



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 11th December 2019**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 7, No. 10**

**Present:**

**Mr William Tate, President**

**Members**

Ms Annie Burgess

Mr Mike Dean

Mr James Dent

Mr David Earl

Mr Kevin Gentle

Mr Christian Harris

Mr Louis Jean

Mr Graham McKinley

Mr Alexander Snowdon

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr Jonathan Anderson

## Business transacted

Alderney Ambulance Service – Statement .....	5
Convener’s Report of the People’s Meeting held on 4th December 2019 .....	6
<b>Billet d’État for Wednesday 11th December 2019 .....</b>	<b>6</b>
I. Annual Reports of States Committees 2019 .....	6
(i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee.....	7
(ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee.....	14
(iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee .....	17
II. The Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019 – Item approved.....	25
III. Occupiers Rates 2020 – Item approved.....	26
IV. Proposed Increase in Water Rates – Item approved .....	29
V. The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019 – Item approved .....	31
VI. Questions and Reports – Questions for verbal reply .....	33
Creating a healthy economy for 20-40 age group .....	34
Date of a public workshop following Vision workshop with States Members .....	37
Age group with greatest increase in population.....	38
Introduction of clear set of energy policies .....	39
Update on PSO process.....	41
Developments with the Alderney Ambulance Service.....	43
Summary of activities in States of Guernsey since last States of Alderney meeting .....	45
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 7.48 p.m. ....</i>	<i>47</i>

*PAGE DELIBERATELY LEFT BLANK*

# States of Alderney

*The States met at 5.30 p.m.*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

## PRAYERS

*The Greffier*

**The President:** Mr Greffier, will you please take the roll call and announce any apologies.

## ROLL CALL

*The Greffier*

5 **The Greffier:** I understand Mr Roberts may be attending late this evening, sir.  
Sir, that is nine Members present.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Greffier.

## Alderney Ambulance Service – Statement

10 **The President:** At this point, before I ask the Convener for his report, I would like to read a  
Statement which has been published this afternoon by the States of Alderney, and the  
Statement reads as follows:

The States of Alderney have received notification from the board of the Alderney Ambulance Service Ltd that it is no longer able to provide a safe and sustainable ambulance service for Alderney.

The decision of the Board follows on from a Review of the Ambulance Service commissioned jointly by the AAS Ltd and the States of Alderney carried out by Richard Webber. The States of Alderney has expressed its serious concerns about the issues identified in the review. It sets out a number of findings about the service including:

- There are a number of pieces of life-saving equipment which do not work
- Some equipment has never been serviced or is past its recommended service date
- Many consumables are past their expiry date
- There is no current Medical Director in place with the effect that there are no governance arrangements for the use of medicines
- Equipment is in use which is beyond the scope of practice of an Ambulance Technician
- The clinical assessment of patients is inadequate and patients are being left without a safe clinical rationale

The States of Alderney consider that this situation is unacceptable and that these issues are of the highest importance in ensuring the safety of the Island. In view of the decision of the Alderney Ambulance Service Ltd, the States is now taking the following urgent steps:

(1) Engagement with the St John's Ambulance in Guernsey and with other key stakeholders to seek their assistance in helping to put a safe and viable ambulance service in place for the short term.

(2) Establishing a model for a new ambulance service for Alderney which would have appropriate clinical and professional governance and could be managed in parallel with the States of Alderney Fire Service.

(3) Inviting volunteers who wish to serve the community in providing an ambulance service to contact the States of Alderney.

### **Convener's Report of the People's Meeting held on 4th December 2019**

**The President:** Mr Dean, you convened the People's Meeting, could you give us, please, the numbers and the makeup?

15

**Mr Dean:** I did, sir.

I convened the People's Meeting on 4th December at the Island Hall at seven o'clock. I was the Convener. I was assisted by the Chief Executive and the Acting Head of Finance. There were seven States Members present, excluding myself, the President, the Minute Secretary, 20 members of the public and four press. Apologies were given for Mr Earl and Mr Gentle.

20

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dean.

## **Billet d'État for Wednesday 11th December 2019**

### **I. Annual Reports of States Committees 2019**

*Item I.*

*(i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee;*

*(ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee; and*

*(iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee.*

**The President:** Mr Greffier, can we now then move to Item I on the Billet?

25

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item I this evening is the Annual Reports of States Committees for 2019. On 4th May 1977, the States resolved to instruct all Committees to prepare an annual report, with that report to be debated at the December States Meeting. And it follows, sir, the Reports from the various Committees.

30

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Dean, were there any observations about Item I?

**Mr Dean:** There were, sir.

35 It was noted there has been no perceivable progress with Fort Tourgis. Mr Dent advised that the States had a verbal guarantee from the Dutch government. However, this is to be provided in written form and the due diligence process is being followed.

40 There was also a question on governance reform. It was noted that the Good Governance Group is still ongoing and will be engaging with the public before reporting back to P&F and then the full States.

It was asked if there is any date for a public presentation regarding the PPA with AEL and Atlantis. The Convener advised that this would be for AEL and Atlantis to organise.

It was noted that the States are in the process of discussing potential events and commemorative celebrations for the 75th anniversary of VE Day and Homecoming Day in 2020.

45 A comment was made that the approval of capital projects under £150,000 being delegated to the Policy and Finance Committee shows no transparency, as items under this value will not be on the Billet to be debated in the full States.

It was also noted that recently the States had met with Swimming Pool Trustees. Mr Snowdon advised that the Education Department are aware of the issues.

50 A query was made regarding the audit of the coin contract. The Convener advised that this is a confidential contract and this will be put through the tender process when the contract is due for renewal to ensure the States are getting the best possible deal.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dean.

#### (i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee

55 **The President:** Now Mr Dent, I understand you wish to propose this Item?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, yes I do.

**The President:** And Mr Earl, in due course you will second it?

60

**Mr Earl:** Indeed.

**The President:** Thank you. Would you like to move your Proposition please, Mr Dent?

65 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, before I begin, may I first ask if you wish me to read the Report in full? In previous years your predecessor suggested this was unnecessary and that I should merely request the text is noted in the deliberations. I would like to know your own views on this matter and to confirm that I am very happy and will be pleased to read the Report in full.

70 **The President:** Well, it is your Report Mr Dent. You make that decision.

**Mr Dent:** Thank you very much. I will read the Report in full.

75 Before doing that, I will ask you to note that the Report is in two sections. The first relates to the activities of the main Policy and Finance Committee and the second to the activities of the Finance Sub-Committee, and I will read both sections.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

**Mr Dent:** Mr President.

80 The year has been dominated by efforts to protect our connectivity. At the beginning of the year we won a hard battle to ensure that the rehabilitation of our runway went ahead as planned. The months following have been dominated by the Public Service Obligation contracts for our air links and efforts to ensure that our Island was properly protected. These efforts continued throughout the year. We have also had preliminary talks about a review of the 1948 Agreement. As of today we have, however, still to agree a scope for this work.

85 On the wider front, we have been dealing with the outwash from Brexit and all the uncertainties that this has created. This has taken up much time. It has also taken up much of our civil servants' time, including the Law Officers who might otherwise have been progressing a number of pressing legislative concerns – and here I will mention just one, our nascent Partnership Law.

90 One useful spin-off has, however, been the increase in the limits to our territorial waters from 3 to 12 miles and the clear understanding that Alderney and Guernsey – and indeed Sark – all have the right to manage their marine resources in a manner that best benefits each jurisdiction.

95 There have been a number of good news stories, and I will highlight just a few. Improvements in our economy as measured by population, numbers of people in work and numbers of businesses established. On the financial side, through good housekeeping, we have balanced our books and even produced a small surplus. The construction and housing sectors are doing well. We have established a nascent cannabis/cannabis oil industry. We are moving forward with plans for the extension of our Connaught Care Home. We have agreed to implement a minimum wage and legislation to mitigate discrimination against those with disabilities. Alderney Electricity Ltd has agreed heads of terms with SIMEC Atlantis Energy for a power purchase agreement that would see Alderney connected to France by an electric power cable.

100 We have reviewed our governance and agreed to move towards a system that better separates our legislative and executive functions and we have a new Code of Conduct for our Members that reflects Commonwealth parliamentary standards.

105 We have hosted a number of very successful international festivals. These have included the Wilder Island and Blue Islands Summit that resulted in the signing of the Blue Islands Charter. But there have also been our annual Literary, Performing Arts and Chamber Music Festivals, the Henry Euler Memorial Trust Symposium, the Annual Fly-In and Air Races, the Hill Climb, golf tournaments and of course the perennial Alderney Week. A growing number of visitors are arriving to observe our birds and wildlife, and the built heritage. A new boutique hotel, the Blonde Hedgehog, has opened.

110 The dig on Longis Common near to the Nunnery revealed extraordinary finds about our Roman and pre-Roman past and there is clearly much scope for ongoing work that can add to attractiveness of our Island as a visitor destination. We are working on plans to exploit this.

115 We continue to monitor developments in the tidal energy market and are watching particularly closely developments in the Raz Blanchard on the French side of the Alderney Race. We have continued on the work necessary to repatriate all property taxes and look forward to a time when we will be able to set them in a manner that most suits our economy. Finally, the Little Ferry has had another successful year. This service is, as you know, subsidised by the States of Alderney. We continue to work with those who redevelop Fort Tourgis. Dutch government guarantees remain on the table.

120 I will now move to the Finance Sub-Committee Annual Report. The Finance Committee's work is dominated each year by monitoring current budget performance, reviewing the annual accounts and setting the Budget for the forthcoming year. Revenue support from Guernsey this year was maintained at the same level as in 2018 and we are budgeting an under-spend of £72,000 compared to the original budget forecast of £19,000 on our revenue accounts. The final accounts for 2018 also reported an under-spend when finalised during the year. This is due to a number of variations from expenditure and income forecasts, but also reflects the measures

130



undertaken to improve financial stewardship and budget management which have contributed to better prioritisation and some efficiency savings.

Other matters of note in this year's budget were some minor adjustments to Occupier's Rates to take account of inflation and also to reflect Alderney's economic and other priorities. 135 This should be the last year that Occupier's Rates will be set before the Single Property Tax is introduced from 2021.

A small, above-inflation increase in water rates was again agreed. Unlike most other States of Alderney businesses or enterprises supported – albeit only partially – by States of Alderney grants, the Water Board has little capital reserves. Therefore it was deemed appropriate to 140 increase the charges by a rate just a little over inflation so that the capital reserve could, over time, develop.

As reported in previous years, we hold adequate capital reserves assisted by receipts from the Alderney Gambling Control Commission. Additional staff resources have been allocated to the capital programme in 2019, in order to improve programme and project management. As a 145 result, much of the 2018 backlog has been addressed, some projects have been moved into subsequent years or removed altogether, resulting in a more realistic and deliverable programme.

The Committee considered and recommended changes to the Financial Rules of capital projects this year, which provided for approval of capital projects under £150,000 to be 150 delegated to the Policy and Finance Committee.

Discussions between the States of Alderney and the States of Guernsey reached agreement this year that the new single Property Tax will be introduced in Alderney from 1st January 2021, which will replace the current Occupier's Rates. The States of Guernsey further agreed that following implementation of the new tax, it will not charge Tax on Real Property in Alderney. 155 Work is also underway to enable the States of Alderney to set its own rates for Fuel Duty and Document Duty from 2021. These measures will significantly reduce the financial dependency on the States of Guernsey and provide opportunities for greater freedom and flexibility in expenditure on delivering Alderney services.

The Committee has again been mindful of its role in the allocation of grants. After a review of 160 current procedures and policies, it was agreed to introduce a new policy with standard criteria to provide greater clarity to grant recipients as well as improving accountability. The States of Alderney will continue to support the local voluntary and community sector by the award of grants to organisations or through a contribution to charitable events.

The Swimming Pool: the Committee remains supportive of the project and continues to work 165 with the trustees on a solution that will be agreeable to all stakeholders. The Committee recognises the public desire to complete the pool and the unsatisfactory nature of the present position which has sadly not improved since last year.

Coins and Stamps: while these are a Committee responsibility, the Committee works within the framework of a contract and agreement with the Commonwealth Mint and Guernsey Post. It 170 should be noted that the contract with the Commonwealth Mint is producing substantially more revenue than that of the previous contract with the Royal Mint.

Finally, changes to the States' Treasury structure at the start of the year have been managed effectively. Improvements have been implemented and the transition has been seamless. We 175 continue to liaise with the States of Guernsey Treasury to discuss what changes could be introduced to improve the function further.

Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you. Do you have anything to add to that, Mr Earl?

180 **Mr Earl:** Mr President, fellow States Members, I have got nothing to add to that erudite report from Mr Dent.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Would any Member care to address the States?  
Mr Snowdon.

185

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues.

I would just like to go through a few areas in the Report. You talk about the seabed – which is fantastic – going out to 12 mile limit. But are we still making sure that we are actually going to get the ownership of the seabed as well? I do not know when that is going to take place, because I think Sark and Guernsey are trying to work towards it. So I would like to know when that is happening.

190

You mentioned in the Report about hemp and cannabis. From my understanding, there is a 20% corporation tax which unfortunately goes to Guernsey. However, what financial contribution are we looking at getting in Alderney? I think you might have touched on, somewhere else, that TRP increase or something for those operators. But I would like some clarification on that if that is okay.

195

You also touch upon the guarantees from the Dutch government. I have not actually seen them, so I would like to see those in writing. If you could share that with the P&F Committee I would be most grateful. It would be very good.

200

And then I have touched on this in the Chamber before: a P&F plan. Now, Policy and Resources have got working streams of what they are actually doing, timelines and what they are hopefully implementing. I would like to actually see something from our P&F about, what are all of the different aspects we are working on, the timelines, and how the Civil Service are doing implementing that? I am well aware that we did pass that resolution, quite recently, to bring back the traffic light system, which would show us the different lights and what we are trying to achieve with P&F. But I would just like to see that that would follow up sometime.

205

I suppose I should address some Finance Committee questions to Mr Dent as well, seeing that he did that the Report. You are touching on capital projects, and I think the GSC has £5.5 million of capital projects, hopefully, to be implemented. I would just like to know, can you let me know what the additional cost is? In the Report it says additional staff for capital projects. I was just wondering what that cost was, if you could let me know what that was.

210

And then, I know this Chamber did agree to it, but I am still unhappy with £150,000 being passed, potentially, at P&F and not coming into this Chamber where it can be debated and we can thrash it out and the public can see how we are spending that public money. So I am just a little bit concerned – that is something that this Chamber has agreed on – about that matter.

215

Finally, just touching on the Swimming Pool, and I know you have highlighted it in your report – I am grateful for that – but I would just like to say, the States of Alderney put £250,000 into that Swimming Pool. I would have thought we have got some obligation to see where that money was and that it was spent wisely. I mean it is a hell of an investment into that pool, I would just like to get some clarification. We do not seem to talk about that £250,000 much, but I would just like to know, what are we actually doing to make sure that money got spent wisely or any action that might be taken? Because it is essential (1) that the children have a swimming pool and (2) if there can be, which you might not be able to do, some sort of community option in there as well. So I would just like some clarification on those points.

220

Thank you, Mr Dent.

225

**The President:** Would any other Member wish to address the States? Mr McKinley.  
I am sorry, Mr Jean, I did not –

230

**Mr Jean:** No, no, it is okay. (*Interjection by Mr McKinley*) Okay, thank you, that is very kind.  
Could I just ask a question first? Can you tell me, are we addressing both the Finance Report and ... together?

**The President:** Yes.

235 **Mr Jean:** And the Sub-Finance?

**The President:** Yes.

**Mr Jean:** Thank you. That helps me, thank you very much.

240 I am concerned, first of all, about the outwash from Brexit and I would like the Chairman to enlarge a little on that statement, because he seems to mention our nascent projects, like the Partnership Law. I think we should have put more effort into the Partnership Law and less into Brexit. That is the point I want to make.

245 As regards our territorial waters from three to 12 miles, we know that we have it at the three-mile limit. At the 12-mile limit, I do not think we will ever own the seabed. But the point is, for me, should we be embarking on a Marine Management Plan for that area of waters, when we know that there is still going to have to the Guernsey boats coming up and down through our waters, which we cannot control, and also, we already know that we are probably going to be giving some grandfather rights to boats in the French area and we have to do that? So then, what do we have to manage? Probably, I think, not a great deal, except up near our shore, which our own fishermen do a very good job of anyway, because they have now switched, in the main, to smaller boats because of the expense of running the bigger ones – the fuel, and they have to go off-Island to buy it.

We have reviewed our Governance and [we are moving] towards a system that better separates our legislative and executive functions ...

255 I was not aware of that – that we have agreed to it. What I believe that we agreed to, and I would like you to clarify it, is to draw up the necessary legislation. Is that correct?

We continue to work with those who redevelop Fort Tourgis – Dutch Government guarantees remain on the table.

260 I would like to reiterate Mr Snowdon's point, I have never seen the guarantees. And I would also like to say this: I drew attention, some time ago, to my unhappiness at what was done regarding the building fees and I felt it was a pretty nasty thing to do to a delicate situation where we are trying to get that Fort done up. Recently I was told that that has been given to the States in the form of shares and they will not be taking it – they will not be taking the planning fee itself. I still think that is horrible – absolutely ghastly.

... Guernsey this year was maintained at the same level as in 2018 and we are budgeting an under-spend of £72k compared to the original budget forecast of £19k on our revenue accounts. The final accounts for 2018 also reported an under-spend when finalised during the year.

I am going to come to that a little later on. I am going to come back to that.

This is due to a number of variations from expenditure and income forecasts but also reflects the measures undertaken to improve financial stewardship and budget management ...

So, as I said earlier, there are things here, without doubt, that people should be congratulated, and we are very pleased, about – *very* pleased.

265 Then we go to the Water Board and we talk about:

... has little capital reserves ... deemed appropriate to increase the charges by a rate ...

And later on we talk, again, of the fact that the Water Board continually has to have capital. The Water Board, as far as I am concerned, is entitled to capital, and to use that as an excuse to raise the rates, to me it does not sit well – not to me. And at a time when people could do with a rest.

The Committee considered and recommended changes to the Financial Rules of capital projects ...

270 Now, here again, I agree with Mr Snowdon.

... under £150,000 to be delegated to the Policy and Finance Committee.

Some of these items, we must be aware – it is important and perhaps we should review this again – must come to the States. It is important to keep stuff coming onto the billet. It is healthy, it is better for the public and this is the right place – where we should be debating and deciding.

275 One of the things that concerns me as well, is the States of Alderney is setting its own rates for Fuel Duty and Document Duty. I do not want to confuse the two, so I am going to talk to you first of all, if I may, about Document Duty and Congé, which I have now found out are going to be merged together. But it means that, unlike Guernsey, it is going to be more expensive because we are going to keep both the Document Duty, which is paid to Guernsey, and the Congé.

280 When we step out of the Guernsey footprint, in terms of tax, we do not do this place any favours. We effectively put a brake and a retardant on the property market and we are taking a bigger wedge than Guernsey does, because we are taking their Document Duty, which at the moment is paid to Guernsey, but we are also taking our Congé, which I have never been able to get the States to see is wrong. We should not be taking two land sale and property taxes. It is  
285 wrong. So there is another one there that I want to touch on.

I am also concerned about the rates for Fuel Duty. I always have been. And eventually we are probably – and I told you this before we were told by AEL – going to eventually, in the fullness of time, look for other ways of bringing in our oil. When we do that, there are ways that we can save money for this Island and make it easier for people to heat their homes and less expensive,  
290 for the time-being, whilst the use of oil still exists and people run out their existing systems. I think that is very important. I think the States has a focal and a very important role in trying to maintain the most reasonable cost of living standards for its population. And on oil, I think we have failed our population completely. I really do. I think we are paying far too much for our oil and fuel.

Swimming Pool – [we remain] supportive of the project ...

295 But I want to jog it free. We have got to talk to the trustees and even if we can get them to come and talk to us, we have got to jog it free. It cannot go on like this. It is not fair on the School, and whatever anybody says, the School have been brilliant. They have been very patient about all of this and it is a real pity, to my mind, that we ever allowed the public in on that site. I am sorry to say it, but there we are. It should have been the site on the corner at The  
300 Serpentine, away from the School, where the School could have continued to use its pool and eventually, if this is going to be a 10-year project or however many years it is going to be, the transition then could have taken place to use the community pool under The Serpentine. Wrong move.

I think I may have said enough on the Finance.

305 Now, I pointed out earlier on, at the October States Meeting when the Budget for 2020 was debated ... Oh, well that is coming up later, so I think I will talk to you in a while about that.

Thank you very much, sir –

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

310 **Mr Jean:** – for your indulgence – very grateful.

**The President:** Thank you. Mr McKinley? (**Mr McKinley:** I won't ...) Oh, okay.  
Mr Dean.

315 **Mr Dean:** Sir, fellow colleagues.

320 Yes, like Mr Snowdon and Mr Jean, I would just like to touch on the extension of the seabed. Obviously we were looking at extending that out to 12 miles, which has now been done, but I am just conscious of the fact the median lines have still not been drawn up between ourselves and Guernsey. I would not like that to fall down in between the cracks and not getting done. So I would like that to be actioned, so we have actually got a report on that so we know what is actually happening.

325 Also the Tourgis: like my colleagues have also mentioned, we do have a Tourgis working group, which Mr Dent, Ms Burgess and Mr Harris are on. Obviously, due diligence has been ongoing. That has been ongoing for 18 months. I appreciate it is not applying for a small mortgage, so lots of checks and that have to be done. But if the company cannot actually come up with the money to get this done, how long are the States prepared for this to go on? If it cannot be done, maybe it is time the States went out and asked for expressions of interest, so we actually can get on and do something with Fort Tourgis.

330 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

335 Would any other Member wish to address the States? Mr Dent, would you wish to exercise your right of reply Mr Dent?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, yes, thank you.

340 I think we have dealt with a number of these points in other sessions and in other places, but let me go over them, if I may. Ownership of the seabed: we have, I think, asked for legal advice as to what this would entail and what additional rights we would get should we obtain it. My own understanding at the moment is that it would cut out the middleman, that is to say the Crown, but in fact, we have, I think, basically got as many rights as we are going to get. But I think that has to be confirmed by the Law Officers. I do not want to prejudice their opinion on that matter.

345 Hemp: 20% corporation tax; certainly we have talked about that in this forum, and Guernsey can obviously impose whatever rates of corporation tax it chooses and it has chosen to become 20%. That is, sadly, outside our remit. How are we going to benefit? I think we talked about that: the most obvious solution is via our property taxes. I am obviously loath to raise local taxes unnecessarily, but I think our property taxes are so much lower than, for example, UK taxes and I think those who have been investing in the cannabis/hemp industry have been well aware that this possibly something that will come about in the future.

350 Fort Tourgis: he would like to see the guarantees – the written ones. I can assure you that so would I. So we are in the same boat. *(Laughter)* I too have been struggling with this for 18 months and I take Mr Dean's point, and I think we mentioned it in the People's Meeting too. We have to draw a line at some point. But anyway, we are where we are at the moment. Let's see where it goes.

355 The P&F plan: I think we touched on that. I will be referring to that matter in an answer to one of Mr Snowdon's later question, so if I could reserve my right to speak on that matter without duplicating things I would appreciate it. But I think the one thing I will note at this point is that we do not have huge human resources, do we, Mr Snowdon? And the Civil Service is not as large as Guernsey's. So doing these things is a bit of an effort, especially if we do not want to employ consultants.

360 Additional costs for staff: I am sorry, I cannot give you that figure, but maybe my colleague, the Chairman of Finance has some figure that, if he cannot give you today, he will give you some other time.

365 £150,000 for approval in this Chamber: we did debate it here and Mr Jean made the point that he wanted to see these things debated in this Chamber. Well, we did debate it, and that was a decision we came to.

370 The Swimming Pool – £250,000: we have been working with the Trustees, as you well know, and at the moment the ball is in the Trustees' court. I would love to progress it as soon as is possible and I believe that the Education Department and the rest are talking to Mr Gentle, and in due course, perhaps in another session on this, you could ask Mr Gentle a question and he might be able to help you further.

375 Mr Jean, you said, less on Brexit and more on Partnership Law. I find myself agreeing with you 100% on this Mr Jean, because the Partnership Law has been a baby that I have been trying to push for some time and Brexit has been a frustration that has made us go round and round in circles.

