



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF THE

ISLAND OF ALDERNEY

HANSARD

The Court House, Alderney, Tuesday, 14th January 2020

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Alderney website www.alderney.gov.gg*

Volume 8, No. 1

Present:

Mr William Tate, President

Members

Ms Annie Burgess
Mr Mike Dean
Mr James Dent
Mr David Earl
Mr Kevin Gentle
Mr Christian Harris
Mr Graham McKinley
Mr Steve Roberts
Mr Alexander Snowdon

The Greffier of the Court

Mr Jonathan Anderson

Business transacted

Billet d'État for Wednesday, 14th January 2020	5
I. Opening of the States of Alderney Annual Meeting.....	5
Convener's Report of the People's Meeting held on 8th January 2020.....	6
II. Election Procedure – Following elections agreed to be by verbal vote	6
III. Election of Vice President – Mr Dent elected.....	7
IV. Appointment of Auditors – KPMG Channel Islands Limited appointed	7
V. Appointment of Committee Chairmen – Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Mr Dean appointed.....	8
VI. Appointment of Members of the Policy and Finance Committee – Nine States Members appointed.....	9
VII. Appointment of Committee Members of other Committees – Ms Burgess, Mr Roberts, Mr Dean, Mr Harris and Mr Gentle elected to GSC; Ms Burgess, Mr Snowdon and Mr Gentle elected to BDCC	11
VIII. Other Appointments: Commonwealth Parliamentary Association – Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Ms Burgess elected.....	12
IX. Other Appointments: St Anne's School Management Committee – Mr Gentle appointed	13
X. Election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation – Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon elected; Mr Earle and Mr McKinley as Alternatives	14
XI. Code of Conduct Review Panel – Five members appointed.....	15

XII. Questions and Reports – Eight questions for verbal reply.....	16
Alderney Ambulance Service next steps	17
Impact of reduced summer timetable for Southampton-Alderney route	19
Swimming pool update	20
PSO progress and likely date for debate	21
Little Ferry Company subsidy this year and start of service	22
Progress with drafting employment legislation	22
Aurigny’s planned use of one aircraft plus one back-up.....	23
Summary of activities in States of Guernsey since last States of Alderney meeting	24
Thanks on behalf of the community to Ambulance Service volunteers	26
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 6.26 p.m.</i>	26

PAGE DELIBERATELY LEFT BLANK

States of Alderney

The States met at 5.30 p.m.

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Greffier

The Greffier: Good evening, Mr President.
If you are ready, I will proceed with the roll call.

5 **The President:** Yes, please.

The Greffier: I understand you have received apologies from Mr Jean this evening.

The President: I have.

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

Billet d'État for Wednesday, 14th January 2020

I. Opening of the States of Alderney Annual Meeting

10 **The Greffier:** Sir, that is nine Members present this evening, and for convenience, I confirm that concludes Item 1 this evening, the opening of the Annual Meeting.

The President: Thank you very much indeed, Mr Greffier.

15 May I just welcome everybody that has braved the weather this evening, and just briefly explain that this is the only meeting of the year that we are required to hold by Law. The purpose of the meeting is to elect the various Chairs of various committees and representative bodies, and it is a meeting that we are required to have as soon as practicable after 1st January.

So it will be slightly different to our normal States meetings, but nevertheless I am sure everybody will find it extremely interesting.

**Convener's Report of the People's Meeting
held on 8th January 2020**

20 **The President:** So we start now with the Convener's Report from Ms Burgess, if you please.

Ms Burgess: Thank you.

25 So the People's Meeting of 8th January 2020 at the Island Hall at seven o'clock: myself as Convener, assisted by the Executive Officer to the Chief Executive & Acting Head of Finance; States Members were seven, excluding myself; President; Minute Secretary; public were 17; and the press were four. We received apologies from Mike Dean.

30 **The President:** Now before you take your seat and in an attempt to stop you having to get up and down throughout the evening, unless the Greffier tells me that I am overstepping the mark, I think we can perhaps agree that in respect of Items I to VIII, there were no comments at all from the public.

Ms Burgess: Yes, confirmed.

35 **The President:** So Mr Greffier, can we take that as read.

The Greffier: Noted, sir.

40 **The President:** Thank you.
Could we move now, please, to Item II.

**II. Election Procedure –
Following elections agreed to be by verbal vote**

Item II.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve:

That the following elections should be by verbal vote, otherwise Rule 20 of the Rules of Procedure of the States Alderney, shall come into operation, i.e., voting shall, unless the States otherwise resolves, be carried out by written ballot.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

Item II this evening is Election Procedure.

45 The States of Alderney are asked to approve that the following elections should be by verbal vote, otherwise Rule 20 of the Rules of Procedure of the States Alderney, shall come into operation, i.e., voting shall, unless the States otherwise resolves, be carried out by written ballot.

50 **The President:** Thank you. Just for the benefit of those who have attended, this is rather unusual in that the Rules require that all of the ballots should be done in writing, so effectively a secret ballot. But the Members can agree that the voting should be open so that everybody hears how they cast their votes.

Again, I understand that all the Members would be happy that that resolution were passed.

Ms Burgess: Yes.

55 **The President:** Is that correct? Would anybody object?
Then that passes, Mr Greffier, I think.

60 **The Greffier:** Sir, noted that it passed without a vote.
In which case, I will move Item III, if you are happy?

The President: Please do.

**III. Election of Vice President –
Mr Dent elected**

Item III.

The States of Alderney is asked to elect a Vice President for 2020.

The Greffier: Item III this evening is the Election of the Vice President and the States of Alderney is asked to elect a Vice President for 2020.

65 **The President:** Now, Mr Dent, I understand that you wish to offer yourself in the role of Vice President?

Mr Dent: Mr President, I would be honoured to hold that position.

70 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
And I understand that you would be proposed by Mr Roberts?

Mr Roberts: That is right, sir.

75 **The President:** And seconded by Mr Harris?

Mr Harris: Yes, sir.

