know, in most cases it will not even be our generation that picks up the tab. The real challenge will be paid by the generations to come, when the oceans have become toxic, the birds and fish are dead and the land is unable to sustain our food and other means. So I think it is obvious, if we are to be practical and indeed if we are to reduce the cost to the world, we really must find ways to cut down on these single-use plastics and, as an economist, I would say that one of the first things we could do is make those who use and buy plastic pay not just the cost of manufacture, but an additional levy that represents the true social cost to the entire world of disposal.

475

Now, while I do not know what the impact of such a policy would have on the price of plastic, I am pretty sure it would increase the price several-fold. I think it would not be long before many would soon be finding other ways to package their goods.

480 Some history: when Greece imposed a €0.03 levy on plastic bags – not very much – use is reported to have dropped by 70%. The Irish plastic bags levy, which is now €0.22 per bag is probably one of the most successful initiatives. In fact some have called it the most popular tax in Europe. Ireland has seen the number of these bags consumed per household per year fall from about 350 to about 14.

485 So what can we do in Alderney? On 8th July, I wrote as Chairman of P&F to the President of the Chamber of Commerce, asking if he would be willing to canvass his members in order to establish how much support there is for the Island working towards becoming a plastic-free zone. Would they favour voluntary action or would they favour legislation? I probably should have asked them how they would react to a new tax, but sadly I did not. Just another case, I think, of 20/20 hindsight. I have not had any reply yet from the Chamber of Commerce, but I am
490 hoping that this and other debates will stimulate the public and businesses to think even further about their attitude to plastic and to act accordingly.

I have already alluded to the difficulties I foresee in introducing legislation and I have noted that Alderney-only legislation would be almost impossible to enforce. However, Bailiwick-wide, we might be able to achieve something. So I think our best policy – that is outside voluntary
495 action – is to encourage our neighbours and work with them on this problem. If we wanted, I do think we could impose a charge – maybe a very hefty charge – through our retailers. Even though it would cause problems, a charge like this would nonetheless show the world that we care and given our small size, one of the few things we can do is set a good example.

Many of you have probably not heard of Vanuatu. It is a small Pacific island archipelagic nation, not wealthy but suffering big time from the plastic problem. Plastic is washing up on their shores and it frequently comes from outside. I know Vanuatu because I did some work
500 there in 2014. In July 2018, Vanuatu became the first country in the world to ban single-use plastic straws and polystyrene food containers. Banning their use was easy, because although small, unlike Alderney they control their own imports and exports. Vanuatu probably did not
505 make a big difference to their own or the world problem, but they set an example, and that is what we can do.

Let me finish. For Alderney, I put most faith in voluntary reductions, hopefully because people see this as the right thing to do, because it would require little policing. Globally, the world needs to introduce new ways of packaging and reducing the amount of plastic we
510 consume and currently throw away, and Alderney can do its bit by setting the world a good example.

The President: Thank you, Mr Dent.

Ms Burgess.

515

Ms Burgess: Thank you, Mr President and fellow States Members.

I enjoyed listening to everything that Chris and everybody has said so far, because I think it is something that we all realise. It is not something that we are suddenly panicking about. We know this has been coming, we see what it has been doing to the world as a whole. But when
520 you actually look at us on our Island, we can see that we really are taking on board the idea of recycling. We can see that by the amount we send off every week that we have collected. But I suppose the point with that is that it really is a large amount – we are sending a lot off.

So the idea is that what we really should be saying to ourselves is: let's send less off, not by not putting as much effort in, but that we have got less to send off – and I think that is the point.
525 So when you start talking about bans and taxes, for me I am not so much looking at that. I am looking at ways of supporting us as a community, who obviously want to use less single-use plastics, that we find a problem.

530 So I am looking at, as an example, water bottles. We see how much that takes up. You should see, when you actually recycle it down and you are looking at how many of those are water bottles, it is actually quite shocking.

535 And then when you actually think of what is a plastic water bottle, what is it containing? It is containing water. It is just something that we are having to drink and the idea that we are there polluting our whole world by wanting to drink, it is a bit of a shock. So the idea is that if – on our Island we are very lucky – we can actually address that. I would like to see us addressing single issues and just building and building and building on that. So with that idea, I would like to see things like water refill sites so people can actually, all around the Island, refill reusable water bottles – water fountains in public areas that are very well-regarded because as an Island, as I have said, we really do embrace the idea of recycling. We can see it happening in our shops, with our retailers, we can see it with how we reacted to the milk bottles and I just want us to
540 give us solutions that as a community we can embrace and that way we use less and less plastics as we go along.

So I really enjoyed hearing everybody's points, but I would like to see a more proactive approach that the community can embrace and actually be able to start to reduce the single-use plastics.

545 Thank you.

The Chairman: Thank you, Ms Burgess. Would any other Member like to speak on this?
Mr Jean, please.

550 **Mr Jean:** I have written nothing down, sir, and I am going to come at a completely different angle.

Very interesting views. I am certainly against any extra burden or taxation on the public and I will give you my reasons why. Already the public pay a great deal of money processing the waste that is being processed, baled and put aside and exported today. There is a great deal spend on
555 it. I do not believe that people have to cart water bottles around with them. I never have. If I want a drink of water, I go to a tap and I have one.

For me, the most important thing of all is where is all this leading to? When we bale all of this waste up, and then we put it to one side, we are all hearing things and I am watching programmes on television that are telling me that the farm waste is piling up, they cannot get rid of their black bale waste and their bale of twine, and the stuff that they used to – China does not take the waste any more. One of the things I believe that the States should be most proactive in, is looking at this in bulk – looking at the problem on the large scale, and checking that the people, where the recycling goes, and saying, 'Is this still being processed? Is this still being recycled? Or is it, like the farmers, being tucked in a yard somewhere and, 'Oh, just forget about
560 it because we cannot deal with it'? That to me is not good enough.