380 Should we embark on a marine master plan? Well, we have a group that have been looking at the marine master plan, I do not want to speak for them. I think Mr McKinley is the representative on that. But again, maybe in another States Meeting you could ask for an update on that. For the moment though, I would say maybe we need to rethink how we look at environmental matters in the whole, but this is a matter obviously for the States at a later date. But we seem to be getting a bit fragmented in our approach to environmental issues. There are different committees looking at different aspects, including sub-committees. Maybe it is time we thought about it and put it all in one greater package. That is my view, obviously it is going to be debated in a further committee at the time.

385 Building fees: well, I think that is a matter for BDCC, I am sorry.

390 The Water Board: saying they should be entitled to capital. Absolutely! But the way we are doing it, by building up reserves, is ensuring that it does not become lumpy and that this entitlement to capital is a smooth demand on the taxpayer, rather than a lumpy one. So I think that that is a good way of doing it.

395 Document Duty and Congé: if they are combined and they come to the States of Alderney, it will, of course, be for ourselves to decide on the rates. That is yet another thing that is useful to have within our grasp rather than giving to Guernsey's grasp. There is absolutely no reason why they would be an increased demand financially on people. It is a bit like combining the property taxes into one, the sum total ... It should be a zero-sum game.

I think that is all the points that were raised, I apologise if I have missed anything out.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

## (ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee

400 **The President:** Now, can we move on to part (ii) of Item I, which is the Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee. I understand, Mr Dean, you wish to propose this Item?

405 **Mr Dean:** I do sir, would you like the Convener's report first?

**The President:** Every time. Every time.

410 **Mr Dean:** The Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee was presented, the Convener advised of the current appeals process, how that is not satisfactory, and then the process that the Committee will need to go through to change it. There were no other questions on the Report, sir.

**The President:** Thank you for your guidance. And you still are proposing this Item?

415 **Mr Dean:** Yes sir. I would like to propose the 2019 Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee. Like my colleague Mr Dent I would like to read the Report.

For 2019 the Committee dealt with 117 planning applications. That total included the planning meeting held on 28th November 2019. In the corresponding previous year, in 2018, there were 139 applications.

420 All of the applications were dealt with at the six-weekly open planning meetings that continue to be well attended by applicants and members of our community. The open meetings continue to demonstrate the effectiveness of the meetings being open to all, the openness and transparency of the planning decision process.

425 With the retirement from office of Mr Birmingham and Mr Roberts finally getting to escape the Committee, the new Committee was formed with Mr Earl and Mr Gentle, alongside Mr Snowdon and myself. Both the new Members have adapted well into their respective roles on the Committee and have an excellent grasp of the planning process and getting to know and understand the current Land Use Plan and dealing with the applications. I am sure they will agree that in January they were on a considerably steep learning curve.

430 The Land Use Plan is a document that gets us away from the mentality that has been the weakness of the States for far too many years: short term solutions over long term goals. In this case, we have a Land Use Plan of such quality that Arup themselves requested that the States of Alderney allow them to put it forward for the prestigious UK RTPI Planning Awards.

435 Whilst we did not win an award, just being nominated and shortlisted to attend those awards was a huge honour for a small population such as ours and the Land Use Plan is something we can all be proud of, as it was shaped by the engagement of the whole community.

A Housing Needs Assessment Survey has been carried out and a report on that will be available in due course. The Committee also look forward to Economic Development bringing proposals in conjunction with BDCC assisting and achieving the criteria set out in the Land Use Plan for achieving much needed economic growth. Our policies allow those achievements to be met.

445 Dealing with the planning applications did not come without some contentious issues, and extensive time was consumed on litigious issues. Our appeal process continues to be an unsatisfactory way of dealing with them through the Alderney Court. The Committee is eager to change that and looks forward to 2020 when we hope to make some inroads in changing that process, although this will be no easy task, as it is involving the Building and Development Control Alderney Law being rewritten. The Committee has formed a good working relationship with our Planning counterparts in our sister Island and we look forward to that working and that collaboration continuing.

450 October saw the departure of Miss Osborne who left our Planning Department and Ms Roberts has stepped in to ensure the continuation within the Planning Department and assisting the Committee, a role that is appreciated by its members. I would like to thank all the Members of the 2019 Committee, Ms Roberts and Committee Secretary, Mrs Baines for all of their hard work throughout 2019.

455 As this is our last States Meeting of the year, I would also like to wish everybody a Merry Christmas.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean. Mr Gentle, I think you wish to second this Item?

460 **Mr Gentle:** Yes sir. Mr President, fellow States Members.

Mr Dean has just said that the appeals process needs a complete overhaul and I look forward to seeing something happen. The Building and Development Control Committee has powers and procedures which oblige it to objectively determine facts and draw conclusions so as to provide the basis of official action. They depend on a predetermined set of guidelines or criteria and can be challenged in a court of law. It is wrong that the incumbent Chairman has to present himself in court to fight a case brought by a disgruntled applicant. On one occasion this year, I would

think that Mr Dean was on the verge of taking a sleeping-bag to the Island Hall, such were the hours he was putting in to prepare for a case.

470 Some of you will remember that I stood here in June and made a speech about employment legislation and then championed a health and wellbeing strategy where physical and mental health are integrated. We must strive to ensure that we do not continue, as a Government, to put our own Members under undue stress due to the failure to implement an appeals process that is fit for purpose.

Thank you.

475

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.

Would any Member wish to address the States on this Proposition?

Mr Dent.

480 **Mr Dent:** I just would like to say a couple of things and I would like to note the very hard work that I know that the Members have put in under the present system. But I would like to ask if the BDCC would be prepared next year to consider measures that might make the planning process more efficient and more speedy – and possibly make their own lives easier? Maybe there are measures that could be implemented to ensure a seamless communications with the other  
485 Committees, because we have had a couple of problems.

Thank you.

**The President:** Any other Member? Mr Snowdon.

490 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues.

I was going to save this one for the Update from General Services – and I will. I would like to discuss a little bit about the Belle Vue, because it was not part of the BDCC's issues or any mix-up from the BDCC as far as I am concerned, but would just like that on record.

Thank you.

495

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Would any other Member wish to address the States? In that event Mr Dean, would you like to exercise your right of reply?

I apologise, did I miss you again, Mr Jean?

500

**Mr Jean:** You have just, but never mind –

**The President:** Could you just –

505 **Mr Jean:** I will in future.

**The President:** Please.

**Mr Jean:** Thank you. Can I speak?

510

**The President:** Yes, please do.

**Mr Jean:** Thank you.

515 I just want to say, I am very interested in the remarks from the Chairman of P&F, when he said he wanted to look at better methods and more control over planning applications. I think the Building and Development Committee have done particularly well during this year and I am concerned about a statement like that, simply because we have invested a lot of money,



hundreds of thousands of pounds, to get a better planning process and more guidelines. Surely to goodness, that should do it, shouldn't it?

520 That is all I want to say.

**The President:** Well, thank you.

Now, unless there is anybody else? No? Mr Dean, would you now like to exercise your right of reply?

525

**Mr Dean:** Thank you.

I shall deal with Mr Jean's comments first. Yes, I would agree with them. I think we have an excellent system at the moment. Maybe Mr Dent would like to write to the Chairman of this Committee, and it can be discussed at their next policy meeting if he has some issues with that.

530

Picking up on Mr Snowdon's point, usually, as the Chair, I normally advise my Committee Members not to comment on any past, present or future applications. But on this occasion I would just like to echo Mr Snowdon's remarks that a planning application was passed and it was for the GSC and the applicant to deal with, and maybe I better leave it at that, I think.

Thank you, sir.

535

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

### (iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee

**The President:** And now if we can move, please, to the Annual Report of the General Services Committee.

Mr Dean.

540

**Mr Dean:** Thank you, sir.

Yes, there were various questions on this. Whilst there were no questions on the Building and Development Control Committee Report, a question then popped up for Mr McKinley. So I will deal with that one first. The query was raised in regard to the mention of the BDCC Law Review and that was clarified by myself. A question was asked about the cost of the Island Hall kitchen and the Convener replied that the cost to date had been just under £47,000 and there were some issues still to be addressed.

545

It was noted that the Fort Doyle sewerage outlet will be sited outside the fort. A plan will be made available once designed and the necessary planning approvals will be sought.

550

It was advised that the Breakwater repairs are ongoing, and the underwater survey produced a positive report regarding the state of the mound.

It was noted that proposals have been received for archaeological works on the Longis site for over the next three years, which will be presented to the Committee for approval in due course. Ms Burgess also advised that a Heritage Working Group is being set up, which will provide assistance and guidance regarding other archaeological and heritage proposals.

555

The Convener advised that £95,000 had been approved for the works on the Old Connaught to make it wind and watertight. These works were ongoing, and will be coming in under budget. Regarding the future use of the building, this has yet to be discussed and there will also be some public consultation and Committee discussion.

560

The GSC Chairman also advised that Mr Owen is still interested in progressing a marina, and he is hoping to progress this next year. No further details are known.

**The President:** Thank you very much Mr Dean.

Mr McKinley, I think you wish to move this Proposition.

565 **Mr McKinley:** If I may sir, thank you. Mr President, fellow States Members.

First of all, I will cover major projects. Phase One of work on the Connaught Care Home, the loft conversion, has begun with a planned completion date of February next year. The total cost is £190,000 covering the contractors, fees, project management and solar panels. A further sum has been set aside for a structural engineering survey for Phase Two. A number of additional  
570 improvements made to the Connaught Care Home during the past year. They include the provision of a back-up generator, safety improvements to pathways and railings, and the installation of stairlifts.

The States agreed the replacement of the harbour crane at the October States Meeting and the crane, which is due to arrive in last quarter of 2020, was considered to be the best option  
575 and is certainly the cheapest at £850,000. I am sure that you are all aware that the cost should be covered by an annual income from the Harbour Fees of at least £150,000 each year over the next six years. Also in the harbour, work continues with the National Lifeboat Institution and others towards a new pontoon in 2020, which is expected to be a shared venture between the States and the RNLI. The Harbour Office has been running the water taxi since August, and will  
580 probably continue to do so in 2020. They will be putting that out for bids. A new Harbour Master, Mr John Taylor, has been appointed and started work on 21st November.

With regard to the Fort Doyle sewage system, the States has agreed to the purchase and installation of a screening unit. The unit will remove all solids larger than 6 mm<sup>2</sup> from the sewage outfall. The positive effects will be cleaner seas, but it will also help Alderney meet  
585 plastic-free environmental targets.

You will all be aware of the occasional rock fall at the York Hill/Cuttings opposite the Le Coqs store. The Committee has agreed to £20,000 preliminary cost to assess the options for preventing the possible impact of a serious rock fall. The options include possible alterations to traffic flow and/or the installation of a heavy duty blanket type metal net which could cover the  
590 entire rock face.

Coastal erosion continues to be a problem in several areas around our Island. £20,000 has been approved for preliminary work on coastal defences at Corblets Bay, where survey work is about to commence. There are also continuing concerns about Fort Clonque and the road from the fort to Platte Saline, which is privately owned in places. The walls of the Arsenal and the  
595 adjoining coastline are also in need of urgent repair, but are privately owned. The continuing possibility of a marina in that area may help to protect the coastline.

The Water Board is planning to install a standby filtration plant and they have also installed a new water main at the foot of Water Lane and repaired the road surface. We are now awaiting quotations for work on the water supply from La Marette to Little Street and for a replacement  
600 Water Board vehicle. With regard to other vehicle and plant replacements, a new sewer tanker has been ordered and a business case is being compiled for replacement of a refuse collection vehicle.

The installation of a milk vending machine at Farm Shop, which had States support, has led to 10,000-plus fewer plastic milk bottles being used this year. Jeans Stores will also be installing a  
605 similar machine, so hopefully that figure will double next year – another positive for our move towards a plastic-free environment.

Work on the Old Connaught is progressing well and within the approved £95,000 costs. Mr Dean, who heads a subcommittee responsible for overseeing the project, will also be interacting with the public to consider further uses for the building, which he will bring back to  
610 the full Committee and the Policy and Finance Committee.

Work to make the Old Fire Station safe has almost finished, and we shall also be discussing its further use at a future meeting. With regard to the Nunnery, the States continue to maintain the site as planned. The States has made some progress this year in ensuring the site is open to the public and has installed some new interpretation boards. New entry gates have been installed.  
615 The work has been completed to ensure the ramparts can be safely accessed. There is more to do next year, particularly around the courtyard and entrance areas, but these improvements are

dependent on further work with the archaeologists about the potential for exposing and displaying some of the original Roman foundations. The Alderney Bird Observatory and a private tenant occupy the buildings within the sites, which means that the buildings are well-utilised.