80 **The President:** Are there any other nominations for the role of Vice President?
Then in that case, Mr Dent, I am delighted to confirm that you will be the Vice President for the next year.

Mr Dent: Thank you.

85 **The President:** Next Item, please, Mr Greffier.

**IV. Appointment of Auditors –
KPMG Channel Islands Limited appointed**

Item IV.

The States of Alderney is asked to appoint KPMG Channel Islands Limited to be the States' Auditors for 2020.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

Item IV this evening is the Appointment of Auditors.

The States of Alderney are asked to appoint KPMG Channel Islands Limited to be the States' Auditors for 2020.

90

The President: Now, we do not have a proposer or a seconder for this Item because again it is a matter that is prescribed by law. But Mr Dent will briefly explain to you the nature of this Proposition.

95

Mr Dent: Mr President, colleagues, this is really just a piece of housekeeping. The appointment of KPMG for another year has been discussed in the Finance Committee, and it is our recommendation that it is approved here in the full States.

We may be considering next year other auditors, but this year we are recommending the continuation of KPMG.

100

Thank you.

The President: Thank you. Does that meet with everybody's approval?

Mr McKinley: Yes.

105

The President: Thank you.

Could we now deal, please, Mr Greffier, with Item V.

V. Appointment of Committee Chairmen – Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Mr Dean appointed

Item V.

The States of Alderney is asked to elect the Chairmen of the following Committees:

- 1. Policy and Finance Committee*
- 2. General Services Committee*
- 3. Building and Development Control Committee*

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

110

Item V is in three parts and is the appointment of the Committee Chairmen. The States of Alderney are asked to elect the Chairmen of the following Committees: the Policy and Finance Committee; the General Services Committee; and the Building and Development Control Committee.

The President: Thank you.

115

So firstly we will take the Policy and Finance Committee. Again, I understand, Mr Dent, that you will be proposed for this position and you will be proposed by Ms Burgess (**Ms Burgess:** Yes.) and seconded by Mr Gentle.

Are there any other nominations for the role of Chair of P&F?

So I think that is confirmed.

120

The next item is the General Services Committee – again the Chair of that Committee. Again, Mr McKinley, I understand that you wish to serve in that role.

Mr McKinley: Yes, please, sir.

125

The President: You will be proposed by Mr Dent (**Mr Dent:** Yes.) and you will be seconded by Ms Burgess.

Ms Burgess: Yes, thank you.

130 **The President:** Are there any other nominations for that Committee?
The job is yours.

Mr McKinley: Thank you, sir! *(Laughter)* With pleasure!

135 **The President:** And finally, the Building and Development Control Committee. Again, Mr Dean,
I think you would like to offer yourself again for the Chair of this Committee.

Mr Dean: I would, sir.

140 **The President:** And that you would be proposed in that by Mr Gentle and you would be
seconded by Mr Harris.

Mr Harris: Yes, indeed.

145 **The President:** Are there any other nominations for the Chair of the Building and Development
Control Committee?
There we are. So you, Mr Dean, are duly confirmed.
Item VI, please, Mr Greffier.

VI. Appointment of Members of the Policy and Finance Committee – Nine States Members appointed

Item VI.

*The States of Alderney is asked to elect a minimum of two Members in addition to the
Chairman, to the Policy and Finance Committee.*

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

150 Moving on: appointment of members of the Policy and Finance Committee. The States of
Alderney are asked to elect a minimum of two Members in addition to the Chairman, to the Policy
and Finance Committee.

155 **The President:** This is where it gets more complicated.
Mr Dent, would you care to nominate, please, a member of the Policy and Finance Committee?

Mr Dent: Mr President, if I may, may I nominate Mr McKinley?

Mr McKinley: Thank you, sir.

160 **The President:** Have we a seconder for Mr McKinley. Ms Burgess?

Ms Burgess: Yes.

165 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr McKinley: Sorry, what am I?

The President: A member of Policy and Finance.

170 **Mr McKinley:** No, not finance – oh, Policy and Finance? *(Laughter)*

The President: Yes. It's all good, Mr McKinley!
Is everybody happy with Mr McKinley being on the Committee? You're in.

175 **Mr McKinley:** Thank you, sir.

The President: Now, the Members were very kind in supplying me with a document last night indicating their preferences for the Committees on which they wish to sit and I have to say, as you can see so far, it has made the process seamless.

180 So I propose to deal with it in this way. I understand that the remaining eight Members wish to be members of the Policy and Finance Committee. Is that confirmed?

A Member: Yes.

185 **The President:** May I ask, Mr Dent, if you are prepared to nominate all eight members to serve on Policy and Finance.

Mr Dent: Mr President, I am indeed prepared to nominate all eight Members, on the understanding that any Member who may wish not to serve make himself or herself known before.
190

The President: Well, I think I had already ascertained that everybody wants a seat at the table. Ms Burgess, are you happy to second that proposition?

195 **Mr Burgess:** Yes, I am.

The President: Thank you.

That being the case, Mr Greffier, does that mean we can avoid all those votes and take it as read?
200

The Greffier: Sir, there seems to be the agreement amongst the Members and yourself, so I cannot see there being any objection.

You should probably note for the record that you have also spoken to Mr Jean, who has confirmed his agreement to –
205

The President: I am very much obliged to you. I ought to have explained that unfortunately Mr Jean is indisposed this evening but I have spoken to him by telephone this afternoon and he has confirmed to me that he wishes to be a member of the Policy and Finance Committee. And so in those circumstances, and I understand there would be no objection from the other Members, he can be appointed in his absence onto that Committee.
210

Thank you, Mr Greffier, for that.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

215 **The President:** Item VII, please.

**VII. Appointment of Committee Members of other Committees –
Ms Burgess, Mr Roberts, Mr Dean, Mr Harris and Mr Gentle elected to GSC;
Ms Burgess, Mr Snowdon and Mr Gentle elected to BDCC**

Item VII.

