



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**Remote Meeting, Alderney, Wednesday, 13th May 2020**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 8, No. 3**

**Present:**

**Mr William Tate, President**

**Members**

Mr Louis Jean

Mr Steve Roberts

Mr Graham McKinley

Mr James Dent

Mr Alexander Snowdon

Mr Mike Dean

Mr Kevin Gentle

Ms Annie Burgess

Mr Christian Harris

Mr David Earl

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr Jonathan Anderson

**Business transacted**

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor .....  | 3        |
| <b>Billet d'État for Wednesday, 13th May 2020 .....</b>   | <b>3</b> |
| Comments received on the Billet.....  | 3        |
| I. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020 – Proposition carried.....          | 4        |
| II. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2020 – Proposition carried..... | 10       |
| III. Regulations Laid Before the States of Alderney .....   | 12       |
| IV. Questions and Reports – Seven questions for verbal reply and one Report .....   | 13       |
| Covid-19 Crisis – response .....  | 13       |
| Public Service Obligation .....   | 15       |
| Policy & Finance Committee – community assistance .....   | 16       |
| Recovery strategy .....   | 17       |
| Capital funding priorities .....  | 17       |
| Planning application process during lockdown .....  | 20       |
| Port restrictions .....   | 21       |
| Alderney Representatives – summary of interactions with Guernsey .....  | 22       |
| Education Report May 2020 .....   | 25       |
| <i>The Assembly adjourned at 3.56 p.m.</i> .....  | 28       |

# States of Alderney

*The States met virtually at 2.30 p.m.*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

## PRAYERS

*The Greffier*

## ROLL CALL

*The Greffier*

**The Greffier:** Mr President, that is nine Members present. Hopefully, Mr Jean will be joining us presently. That confirms the Meeting is quorate and at present, sir, we have no Members registered to log a proxy vote.

5

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Greffier.

## Welcome to the Lieutenant Governor

**The President:** Before we move into the substance of the Meeting, might I take this opportunity to welcome His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor, Sir Ian Corder, who joins us from Government House in Guernsey this afternoon.

# Billet d'État for Wednesday, 13th May 2020

## Comments received on the Billet

10 **The President:** If we can now move onto Item I please, Mr Greffier, of the Billet.

**The Greffier:** Thank you sir, just to confirm Mr Jean has subsequently joined the Meeting and hopefully he can hear us. You may also wish to just to confirm in line with the regulations if any comments were raised on the Billet.

15

**The President:** I think I am going to ask Mr Dent if he would summarise the comments that we received.

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, Mr President.

20 We received four comments, I think, from one person. A member of the public commented that these are Draconian laws, which place our constitution into abeyance, excluding the electorate from the process of drafting them. The following specific questions were raised:

25 One, why was the Swedish model not considered to introduce control measures by consent? Two, the Emergency Powers are produced by the Civil Contingencies Authority and where the regulations were laid to the Meetings of the States of Alderney by the President, why is there no provision for a petition or electors or for the States to revoke the powers?

30 Three, why have the Regulations which only relate to Guernsey not been removed before placing them before the States of Alderney; and, four, do the Regulations expire automatically and, if so, when.

Mr President, if it is okay with you, I will read a response, as well?

**The President:** Yes, I think that is appropriate in the circumstances.

**Mr Dent:** Okay, I can reply in the following manner. Firstly the emergency is being handled under the Emergency Powers set out in the Civil Contingencies (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2012, which is a Law that was approved by the States of Alderney. Secondly, the CCA is an emergency law-making body and its regulations then permit the Committee for Health & Social Care to make directions. The Committee follows the advice of medical experts and the approach taken in the Bailiwick differs from that taken in other countries such as Sweden and the UK. It has proved to be successful so far.

40 Of course, there is a difficult balance to be struck between dealing with the public health threat and the economic impact. There is however limited scope for taking a different approach in Alderney from that in Guernsey, as our health services are provided through the transferred services arrangement.

45 I represent the States of Alderney on the Civil Contingencies Authority and whilst discussions that take place in the CCA meetings are confidential, changes in regulations are published and the Chairman of CCA, Deputy Gavin St Pier, makes regular public statements on the work.