620 The Committee continues to be concerned about rumours circulating on the Island about the Nunnery and the actions of some people to undermine the approach being taken. The site has gone from being closed to being open and accessible to the public. It houses the Alderney Bird Observatory, which is an asset to the Island and its visitor economy. This is a success story for Alderney.

625 At Longis there have been improvements to the sewage plant, with work on the filtration units and the erection of a fence. This has improved the appearance of the site.

Moving to Telegraph Tower, a recent condition report highlights its number of features which make the building unsafe and unsuitable for residential occupancy. They include unsafe water supply, damaged staircases and unsatisfactory electrical installation. The survey estimates a cost of about £109,000 to make the building safe and watertight. That does not include a mains water supply. We shall be exploring the option of providing a mains water supply as a consequence of the runway extension or widening. Possible options for further use include working with a partner such as Landmark Trust. Further research on future uses will continue with a report to the committee in due course.

635 Moving to Fort Grosnez, the States of Guernsey are funding the clean-up. A number of abandoned cars have been removed, as well as many unwanted items of scrap. The large yellow crane has been shipped off the Island, as have the CTU cranes. Once again, the fort has been cleared out. But once it has been cleared out, at the expense of the States of Guernsey, we shall make an assessment for its future use. But there is no water supply and the electricity supply is intermittent. We shall report back to the Policy and Finance Committee in due course. At Fort Albert, the entry bridge was in need of replacement and, with the help of the Royal Engineers, a new bridge has been designed and is being installed.

640 In the town, a survey for town area pavement refurbishment is planned for 2020 and access for the wheelchairs and pushchairs has been improved in past years. Delays over parking and traffic reports and mixed messages from the Building Development and Control Committee and the General Services Committee, has led to Mr Noel Hayes pulling out of the proposal to use the former Belle Vue site as a grocery store, bakery, bar and off-licence, and six luxury apartments. I have written to Mr Hayes to apologise for the unacceptable delay with the administration of his projects, with the hope that he may reconsider his decision to put the property back on the market.

650 May I conclude by saying a genuine thank you to my fellow Committee Members for their very useful contributions and hard work during the past year. I also say thank you to the civil servants who attend and contribute very positively before, during and after the meetings. My final thanks go to Mr Aaron Bray, who has worked tirelessly during his four years in Alderney as Head of Estates, Environment and Infrastructure, not just for my Committee, but for the entire States and the people of Alderney. We are sorry to see you go and your family leaving, and good luck for the future.

I wish you all a Merry Christmas and thank you, Mr President.

660 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr McKinley.  
Ms Burgess, I think you want to second this Item?

665 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members. I do and I do not actually need to add. I think that was a very good report and I would particularly like to echo the sentiments towards Mr Bray.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

670 Having missed him on two occasions, I am sure Members will forgive me if I ask, do you wish to address the States, Mr Jean?

**Mr Jean:** It is really kind of you, sir, and I will, if I may.

675 Everyone knows I had concerns over the crane and I never did get the answer to some of the questions that I really wanted. One of them was, particularly, how much it will lift, and some of this was related to my interest in how we bring in our oil in the future, which, interestingly enough, was brought up at one of our Committee meetings where we were updated on the possibility, in time, that the tankers may not come here because they are getting elderly. So those questions were particularly important to me – that I knew how much that crane could lift. I still do not know. I have no idea. So I am still pretty unhappy about that, I have to say.

680 But one of the things that tempers it a little for me, and makes it a little more acceptable, is the fact that I have now heard that things have changed and there is now a move towards getting a resale value for the crane, because one of the things that made me very unhappy in the P&F papers that we received, the crane was to be scrapped. That, I gather, is no longer the case. It now has a resale value and I am grateful. Mr Dean looks confused, but it is true. It was in the P&F papers – the crane was to be scrapped.

685 I would also like to ask, I am delighted to hear that we have a new Harbour Master appointed, but everybody knows that some time back I raised the points regarding qualifications in pilotage and what it is costing Alderney. And again, this is down to good housekeeping, to me, and I would like to know if Mr Taylor is a qualified pilot.

690 I would like to go back for a moment, just once more, on the crane and what I want to say about it. As asked my questions went unanswered and if we are not getting good value for money for the crane and it is not right, then what happens is this: all those costs get passed on to the consuming public – and they are mentioned here. And every lift and every boat that is lifted and every piece of work that is done by that crane to balance out the payment costs for a crane that, again, because we have got the same crane, is only going to last six or seven years, is going to be more costly. It must go up. If we do this, it has to go up.

695 Now, I move to the walls at the Arsenal and the adjoining coast, and the fact that they are on private property. Yes I agree, but I believe that we have a responsibility for walls of that nature, and I also believe that in the next year or two, if we are just going to wait for a private marina scheme, which may take ... Let's face it, we have been talking about a marina now for 40 years, it could well be another 10 or 15 years that they are talking about a marina scheme.

700 What I am trying to say is a stitch in time saves nine. If the whole of that walls falls out ... These are points that I have already raised much earlier on and my concerns remain the same. As far as I can see, the wall sits on a pin the middle, and eventually it will go.

705 Now, with regard to the Nunnery: unfortunately, although there is much good work being done there, to say that there are rumours abounding the Nunnery, it is more than rumours. It is more than rumours. This is quite an unhappy situation, the Nunnery, and I do not think we have heard the last of the Nunnery. I am certainly not happy with it and would not put it under the heading of 'just rumours'. It is more than that, it is not good.

Telegraph Tower is back in the possession of the States and a recent condition report ...

710 Well, I would like to see a second condition report and I would say that we might have thought getting the lease off the previous tenant, I think it might have been better to have left it with him, when I am looking at the cost of refurbishing two rooms – one-up-one-down – and a staircase. I think we might have been better to have left it with the previous tenant.

715 I think it is wonderful that we are doing the entry bridge to Fort Albert. That has looked very sad for a number of years now. That is a really good thing – congratulations on that one. And any improvements in the pavement area in the town and access for wheelchairs is good. It is wonderful.

I want to talk about the Belle Vue situation, and I want to say how much I admire the decisive action of the Chairman of General Services and the way that he apologised was (Mr McKinley: Thank you.) great – really fantastic. But I am just going to say this about the actual issues themselves with regard to car parking. I do not really fully understand what they were, but I do understand this. In the town up at Tesco in the Marais Square – also founded by Mr Hayes – there is a little car park with, maybe, five bays, and cars go in and out of there all day. That has been quite adequate. The Butes car park is huge and I have to say the meal that was made over it, and the spending of £5,500 with Arup is really cruel to hear. It is no wonder that Noel Hayes did it pack it in. It is really a great shame that we made such an issue over what I would regard as in-and-out five or six car parking spaces. It is a great shame.

I think that concludes my remarks, sir. Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Would any other –?  
Mr Harris.

**Mr Harris:** Mr President, fellow States Members.

I will be briefer than Mr Jean. I am just going to raise the point about the milk vending machine at the Farm Shop – to add a bit of positivity there. It is well over 10,000 bottles now – into the twenty thousands – and a second machine has been installed down at Jeans Stores. So that can only benefit the Island. And we are working positively towards our environmental reform, hopefully, and I think this should be a catalyst to hopefully ban the plastic bottle in its entirety next year – plastic water bottles certainly. So that is a positive step.

And also, just to mention the rock fall at the York Hill/Cuttings site, we made that priority project in GSC earlier this year. I think, really, we need to make haste with that and get on with it, because with this weather, at this time of year, it is only going to get worse.

So, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much.  
I think Mr Dent, did you wish to speak?

**Mr Dent:** Thank you – briefly.

Just on the matter of the crane, which I did not expect to speak on, but I do not remember – I do not recollect – anything in P&F about it being scrapped. If that language was used, I am sure it was not intended because there is clearly a retail value attached to the crane. So that is it.

Mr Jean mentioned the price of oil, and my apologies, I can answer this question now as part of the subject has been raised. If you recall, earlier this year – a few months ago – I did an analysis with James Lancaster from AEL of the various elements that make up the price – the pump price – of road fuel. One of the larger items was in fact the retailers' margin, which I think was over 30p. So it is a very considerable element of the price.

Then my last point is I just would like to draw everyone's attention to the unused States properties we have already. If we are going to be adding Telegraph Tower and Fort Grosnez, maybe I would just go back to the Old Connaught, which has been unoccupied for – in my opinion – far too long. I would like to see GSC making an effort to find uses for these properties. It may not always be the most optimal use you will find, but you cannot wait forever. Put these properties to use sooner rather than later.

Thank you.

**The President:** I think Mr Snowdon, you indicated. Mr Dean is anxious –

**Mr Snowdon:** I am happy to let Mr Dean go first ... *(Laughter)*

**The President:** Mr Dean.

770 **Mr Dean:** Sir, fellow Members.

A question for Mr McKinley, I do not expect him to answer it now, but maybe he might be able to. Obviously I have not been a States Member before, when we have done the procurement for a new crane. Obviously that is over our allowance to spend, so that has to go through the States in Guernsey. So I just wondered, at some point, whether we could be updated on when that is actually going to go to the States in Guernsey and how long that is going to take? I would not want that to not get actioned soon enough and then we are in the situation where we have got a problem with our crane and we cannot order the new one has not been processed yet. But I do not expect Mr McKinley to answer that now – if he could just make note of that.

780 If I could answer Mr Dent on Mr McKinley's behalf, the Old Connaught: there is a working group dealing with that and work is progressing. But at the moment, the builders are there doing it. So we cannot actually do anything further until that is done. But Mr Dent can rest assured that the sub-group and the General Services Committee do indeed want to get that building back into use and it is one of their priorities – or certainly it is the sub-group's priority.

785 **The President:** Thank you very much.

**Mr Dean:** Thank you.

790 **The President:** Now, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues.

Firstly, I just want to say well done to GSC. You have had quite good year and I think next year you are going to have, hopefully, a good year. You have got a big budget to get through, so hopefully get through that budget and implement those projects.

795 The crane seems very popular tonight. I just wanted to say, in your Report, you said it:

... is certainly the cheapest at £850,000.

And that is a wheel crane, isn't it? I think when we had this debate, they talked about trap cranes and different types of crane. So you have got a load of different tenders for the wheel crane, I presume. I just wondered if that would be available some time – at the £850,000 and what the other prices were for the other crane options which were wheel-based.

800 Marina: there was quite a lot of talk about the marina, and a few years ago we had two people involved in it and then it all sort of fizzled out. I just want to know what, actively, GSC is doing to try and get that interest with marinas and move forward on that, because I would be a big step forward. But it seems a bit like a different project. It does not seem to ever progress from pretty pictures, as it were.

805 The Nunnery has been quite a theme for quite a long time and when I was in Mr Harris' job at Tourism I know it was quite a heated thing with the accommodation sector at the time. But what I would just like some reassurances, really probably for the accommodation sector, is, fantastic the ABO is operating and it is getting that interest and everything, but could you just reassure me that that criterion is in place – that the only people that can stay there ... It has got to be related to wildlife and heritage groups only? I think that was a resolution passed by the P&F. I just wanted to make sure that that was happening and that it was not just open doors for anyone.

815 I think you talked about rumours about other projects, but there was a, hopefully wrong, rumour about Telegraph Tower becoming public toilets – (*Laughter*) and I hope that is not going to be the case. For the States, I just want some clarification that hopefully that is not being looked into. I am sure we could make some other arrangement for public toilets instead of using that, if that was the case.

820 Just to touch on the Belle Vue, because the press release for the Belle Vue that came out at the time seemed to focus on that it was a planning process and there were mixed messages from GSC and BDCC. As you know, I have never been a member of the GSC, but I was a member of the BDCC at the time with Mr Roberts, Mr Dean and Mr Birmingham. I can clearly remember the resolution that was passed – I actually voted against it, the only one that was – from that Committee at the time, that the application was approved subject to car parking and traffic being sorted out on the Butes, which would have been passed to GSC at the time.

825 Now, that was a resolution from BDCC and it will be on our Committee minutes at the time. So I am not quite sure where the confusion has gone to, because it should have been passed on by the Civil Service, or may be passed on to Mrs Paris at the time, so that GSC could implement it. Now, this is quite some time ago, so I am not quite sure what is taking so long. Because really, my understanding is, that it was down to GSC to sit around the table in your Committee meeting and say, 'Are you happy with this? What are the issues? Yes or no?', and then it would go forward. I do not know why it has taken so long – a considerable amount of time – to get to this stage.