The States of Alderney is asked to elect the members of the following Committees, in addition to the Chairmen:-

- 1. A minimum of two Members to the General Services Committee*
- 2. A minimum of two Members to the Building and Development Control Committee.*

The Greffier: Item VII this evening, sir, is the appointment of Committee Members to other Committees. This is obviously in two parts.

220 The States of Alderney are asked to elect the members of the following Committees, in addition to the Chairmen, that being a minimum of two Members to the General Services Committee and a minimum of two Members to the Building and Development Control Committee.

225 **The President:** Dealing firstly with the General Services Committee, I understand that Ms Burgess, Mr Roberts, Mr Dean, Mr Harris and Mr Gentle would all seek election on to that Committee. Is that the position?

Two Members: Yes, sir.

230 **The President:** That being the case, would you like to propose that as Chair of that Committee, Mr McKinley?

Mr McKinley: Yes, indeed, sir, it makes sense: they are the Members of last year and there will be continuity within that.

235 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Would you care to second that, Mr Snowdon?

Mr Snowdon: Absolutely, sir.

240 **The President:** Thank you. Does anyone have any objection to that course? Then I think we can take that one has read, Mr Greffier.

245 **The Greffier:** Thank you. Just for clarification, that was Ms Burgess, Mr Roberts, Mr Dean, Mr Harris and Mr Gentle.

The President: Yes. Moving at pace.

250 **The Greffier:** In which case, I suggest we move on to the Building and Development Control Committee.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

255 The Building and Development Control Committee of which Mr Dean is now the Chair. I understand that the following Members would wish to be elected to that Committee: Ms Burgess, Mr Snowdon, Mr Gentle, and that makes a total of four. So Mr Dean, would you like to propose those three colleagues?

Mr Dean: Yes, I would, sir.

The President: Who would like to second? Mr Roberts.

260

Mr Roberts: I will second.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.
Any other nominations?

265

Mr Snowdon: I would just like to nominate Mr Dent, maybe.

The President: Mr Dent, do you wish to accept that nomination?

270

Mr Dent: I must respectfully decline. I did indicate yesterday, as Mr Snowdon will note, I had a certain willingness but I have received certain advice since then that it is possibly not appropriate. Thank you.

275

The President: Thank you. Just for the sake of clarification, would that advice involve your role as the Chair of P&F and your role on the BDCC?

Mr Dent: It would indeed, thank you.

280

The President: Thank you very much indeed.
So does anybody else have any other comments to make about the proposed members of the BDCC?
There we are. So that deals with Item VII.

285

The Greffier: Sorry, just again for clarification, Ms Burgess, Mr Snowdon and Mr Gentle, in addition to Mr Dean as Chairman.

The President: Yes, I am sorry, I will slow down.

**VIII. Other Appointments:
Commonwealth Parliamentary Association –
Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Ms Burgess elected**

Item VIII.

The States of Alderney is asked to elect three members to sit on the Management Committee in the affairs of the Alderney Branch of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (the President being Ex-officio Chairman) for 2020.

The Greffier: Are you ready to move on to Item VIII in that case, sir?

290

The President: Yes, please.

295

The Greffier: That is the Other Appointments – the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association. The States of Alderney is asked to elect three Members to sit on the Management Committee in the affairs of the Alderney Branch of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association, yourself, sir, being the ex-officio Chairman, for 2020.

The President: Thank you.

Now again, I have been helpfully informed that Mr Dent, Mr McKinley and Ms Burgess, you would all like to be elected to that Committee?

300

Ms Burgess: Thank you.

The President: Are there any other nominations for that Committee? Would somebody please like to propose those three Members.

305

Mr Snowdon: I am happy to propose, sir.

The President: Thank you, Mr Snowdon. A seconder, please? Mr Harris.

310

Mr Harris: Yes, happy to second.

The President: Thank you. There we are. That is the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association, duly elected.

315

The Greffier: Just for clarification, sir, no one else did want to stand, did they?

The President: No, I do not think so, but thank you for reminding me.

**IX. Other Appointments:
St Anne's School Management Committee –
Mr Gentle appointed**

Item IX.

The States of Alderney is asked to resolve to appoint, for a period of one year, renewable at the next Annual January Meeting, one member as a Representative on the Management Committee of St Anne's School.

The Greffier: Thank you, sir.

320

Item IX this evening therefore is St Anne's School Management Committee. The States of Alderney is asked to resolve to appoint, for a period of one year, renewable at the next Annual January Meeting, one Member as a Representative on the Management Committee of St Anne's School.

325

The President: I am afraid, I am going to have to ask you now to rise and give us the Convener's Report, please, Ms Burgess.

330

Ms Burgess: Sir, at the People's Meeting, a member of the public commented that last year when Mr Gentle stood for election as representative on the School Management Committee, he declared an interest, as a member of his family is employed by the School. The latest exam results and quality of teaching at the School is of great concern to this member of the public and the States should consider electing an alternative Member.

No other comments were made.

335

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Now, I understand, Mr Gentle, you would wish to be the representative of the State on the School Management Committee and you would be proposed by Mr Dent and you would be seconded by Mr Harris.

340 **Mr Gentle:** Yes, sir.

The President: Are you content with that?

Mr Gentle: Thank you, sir.

345 I thank my fellow States Members for their support and confidence. I am delighted to be nominated to this position again.

We have made some inroads as a Committee this past year, but there is still a lot to be done. I very much look forward to giving my input over the next 12 months to help take the School even further forward, always mindful of keeping my fellow States Members informed if and when things need to be brought to their attention.

350 To precis what I said last year, this appointment will once again be entered on my declaration of interest form held by the Greffier, in order to allay any fears of conflict – the point we have just heard about. As a community, we need to support the School strongly and I urge everyone to do so.

Thank you.

355

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

So in the absence of any other nominations, is everybody happy with Mr Gentle in that role? Thank you, Mr Greffier. We move now please to Item X.

X. Election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation – Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon elected; Mr Earle and Mr McKinley as Alternatives

Item X.