I believe that is where the States has a very important role to play in pushing to see that our stuff is indeed recycled. That is what it is about. So the rest of it to me is just lip service. You can talk about collecting bottles, you can talk about baling them. I am pleased to see people buying an aluminium bottle with pretty paint on it and it amuses me when people come into my house
570 with a water bottle and sit it there – it is obligatory, the water bottle goes around with them everywhere – because I have never done that. But it does amuse me to see people come in and put a water bottle down in front of themselves. It is an unusual thing to me, I find it interesting.

So there we are. For me, it is about the final part of it. It is no good baling this stuff up and it going somewhere. We do not know where it is going, we do not know now if it is still being
575 recycled. China, as I say, has stopped taking the waste. So that is where I believe the States really has the role.

The General Services Committee and the P&F Committee should be writing letters to the people and saying, where is our stuff going to? We would like to know if it is being recycled.

580 The one thing I am going to say here: for very many years the public of this Island have put in a great deal of effort. You see them all going down with their cars, you are seeing them dropping their stuff off religiously into the aluminium containers, into the various containers. Now, it would be very disappointing for all of us if that was not going the whole way and actually really being recycled. We should check that out. There we are.

Thank you very much.

585

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Jean, for that.
Any other Member? Mr McKinley.

Mr McKinley: I think almost everything has been said that needs to be said.

590 I would say that there is illegal-tipping on this Island, and I think it needs to be looked at carefully, and if necessary those responsible should be fined. I am talking specifically about the green waste area, where quite often plastic and other waste is dropped there also.

I think that the recycle area will need to be enlarged. It needs to be considerably bigger and it needs to be advertised well. I am not sure that we should be able to do rubbish collection, but perhaps we should consider that also.

595

I would like to just inform people that there are plans to install water refill areas on Victoria Street certainly, and the General Services Committee has passed that. I think that will happen also elsewhere around the Island.

600 Finally I would just like to congratulate the Alderney Wildlife Trust for the work that they do specifically in this area, and there is one member of the Wildlife Trust in the Public Gallery at the moment – well done to all of you and please let us all continue with that work.

Thank you sir.

The President: Thanks very much indeed, Mr McKinley.

605

Would any other Member like to speak? Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir, fellow colleagues.

I think Mr Dent actually raised quite a good point: do you ban or tax? Yes, I think both are actually a problem. I think we need to actually get back to the root of the cause of plastic.

610

I was in a supermarket recently with another States Member, and it was amazing the amount of plastic on the shelves – just chock-a-block. You have got your yogurts, your fruit, all bits and pieces. If you go back to it, you think, well actually, the wholesaler and the retailer are the ones that I think are at fault, because you have got our retailers over here that are buying it from the UK wholesalers and bringing it onto our shelves. So I think we really need to come up with some sort of incentives for our local businesses to stop importing the plastic from those companies.

615

Now the question is, are there other companies that are supplying no-plastic products? So if you think of the likes of a market-town sort of thing, with your market on a Saturday or something, we used to go to them in the UK, and you see hardly any plastic around those vegetables and everything. So there must be some companies out there that will have plastic-free products, so do not have to have all the wrapping around whatever that product that is coming on to our shelves.

620

I think we should really look at incentivising it, as I have said, and we do have TRP coming back to the Island, so if the States was minded to, you could think about reducing TRP for those companies that are actually reducing plastic in Alderney as one way of incentivising the way forward.

625

But I do not think a tax is the right solution, because I do not think, actually, the tax gets rid of it. It actually puts the cost up to the people that have to buy their products every week – which we do not want.

630

I was invited to a meeting about two years ago with the former Chairman of GSC and myself, and that was with the Wildlife Trust and Claire Thorpe. I would like to thank Claire for the

amount of work that she has done on this subject, which has been tremendous over the last couple of years.

I think we also do need to think about a few other things moving forward, which is where do we want to go from this? I notice there is no resolution with this at all, so I would like to see ...
635 This comes from P&F and it goes back to the States, then it goes back to the P&F and it goes back to GSC, but are we actually going to agree on a way forward? I think that is really essential, that we have some resolution. Even if it is a minor resolution and then we can get a harder or more substantial one if the States and public and businesses are minded to do so.

640 But I think it is a very good debate, and talking is very good, but we need actually some action.

So thank you.

The President: Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

Mr Dean, do you wish to speak?

645

Mr Dean: Thank you, sir, fellow colleagues.

Not a great deal to say, much of it has already been said by my fellow colleagues and I do echo the same sentiments as them.

650 Like Mr Snowdon, I would not like to see a tax. We actually need to deal with it at source, so dealing with it when it comes over to the Island, and actual education for the people on this Island. We all love living here and we need to protect this Island and it is up to each and every one of us to actually reduce the plastic, that we actually recycle.

655 As Mr McKinley has pointed out, at GSC we have discussed having water stations around the Island, which the Committee fully endorse – I certainly fully endorse that – and we should look at it everywhere. We should have a water station up at the airport for everybody.

Nothing further to add, sir. Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

660 Might I just commend all the States Members for the passion of that discussion. I think that we are all very clear now that this is an issue which is going to be taken seriously, and hopefully we can develop a strategy to deal with it.

Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Dent: Am I allowed to sum up?

665

Mr McKinley: I think you have said enough already. *(Laughter)*

The President: It depends how you are reading the room, Mr Dent. If you think it would be helpful, of course you may.

670

Mr Dent: Thank you, Mr President.

I do not want to dwell at length on any point. I would like to thank everybody that contributed. I think it was a very interesting debate and a lot of sensible suggestions were made.