830 So I just wanted to highlight that up, that I do not really know why BDCC is getting the blame for something that is actually a GSC matter. I think that press release that went out is unfortunate because I believe it to be wrong, looking at the evidence based on it. And it also says in that press release that there was going to be a planning process issued and I really do not know ... I missed the last BDCC meeting unfortunately, but I do not think BDCC have agreed to that, so I guess it is the planning process into GSC on the handling of that matter. Anyway, I will not go on any more about that.

840 I would also like say many thanks to Aaron Bray and it is sad to see him and his family leaving the Island. I think he was a credit to the Island and put a considerable amount of effort and time into Alderney and getting involved in the community in different aspects of it. So I wish him all the best for the future.

845 Thank you.

**The President:** Would any other Member like to address the States?  
Mr Gentle.

850 **Mr Gentle:** Mr President, colleagues.

Marina: the formation of a working group for a Harbour Master Plan, which would include a marina hopefully, was discussed the other day at GSC and will be on GSC's agenda for January. With regards to Mr Jean's point about pilotage, and this is as far as I understand, the Harbour Master anywhere is a qualified pilot, but only in the area that they do the pilotage. Under the maritime laws in force today – I do not know what they are called – the Harbour Master is the person responsible for investigating any pilotage incidents. It is the view of the Harbour Master here that in order to have scrutiny and transparency, the Harbour Master is not the best person to be the pilot.

855 Thank you.

860 **Mr Jean:** Well, that's that then! *(Laughter)*

**The President:** I think there is only you left, Mr Earl, do you wish to address the States?

865 **Mr Earl:** On this, no. *(Laughter)*

**The President:** In that event, Mr McKinley, would you like to exercise your right of reply?

**Mr McKinley:** I will sir. Thank you very much.

870 First of all, Mr Jean, I thought the crane might come up. (*Laughter*) We looked at several options – I say ‘we’: the harbour staff and the previous Harbour Master and those trained and qualified in cranes, it would not be good for just anybody to go and look at them – actually came up with four options of wheeled options. They also looked at the possibility of tracked option, which he had once before. That tracked option actually caused an awful lot of damage to the surface of the new Commercial Quay and so they decided not to continue with a tracked option. 875 So they looked at four-wheeled options. The other three cost over £2 million and this one cost £850,000. So that was one of the major costs. There was not otherwise much difference between the cranes.

As far as tonnage and lift is concerned, I do not quite understand what you are on about with assisting the oil inflow into the Island, because I do not know how the crane is going to do that. 880 Perhaps you could explain that when ... (**Mr Jean:** I could.)

As far as pilotage is concerned, Mr Gentle has answered you. Mr Taylor is a trained pilot. He was trained in the waters of Scotland – the Scottish Islands and in Perth. But he is obviously, as Mr Gentle said, not trained in the Channel Island waters. So he would have to be so trained to 885 qualify. (**Mr Jean:** Thank you.)

You also mentioned, I think, the cost and the input for the crane, going back to the crane. I did actually mention that we were receiving something like a £150,000 a year from Harbour Fees or mooring fees for the tankers and others that come in. So that more than covers the cost of 890 £850,000.

You mentioned the Arsenal wall. I agree with you entirely. But it is privately owned and unless it is really serious, then we have other priorities around our Island that are States-owned. I think we have to obviously allocate our priorities to the States-owned properties, rather than privately owned properties. But I hope that the marina, if it comes along and is in that part of the Island, in Arsenal and the bay, will help. 895

As far as Alderney Bird Observatory versus the Alderney Wildlife Trust, ‘rumours’ is a polite way of putting it. Yes, I agree with you, but I did not want to put it in any other way. There have been some very unpleasant statements made.

Telegraph Tower: the number agreed was £109,000. I forget what you actually asked about that one – whether it was worth it and whether – 900

**Mr Jean:** Whether we should have taken it back.

**Mr McKinley:** Well, we have not agreed to the £109,000, we have not agreed to what work should be done. That was the assessment of one person bringing it back to safe usage. So we 905 have not agreed anyway.

Mr Dent asked a question about the Old Connaught, which was answered – thank you very much – by Mr Dean. Mr Dean made a statement about the States of Guernsey permission for the crane, was it? Yes. That has gone to the States of Guernsey, we do not know when the reply will come, but it has to be agreed by them if it is over £250,000.

Mr Snowdon asked a question about, I think, a track crane. I mentioned that and the wheel-based crane. He also mentioned the marina, I think we have covered that option and I think Mr Gentle covered the answer also. 910

Nunnery accommodation, I can confirm, is open. It is not just for the Bird Reserve, it is not just for the Wildlife Trust. They have the priority, if you would like, but it is open to anyone else 915 at any time in the season.

Telegraph Tower: no, not public toilets.

As far as Belle Vue is concerned, I am not going to go into great detail on this openly at the moment, because we have a special States meeting on Monday at which I think this whole business will be discussed. But I would just say, though, that following the permission, which I did not know about until quite a lot later, that the building itself was okay, the issue then 920 remained traffic and parking. Mr Dean undertook to look into that, possibly not as a member of



Building and Development, but Mr Dean anyway offered to look into it. I have now seen a report, but it was a bit late. I will not go into further detail on that, sir.

Thank you. Thank you very much.

925

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Well, that deals with Item I.

## II. The Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019 – Item approved

*Item II*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019' and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Her Royal Sanction thereto.*

**The President:** Mr Greffier, would you please now to Item II?

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

930

Item II this evening is the Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019. A letter has been received from yourself, sir, as President of the States, and the States are asked to approve 'The Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019' and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Her Royal Sanction thereto.

935

**The President:** Thank you.  
Mr Dean.

**Mr Dean:** Sir, colleagues.

940

There was one question, and it was noted that the distribution of assets and gender equality should be reviewed within the wider review of the Law. The Chief Executive advised that these points can be raised again with Guernsey within the consultation process.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Dent, I think you are going to propose that this.

945

**Mr Dent:** Sir, these amendments provide some changes to the existing law governing how couples divorce, legally separate and annul a marriage. The changes are, in fact, a precursor to a full review of the law which I understand is currently underway. We need to note that on our sister Island, the States there have taken the view that while we wait for that full review, there is an immediate need for the court to have greater powers in one particular aspect, that is the division of assets. The amendment consequently deals almost exclusively with this matter and grants the divorce courts greater powers to direct how real or personal property may be divided.

950

I believe this is a matter on which we need to follow Guernsey. I also believe that it behoves us to bring about these changes, which will provide additional powers to the divorce court and ensure that justice is done between the parties in matrimonial proceedings.

955

With these few words, I consequently commend the legislation to the Chamber. I note, finally, that there are further matters related, for example, to pensions, that may need primary legislation and our consideration at some future date.

Thank you.

960

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Mr McKinley, I think you are going to second this.

**Mr McKinley:** I am, sir, and I have very little to add.

965

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Does any Member wish to speak on this Item? Mr Dent, would you like to exercise your right of reply?

970

**Mr Dent:** In the circumstances, I feel I have nothing to say.

**The President:** I do not think you have. Thank you very much indeed.

Could we move to the vote please, Mr Greffier.

975

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

The States are asked to approve the Matrimonial Causes (Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2019 and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Her Royal Sanction thereto.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Ms Burgess	None	None
Mr Dean		
Mr Dent		
Mr Earl		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr Jean		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Snowdon		

980

**The Greffier:** Sir, that is all nine Members present in favour.

**The President:** Thank you.

### **III. Occupiers Rates 2020 – Item approved**

*Item III*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The Occupier's Rate (Level for 2020) Ordinance, 2019'.*

**The President:** Item III now please, Mr Greffier.

985

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item III this evening is the Occupiers Rates for 2020. A letter has been received from Mr Dent as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the 'The Occupier's Rate (Level for 2020) Ordinance, 2019'.

990

**The President:** Mr Dean.

**Mr Dean:** There was one question. It was queried if charities would still be exempt from the TRP element once the Single Alderney Property Tax is introduced in 2021. The issue is going to be discussed further by the Finance Committee.

995

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.  
Again, Mr Dent, I think you are going to propose this Item.

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, sir.

1000 This is a piece of simple housekeeping. Having agreed the Budget in October, we now need to enact the Ordinances that will provide the agreed, rather modest, increase in our Occupiers Rates. In doing this, I would like everyone to note that this increase is well below the increase in TRP of 10% the States of Guernsey required for their budget purposes. We carefully financed our expenditures against expenses.

1005 Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Earl, I think you are seconding this.

**Mr Earl:** Mr Chairman, fellow States Members, I have nothing to add.

1010

**The President:** Thank you. Any Member wish to speak on this?  
I think this time Mr Snowdon probably just pipped you at the post.

**Mr Jean:** Absolutely.

1015

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President; sorry, Mr Jean.

**Mr Jean:** No, it is fine.

1020 **Mr Snowdon:** Yes, I just did a bit of research on this, because I know there are comments going around and I just wanted to highlight it during this debate, really, with the Occupiers Rates. So the 5% increase, which we have already agreed, and this is the Ordinance to go through, I understand all of that and I will be supporting it – reluctantly, I will be supporting it. However, I just want to highlight, because there seem to be some – ‘rumours’ are we using tonight, as the word? – rumours going around that Occupiers Rates and TRP seem to be quick win to make some income for the States of Alderney. But I just want to highlight, I have not actually gone through the figure, but I think the estimate to TRP and the Occupiers Rates for an average house might be about £600 and the average for a UK house is £1,600 in council tax.

1025

But I would just like to highlight that the Alderney side of it is that we have very high food costs here, we have got high electric – 44.5p in 2008 compared to 15.2p in the UK – and high travel costs. So though it may look like a quick win to increase it, there are actually very expensive living costs, I believe, on the Island. So I think, when this debate continues and other things connected to this will come up with this States and maybe a future States, I think we need to really do some research into how it will affect the people if that was a major increase on our property tax together.

1035

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Jean.

1040

**Mr Jean:** Thank you.

I want to, if I can, begin, first of all, by pointing out that we also know as well that this year there is going to be a 10% rise in domestic TRP from Guernsey. So not only does this Island cop it once, it cops it twice. I want to build on what Mr Snowdon has just said. We have just heard

1045 about the good Budget, and I would like to see us not behaving a bit like Captain Bligh on the mutiny on the *Bounty*, when Fletcher Christian told him, as he was carrying out the punishment on the man, 'Carry on with the punishment', and Fletcher Christian said to him, 'But the man is dead, sir.' And then Captain Bligh said, 'Carry on with the punishment.'

1050 I believe, as I have pointed out, we have got a good Budget, and I do not believe that we should be actually doing this. I think with the rise from Guernsey, it is not, to me, very merciful to the public here. We are still quite deeply in recession here and a lot of that is transport led. I would be far happier once we have done something to remedy the transport situation, the ferry situation and the plane situation – both need addressing and both need improvement. I would be much happier to consider things like this when the Island is again functioning properly.

1055 Because this hits businesses hard and it hits working families and it hits, particularly, OAPs, who are subject to this expensive oil, things that I can do nothing about – to help them with. But together, working together, we could do something with some of these things. But we do not. We just think that we are here to rubberstamp this stuff. But it is more important than that.

1060 I think I have made my point to you all and I think that we have got to be very careful in this Island. As I say, the recession bites deep and a lot of people not having an easy time, and we do not need to do this; we have got a good Budget. But there we are.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Any other Member wish to speak?

Mr Earl.

1065

**Mr Earl:** Mr President, fellow States Members.

I can understand Mr Jean's concern about rates as a large property owner, but I would like to just –

1070 **Mr Jean:** Excuse me – (**The President:** Mr Jean.) could I raise a point of order please?

It is not about me as a large property owner. I am talking about every resident of this Island, particularly the old age pensioners and working families.

Thank you.

1075 **The President:** Thank you.

**Mr Earl:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

1080 But I would like to apprise him and other States Members, and everyone here in the Public Gallery, of some interesting facts. I do not know if Mr Jean has any idea of what it costs to run this Island, but I will say for the questions it is in excess of £3 million. Our Occupier's Rate raises something in excess of £500,000, which leaves a balance of £2.8 million. The proposed the increase in Occupier's Rate will raise, as we have seen in the notes, £27,000. That is just a 5% increase.