Following the procedure as laid out in the Resolution of The States of Alderney dated 18th October 2006, and the Plebiscite election of 17th December 2018, the States of Alderney is asked:

(a) To elect two members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation for 2020, and

(b) To elect two other members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation as Alternative Representatives for 2020.

360 **The Greffier:** Item X this evening is the election of Alderney Representatives to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation

Following the procedure as laid out in the Resolution of the States of Alderney dated 18th October 2006, and the Plebiscite election of 17th December 2018, the States of Alderney is asked (a) to elect two Members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation for 2020, and (b) to elect two other Members to sit in the Guernsey States of Deliberation as Alternative

365

Representatives for 2020.

The President: Ms Burgess, were there any comments at the People's Meeting?

Ms Burgess: Thank you. Yes.

370

A member of the public queried whether the same two Members will be elected and he wished for it to be noted that these two Members do a very commendable job representing the Island in the States of Deliberations on all the issues the Islands face. He wanted to thank them.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

375 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, that is it from me.

The President: This one is something of an anomaly because the Plebiscite votes the Representatives for two years, but we have to confirm that within the Rules of this Chamber every year. So there is a convention and that convention is that the States support the result and
380 outcome of the Plebiscite.

So what that would mean in practice tonight is that were elected by the community and therefore it would be the convention that the States would approve them. So does not meet with everybody's approval?

385 **Several Members:** Yes.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

In addition we have to elect two Alternates, who in the event of a problem can go down to Guernsey. Now, again this follows from the election result: Mr Earl and Mr McKinley.

390 Are all the Members content that the resolution will reflect that they have been duly elected? And finally, Mr Greffier.

XI. Code of Conduct Review Panel – Five members appointed

Item XI.

Under Part III, Item 12.2 of the Code of Conduct, the President shall appoint up to five members of the population on the electoral roll to form the Members' Conduct Review Panel.

The States of Alderney is asked, on the recommendation of the President, to appoint the following members to the Conduct Review Panel for a three year period until the meeting of the States of Alderney in January 2023:

Mr Peter Allen

Mr Peter Cunningham

Mrs Helen McGregor

Mr Matthew Birmingham

Mr Donald Hughes

The Greffier: Item XI is the Code of Conduct Review Panel.

Under Part III, Item 12.2 of the Code of Conduct, the President shall appoint up to five members of the population on the electoral roll to form the Members' Conduct Review Panel.

395 The States of Alderney is asked, on the recommendation of yourself, sir, to appoint the following members to the Conduct Review Panel for a three-year period until the meeting of the States of Alderney in January 2023: Messrs Peter Allen, Peter Cunningham, Matthew Birmingham, Donald Hughes, and Mrs Helen McGregor.

400 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

I would just point out there has been a slight change because, as you know, we have now adopted a new Code of Conduct procedure and so the appointment now is for three years, as opposed to one which it was formerly. I am informed by all those five people that they are quite content that they should be appointed on that basis.

405 I understand that those appointments find favour with the Members. So we, I think then, can take it as read that those five people, one of whom is in the Gallery tonight, will be appointed.

The Greffier: If that is the resolution, sir, did you want to get a proposer and a seconder?

410 **The President:** Yes please. Who would care to propose that? Mr Gentle?

Mr Gentle: I would, sir, thank you.

415 **The President:** And second, Mr Dent.

Ms Burgess: And also, just to say, there were no comments at the People's Meeting about that.

The President: Thank you.

And that I think, Mr Greffier, concludes the election process.

XII. Questions and Reports – Eight questions for verbal reply

Item XII.

The following questions had been received:

Questions received from Mr Alex Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy & Finance Committee:

(1) Could the Chairman explain what the next steps are with the Alderney Ambulance Service?

(2) Following the release of the summer timetable, can the Chairman explain the impacts for our island with over 4,000 seats lost on the Southampton-Alderney route?

(3) Does the Chairman have any updates about the swimming pool, taking in to account five years have now passed with no swimming pool for the schoolchildren?

(4) Could the Chairman confirm any progress with the PSO and when it is likely to be debated?

(5) Can the Chairman confirm if the States of Alderney will be supporting the Little Ferry Company this year with a subsidy, and when the service will potentially start?

Question from Mr James Dent for the Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation:

Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise their activities in the States of Guernsey since the last meeting of the States of Alderney?

Question from Mr Kevin Gentle for the Chairman of Policy & Finance Committee:

If the Chairman is able, could he please explain how much, if any, progress has been made with the drafting of employment legislation and if he can indicate when something concrete might be put in front of us?

Question from Mr Steve Roberts for the Chairman of Policy & Finance Committee:

Would the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain to the public his view on just how Aurigny's plan to use a single aircraft with just one back-up aircraft is going to work?

420 **The Greffier:** Yes, sir.

The only matters outstanding are Questions and Reports.

I understand, sir, you have received a total of eight questions this evening.

425 **The President:** I have this evening, yes. Now, if you allow me a moment to locate them.

Yes. Thank you very much indeed. Now again, Mr Snowdon has five questions. Mr Snowdon, to save you having to get up and down and up and down, would it be easier if I read the questions?

Mr Snowdon: Yes, absolutely.

430 **The President:** Thank you very much.

So we have received five questions from Mr Snowdon. Can I also say that Members are entitled to a supplementary question arising out of the answer which has been given by the appropriate Chairman, and you will recall that hitherto I have always kept asking the question 'Does any other Member have a supplementary?' I think we can probably do away with that now, and I can simply
435 say if any Member has a supplementary question, would he please indicate very clearly to me and then I will call upon him to speak. So it just makes the whole process run a bit more smoothly – I hope.

Alderney Ambulance Service next steps

The President: So we will start with Mr Snowdon's question and this is a question for you in your new role, Mr Dent, as Chair of Policy and Finance. Could the Chairman explain what the next
440 steps are with the Alderney Ambulance Service?

Mr Dent: Thank you. Let me start by summarising what has happened to date.

Firstly, this dispute began as an internal one between the board and its crew. The States of Alderney were not running the ambulance service.