675 The one point I would like to make, which is why I am standing on my feet, is I would like to answer the question as to why there was no resolution.

First of all, the matter was placed on the Billet as a first step in I think probably a long-term debate on the Island. The idea, besides hearing Members' views, is to encourage public debate and discussion, and we will undoubtedly be bringing this back after further discussion in P&F.

680 But I would like to say that there does appear to be some procedural difficulties attached to having resolutions that we can change easily during the course of a debate such as this, and I think one of the things that I would like to do – to work on in the next period – is some way we can change the rules of debate, so that we can debate matters like this at the beginning of the

discussion, a bit like at the beginning of a white paper, without an absolutely fixed resolution, and where we can thrash things out and can move things forward.

685 Thank you very much.

The President: I think on that point, Mr Dent, that the Rules of Procedure are a matter for the States of Alderney, and so it is open to you, should you wish to change them, to do just that.

690 **Mr Dent:** Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much.

III. Questions and Reports – Five questions for verbal reply

Item III.

The following questions had been received:

1. Question from Mr Roberts for the Chairman of the Finance Committee, Mr James Dent:

Can the Chairman of the Policy and Finance please update this House and the Island of Alderney on the progress and position of negotiations with Guernsey of the most important issue of the moment, namely the 1948 agreement?

2. Question from the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee to the two Alderney Representatives in the States of Guernsey, Mr Steve Roberts and Mr Alex Snowdon:

Can you briefly summarise the matters of importance to Alderney that were debated during the recent Guernsey States of Deliberation Meeting, and any subsequent meetings you may have had with Guernsey politicians or officers relevant to Alderney affairs?

3. Question from Mr Alexander Snowdon to the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, Mr James Dent:

- i. Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain any updates with the swimming pool?*
- ii. Does the Policy and Finance Chairman have any news from the new public service obligation process?*
- iii. Can the Chairman explain what tax is place on CBD products regarding hemp and cannabis produced in the Bailiwick?*

4. Question from Mr Alexander Snowdon to the Chairman of the General Services Committee, Mr Graham McKinley:

Could the General Services Committee Chairman still explain what is happening with the Nunnery?

5. Question from Mr Alexander Snowdon to the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, Mr James Dent:

Can the Chairman of P&F provide an update on the moves to extend our territorial waters from three nautical miles to 12?

The President: Madam Greffier, might we now move on to Item III?

695 **The Deputy Greffier:** Yes, sir.

Item III is Questions and Reports, and I have several questions in the order that they have been given to me.

Progress and position of negotiations with Guernsey regarding the 1948 Agreement

The Deputy Greffier: Sir, the first one is a question from Mr Roberts to the Chair of the Finance Committee – I understand Mr Dent will be answering this question:

‘Can the Chairman of the Policy and Finance please update this House and the Island of Alderney on the progress and position of negotiations with Guernsey of the most important issue of the moment, namely the 1948 Agreement?’

700 That, sir, was for verbal answer.

The President: Would you care to answer the question, Mr Dent?

Mr Dent: With pleasure.

705 Mr President, colleagues, we are still discussing high-level and other objectives and until these are agreed, there can really be no substantive discussions. We are however hopeful that one of the high-level objectives will be a focus, not just on the financial arrangements, but also on support for each other’s economies. We have unofficially been led to believe that Guernsey will be agreeable to this.

710 Alderney is at a crossroads, and I believe that the renegotiation process affords us the opportunity for positive change. I am not one of those who would have us bury our head in the sand and refuse to talk. As neither side can change the 1948 Agreement unilaterally, we should not be afraid of engagement. In fact I think a suspension of co-operation would be likely to have a very bad outcome. It would indicate to those in Guernsey that all we do in Alderney is object.

715 But I do have to say, discussions are not moving rapidly.
Thank you.

The President: Thank you.

720 Does any Member have a question arising out of the answer that has been given by Mr Dent?

Mr Jean: Yes.

The President: Mr Jean, please.

725 **Mr Jean:** My supplementary question would be: would the Chairman agree with me that a suggestion was made that we take a third person with us with expertise on the subject to help with the negotiations of the 1948 Agreement, and has anything been done to fulfil those criteria; and if not, can he explain to us why a decision has been taken not to go down that avenue?

Thank you very much, sir.

730

The President: I am required, Mr Dent, just to point out that you do not have to answer any of that question.

735 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, I am well aware that I do not have to answer that question.

740 In answer to Mr Jean, no decision has been taken about an independent chair. We have raised the matter. It is very much our view that we should have such a person serving on hand at the appropriate moment. At the moment, we are, however, discussing the high-level and other objectives, and I think when that has come to some kind of fruition, we will have some knowledge about the situation on whether there will be a high-level chair, and I very much hope that we will get one.

Mr Jean: Thank you very much, sir.

745 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.
Does any other Member have a question arising out of the answer by Mr Dent?

Alderney matters raised in Guernsey States of Deliberation

The President: Could we move on then, Madam Greffier, to the second question?

750 **The Deputy Greffier:** Yes sir.
The second question is from the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee to the two Alderney Representatives in the States of Guernsey:

Can you briefly summarise the matters of importance to Alderney that were debated during the recent Guernsey States of Deliberation Meeting, and any subsequent meetings you may have had with Guernsey politicians or officers relevant to Alderney affairs?

And that is for verbal answer, sir.

755 **The President:** Who would like to kick that one off?

Mr Roberts: I will go first then.

760 There is some confusion within the States of Guernsey as to just who is responsible to medical air charters out of Alderney. I asked the question to Deputy Soulsby from Health and Social Care, and at the summing up I did not get an answer. I then stood up and said my question has still not been answered, and I got the answer that it was really the whole of Guernsey States were responsible and that some recent helicopter charges were very expensive when Aurigny failed to be able to provide a proper service. I appreciate that answer, but it fails to bring a solution.