1085 Now what is really quite interesting is that the money we receive from Occupier's Rates barely covers – and Elania correct me if I am wrong – the cost of black-bag bin waste and recycling –

1090 **The President:** Mr Earl, I am nervous to interrupt, but it has been pointed out to me, quite correctly, that having seconded this motion, you had your opportunity then to speak, and therefore –

**Mr Earl:** I should have said 'I reserve my right'. I apologise for that and I am happy to sit down if you prefer.

1095 **The President:** Thank you very much.

Does any other Member wish to speak? Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** I think nothing more needs to be said. We know all the arguments. Thank you.

1100 **The President:** Could we move to the vote then please, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

The States of Alderney are asked to approve the 'The Occupier's Rate (Level for 2020) Ordinance, 2019'.

1105

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Ms Burgess	Mr Jean	None
Mr Dean		
Mr Dent		
Mr Earl		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Snowdon		

**The Greffier:** Sir, 8 votes in favour, 1 against.

1110 **The President:** And Mr Earl, may I apologise to you. It was entirely my mistake that I did not pick that up. I do apologise.

**Mr Earl:** It is not your fault at all Mr President.

**The President:** You are very kind.

#### **IV. Proposed Increase in Water Rates – Item approved**

*Item IV*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The States Water Supply (Rates of Charge) (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019'.*

1115 **The President:** Can we now move on, please, Mr Greffier, to Item IV.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

1120 Item IV this evening is the 'Proposed Increase in Water Rates'. A letter has been received from Mr McKinley as Chairman of the General Services Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the 'The States Water Supply (Rates of Charge) (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019'.

**The President:** Mr Dean.

1125

**Mr Dean:** Sir, colleagues.

The minimum rate charge and the new rates were clarified.

**The President:** And I think ... I am just looking that –

1130 **The Greffier:** Mr McKinley to propose, sir.

**The President:** Yes, Mr McKinley, I think you are going to second this?

1135 **Mr McKinley:** I am going to propose it I think.

**The President:** Sorry, yes you are.

**The Greffier:** Mr Dean to second, sir.

1140 **The President:** I am still confused.

**Mr McKinley:** Very briefly sir, fellow State Members.

As I mentioned in my General Service Committee report, there are certain expenses that have come this year: the new filtration plant, Water Lane, La Marette and other such things; an awful lot of work, actually. And like everything else, the costs are going up. So without going into the full detail, there are three categories, really, in water costs. One is water supply otherwise than by measure; water supplied by measure for domestic use; and water supply by measure for other than domestic use. I will not go into every single bit of increase, but the most interesting one, I think, to most people here and most people listening, would be the increase in their domestic home costs. They are looking at about an additional £5 per year, I believe. So very little. So I ask you, please, to consider and to agree to the costs.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Mr Dean, you are seconding this, I understand.

1155 **Mr Dean:** Yes sir. Mr President, fellow colleagues.

Like my fellow colleague, Mr McKinley, I do not intend to go into a great deal of detail. We have already discussed it at great length in the October Meeting and this is just a piece of housekeeping to put the Ordinance in place.

1160 If I could just address something to Mr Jean, the Finance Committee certainly do not just come up with these figures just out of thin air. A great deal of time is consumed on looking at all the implications and a great deal of discussion does take place within the Finance Committee before these proposals come forward.

That is all I have to say.

1165 **The President:** Thank you. Does any Member wish to speak on this Item?  
Mr Harris.

**Mr Harris:** Mr President, fellow Members.

1170 Just to echo Mr Dean's point there, that these things are discussed at great length within the Finance Committee – we do not just do these things on a whim. I think it needs to be taken into consideration that these are rates that are applicable to us as well. We all pay the same rates and I do not mind voting to pay more. But sometimes these things are a necessary evil.

So, there we are.

1175 **The President:** Does any other Member wish to speak?

**Mr Jean:** Yes, if I may –

1180 **The President:** Mr Jean.

**Mr Jean:** – only very briefly, just to say, as you know, I do not agree with this, because the Water Board does have a surplus, and quite a reasonable one, already. It is entitled to funding from capital allocation. As far as I am concerned, there is no better course. I would not want the Water Board not to progress, but I do not see, at this time, with things as they are, that this is another good thing to do to the public, and I am not going to vote for this either.

Thank you.

**The President:** Any other Member?

1190 Mr McKinley, would you like to exercise your right to reply?

**Mr McKinley:** Only briefly sir. I am not quite sure what Mr Jean was on about, but the Water Board does get a grant – it gets a considerable grant. It is getting a grant for the filtration unit, it is getting a grant for the work it has done on Water Lane, but it is still not able, quite, to survive within that and what it earns. So it is just asking for a small increase.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you. Could we move then, please, to the vote, Mr Greffier.

1200 **The Greffier:** Thank you.

The States of Alderney are asked to approve the ‘The States Water Supply (Rates of Charge) (Alderney) Ordinance, 2019’.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Ms Burgess	Mr Jean	None
Mr Dean		
Mr Dent		
Mr Earl		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Snowdon		

**The Greffier:** Sir, 8 votes in favour, 1 against.

1205

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Greffier.

**V. The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019 –  
Item approved**

*Item V*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve ‘The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019.’*

**The President:** If we can move on now, please, to Item V.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

1210 Item V this evening is the 'The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019'. A letter has been received from Mr McKinley as Chairman of the General Services Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the 'The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019'.

1215 **The President:** Mr Dean, you have the Convener's remarks?

**Mr Dean:** Sir, there were no comments on the Item.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
1220 Now, I think this one is being, again, proposed by Mr McKinley.

**Mr McKinley:** Yes indeed sir. Yes it is. Do you want me to speak now?

**The President:** Yes please.

1225 **Mr McKinley:** Thank you very much, sir.

This is one thing that we really have not discussed in great detail. We have discussed the Water Board and other such things in detail, this has been ongoing for 30 years. It quite amazes me that the Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 has not been approved until this date 30 years later.

1230 I do not quite know what the delay has been about, but it really only applies to, I think, a couple of small companies on this Island. It is really looking to the inspection, specifically to do with hiring a vehicle rather than private ownership of a vehicle. It is looking at the insurance of that vehicle, which obviously is also specific to hiring, and it is looking for a licence. Without going into detail, that is one once small place, I do not know what the details are, other than it is not surprising that there is such a Law, and there should be such a Law.

So I ask you to agree to it.

**The President:** Thank you.  
1240 Mr Gentle, you are going to second this.

**Mr Gentle:** Mr President, fellow Members: better late than never.  
Thank you.

1245 **The President:** Does any Member wish to speak?  
Mr Dean.

**Mr Dean:** Like Mr McKinley, I am not quite sure what happened here, but it was something, when the General Services looked at it, that they found that the Law had not been enacted.  
1250 I would also like to declare an interest, and from that point, I will not be voting on this.

**The President:** Yes, thank you very much Mr Dean. That is noted.  
So can we now – Mr Snowdon.

1255 **Mr Snowdon:** Sorry, President ...

I just wanted to say, 30 years? Is there anything else outstanding that needs to be done here at all? Because 30 years is a long time for this not to be dealt with and it does raise the question of if there are any other Ordinances or something that does need to be passed. It is something that needs to be looked at quite seriously, I would say.

1260 Thank you.



**The President:** Does any other Member wish to speak?

Mr McKinley, would you like to exercise your right to reply to that question?

1265 **Mr McKinley:** I would just say, well, it proves that we are doing some other work – we are doing some other homework and have gone back 30 years now!  
Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

1270 Could we move to the vote please, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Thank you.

The States of Alderney are asked to approve 'The Hired Motor Vehicles (Alderney) Law, 1989 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2019'.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Ms Burgess	None	Mr Dean
Mr Dent		
Mr Earl		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr Jean		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Snowdon		

1275

**The Greffier:** Sir, 8 votes in favour and one abstention.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

## **VI. Questions and Reports – Questions for verbal reply**

*Item VI*

*The following questions have been received:*

1. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*Can the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain what is being done by the States of Alderney to create a healthy economy, with job creation for the 20 to 40 age group?*

2. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*Following the Vision workshop last week with States members, could the Chairman indicate when a public workshop will take place?*

3. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*It has been stated our population has increased, could the Chairman indicate which age group has seen the most increase?*

4. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*Does the Chairman agree, the States of Alderney should introduce a clear set of energy policies related to delivery, cost, and security of energy, which should also include exploring ways to help improve existing housing stock?*

5. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance update the States of Alderney on the PSO process, with any meetings which may have taken place?*

6. Question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:

*Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain any developments with the Alderney Ambulance Service (AAS)?*

7. Question from Mr Dent for the Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation:

*Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise activities in the States of Guernsey since the last meeting of the States of Alderney?*

1280 **The President:** If we can now move to Item VI.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item VI this evening is Questions and Reports and a total of seven Questions have been received.

1285

**The President:** Do we have a particular order in which they were submitted or shall we just take Mr Snowdon on the basis that he has got the most?

1290

**The Greffier:** We did receive Mr Snowdon's five Questions first, followed by the one from Mr Dent and then the sixth Question from Mr Snowdon. So you may wish to take the first six in a row for ease.

**The President:** But before I do, I am going to invite Mr Dean to give us the Convener's Report.

1295

**Mr Dean:** Mr President, colleagues.

At the time of the People's Meeting, I was aware there were five Questions. I read out the five Questions which were submitted to the Chairman of Policy and Finance by Mr Snowdon and there were no comments on that Item. I advised Mr Dent that as he would be addressing the answers to those Questions in States, he did not need to reply.

1300

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

### Creating a healthy economy for 20-40 age group

**The President:** Mr Snowdon.

1305

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues. Questions to James Dent.

Can the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee explain what is being done by the States of Alderney to create a healthy economy, with job creation for the 20-40 age group?

Thank you.

1310 **The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, I think these Questions should have been asked elsewhere and I would like to ask why this Question has not being put to the Chairman of the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development. In the circumstances, I think it would be a little improper  
1315 of me to respond, except, perhaps, with some generalities and history.

The Chairman of the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development may be inclined to give you a more detailed response should you direct your question to him on, perhaps, another occasion. And as you already know, the principal action of the Committee which I chair, the  
1320 Policy and Finance Committee, was the setting up of this Sub-Committee specifically to progress matters such as the ones you are talking about. As you also know, the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development has carefully thought out terms of reference. You yourself had much hand in writing their mandate.

Your Question does, nonetheless, provide me with the opportunity to inform everyone that Alderney's Economic Development was discussed two weeks ago at the most recent meeting of  
1325 the Bailiwick Council. At the meeting, officers serving Guernsey's Committee *for* Economic Development offered to assist all three jurisdictions in the Bailiwick with practical technical help and developing economic plans. It was envisaged that the assistance might have at its core a focus on complementary, rather than competitive, activities. Appropriate measures aimed towards ensuring that each Island mitigated any negative impacts on their sister Islands might  
1330 also receive their support. As you are aware, Alderney has but few resources to do planning of this type and we should welcome any technical help from Guernsey, with its much larger resources.

I am pleased to say that Sark too welcomed the initiative, so there is now the prospect, possibly for the first time, of all three Islands working together; a joint venture to promote the  
1335 Bailiwick as a whole, rather, and to co-ordinate, the current independent efforts on each of the Islands. It will of course be for the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development to decide whether or not to accept Guernsey's offer. But given that Guernsey is keen that Alderney attracts more younger working age new residents and fewer people of retirement age, I expect that help in the specific area you are suggesting could be forthcoming next year.

You may also remember that an integrated approach, such as this, was being promoted by Alderney as one of the key principles in any review of the 1948 Agreement. Usefully, it seems  
1340 that we may be able to achieve one of our goals outside the framework of the 1948 Agreement discussions.

If I may, I would like to conclude this answer with a rather personal opinion. Government  
1345 intervention is most successful when it concentrates on developing the sound infrastructure and regulatory environment within which the private sector can flourish. P&F's own efforts, which are outside the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development, have been concentrated in this area via the promotion, for example, of the Partnership Law, and via the repatriation of certain taxes, so that they can be properly tailored to the needs of Alderney, rather than focused  
1350 on the prevailing economic climate in Guernsey. These actions are of course not things that are aimed specifically at the single age category. They are aimed at business in general.

We might, of course, make it easier for persons and families to come and settle with, for example, help in relocation and finding housing. I have advocated the creation of an at arm's  
1355 length development company: a one-stop shop for entrepreneurs that could assist with the finding of premises, advising on staff, housing and regulation, and business mentoring. A facility aimed specifically at those interested in setting up businesses here, and in which, in fact, I think

would be something that people in the age category you speak of would be particularly interested in.