50 Thirdly, measures that have been taken so far have a wide-ranging impact on us all. They might be described as Draconian but they have been introduced in extraordinary circumstances to protect us. Fourthly, there is provision to revoke the powers and consideration and this is exactly what we are doing here this afternoon. The Regulations do expire automatically after 30 days; but they can be renewed if necessary. Lastly, the Law Officers' advise on the packaging and they no doubt found it easier to put the Regulations into a single package.

Thank you very much.

55 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

**I. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020 –  
Proposition carried**

*Item I.*

*The States of Alderney are asked:*

*Not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020.*

**The President:** Now Mr Greffier, can we now turn to Item I, please.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

60 Item I this evening is the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy & Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020.

65 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Greffier. Mr Dent, I believe you are going to propose this Item?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, yes, I will. I wondered if you wished me to just explain the term ‘not to annul’.

70 **The President:** You have remotely read my mind, so if you would do that, I think that would be very helpful to everybody that is listening.

**Mr Dent:** The term ‘not to annul’ is a little bit difficult, it was certainly difficult to me when I first came across it, and it is possibly particularly difficult for much of the public. It is a double negative and I think something my English teacher would have asked me to avoid using. It is nonetheless lawyer speak and what we are being asked to do this afternoon, if we choose this afternoon not to annul, we will be saying that we are agreeing to the Regulations imposed by the CCA.

75 If you are content, Mr President, I will now go onto propose Item I.

80

**The President:** Yes please.

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, this is really a piece of housekeeping. These are all Regulations made by the Civil Contingencies Authority, all have subsequently been approved by the States of Deliberation in Guernsey and they are required to be placed before the States of Alderney in order that they be not annulled. All Regulations made in this manner must in fact be placed before our States.

85 If you remember, this is an important safeguard, which we in fact reinforced two years ago. We did this by revising our own requirements. Regulations made in Guernsey must be brought before our States within specified periods. Having said this, in these cases the Regulations themselves require this process.

90 You will note the extensive list of headings and the subject matters covered, not something I intend to go into today. I would just like everyone to note the speed at which the Civil Contingencies Authority was required to work and indeed able to produce these Regulations, which came into force in a timely manner.

95 These Regulations were consolidated by the CCA on 16th April and, in their consolidated format, laid before the States of Guernsey shortly thereafter. I believe there are some 150 pages and, for those minded to do it, they are on the States of Guernsey’s Law Office’s website.

100 Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Now, Mr Snowdon, I understand that you are going to second this Proposition?

105 **Mr Snowdon:** I would do sir. Could I reserve my right to speak if that is alright, sir?

**The President:** Yes you may. Mr Greffier, have you received any indications that any other Members wish to speak on this topic?

110 **The Greffier:** Yes sir, Mr Gentle.

**The President:** Mr Gentle then, please.

**Mr Gentle:** Thank you, sir. Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues, I have looked long and hard at this, trying to find where I can actually get this speech in and this is tenuously linked to part two of the Billet Item. We have come a long way on public good will and an indomitable community spirit.

The people of this Island are experiencing economic hardship and are under great stress but, by being in step with Guernsey, and following the scientific lead of the experts, we still have no cases of coronavirus in Alderney. Judging from some of the emails I have seen, it almost seems like a slap in the face to some to accept and re-enact these emergency laws in front of us today.

The people of this Island we are proud to call home have shown themselves to be nothing but trustworthy. We have asked them, and they have consented, to co-operate. We have the situation where we need to be looking at opening certain businesses that can provide a counter service and also policing the number of people allowed in to still maintain social distancing and I believe this is a question that we should be asking the scientists and demanding an answer to, because people are going bust and they want to know why.

The lockdown-exit framework paper –

**The President:** Mr Gentle, please, you have talked about a tenuous link, it is becoming too tenuous, I am afraid. Could you please keep your remarks to the matters which are set out in Item 1 of the Billet?

**Mr Gentle:** Well, Item 1 of the Billet, part two, control of premises, gatherings and movement of persons, I am getting there. If you feel I am straying off the point, please stop me again.

**The President:** Very well, carry on.

**Mr Gentle:** The question was asked about the Swedish model. I believe Mr Dent has tried to answer it. Sweden asked its citizens to practice social distancing on a mostly voluntary basis and, despite not officially declaring the goal of reaching of herd immunity, but augmenting immunity is part of their broader strategy, or at least a likely consequence of keeping their schools, restaurants and most businesses open.