765 We now have regular meetings each Thursday with P&R. This is bringing success and rhetoric about the way forward, and we are in a much better position with Guernsey understanding just what we are saying. It is not about a blame game, as that achieves absolutely nothing. We all know who, but name-calling is futile and has got us nowhere.

770 It is now about negotiating solutions, and this is the avenue to restore an airline that serves Alderney, with air medicals, plus reliable, affordable air travel, and for that you need recognition by Guernsey politicians of Alderney's artery that feeds the economy – namely our air services. Indeed, it was our private meetings with the STSB and P&R that in my mind, this time, became more important than anything that came up in the States Meeting itself. We seem to have built up a rapport.

775 Liberation Holidays came up, as Overseas Aid did. I had a CareWatch meeting straight after the States Meeting, talking about new drug funding and the needs of the disabled and elderly in Alderney. One disabled lady, delayed from the night before, was delayed all day until 9.30 that evening – and that lady was in a wheelchair. I thought that was disgraceful.

780 The road tax was debated and long debates and amendments on the Planning Committee, which went on until eight o'clock on the Friday. I do not know whether that is a record, but it is very, very late.

After we had attempted to escape home, only to be denied exit due to aircraft shortages and weather conditions, we got home on Saturday.

785 There was an amendment in a long debate on protecting trees in the Bailiwick, which I joined in, actually. I gave the need to protect our hedgerows and replace and increase our tree numbers in Alderney, as a States Member for wildlife and agriculture.

790 I also lightened the atmosphere – as I like doing – that once or twice in my life, I have been completely out of my tree. Some things are better left unsaid, and I usually realise it right after I have said them. *(Laughter)* But it all went down very well, and it was a good meeting with good positive progress. I was very pleased.

The President: Thank you, Mr Roberts.

795 **Mr McKinley:** Only once or twice?

The President: Does any Member have a question for Mr Roberts arising out of his report?

Mr McKinley: Yes please, sir.

800 **The President:** Please, Mr McKinley.

Mr McKinley: This question really is for both of our representatives in Guernsey but, is it not time that we were visited by members of the Policy & Resource Committee here in Alderney?

805 It has been a long time since Mr Gavin St Pier or Mr Brouard or Mr Trott have been here. It would also be useful, I think, under present circumstances to invite Mr Derby up here *(Laughter)* but I am not sure that he would want to come. He certainly may not be able to go back. *(Laughter)*

810 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, Mr McKinley, this was talked about, but it was actually talked about the other way around. We were talking about sending our States Members down to Guernsey to meet everybody, as there are more Deputies there than there are States Members. So it would make sense for us to go down there – 10 to go – then 38 to come up here.

815 We have also been invited to Jersey – Mr Snowdon and myself – for the CPA in September, but I think it clashes with a Policy and Finance so we have got a problem there. But we are working on that, which was a thing that you actually did, and I commend you for, a couple of years ago, and it worked, when you brought the politicians up to Alderney to meet.

The President: Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Does any other Member have a question for Mr Roberts?

820

Mr Jean: Yes, if I could.

The President: Mr Jean.

825 **Mr Jean:** Could you expand a little on the motor tax issue? I heard a member of the motor trade, in interview on the radio, express concern that there was the possibility of a multiple tax: an increase in the tax on petrol I believe, up to above inflation, and up to cover the actual money lost in recent years; and also a mileage gismo (**Mr Roberts:** Yes, the mileage.) was due to be fitted into cars to monitor the amount of mileage on the car.

830 There is actually a third one, and I cannot remember the third one – (**Mr Roberts:** Yes.) but what I am asking you is what actually happened in the States regarding that? The motor trade is taking it very seriously, and probably so too should the people of Guernsey.

The President: Mr Roberts, those questions seem to me to relate to matters affecting Guernsey, rather than here, therefore you may feel that it is –

Mr Jean: Sir –

840 **Mr Roberts:** No, no, I will answer that, sir – (**Mr Jean:** May I give –) yes, it is fine.

The President: No, Mr Jean, it is okay.

845 **Mr Roberts:** This motor tax may be repatriated back to Alderney shortly – 2021 I believe. So we abstained for most of the vote. I am against bringing back motor tax – personally, I would not like to see that – even though we have hugely high prices on fuel here on Alderney. If we bring back the motor tax, it will bring down the price of fuel, but it is six of one and half a dozen of the other. And you could also say that people with a car on the Island that are holiday-home-owners, who bring in a lot, have a car in a garage and just pay so little on their petrol but pay no motor tax, are actually getting off very light, where the rest of us are here paying all year

850 around.
So that is where it is – it has got to come back to the States. There was no definite decision made. It has got to come back again to Guernsey States before any decision will be made. But this tax is going to be repatriated to Alderney, and Alderney will decide which way it wants to go.

855 **Mr McKinley:** Exactly.

The President: Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Does any other Member have a question?

860 Might we move on now please, Madam Greffier, to the third question, which I think is in three parts –

The Deputy Greffier: It is sir.

The President: Perhaps it would be –

865

Mr Roberts: Sir?

The President: Sorry – Mr Snowdon.

870 **Mr Roberts:** Mr Snowdon has not spoken –

The President: Oh, I do apologise.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

875

The President: The floor is yours.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

880 Just in response to Mr McKinley, you are absolutely right, we should be getting people up here and we are working very hard to get the right people up here, because the situation at the moment is absolutely dire, to put it bluntly.