445 Secondly, the board has now, however, handed the service over to the States and the board is no longer running it.

Thirdly, the State is now operating the service, with the help of volunteers.

Fourthly, and most importantly, the prime concern of the States is that going forward we have a safe 24 hour, seven days a week service.

450 That is the history and I continue. On 11th December, the Policy and Finance Committee resolved unanimously to ensure that there were short-term and there could be long-term arrangements in place for such a safe ambulance service.

Short-term arrangements were put in place over the Christmas and New Year period under the leadership of the Chief Fire and Rescue officer and 14 volunteers were trained to enable a basic service to operate. I am grateful. Indeed, I think we should all express our sincere thanks to those
455 who have stepped forward to ensure this safe service.

Over the holiday period, a number of priority one calls to the service – possibly more than normal – took place. These included a suspected heart attack, a fall, seizures, fractured limbs and a head injury. There were also police assistance requests and mental health injuries.

460 On Thursday last week we had the opportunity to review the situation. Amongst other things we looked at how the service had coped. I am pleased to report tonight the feedback we have had on that day from our professional partners in health delivery. If I may I will simply quote them: 'Their attitude to their patients has been nothing short of exemplary. They are efficient, kind and compassionate with their patients.'

465 I could now invoke the spirit of Sir Winston Churchill, who is reported to have said, 'Never let a good crisis go to waste', and I think others may have also laid claim to saying it. But with these words in mind, I would like us all to try and be optimistic and work hard so that we come out of the situation in a better position than we went in.

470 So yes, we have had a crisis and there are things still to resolve. Most importantly, we now have an opportunity to think clearly about the type of service we want going forward. For example, we need to consider whether the practices in the UK and elsewhere are appropriate for Alderney. A hospital is never more than a flight and a drive from any incident or home, and I have heard it said that the concept of scoop and run is possibly more appropriate for Alderney than

475 would be replicated under functions of a UK or even Guernsey-type operation. This is a matter we need to consider carefully and take advice on.

We need also to consider the type of oversight we need. None of us States Members are experts in ambulance transfer services – another reason for taking advice from those who are. On Island the views of the IMC and hospital are of paramount importance.

480 So going forward – these are my views because, as you know, P&F has not yet been able to formally debate the options – for the moment I believe we should take no precipitous action. We should allow the current arrangements to continue. To date the public and professional feedback for the services has been good, but we need to see how things go.

485 On the matters where we need to take decisions, we should take advice and consider the options and request that our CEO comes back to us with cost assessment and perhaps a recommendation. And so I am pleased that the stakeholder group of the appropriate professionals has been established and is working with the Civil Service on proposals. These will be brought forward for a political decision in the next few weeks.

I do not wish to pre-empt the proposals but only emphasise again that I believe we must have sound clinical governance, strong leadership and a well-trained and supportive crew.

490 Finally, although not directly related to ambulance affairs, we should all push hard for the rapid introduction of the employment legislation we all agreed to last year. I think that what happened in December has highlighted a need for this.

Thank you.

495 **The President:** Before you sit down, Mr Dent, may I just ask you to clarify one point for people who do not understand and perhaps have never heard the expression ‘scoop and run’. What does it mean?

500 **Mr Dent:** I think, Mr President, it means that you pick up the patient as carefully as you can and you take them to a place where there will be proper medical services on hand for immediate attention.

The President: Yes, that sounds far more elegant! (**Mr Dent:** Does it?) It does, thank you.

505 **Mr Dent:** Thank you.

The President: Mr Snowden, please.

510 **Mr Snowden:** A supplementary question, if that is alright, President. (**The President:** Yes, please.)

515 We had the Richard Webber presentation or talk with him. I would just like to get some clarification because we have got the two sets of fire engines – one set of fire engines at the airport and one to do the rest of the Island. I would like some clarification: do we need two sets of ambulances ready if there was an incident – hopefully not, but – a car crash at the Lighthouse and an incident at the Airport? Is it still operational with only one ambulance? Or do we need two ambulances?

I am a little bit concerned that we might only have one ambulance operational and if there is an incident, my question is can the Airport still function if there is a call-out for an ambulance somewhere else on the Island?

520 **The President:** Mr Dent.

525 **Mr Dent:** I believe Mr Webber gave an opinion on this, during his presentation to ourselves when you were there. I think I can really only quote his view on this matter at the moment. That was that in terms of the numbers of call-outs we have, we are rather better provided for than the

UK, where the average length of time for someone who has suffered a fall, receiving attention from an ambulance can be up to four hours. We I think get very rapid attention.

The chances of two incidents happening at any one time are very low indeed. But yes, it does happen and it is all a matter of probability and what we all find to be acceptable.

530 As regards the Airport, Mr Webber drew our attention in fact to the situation in Stansted where indeed ambulances are supposed to be on call within 15 minutes, but in fact, it is well known that when ambulances are called to the airport in Stansted, they take often 30 to 45 minutes to arrive. So he made the point that this is deemed quite acceptable in the UK.

535 Obviously, we would like as much proper cover as is possible to obtain, but belt and braces in everything does cost money. I am sure we will all have an opportunity to consider exactly what we need in the coming time.

Thank you.

The President: Any further questions for Mr Dent? Thank you.

Impact of reduced summer timetable for Southampton-Alderney route

540 **The President:** Your second question is: following the release of the summer timetable, can the Chairman explain the impact for our Island with over 4,000 seats lost on the Southampton-Alderney route?

545 **Mr Dent:** Firstly, Mr President, we are continuing to review the new timetable. You have been involved in meetings on this subject so you are as aware, I think, of the answers that I am about to give as anyone.

550 Secondly, the new timetable does indeed show – it is actually about 4,400 reduction in the number of seats on offer on the Southampton-Alderney link but this has been offset by an about 4,200 increase in the seats on offer on the Albany-Guernsey route. I would not want anybody outside of Alderney to think that we will be cut off to the extent that we have lost 4,000 seats *per se*.