Now Sweden have won praise in some quarters but has also managed to exceed the *per capita* death rates of other Nordic countries and has drawn criticism, in particular, for failing to protect its elderly population. Sweden's response has not been perfect, but it has succeeded in bolstering immunity among the young and healthy.

**The President:** Mr Gentle, I apologise, but I am going to have to stop you because the Proposition is you are being asked whether or not to annul the Emergency Powers Regulations, so that is a simple either yes or no. Frankly, the approaches taken by other jurisdictions do not fall within that. So if you were trying to find a way in which to make this speech, then I commend you for that but I think, as far as this Item is concerned, I really think now that you have said enough.

So, unless you have anything else to say about whether or not you think the States should annul these, then I would ask you to respect that.

**Mr Gentle:** I will sit down, sir, sorry. Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Greffier, does any other Member wish to speak?

**The Greffier:** Yes, I have just heard Mr Roberts.

**The President:** Mr Roberts, please.

165 **Mr Roberts:** Sorry I am late, I am just linking with my mic. You will probably stop me as well,  
Mr President. I do not know, really, what Mr Gentle did wrong there. This legislation we debate  
today encompasses three Islands, including Sark. This emergency guidance is a code for our  
survival and for the wellbeing of all Islands in every respect.

170 It is for the very protection of all in these unprecedented times that we see these guidelines  
laid out in Law before us, however we may feel about them. But these Islands are different and  
they should be treated differently in our respective positions and we need to reapply to tailor all  
that we need.

175 By a combination of some due diligence and great fortune, Alderney remains to be Covid-19-  
free, and with Guernsey doing so well now, there is no rationale not to consider relaxing some  
areas internally –

**The President:** I am sorry, Mr Roberts, you are doing the same thing. You are making a speech  
about the circumstances, not a speech about whether or not we are going to annul these  
Regulations.

180 **Mr Roberts:** Mr President, I will come away from that because you are the President, but I  
want to register a protest at the way you are stopping people talking. If this had happened in  
Guernsey, I would have been allowed to voice this sort of thing, because it is all in relation to this  
matter. Everything.

185 **The President:** Well that may well be the approach taken in Guernsey, but you have read what  
the Proposition is, you are being asked to consider whether or not you are going to annul these  
Regulations.

190 **Mr Roberts:** I may or may not. But I need to make a comment on these various rules and  
Regulations and that is all I am doing, I am talking about these rules and Regulations, because I  
think that Alderney is a special case.

195 **The President:** In which event, limit your remarks to Alderney and not to other parts of the  
Bailiwick.

**Mr Roberts:** Right, I will not mention any other parts of the Bailiwick, sir.

**The President:** Carry on.

200 **Mr Roberts:** Alderney's strong virus-free environment needs to be maintained. A strong access  
control policy will be required to do that. It cannot control measures that are reliant on individuals  
taking their own responsibility to self-isolate for the Island's wellbeing. I think that is a good idea  
– my head is just not only made for wearing a hat!

205 Add to this stricter measure perhaps some testing would give some more insurance to relaxing  
the rules here, us bringing in Alderney's rules here, us bringing the economy back to somewhere  
near the surface internally and restoring livelihood. I will not mention Sark, so I will leave that out.

A hypothetical question, if Guernsey had no cases and a clean Island and then Alderney had an  
outbreak, do you think they would allow day trippers to go to that Island without self-isolation,  
returning on the same day?

210 **The President:** I am sorry Mr Roberts, I have given you some latitude but I think now you are  
straying well away from the Proposition. Please speak to the Proposition, should you annul these  
Regulations or not?

215 **Mr Roberts:** Okay. We have formed a pandemic group, comprised of five members to advise Alderney Policy & Finance on local needs and ways forward. This was opposed. I am glad to say it is a great step forward, laced with common sense and a touch of democracy. I cannot give my thanks to Guernsey, because I am not allowed to, on all their good work, because I have got that written out.

220 I can give our thanks to all our care workers. Every Island is different. Alderney is different, let us get it recognised across the water and tailor Alderney's needs for what we differ.  
Thank you sir, I am finished.

**The President:** Mr Greffier, does anybody else wish to speak?

225 **The Greffier:** I believe Mr Snowdon may do. I understand he reserved his right to speak.