1360 Finally, one very important thing we can all do is talk up our economy. Those few who put it out that the Island is facing some kind of downward spiral are really doing us no good at all. I try to think positive and I hope you do too.

Thank you.

**The President:** Do you have a supplementary question, Mr Snowdon?

1365

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, yes I do.

1370 I would like to ask – Thank you, Mr Dent, you did answer that Question and it referred to the Bailiwick Council – was Economic Development from Guernsey at that meeting or just Deputy Brouard at that meeting? Because it is very good news and hopefully our Economic Development Committee will work on that. I just wondered who was actually representing? You said about this sometimes working thing between the Bailiwick, and also, hopefully, the Channel Islands with Jersey, fingers crossed.

**The President:** Thank you. Mr Dent.

1375

**Mr Dent:** Yes, there was indeed a representative, a senior level technical officer, whose name I am afraid escapes me at the moment, but I can supply it, sir, at some later date. But it was a very senior person who gave the input.

Thank you.

1380

**The President:** Does any other Member have a supplementary question arising out of the response given by Mr Dent?

**Mr Jean:** I would –

1385

**The President:** Mr Jean, please.

**Mr Jean:** – like to ask a question.

1390 Condor Ferries has changed ownership in recent years. Would the Chairman agree with me that perhaps a letter should be written to the new owners of Condor Ferries to see if they would manage and run a ferry if Alderney were to buy one?

The reason I say this is because, as an economic enabler for Alderney, it would be a very important thing to do, bearing in mind that unfortunately this year the Little Ferry, through weather, had to cancel 25 of its operational runs. My point is we need a proper ferry to service –

1395

**The President:** Mr Jean, I hesitate to –

**Mr Jean:** Okay, thank you. I am done.

1400

**The President:** You have asked your question.

**Mr Jean:** I am done.

**The President:** Thank you.

1405

Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Jean, I am very happy to assist with writing letters of all kinds. Condor Ferries operate very large ferries. They are incredibly expensive and I really cannot see how we would

1410 be buying a ferry that Condor might be interested in running. But let's put your idea to P&F, please.

**The President:** Thank you. Does any other Member have a question arising out of Mr Dent's answer?

1415 Mr Dean.

**Mr Dean:** Step wearily into this, sir, fellow colleagues.  
I am a little bit confused, because I thought Mr Jean actually sits on the Sea Transport Action Group?

1420 **The President:** Please refrain from comment. It is a question to Mr Dent.

**Mr Dean:** Okay. Would Mr Dent not agree that as Mr Jean sits on the Sea Transport Action Group that would be for them to deal with?  
Thank you.

1425 **The President:** Very neatly done there, Mr Dean.

**Mr Dent:** Most certainly Mr Dean. I would agree wholeheartedly. *(Laughter)*

1430 **Mr Jean:** If I could do anything with the Sea Transport Group. I have got opposition.

**The President:** Thank you for that additional comment.

1435 **Mr Jean:** Thank you, sir, for allowing it.

**The President:** Does anybody else have a question arising out of Mr Dent's answer?

#### **Date of a public workshop following Vision workshop with States Members**

**The President:** Okay, move on now to – (**Mr Snowdon:** Question 2.) your second Question Mr Snowdon.

1440 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

Following the Vision workshop last week with States Members, could the Chairman indicate when a public workshop will take place?  
Thank you.

1445 **Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, you were a participant in the workshop, so I suspect you may already know the answer. As you may remember, we went through some, I think it was 150 responses, categorising them all and indicating our own preliminary view in regards to their practicality and priority. The workshop concluded with the Civil Service agreeing to assemble the responses and these preliminary views into a format that would be digestible by both ourselves and the public.

1450 This clearly needs to be done before any public workshop can take place. And, as you know, no date was set. But like you, no doubt, I would like to see it move as rapidly as is practical and given all the other matters that we and the Civil Service are now dealing with, some of which are high priority, and some of which are lower priority.

1455 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, supplementary question.

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, I thank Mr Dent for outlining his answer. However, I think it was 170 responses and my concern is – and I thank everyone took part in some questionnaire, I think it was over a year ago when it took place – that I do not feel that it has actually gone to the whole of the public. Therefore, I am concerned that only 170 responded. How would he get more people to engage, to go forward with a vision that has ... whether it be people at school, schoolchildren or the old people at the Connaught – everyone – to get part of it? I think the 170 is not enough.

So what I am concerned about is that we are going forward with a vision of only 170, when we should have far more great a pool from the population of this Island. Therefore, how do we get that engagement with a workshop or something?

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, I do not think we were saying that we would not have the workshop; simply that we had not yet got a date for it.

Thank you.

**The President:** Does any other Member have a supplementary question that they would like to put? No?

#### **Age group with greatest increase in population**

**The President:** In that event, we can move on to your third Question, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you.

Could I just clarify where this Question has come from? It is basically with Mr Roberts' report to the States of Guernsey that this is a query. So that is why I have asked you this Question tonight.

It has been stated our population has increased, could the Chairman indicate which age group has seen the most increase?

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Yes I could.

First of all, I would like to say that the Alderney Electronic Census gives information on this and that, rather than undertake a piecemeal analysis, I think Members, and indeed all interested members of the public, should read that document in order to gain a really proper understanding of this subject. If I could refer them to Table 2.4.1, Table 4.1.1, and Table 4.1.2, because a single statistic does not paint a picture.

However, and in order not to completely disappoint you, I have extracted some data and undertaken my own analysis. During the year ending 31st March 2018, we had 196 immigrants and 144 emigrants. 78.6% of these immigrants were in the age group 16 to 64, 16.8% were in the age group 64 to 85 and there were no immigrants aged over 85. Emigrants formed 71.5%, 15.3% and 0.7% respectively of these categories.

During the period 2012-18, and in real numbers terms, the 65-84-year-old group has been increasing the most, at a rate of about 14 persons per year. In 2012, they formed 25.9% of the population, in 2018 they formed 31% of the population. In terms of the proportion of the population that each of these age groups comprises, it is the over 84-year-olds that have grown

1505 most rapidly. In 2012 they formed 3.3% of the population, later, to 2018 data, suggesting they now form 5.6% of the population. In other words, over a six-year period the proportion of the population over 84 has multiplied by a factor of about 1.7.

I will be very happy to give you that in an electronic format if you have not been able to write it down so far. There is a whole report with all those tables, with more data than you will ever care to imagine.

Thank you.

1510

**The President:** Well, there you are, there is an answer. Do you have a supplementary question?

1515 **Mr Snowdon:** Just a brief one. I just thank Mr Dent for going through the statistics on that. I would also like to say to Mr Dent, of course we are trying to get that 20-40 age group coming to Alderney too.

Thank you.

1520 **The President:** Mr Earl, you have a supplementary question.

1520

**Mr Earl:** Mr President, fellow States Members, would Mr Dent care to agree with me that we are facing a demographic time bomb?

**The President:** Mr Dent.

1525

**Mr Dent:** I would agree. Thank you.

**Mr Earl:** Good.

1530 **The President:** Does any other Member wish to ask a supplementary question? No?

### Introduction of clear set of energy policies

**The President:** In that event, your next Question, please, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

1535 Does the Chairman agree the States of Alderney should introduce a clear set of energy policies related to delivery, cost, and security of energy, which should also include exploring ways to help improve existing housing stock?

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Dent.

1540

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, you have been keeping me busy for the last couple of days.

1545 Mr Snowdon, I have long advocated clear policies on all manner of subjects and sadly this remains an elusive dream. I find your link to our energy policy and housing stock interesting, but it is not clear to me what you have in mind. If you are promoting a green, carbon neutral future which involves greater use of electricity and this through economies of scale leads to reductions in the unit cost of that electricity, I would of course support your suggestion. There are, however, many other ways of improving our existing housing stock, which I am sure I would also support.

1550 Finally I am not actually sure that I know your own views on this subject. May I suggest that you elaborate on these, perhaps in one of eminent fortnightly journals?

Thank you.

**The President:** Do you have a supplementary question in response to that Mr Snowdon?

1555 **Mr Snowdon:** I do absolutely, Thank you, Mr Dent.

I am glad you said that, because I have got the energy policy here, written in 2018 for the States of Alderney. So just wondering when we are going to implement this one or another one. I am not quite sure if you were part of this one, but it was part of the Energy Group that we did have with Mr Jean, myself and civil servants, started by Martin Thornton in February 2018 and edited in May 2018 by Andrew Muter, our current CEO. So I was just wondering if we should actually do something with this or just put it back the shelf with all the dust?

1560 Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, as you probably know, I was not a member of that group. I actually thought you were a member of that group. Am I wrong?

**The President:** Well, let's not get involved in –

**Mr Dent:** Am I wrong? Yes, yes.

1570

**Mr Snowdon:** A point of clarification, or order?

**The President:** Point of information.

1575 **Mr Snowdon:** Point of information, thank you, sir.

That group was disbanded, with myself and Mr Jean, and now we are on the Tidal Group together.

Thank you.

1580 **Mr Dent:** I know we are on the Tidal Group –

**Mr Jean:** And if I could add, I was removed from the Group and never knew why. *(Laughter)*

**Mr Dent:** To tell the truth, I thought that the recommendations of the Group were moving ahead, so I stand informed.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Mr Gentle, you have a supplementary question.

1590 **Mr Gentle:** Mr President, colleagues, would the Chairman of P&F agree with me, then, that the absence of this energy policy manages to politically handcuff Alderney Electricity Ltd?

**Mr Dent:** That is an interesting question, and I think my instant reaction is that it possibly does, yes.

1595 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you. Does any other Member have a question?

Mr Dean.

1600 **Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow colleagues.



Would Mr Dent not agree, then, that perhaps this energy policy should be tabled at the next States Meeting for debate?

Thank you.

1605 **The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Dean, I am always happy to debate matters of this sort. You have my support for that, I do not know about the rest of my colleagues, sir –

1610 **The President:** Let's not go into that now. *(Laughter)* Does any other Member have a question for Mr Dent?

Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

1615

**Mr Dent:** He has asked his supplementary question.

**Mr Snowdon:** No, it is not a supplementary question.

1620 **Mr Dent:** Oh, it wasn't. *(Interjections)*

**The President:** We have had that, we have moved on now to the next Question. So it is not just me!

#### Update on PSO process

1625 **Mr Snowdon:** Question 5, could the Chairman of Policy and Finance update the States of Alderney on the PSO process, with any meetings which may have taken place?

Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, I think you already know the answer to this as well.

1630 The last meeting was the one which you yourself attended on Tuesday, 12th November, when the whole of P&F met with Members of the Guernsey Committee *for* Economic Development. As I remember, and I hope you do too, we stressed the need for a three-plane solution and we stressed the need to retain the Southampton link.

1635 As you also know, we have had no feedback. We do not know what the Committee *for* Economic Development recommended to P&R, and on 28th November, we wrote to P&R seeking information. The letter was circulated to yourself and copied to the President of the Committee *for* Economic Development. In this letter, as you may remember, we offered to meet with the Policy & Resources Committee to discuss constructively how we might be able to move forward and provide some certainty to the Island and its community.

1640 We have not had a response to this letter. I have recently written again asking for some indication of the next steps in this process and reiterating our offer to engage constructively with P&R to find the best way forward.

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Snowdon, do you have a supplementary question?

1645

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, yes, sort of.

1650 I am concerned we have not had a response to that letter and I think it is so important that I will be going down to Guernsey, hopefully tomorrow, but I think you should be going down to Guernsey as well, Mr Dent, and finding out what has happened at that Committee, because that Committee does owe us, I think, the outcome of those discussions that we had with that recommendation before it goes to Policy & Resources. It is very important that we know how we are going forward and how we are moving forward as an Island.

Thank you.

1655 **The President:** Mr Dent.

1660 **Mr Dent:** I support a number of the things you have said. We have been advised that the correct time to engage is when we have had some kind of response from P&R, and also when we know what the conclusion of the PSO process has been. Until that time, we have somewhat tied hands. But I take your point very clearly and I do take it on board as important.

**The President:** Thank you. Does any other Member –?  
Mr Dean.

1665 **Mr Dean:** Mr President –

**The President:** Busy night! (*Laughter*)

1670 **Mr Dean:** – fellow colleagues, would Mr Dent not agree, it is very disappointing that 30 days have elapsed since that meeting took place? Obviously, I was at that meeting, we were aware we would be hearing by Mr Parkinson, the President of the Economic Development board, that we would have some clarification on what was going on. The PSO process seems to have gone on and on and on, and it is affecting Aurigny, it is affecting everybody here's livelihood and I think it is unacceptable that we still do not know what the outcome from that is.