I think I wrote a very detailed email yesterday which actually was going to come up at P&F tomorrow, where the President of the States Trading Advisory Board has offered to come up and speak to all Members about the situation with them. We were going to bring that up at P&F but we have pre-empted it now. So hopefully you would like for that gentleman to come up, who is very happy to come and see you, and we can have a proper discussion about that at P&F sometime or an outside meeting of P&F.

Just going back to the States summary – I do not think we gave a summary on the June one, so is it alright if I do a little bit on the June and a little bit on the July meeting, or does it have to be July? I will go for both unless you stop me, Mr President.

So just going back to the June meeting, the P&R Plan came up with 21 amendments – it was quite a long debate – and we thanked Policy & Resources for the inclusion of a 12-mile-limit in their Plan, Alderney Runway, Breakwater and Harbour. So just to give some clarification, that is the Policy and Resources Plan for Guernsey which shows working-streams of the projects that Policy & Resources and other Committees may be undertaking – it is basically the Policy and Resources Plan. So it is quite good that we have got the Alderney Runway in there with a work-stream to go through it, and also the 12-mile extension.

Also in the Plan was the passenger numbers for the airports, with the Southampton route highlighted as not looking good for 2018. We rebuffed that quite strongly with the data that we were given from the Civil Service, which I think the first four months of this year gives an 11% increase on the Southampton route and a 3% increase on the Guernsey route. So we did explain to the House that those transport links are very important for the Island and are our lifeline routes, and we did emphasise the Southampton route really was very important for us and that it should be encouraging that this year there is the 11% increase on that Southampton route.

Going on to the Policy and Resources Plan, again, there were quite a lot of amendments regarding climate change, and we felt that it was important that Alderney gave a few examples about how we may have projects that will help towards climate change – or reduce climate change, sorry – such as tidal, whether that be small scale or large scale in the future, solar farm from AEL, plastic-free – which we have had tonight, which was good – and the Cold Water project – again, that is AWT – with Herm, which is a very good thing. So we touched on that.

The extension to the seabed happened yesterday, on 23rd July, and that is going out from the three miles to the 12 miles. However, I would express some caution because we do need a separate application to actually get the ownership of the seabed, which we did express in the July meeting with an update from Policy & Resources' Al Brouard, who gave an update about the Bailiwick and territorial waters. However, we did ask the question, when is the next stage for getting the ownership of the seabed out to 12 miles? Unfortunately he was unable to give us a timeline but we did thank him for the consultation so far with the States of Alderney.

Another item that was on there was Home Affairs. That Committee has gone through a bit of a rocky road, but hopefully it is on the mend now. There have been two new people elected to the Home Affairs Committee.

Medevacs: Mr Roberts talked on the Medevac question that was asked to Heidi about the PSO out come and how that will be provided. Then we also had very good meetings, as I say – as Steve has said actually – with Policy & Resources, and we feel that we are getting some understanding. However, that does not actually mean anything; we have got to actually see some results from that. So I hope those talks carry on with Policy & Resources, and I would really encourage to take that opportunity up with the other Committee

I also had an Education meeting about the two school models and I have touched with Mr Gentle on that earlier today and on what those impacts may be.

The Road Tax and Planning requête and Liberation Holiday were the other items there, which do not affect Alderney that much. You could argue the Road Tax a little bit in the future, but the others do not.

I think that is about it, but I did write that detailed email and I am happy to answer any questions you may have.

The President: Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

935 Does any Member have a question for Mr Snowdon?
Mr McKinley.

Mr McKinley: One very brief one, sir: you mentioned the responsibility for the Harbour and the Breakwater – one thing that has been concerning the General Services Committee for some time is the handing back of Fort Grosnez to the States of Alderney. They promised to do it this year; they have not really done very much. There is an awful lot of rubbish and dilapidated cranes inside and outside causing eyesores, and really inhibiting our chances to get in there and to tidy the place up, and use it ourselves, possibly for the States Works Department, possibly for some other alternative.

945 But I do think Mr Brehaut and his team need to take strong note of our concerns about this.

Mr Snowdon: Sorry, Mr McKinley, was there a question there?

The President: Mr Snowdon, I will deal with that matter, thank you.

950

Mr McKinley: Really it was: are you dealing with Mr Brehaut and are we going to get him up here?

Mr Roberts: Should that not be for the Chairman of GSC to deal with, sorry sir.

955

The President: I am sorry, but this is not a free-for-all. Please take your seat.

Mr Roberts: I do apologise.

960 **Mr McKinley:** Yes, it is for the Chairman of the General Service Committee. That is why I am asking the question.

The President: I apologise.

965

Mr Roberts: Thank you.

The President: So you are asking the Chairman of –

970 **Mr McKinley:** I really am asking, has there been any progress down in Guernsey on handing back what relates to us? Has anybody talked to you about it? Have you heard – ?

Mr Roberts: We have not spoken about it, Mr McKinley, on that particular thing, but we thought, the Chairman of GSC, it would be your responsibility to actually liaise with Guernsey on that very subject. We can ask that question for you the next time we go; by all means we can.

975

Mr McKinley: We have done, but certain Members come up here with no notice at all, at lunchtime they get in touch with our States Works Department –

980 **The President:** Mr McKinley, with respect, I think you (**Mr McKinley:** Sorry.) are straying slightly now –

Mr McKinley: Thank you, sir. Sorry.

985 **The President:** I think probably that is the best move.

Mr McKinley: Thank you very much, sir, sorry about that.

Mr Roberts: Thank you, sir.

990 **The President:** Does any other Member have a question for Mr Snowdon?
Now we can move on to the next question, please, Madam Greffier.

Update on the swimming pool

The Deputy Greffier: Sir, I think we were just about to decide to take these one at a time.

The President: Yes please.

995

The Deputy Greffier: So this is a question for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee from Mr Snowdon for verbal response. The first part is:

Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain any updates with the swimming pool?