But while this Aurigny reorientation is disappointing, our greatest worry centres on the resilience of Aurigny operation, particularly when only one of the two aircraft they may have could be absent for servicing.

555 Having said this, the impact on our Island of a reduced direct service to Southampton remains a matter of conjecture. Personally, I believe it could be devastating; but as you know, we are assembling material that hopefully will show the impact in a more quantitative, less conjectural manner.

560 As long as Guernsey's Policy & Resources Committee remain unready to finalise their position in regard to support for our vital landings and we have consequently no commitments from Guernsey to either re-wing or to provide extra capacity from other sources, Aurigny are in a difficult situation. It is rare that I defend Aurigny, but in this instance I must. We in Alderney are, on the other hand, bitterly disappointed that Guernsey's Policy & Resources Committee have not taken up our offer to discuss the wider options.

565 Because of these uncertainties, during December, we were lobbying both Aurigny and Guernsey Airport in order to obtain an as close as possible service to the one we had last year. The States of Alderney are of course continuing to explore all options for maintaining and improving both the resilience and the services on offer.

570 As you know, there are a number of measures we are taking to determine whether the hold-ups within P&R are for legitimate or for illegitimate reasons. There are a number of good reasons to pursue separately the restitution of the 2019 timetable and a final outcome for the PSO. As you also know, detailing this in public might be a little counterproductive.

Thank you.

575 **The President:** Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, President.

Would the Chairman of P&F agree that this is very damaging for the Island and it has been downgraded before the PSO has come to a final decision?

580 I would also like the Chairman to hopefully agree that though the MoU is not legally binding, it is not setting the level that the MoU has got in that agreement that is in place and that is very concerning at this stage.

The President: Crafty tool there Mr Snowdon! *(Interjection by Mr Snowdon and laughter)*

585 I think it is the first meeting of the year: Mr Dent, if you are happy to answer it.

Mr Dent: On the grounds that it is the first meeting of the year, I would be very happy to answer it.

590 I think, Mr Snowdon, I actually said that I believe it could be devastating. You said 'very damaging' – I am not quite sure what the difference is, but anyway ...

The MoU no longer exists, I am sad to say – or maybe I am not sad to say – but the fact of the matter is that the MoU ceased to exist on the last day of last year. Aurigny basically said they were not going to continue to comply with it or to agree with it. So questions about it are pointless.

595 **The President:** Would anybody else ... ?

Okay, thank you.

Swimming pool update

The President: Now, we will move on Mr Snowdon to your third question. Does the Chairman have any updates about the swimming pool, taking in to account five years have now passed with no swimming pool for the schoolchildren?

600 Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Thank you.

Mr Snowdon, as I am sure you know, this is not a States of Alderney project. Your question might therefore have been more appropriately put to the trustees. In short the answer is no.

605 Mr Gentle, who is our representative dealing with education matters and has just been re-elected to the management board of St Anne's, has however been liaising with the Guernsey Committee for Education, Sport and Culture and he is very hopeful that the funds will be forthcoming, if the result of a Bailiwick-wide policy to provide swimming facilities to primary schoolchildren is favourable. However, the policy letter dealing with this has still not appeared.

610 Should this come about, then there does of course remain the question of wider community access. Matt Fallaize, President of the Committee for Education, Sports and Culture, stands ready to consider any proposals for support and assistance in relation to the community pool.

615 However, we must be very mindful of the difference between a pool funded by Guernsey purely for the use of schoolchildren and a community pool for the youth of everyone. Mr Fallaize has been in talks with relevant parties, but he is acutely aware that the impetus has to come from Alderney and that the trustees may need to be the drivers.

As I think you know, we are all keen to see this project completed. I would finally remind him that Guernsey has not given us permission to spend any more than the £250,000 we have already put into the project. A little lobbying with Guernsey might consequently be useful and perhaps as

620 an Alderney Representative in the Guernsey States of Deliberation, you could help unblock the financing, if and when needed at the time.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Snowdon, a supplementary question.

625

Mr Snowdon: Yes, thank you.

Just referring to the £250,000 given from the States of Alderney, from public money, could you just clarify whether there were any conditions when that was given at the time?

Thank you.

630

The President: Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: You catch me off guard (**Mr Snowdon:** Sorry.) and I must confess, I am unaware of any conditions that may or may not have been imposed, but I am sure those can be found out quite easily.

635

The President: Thank you.

Does anybody else have anything to say about the swimming pool?

Thank you.

PSO progress and likely date for debate

640 **The President:** The fourth question, Mr Snowdon, again to Mr Dent: could the Chairman confirm any progress with the PSO and when it is likely to be debated?

Mr Dent.

645 **Mr Dent:** As Mr Snowdon knows, as Chairman of Policy and Finance, I have no more insight into where on earth the PSO process has got to than he does as an Alderney Representative in the States of Guernsey. Repeated requests have been made without success to the States of Guernsey for information or opportunities to be consulted or even just an idea of decision timetables.

Again, as I referred, in my last question, he has a voice in the States of Deliberation: perhaps he could inform us later during this meeting of what he knows.

650

I have previously reported my communications with the President of P&R: two letters and a telephone conversation from myself, offering to enter into discussions. As you know, the President of P&R is saying little, other than that there will be a debate when P&R have reached a recommendation that they can put to the States of Guernsey.

655

The President: Thank you.

Mr Snowdon – pass? (**Mr Snowdon:** Pass.) Any other Member?

Little Ferry Company subsidy this year and start of service

The President: We now move to Mr Snowdon's final question again to Mr Dent: can the Chairman confirm if the States of Alderney will be supporting the Little Ferry Company this year with a subsidy, and when the service will potentially start?

660 Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: Mr Snowdon, when the Policy and Finance Committee have a proposal for support for another season of the Little Ferry in front of it, I am sure it will be well received. I know that opportunities to look at the larger capacity vessel are underway, but I am not clear whether the regulatory hurdles for this can be cleared.

665 I understand that the Surface Transport Action Group has met or is meeting to discuss ferry transport and I hope they will be able to provide further advice to the Committee in due course.