1675 **Mr Dent:** Mr Dean, yes, I will agree.

**The President:** Thank you. Is there any other –?  
Ms Burgess.

1680 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.  
Just to actually agree with Alex's statement and – sorry, Mr Snowdon –

**The President:** It has to be a question to Mr Dent.

1685 **Ms Burgess:** Oh, sorry. Okay, the question is, would you consider maybe going across to Guernsey to have a conversation without actually being invited, but perhaps put yourself forward to almost bring it up into the conversation, that we need to address this, as Chair of P&F?

1690 Thank you, sir.

1695 **Mr Dent:** Mrs Burgess, yes. I mean, I think I answered that in response to Mr Snowdon's question, that we have got one or two minor impediments in regard to the PSO that have not been closed, and we do not want to somehow shoot ourselves in the foot, either legally or in any other way, by doing this in the wrong process or in the wrong manor. But yes, I would consider all these things and I would consider these things day-by-day almost all the time. And the Air Transport Action committee is meeting regularly – at least once a week – and these things come up at those meetings every week.

Thank you.

1700

**The President:** Thank you. Does anybody else have a question?

### **Developments with the Alderney Ambulance Service**

**The President:** In that event we can move to your last Question, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, fellow colleagues.

1705 Could the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain any developments with the Alderney Ambulance Service?

**The President:** Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, yes, we have already had a statement that the President delivered.

1710 If I could just go back a bit, the Alderney Ambulance Service has been informed by the St John Ambulance in Guernsey about some serious safety problems with the Alderney Ambulance Service which they had identified when they provided cover during the summer. As a consequence, they proposed a review be undertaken by an independent person.

1715 The Alderney Ambulance Service requested that the States help fund the review and on Friday, 25th October, during discussions between the CEO and all P&F Members, this was unanimously agreed. It was noted that States funding would enable the States to see any final report. Given the potential problems for the Ambulance Service, it was considered important that the States was able to understand what was happening.

1720 On that Friday, 25th October, the question as to whether a formal resolution was required was raised. Our CEO explained that this was not necessary, because he could approve the funding with the powers delegated to him as Chief Executive. He did, however, not want to do so without having consulted us. With this, it was agreed that the CEO could proceed.

1725 The Policy and Finance Committee appointed Mr Harris as their representative to liaise with the Alderney Ambulance Service, and Mr Harris has been doing this. The Finance Committee appointed both myself and Mr Harris to liaise in regard to financial issues. We have both been doing this.

1730 On Monday, 2nd December, we both attended a briefing by the independent reviewer. Mr Stephen Taylor, our strategic financial adviser, was also present. There were clearly important and serious challenges for the Alderney Ambulance Service to deal with. On Wednesday, 4th December, about two and a half hours before the People's Meeting and while I was in Guernsey, I learned of the industrial action about to be taken by the ambulance crew. On Friday, 6th December, following a workshop on another matter, the CEO briefed eight Members of the States who were attending about the developing situation. The report from the independent reviewer was received by the States today. It sets out a number of serious concerns which the President read out in the Statement at the beginning of this meeting.

1735 This is a situation which neither the Alderney Ambulance Service nor the States can allow to continue. The Alderney Ambulance Service board has therefore informed the States that it cannot continue to provide a safe service. The States will now work with key stakeholders to put in place short-term cover and to develop a model of ambulance cover which will work for the Island in the longer term.

1740 Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank Mr Dent.

Mr Snowdon, do you have a supplementary question?

1745 **Mr Snowdon:** I do, thank you, sir. I do not know what my supplementary question is because there are so many.

I am concerned about all of this, because we seem to have gotten into a mess, and the States of Alderney was not involved and then we are involved and we have not been involved. What I would really like to know is what mediation has taken place, or that we know has taken place, before the events that unfolded today?

1750 I think I received an email at 4.30 p.m. today, which was the Report, which I believe you and Mr Harris, who was appointed, saw early last week. It was not passed on. I am very concerned about this. It has going into an awful situation and obviously, I have not gone through the Report in detail, but there are other issues in there. But there are ways of writing reports and there are ways of trying to put a positive outcome of how you are going to do that –

**The President:** Mr Snowdon, you are now –

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, I –

1760 **The President:** I think the point of your question was there, and I think Mr Dent can answer it –

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes – mediation was my question. Thank you.

1765 **The President:** Yes, thank you.

**Mr Dent:** Mr Snowdon, on the subject mediation, I think it is not for me to involve myself in that matter. I know that the President made a certain offer, but that is for the President to speak about. I am concerned solely, and I do emphasise solely, with the obtaining, in the coming weeks or whatever, a safe ambulance service for the Island. This is an internal dispute between the board of the Alderney Ambulance Service and its staff.

1775 **The President:** On a point of order, Mr Dent, I was approached – (**Mr Dent:** Oh, pardon.) and invited.

**Mr Dent:** Pardon me – I do apologise.

**The President:** It is okay. Does any other Member wish to ask a question?

1780 **Mr Jean:** I would, if I may.

**The President:** Yes, of course you may, Mr Jean.

1785 **Mr Jean:** Thank you, sir.  
Would the Chairman agree with me that the present ambulance crew have run without any public complaint at all and could the Chairman tell me –

**The President:** You have had your question.

1790 **Mr Jean:** Well, I would like to ask one more.

**The President:** Well, you are only entitled to ask one, Mr Jean, I am afraid. It is a supplementary question.

1795

**Mr Jean:** Oh, well then may I change it and scrub that one? (*Laughter*) I do wish to ask this second one – rather important. Could the Chairman tell me who asked for the Report? Who actually initiated the Report itself?

1800 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.  
Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** May I answer both questions?

1805 **Mr Jean:** I would be grateful, I would be pleased.

**Mr Dent:** Well, it will only take a second. The board of the Alderney Ambulance Service asked for the Report. I am totally unaware of complaints or otherwise regarding the Ambulance Service, so I cannot answer.

1810 **Mr Jean:** That says a lot, doesn't it?

**The President:** Thank you.

1815 **Mr Jean:** Thank you.

**The President:** Does any other Member wish to put a supplementary question to Mr Dent? Okay. Well then, that concludes your Questions, Mr Snowdon.

1820 **Mr Snowdon:** Yes.

**The President:** Yes, thank you.

#### **Summary of activities in States of Guernsey since last States of Alderney meeting**

**The President:** And I think we have got one final question from Mr Dent, Mr Greffier.

1825 **The Greffier:** Yes sir.

**Mr Dent:** I am just trying to find the wording of it but ... Thank you very much.  
Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise activities in the States of Guernsey since the last meeting of the States of Alderney? I am of course aware that we only have one Representative here today.

1830

**The President:** I am sure Mr Snowdon is up to the task.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir. I will take that as a compliment.

1835 The States of Guernsey is going on at the moment – well, not now, but has been going on today – and Mr Roberts is down there. I have stayed so I can ask those Questions to Mr Dent and go through this with colleagues tonight.

Just to emphasise, there is quite a lot to go through and, Mr McKinley, I do not want take up too much of your time. So I will try and be brief.

1840 Just going to the States –

**Mr McKinley:** It is not just my time.

**The President:** Please.

1845 **Mr Snowdon:** – of Guernsey Annual Budget for 2020: some of you might be aware there were some aspects there for the States of Alderney to be noting and a little bit concerned about. So if I go through point 31., it was basically saying that the grant from the States of Alderney is to be treated ... sorry, the cash, from a cash limit to a grant, as it is going to be treated in the future. So therefore, it is classed as a grant rather than a cash limit. I think we might just need to  
1850 think about how that works in 1948 Agreement, when those talks happen.

With the Alderney Gambling Control Commission, the States of Alderney capital allowance is up to 31st December 2020 and it is written in here. Now we are going to dispute that, that is our money and that they should not be writing it in here. Myself and Mr Roberts did emphasise during the debate the importance of that gambling money. I think earlier, when we had our  
1855 other Items in the Assembly today, I highlighted about £5.5 million for GSC projects coming up, but that is mainly funded by our gambling funds. So if we took that away, how are we going to put those vital infrastructure projects and beyond? That was all highlighted in the debate and I think the Deputies understood that. However, it seems like that battle may happen next year, because it is only 2020.

1860 Also, the same sort of item, with the £300,000 to the Alderney Economic Development Fund, came up as well. That is point 33, and that is to 2020 again. Mr Harris and the Committee worked very hard on that, and that has paid for things like the Little Ferry, Sure internet updates and everything, faster internet. So I would emphasise that that is very important for us and that was made through the debate – that that was vitally important.

1865 During some of the debate, the question that ... I think this has been reported already – Mr Brouard came out with a statement about the working streams with the 1948 Agreement. I think you yourself have written a letter regarding that matter, because we did not know anything about that at the time, and we made that known at the time – that we do not actually know or have agreed those working streams that we are going to be working on with the 1948  
1870 Agreement.

**Mr Dent:** Point of order, sir.

**The President:** Mr Dent.

1875

**Mr Dent:** I would just like to confirm that that letter has been written.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you. I thought I said you did write it, but thank you. If it is in the post, great.

1880

**Mr Dent:** Well, you just said ‘maybe’. You were just saying ‘maybe’.

**Mr Snowdon:** Great, okay. So that letter has been written and hopefully outlining how the aspects of those follow.

1885

The PSO did come up in some of the debates during the States of Deliberation – there has been quite a few – and Charles Parkinson did say that he will be discussing the matter with the States of Alderney. That has now happened. I think my earlier questions highlighted that we do actually need to know the outcome of what Economic Development is recommending to Policy & Resources.

1890

Mr Jean highlighted, actually already, about the 10% rate rise in TRP, which will come into effect in 2020. It is my understanding that the States of Alderney will be readjusting in 2021. However, that 10% will be affecting us and we have actually got another 5% there as well.

1895 Steve Roberts at the last States gave a general update on the Alderney situation, which was similar to your Chairman's Report for P&F, and highlighted issues and positive green shoots which we do need to promote.

1900 There were certain questions from Deputies. One of them was, actually, can Guernsey plug into the Atlantis tidal farm? And I think there needs to be a bit of clarification that that tidal farm is in our waters, in Raz Blanchard, and it is only phase one. So potentially, yes, but it is a long term vision. So I think the press releases at the time may have got a bit confused down in Guernsey.

1905 Another question that came up was basically, from the Deputies in reply to Mr Roberts' Annual Report to the States of Guernsey: what controls do we have over people moving to the Island? And Mr Roberts basically did highlight, it is not a control we have, but we do have work permits for those people that are working. However, there seems to be mood in Guernsey that there need to be some restrictions on people coming in and going onto the healthcare system straightaway. I think that is something that we need to discuss – about how people may move to the Island and how they may have to have some sort of paid-up scheme before they go onto the healthcare service.

1910 Governance reform was asked to Mr Roberts as well. I do not think he really answered that question. Another one that came up was the Belle Vue was asked about. Mr Trott made some statements that we rebuffed quite a lot at the time. We also had the runway requête for a Guernsey Airport business case to extend it. Personally, I think there might be some opportunities, if that did happen, for Alderney to try and get people that do travel through Guernsey to get costs down. But, obviously, we want to see our runway done first as well. And at  
1915 the moment we have got the general election stuff going on down in Guernsey moving forward.

1920 I did have a conversation with Deputy Peter Ferbrache and some of you may remember that he did make that offer to come up to Alderney and meet with us, which he did do, but also have some sort of engagement over Aurigny with the public. He is now saying that he is more than happy to do that, as long as Aurigny win the PSO. So that will be after February, but we do not know the outcome of the PSO. That is the situation with that one.

1925 We also did have meetings with Mr Harrison and the electric planes. I think that is quite an early thing, but it is an interesting thing. I suggested to Mr Harrison that Cranfield University and Rolls-Royce, who he is apparently in partnership with, or working with, should be more than welcome to come to all of the Islands, including Alderney, and do some sort of presentation about how that may take off.

I think those are the main bits I will get across now. I am happy to answer questions, if anyone has got any. Thank you.

1930 **The President:** Mr Dent, do you have a supplementary question?

**Mr Dent:** No, I do not. Thank you.

**The President:** Does any other Member have a question for Mr Snowdon?

1935 I think, in that event, that concludes this evening's business. Mr Greffier, would you bring the Meeting please, to a close.

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 7.48 p.m.*