1000 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, as you all know, this project is a community project. It is not a States project. Having made a considerable grant to the project, the States is obviously keen to see it progress, and we had to provide an additional support to the trustees to help try and get the project back on track.

There are, however, a number of issues that only the trustees can make progress with. We will, however, continue to work with them and help wherever we can.

Thank you.

1005

The President: Does any Member have a question?
Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir, fellow colleagues.

1010

Thank you for your answer, Mr Dent, but I think it is nearly five years that we have not had a swimming pool for the children at the school, and with a £250,000 grant, I believe, from the States of Alderney, I think we really do need to push for some sort of timeline and all parties to work together to deliver something. We cannot be looking at another five years, can we?

1015

Mr Dent: Mr Snowdon, I have full sympathy with your comments and I note what you have said and we will continue to work with the trustees to what extent we can to help them.

I am frustrated by the situation.

The President: Thank you Mr Dent.

1020

Does any other Member have a question about the swimming pool?

New public service obligation process

The President: Madam Greffier, can we move on to the second part of the question?

The Deputy Greffier: Sir, the second part is:

Does the Policy and Finance Chairman have any news from the new public service obligation process?

The President: Mr Dent?

1025

Mr Dent: Thank you, Mr President, colleagues.

Tenders are currently being assessed and scored, and I cannot really say anything more than that at the moment because I am not involved in the assessment. I gave a timetable at the last States Meeting, and I have no reason to believe that that timetable has changed.

1030

We are, of course, very unhappy about the level of service we have been getting from Aurigny, and the service over the last two weeks has been particularly bad. I wrote to Aurigny and to the Chairman of the STSB, and Aurigny replied via the Chairman of STSB. They said simply this: 'We will plan to run our service as scheduled until the outcome of the PSO, and will do this as we always do, to the best of our abilities. We apologise for any inconvenience during the recent technical fault with one of our aircraft.' I think it was more than one.

1035

Finally, and as you know, we remain highly sceptical about the level of losses which Aurigny attribute to the Alderney routes, and intend to continue to press for full disclosure of costs in any discussion after the results of the current PSO tendering exercise are known. There may be difficult conversations ahead, particularly about how much the air routes are subsidised by and about who subsidises them. Such conversations, if we are to have confidence in the outcome, will obviously require transparency and an ability to question the costs.

1040

Thank you.

The President: Do you have a supplementary question, Mr Snowdon?

1045

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

Yes, I believe you said there are some bids. Can we have the number of bids that have been submitted? Do you know what the number of bids is? And also, are there any bids for the Medevacs separate or included in the commercial operations?

1050

Thank you.

Mr Dent: Mr Snowdon, I am sorry, I do not know the answers to your questions.

The President: Thank you.

1055

Does any other Member have a question for Mr Dent in relation to that matter?

Mr Roberts: Yes, sir.

The President: Mr Roberts.

1060

Mr Roberts: Mr Dent, what is the Chairman planning to do if the PSO fails and our airline is even more depleted?

The President: Mr Dent.

1065

Mr Dent: Mr Roberts, I think this is a difficult question because we are in negotiations with –

The President: Mr Dent, you are not required to answer the question.

1070

Mr Dent: I understand that, and I wish to explain why I am tardy about answering the question.

This is a difficult question to answer. We are in negotiations, obviously, with Guernsey. I think it would be foolish to disclose in a public place any Plan B or Plan C, and I would like at this point to say that any leaking of these things is not to our advantage.

1075 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.
Mr McKinley.

Mr McKinley: Sir, I do not have a question but I would –

1080 **The President:** No, Mr McKinley. It has to be a question, I am afraid.

Mr McKinley: I would just like to congratulate a member of the public – someone who is in the Public Gallery at the moment – for the work that she has done –

1085 **Mr Jean:** Put it in the form of ‘Would the Chairman agree with me?’

Mr McKinley: Alright. *(Laughter)* Thank you very much.

1090 Would the Chairman of Policy and Finance agree with me that we should congratulate Mrs Barbara Benfield for the considerable work that she has done in this particular respect? She sits in the Gallery now and I think that all States Members would congratulate her on **(A Member:** Hear hear.) what she has done.

1095 **Mr Dent:** Mr McKinley, I would like to congratulate Barbara, I would like to congratulate everybody that has written letters and lobbied on our behalf, and I would urge them to continue to do so, and thank you everyone who has done this.

The President: Thank you, Mr Dent.
Any more questions? Mr Dean.

1100 **Mr Dean:** Mr Dent, would you not agree with me that the PSO process that may or may not have Medevacs is of huge concern to the Island? It should be top of our list that the Medevacs are sorted out.

1105 I know the two Alderney reps have been asking questions in the Guernsey States, and it seems to be batted from one Committee to another, and we still do not have a proper answer for the people of this Island, and it is of paramount importance. So as a States, and as the Chairman, we must not lose sight of that. If we end up with a PSO coming back with no Medevac provision, we are going to be in a worse state than we are now.

Thank you.

1110 **The President:** Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Of course, I agree almost entirely with what you have said.

1115 I would only add that we have discussed this in this Chamber before, and indeed, as Mr Roberts pointed out during his discourse on what went on in the States, the States of Guernsey collectively accept that they are responsible for Medevacs, and that is not something I would wish to change. In fact, it is something that I would wish to emphasise as much as I can. It is for the States of Guernsey to get their act together and sort it out. And I hope that it will be sorted out. I have no reason to suppose that anyone will not do their bit.

1120 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Tax on CBD products

The President: Madam Greffier, the third question, please.

The Deputy Greffier: Yes, sir:

Can the Chairman explain what tax is placed on CBD products regarding hemp and cannabis produced in the Bailiwick?