For my own part, I can only confirm that if the proposal was to repeat the support we gave last year, then I would support it. If the proposal is for something else, then I and I hope all of us will first have a look at both the costs and any increased benefits for the Island.

670 Thank you.

The President: Mr Snowdon.

675 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

Would the Chairman agree, it was fantastic work by Little Ferry last year, but it would very helpful if the timetable came out soon, so people could look ahead and know what is going on. And I hope you would agree that the Transport Action Group could hopefully sort that out and push something to P&F?

680 Thank you.

Mr Dent: I would agree.

The President: Thank you. Anybody else?

685 Thank you. Well, that concludes, Mr Snowdon, your questions. Thank you.

Progress with drafting employment legislation

The President: I propose to deal next with a question from Mr Gentle to the Chair of Policy and Finance and the question is: if the Chairman is able, could he please explain how much, if any, progress has been made with the drafting of employment legislation and if he can indicate when something concrete might be put in front of us?

690

Mr Dent: Mr Gentle, yes. Following the resolution of the States in June last year, dialogue has been held with the Law Officers to explore how appropriate progress could be made in introducing basic employment legislation – indeed, alongside the development of minimum wage legislation and disability legislation.

695 A report will be considered at the next Policy and Finance Committee, which will request the Committee to take a view on which aspects of the Guernsey Law may be relevant for inclusion within the drafting work being undertaken now by the Law Officers.

The Guernsey Law included – this is for your information – statutory requirements for minimum periods of notice and dismissal, statutory definitions of the grounds for unfair dismissal, and the ability to adopt codes of practice and deploy legal powers in respect of employment practice.

700

705 The Policy and Finance Committee will need to determine whether it wishes to include only some or all of these matters in a basic Alderney Employment Law. In addition to this, some thought will need to be given to enforcement. I think it is unlikely that an industrial disputes tribunal could operate in Alderney in the same way that it does in Guernsey.

I for one look forward to further debate on this matter in the Policy and Finance Committee and in due course, in the full States of Alderney.

710 **The President:** It sounds very positive, Mr Gentle.

Mr Gentle: Thank you.

The President: Do you have a supplementary question?

715 **Mr Gentle:** No, I don't, sir. Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Aurigny's planned use of one aircraft plus one back-up

720 **The President:** Mr Roberts, we can move now to you. Again, it is a question for Mr Dent: would the Chairman of Policy and Finance explain to the public his view on just how Aurigny's plan to use a single aircraft with just one back-up aircraft is going to work?

Mr Dent.

725 **Mr Dent:** Before answering this, I need to provide very briefly some background information. The recently published Aurigny summer timetable is clearly based on the operation of a single Dornier at any one time and this is something that is termed in the aviation industry as a single line of flying. Aurigny will of course have at their disposal both of their Dornier 228 NG aircraft but are choosing to use just one of these aircraft and hold the other in reserve as back-up. You might initially not see a problem with this, but we, if not Aurigny, are going to have a major problems.

730 Our problems will occur during the not infrequent periods of scheduled and scheduled maintenance when there will be just one aircraft to undertake this single line of flying and no back-up. When one aircraft is already out of service for maintenance and Aurigny finds a need for unscheduled maintenance on their back-up, or should there be weather disruptions, or should a medevac disrupt the timetable, Aurigny will be without the capacity to put on replacement flights.

735 Put very simply, in these fragile periods should the remaining only serviceable aircraft then go 'tech', we will find ourselves without any service. And sadly, given the weather we have, Aurigny's history of going tech, and just the more modest disruptions that medevac flights cause, this is possibly going to happen too often.

And so in answer to you, my colleague, it is not going to work.

740 **The President:** Thank you. Do you have a further question for Mr Dent?

Mr Roberts: Yes sir, please.

Does the Chairman know if we have a contingency plan in place for 2020?

745 **The President:** Mr Dent.

Mr Dent: We do not have a definitive contingency plan but we are working on options. I think Mr Roberts is well aware of what we are doing, and for the reasons I explained earlier, I do not think we want to go into any great details.

750

The President: Thank you. Does anybody else wish to ask the question? Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Yes, thank you. Yes, I think you can answer this question. Would the Chairman agree that to ... I'd better ask one question, hadn't I? Would the Chairman agree that we should be wet-leasing some sort of aircraft to make sure that there are three available to serve our Island? Thank you.

755

Mr Dent: I think that is one solution, certainly, Mr Snowdon, yes. I think that we need to explore all options and this is one very clear option.

760

The President: Thank you.

Summary of activities in States of Guernsey since last States of Alderney meeting

The President: Now we move on to the final question which has been submitted by Mr Dent and this is his usual request to our Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation. Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise their activities in the States of Guernsey since the last meeting of the States of Alderney?

765

So either Mr Roberts or Mr Snowdon – who would like to kick off? Mr Roberts.

Mr Roberts: Thank you.

Well, last month, there were a lot of election procedures and various other reports, so we did not get a great deal of chance to ask the searching questions that we like to ask. The opportunities do arise from time to time, and when you are not expecting them as well, so you have always got to be ready for an opportunity.

770

Last month I suggested to Economic Development that a joint economic plan be drawn up between Alderney and Guernsey, as it makes sense to work together to improve our economy here, if Guernsey have some input into drawing business to the Island. So I did ask that question. It was well received actually.

775

If I could go on to tomorrow's meeting, is that alright? Tomorrow's meeting relates to several questions and a statement from P&R. We had hoped to raise an airlink question from that statement. However, we will miss that as we are delayed tomorrow because they haven't got enough aircraft. *(Laughter)* We were due out at 7.45 and now we are going at 1.30 so we will miss that statement so we will not be able to ask that question. However, we have arranged for that question to be asked in our absence. So we have done a bit of work, Mr Snowdon and myself, and we have managed to get somebody to ask that question. We do have friends in Guernsey and we have a lot of friends within the Assembly in Guernsey and they care about Alderney. It is not all bad.