The President: Mr Dent.

1125

Mr Dent: Mr President.

I have discovered, recently in fact, that the States of Guernsey is already imposing a 20% tax on the profits of all businesses involved with the cultivation and production of cannabis-based products, and that this tax applies in both Guernsey and Alderney.

1130

As I think you are aware, Alderney is currently exploring its own ways to benefit financially and when we have a single property tax, one method could be to introduce new categories. This is, however, something we would have to explore with the businesses setting up here, and would of course have to come before this Chamber before it was approved.

Thank you.

1135

The President: Mr Snowdon, do you have a supplementary question?

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

1140

Just taking a point, Mr Dent, would that not make us more expensive than Guernsey, and Guernsey would be more attractive to those companies if we put another tax on top? I do agree that we definitely need to make some money, but I just wonder how we get the attraction for Alderney.

The President: Mr Dent.

1145

Mr Dent: Mr Snowdon, I think your analysis is of course correct, but I would like to say that I think these companies look at the property tax regime in Alderney as particularly benign – this is Alderney and Guernsey as well – and compared to the UK and other jurisdictions where they are growing it, we look a pretty good place to come.

1150

Thank you.

The President: Thank you, Mr Dent.

Does any other Member have a question for Mr Dent?

Thank you, Mr Dent.

Update on the Nunnery

1155

The President: Can we now move on please, Madam Greffier, to Question 4?

The Deputy Greffier: Sir, that is from Mr Snowdon to the Chairman of the General Services Committee for verbal response:

Could the General Services Committee Chairman please explain what is happening with the Nunnery?

The President: Mr McKinley.

1160 **Mr McKinley:** Thank you, sir.

Thank you, Mr Snowdon, for your question.

The lease of the Nunnery was surrendered by the Alderney Wildlife Trust in March this year. Now the building was returned to the States. Discussions have been held with the Alderney Wildlife Trust, the Alderney Bird Observatory and the Alderney Society, to achieve two things:
1165 firstly, to consider how the work of the Alderney Bird Observatory could be continued, so that we continue to benefit from the work it does and the visitors it brings to the Island in the shoulder months; and secondly, to understand how best we could open up the Nunnery site to the public for its enjoyment and interpretation.

I am pleased to say that we have made progress on both of these fronts, although there is still much to do. A new Alderney Bird Observatory organisation has been established, and its business plan has been reviewed by an independent expert. General Services Committee has agreed to support this organisation in its first year, with a similar package of support to the one provided last year to the Alderney Wildlife Trust.
1170

We will support the cost of the bird warden activity while the organisation is established and the income stream from the hostel accommodation is built up. Thereafter, we hope the ABO will be self-sustaining. The ABO will have, at present in the Nunnery, the hostel accommodation and the bird ringing. It will also have one single accommodation for the alternate birdwatcher or bird-ringer. But it is not exclusive use to the ABO. There is also now a private tenant on site in one of the flats, and this is generating rent income that will help with the sustainability of the Nunnery in the longer term.
1175

In terms of public access, we have now ensured the building is open to the public, the grounds are being maintained by the States' Works Agricultural Team, and we are working with the Alderney Society to develop some interpretation materials which will help visitors in the future. There is further work to be done in terms of making the site safe and accessible, and we are in discussions with Jason Monaghan to ensure that we have the best heritage advice in doing this. Actually we have had a couple of visitors this last week doing just that.
1180

So in summary, the Nunnery now houses the hostel associated with the ABO, a private tenant, and is open to the public and there is more work in progress around its future interpretation and improved access.
1185

1190 **The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley.
Mr Snowdon, do you have a supplementary question?

Mr Snowdon: I do, thank you, sir.

1195 Where to start with this one? Your predecessor – there were quite a lot of concerns with the Nunnery of your predecessor because of no consultation with the accommodation sector. I sincerely hope that the new GSC Committee has had consultation with the accommodation sector before you entered into any agreement, because it is important that all their views and feedback are heard.

1200 I would also like to say, are there criteria which specifies that the people staying there are connected to wildlife, heritage and I do not know if it was environmental groups only? That was a resolution of P&F a couple of years ago when I pushed for it when there were quite a few issues, and I just hope that you can give me some reassurance on those points.

Thank you.
1205

The President: Mr McKinley.

Mr McKinley: You are quite correct, there have been some questions, particularly this last week actually, questioning the General Services Committee on what the prices were, basically, for the accommodation down there, and the effect that that accommodation was having on other people who rent their rooms out.
1210

1215 The answer is that the prices have gone up to almost the same price as now private owners. The reason is it kept down slightly is that it is a ten-man dormitory, and a lot of people do not want to sleep with nine other people, basically. They want private accommodation. I am not sure I would like to sleep with nine other people –

The President: Mr McKinley, please.

1220 **Mr McKinley:** And there are discussions with the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development is meeting with the accommodation people, I think in the next week or so –

A Member: A couple of them tomorrow.

1225 **Mr McKinley:** Yes. So we are steadily making progress.

The President: Thank you, Mr McKinley.
Does any other Member have a question for Mr McKinley about the Nunnery?

Update on extending Alderney's territorial waters

The President: Madam Greffier, may we move to the final question?

1230 **The Deputy Greffier:** Yes sir.

That is from Mr Snowdon to the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee for verbal response:

Can the Chairman of P&F provide an update on the moves to extend our territorial waters from three nautical miles to 12?

1235 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, have events taken over that question? You did say earlier that that Law had come into law on the 23rd?

Mr Snowdon: No, I think Mr Dent has a reply he would like to read out, and I think that reply probably takes into consideration the 23rd.

1240 **The President:** Okay, thank you, Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Thank you for indulging me; there is something I would like to end ...

1245 But I would like to just go over a few points beforehand, and as Mr Snowdon has pointed out, yesterday on 23rd July, all of the Bailiwick of Guernsey's territorial seas were increased. The jurisdictions of Alderney, Guernsey and Sark now have rights and control over substantial areas of water, bringing us into line with international norms.

As you know, previously the limit on our territorial seas extended to just three nautical miles from our coast. The new 12-mile limit is the maximum permissible under international law.

1250 I would note that our territorial sea extends to less than 12 nautical miles wherever the distance between the coastlines of the Bailiwick and the coastlines of other territories is less than 24 miles. That is to say between ourselves and France mainly.

The extension gives us greater control over activities in the three to 12 nautical mile area, as we now have all of the legislative competence and corresponding law enforcement powers in this area. The extension does not increase the number and type of responsibilities we and others have. Existing search and rescue regional operational arrangements and existing pollution

1255 incident plans are unaffected. We have recognised our historic and continuing links with our neighbours, and we will continue these good neighbour policies.

The extension is particularly important for us if and when the UK exits the EU. As a result of this extension, there is an automatic extension of applicable Bailiwick legislation in the 12 nautical mile limit. That is with the exception of some fishing legislation. Fishing access in our
1260 and in the wider Bailiwick waters from nought to 12 nautical miles remains unchanged. This is because of the UK's participation in the London Fisheries Convention, which will continue until the UK ceases to be a member of the European Union.

The Bailiwick Fisheries Management regime will also remain the same as it was before extension and until any new regime is subsequently agreed between the three Bailiwick
1265 authorities.

Mr Snowdon mentioned the ownership of the seabed. Now, this is something rather unique that Alderney has. So it is not something that Guernsey has, it does not actually own the territory to three miles – as far as I am aware; you may correct me if I am wrong. I think it would therefore be up to Alderney to press the case, should it wish to have this additional ownership,
1270 but I do not think it brings with it any substantial increase in the things we can do with the water.

I will leave it with that for the moment. Thank you.

The President: Mr Snowdon.

1275

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

Yes, I was just going to say on the seabed thing, my sort of understanding is: I am not quite sure if that is going to be a joint application with Sark, Alderney and Guernsey for the ownership of the seabed. But whether we do it privately without the others of the Bailiwick altogether, I
1280 think it is very important for a renewable energy aspect, mineral exploitation, whatever we want to do, to get that, and just to say that we have got – I think you would agree with me – that we have got some reassurance over how deep as well.

The President: Mr Dent.

1285

Mr Dent: I have noted the reassurance we have over pollution incident plans. I would just reiterate what I just said about the ownership. I do not believe that Guernsey will be making an application. I may be wrong, but I think we gain with the present extension of the territorial limits all that we would ever really need under international law – the control, the waters and
1290 what is on the seabed.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Roberts.

1295

Mr Roberts: Yes please, sir.

Would Mr Dent not agree actually that the seabed is very important to us with mineral rights and also possible tidal power turbines going on the seabed?

The President: Mr Dent.

1300

Mr Dent: Mr Roberts, I think you will find that we gain those rights with the extension of the territorial waters –

Mr Roberts: With the seabed?

1305

Mr Dent: It is *ownership* of the seabed, which is a technical matter, separate. We would be, I think, the only territory in the world that actually has ownership over the ... that I am aware of.

The President: Does any other Member have a question?

1310 Mr Dean.

Mr Dean: Mr President, fellow colleagues, Mr Dent, now the Bailiwick extension has taken place, it is important that we do not lose sight that the median lines have now not been drawn for Alderney. It was a question that came up when it was going through and the advice that

1315 came back was that it should go through as a Bailiwick.

Now it has gone through as a Bailiwick, can you ensure that letters will be written to make sure that Alderney's median lines are now drawn?

Thank you.

1320 **The President:** Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Mr Dean, this is a matter which has been raised a number of times at Bailiwick Council meetings and there is a process agreed that this will be something which will happen in due course.

1325

The President: Thank you, Mr Dent.

Mr McKinley, did you – ? (*Interjection by Mr McKinley*) Please.

Mr McKinley: Could I ask Mr Dent please: the 12-mile limit includes, for us, two very important areas – the shell bank and also the south-west Casquets – which presently, or before the extension of the 12 mile limit were very popular fishing sites for the Guernsey fishermen. I believe also that the Guernsey States wish to put a cable from Guernsey to France which will go across the shell bank. Whether it will go across our part – we own about 90% of the shell bank, and they own the little bit to the south.

1330

So that is one concern, and the other concern – or the other explanation really – is the 12-mile limit between here and France of course cannot be 12 miles because it would end up in France, so presumably it is half the distance between us and France.

1335

If you could just clarify that, sir.

1340 **The President:** Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Mr McKinley I hoped I had made it clear that our territorial sea extends to less than 12 nautical miles where the distance between the coastlines of the Bailiwick and the coastlines of other territories is less than 24 nautical miles. So yes, we draw a line midway between us, and we have to establish the coordinates precisely with the French. But at the moment we have it under international law to that line, and I think we know fairly accurately where it is.

1345

The President: Thank you very much, Mr Dent.

Anybody else? I think that concludes the Items –

1350

The Deputy Greffier: Can I just ask Mr Jean, sir, to confirm from the Convener's point of view, that there were no comments in relation to Item III?

Mr Jean: Hang on a minute ... (*Laughter*)

1355

No. (*Laughter*)

The President: Thank you, Mr Jean. (*Interjections*)

Then, other than to thank you all for your forbearance for my first attempt, I would now ask Madam Greffier to close the meeting.

1360

The Deputy Greffier: Sir.

PRAYERS

The Deputy Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 7.04 p.m.