780

785

Fiscal reviews are coming up this week and GST; and the subject most close to my heart – drug funding parity with the UK and Jersey. There are many new and effective drugs have entered the market. There are some 70 or more and these more effective and sometimes life-saving drugs are not available here in Guernsey or Alderney. We get lesser drugs than the rest of Britain and I find that disgraceful and we will be supporting the upgrade. It is all about priority. Mr Snowdon and myself feel strongly that our sick and elderly are suffering when better drugs and treatments are available.

790

795 We are now lodging written questions on the state of the new timetable, but that is our next thing, where you actually write a question and you get a written answer, but it goes on the website and it goes out into the press. So that is our next line of action.

On the disgraceful aircraft plan that is simply inadequate for Alderney, the time is coming when Alderney has got its back to the wall now. We are going to have to think differently.

We will do our most to support Alderney, its connectivity and its health this week.

800 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Mr Dent, do you have a question for Mr Roberts? No, thank you. Does any other Member have any questions? Thank you.

Mr Snowdon, would you like to make your contribution?

805 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir. So just replying to the meeting in December of the States of Guernsey, there was quite a bit on there. They had the general election, which obviously doesn't affect us, in 2020 – spending limits for the candidates; Home Affairs' Bailiwick security policy. Meetings that we had on that trip as well: we did ask the President for Economic Development if that recommendation for the PSO could be shared with the States of Alderney. Unfortunately,
810 Deputy Parkinson feels it would be inappropriate at the moment, but that has gone to Policy & Resources so we are very much looking to have some sort of consultation on Policy & Resources before that final recommendation comes to the States of Deliberation. So I hope we can push again tomorrow for that.

815 We also had a meeting with Mr Harrison about electric Islanders. That is a future project, that is not going to happen in the next five minutes; that is three or four years down the line with people such as Rolls-Royce and Cranfield University involved in that project. I believe he is coming over shortly to talk to the States of Alderney. So that is quite an interesting thing.

820 I think I might have highlighted this as well but the President for the States' Trading Supervisory Board, which holds the shareholding of Aurigny, informed myself and Mr Roberts that he would give some sort of public engagement or presentation about Aurigny after the PSO, subject to the outcome of the PSO, unless someone else is awarded that contract. So that is a little bit disappointing because I was hoping that was going to happen sooner than later and I think you know that we have been pushing for that for quite some time but I do welcome that Deputy to come over and have some public engagement with us and the community about Aurigny. So we
825 will see what happens with that, hopefully in the close future.

830 Just going on to the January States meeting which will start tomorrow, but unfortunately we are missing the first part of it, where we were hoping to submit some questions about the summer timetable because Policy & Resources will be giving a general update. I think we should be entitled to ask these questions but there is no plane available until lunchtime so we are going to miss the opportunity. As Mr Roberts highlighted, another Deputy will hopefully ask the question on our behalf – fingers crossed. There will be questions from Deputy Dawn Tindall about the Flybe situation, so I recommend you to listen to the radio, if you have got time tomorrow.

There are also ferry links from Deputy Gollop, which I do not know how Alderney may be involved in that somehow, but it will be interesting to see those responses.

835 I am just going to say one thing that I also wanted to highlight with our questions to Policy & Resources that unfortunately we will not be asking tomorrow is also about the Dornier doing other routes which was meant to be serving our Island. I am hearing it is going to Guernsey and Jersey and Guernsey-Southampton so it should really be serving Alderney first, rather than other places.

840 Mr Roberts highlighted the Review of the Fiscal Policy Framework and Fiscal Pressures. Now that is going to be quite an interesting debate and I think there will be a lot of views from a lot of Deputies – you can see the size of the Billet – on that policy letter.

One thing that I would think is on the Alderney side is that GST coming in at maybe something like 8% would be extremely damaging for our Island, and I think our construction industry would be hit quite hard. It is just to see where Guernsey is headed on it, but I think that is something that

845 we need to highlight. The GST, I do not feel ... There might be other options but I think that will be quite damaging, actually, for us because we have got the price of shipping for things. So I think we will try and highlight something during debate, hopefully if we get down there tomorrow.

There is also a bit in about Aurigny that we might try and highlight – value for money and quality of service, maybe.

850 Mr Roberts touched on the Review of the Funding of Drugs, Treatments and Devices, so I think you have covered that area already.

There is also Brexit – hopefully! Finally got here! The Withdrawal Agreement from the UK to the EU impacts of the Bailiwick of Guernsey – that is also coming up. Then we have got charities and non-profit organisations, TV licensing. That is as far as I have written, so I think that is generally what we have got.

855 I am happy to answer any questions if you have got any. Thank you.

The President: Anything, Mr Dent?

860 **Mr Dent:** If I may, yes. Mr Snowdon, a recent States of Guernsey report has highlighted recent GDP growth and the healthy state of the Guernsey economy. Would he not agree that for Guernsey to be putting it out that they are in financial dire straits is possibly not entirely true?

Thank you.

865 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Yes, I would also say that it is important to invest in all of the Bailiwick and that includes Alderney to be possible as well.

Thank you.

870 **The President:** Any other questions? Thank you very much indeed, Mr Snowdon.

Thanks on behalf of the community to Ambulance Service volunteers

The President: Well, that completes the formal part of the evening, but Mr Dent has mentioned the ambulance and I think that I need to say something on behalf of the community. As we were all preparing for Christmas, little did we know that we were going to be faced with a situation which required us to act very quickly and in a way in which it secured the protection of the community. The politicians and the civil servants came together and by acting speedily we were able to diffuse the situation and immediately put into place an interim regime, which meant that everyone was protected. Now, Christmas is not the easiest time of year. We put out a request for volunteers to come forward and there was certainly no shortage. That, in my view, speaks volumes for this community. So I think really, I would like to thank the volunteers who stepped up so manfully, on behalf of the community and say that we all owe them a great debt of thanks.

880 **(Members: Hear, hear.)** Thank you.

Would you care to close the meeting, Mr Greffier?

PRAYERS

The Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 6.26 p.m.