**The President:** Any other Member?

230 **The Greffier:** Not at present, sir, no.

**The President:** Then Mr Snowdon please.

235 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir. Mr Roberts, you have got your microphone on. There is a bit of echo coming back.

**Mr Roberts:** I am sorry.

240 **Mr Snowdon:** Thanks, Mr Roberts. Just touching on what we are presented with today, I very much support what we have brought to the States today. The work of the CCA has been utterly important to keeping the Bailiwick and Alderney safe as we went through these different phases and probably will be as we go forward as well.

245 I would just like to say that we also do have the representative, and Mr Dent has highlighted, on the CCA and there is a representative from Sark, as well as the Committees in Guernsey. So our voice is heard on the CCA. But I think, going forward, if the CCA changes, there may be other Committees that may be formulated and it is important that our voice is heard in the Bailiwick.

Other Members have already touched upon items for Alderney may need to be bespoke, so I am sure Mr Dent is working very hard on our behalf and I know we can consult with Mr Dent; he does update us quite often on the CCA meetings, as much as he can on those items.

250 I would also like to thank, particularly, Deputies Heidi Soulsby and Gavin St Pier for all the fantastic work on the CCA –

**The President:** Again, Mr Snowdon please. Perhaps you could address those issues when you are later asked a question by Mr Dent? Would that be more helpful? I think it would be more relevant than thanks at this stage.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President.

260 I think I would just like to show the CCA, I think we have got to have every faith in the CCA. I know there might be some, not faith, but concerns that Alderney's voice is lost and I am trying to emphasise to the Members, because this is an item for debate and maybe I have not heard all Members speak yet and I do not know if any more Members will speak, but I think it is very important that during the debate on this Item, that personally I explain that I do have confidence in the CCA, so that was why I was outlining the process and the membership of the CCA. I would also like to go on quite strongly on record to thank Dr Brink and her wonderful team who are part of inputting, I believe, onto the CCA.

I think it is really important that we recognise the situation that we have got to now, which is absolutely wonderful, and our voice is heard. But what I wanted to try and give Members some reassurance about, I know it has been discussed at Policy & Resources, that we do have the subcommittee set up and hopefully bespoke options may be looked at by those Members on the States of Alderney.

So there is a process in place and that is what I was trying to emphasise to the Members. Maybe some Members might not support this Item today so I thought it was important, during the debate, that we highlight that.

I could go on, but I think I have probably covered all the points. Thank you sir.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowden. Any other Member wishes to speak, Mr Greffier?

**The Greffier:** I have received no further notifications, sir.

**The President:** Mr Dent, do you wish to exercise your right to sum up?

**Mr Dent:** I would just like to say very briefly that there are ways and means for bespoke solutions for Alderney, within the current Regulations. The current Regulations do not preclude them, but these would have to be reflected in directives that came from the Committee for Health & Social Care, which is the sort of second stage in the process. Please Members, do understand that these arrangements for bespoke things are there.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

So could we now move, Mr Greffier, to take the vote, please?

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. Members are reminded if they could vote using the chat function, either indicating for, against or abstain, and for clarification, the States of Alderney are asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provisions) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020.

As it stands, sir, I cannot see we have had a vote yet from Mr McKinley, Mr Jean or Mr Harris.

**Mr McKinley:** I am not quite sure how to do this, I am afraid, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Your vote in that case, Mr McKinley. (**Mr McKinley:** For.) Mr Jean, are you in position to vote at all? (**Mr Jean:** For.)

*The results of the vote were as follows:*

| FOR         | AGAINST | ABSTAINED |
|-------------|---------|-----------|
| Mr Jean     | None    | None      |
| Mr Roberts  |         |           |
| Mr McKinley |         |           |
| Mr Dent     |         |           |
| Mr Snowden  |         |           |
| Mr Dean     |         |           |
| Mr Gentle   |         |           |
| Ms Burgess  |         |           |
| Mr Harris   |         |           |
| Mr Earl     |         |           |

**The Greffier:** All 10 Members have voted in favour.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Greffier.

**II. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2020 –  
Proposition carried**

*Item II.*

*The States of Alderney is asked:*

*Not to annul “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2020”.*

**The President:** Now we can move onto Item II and I do not think there were any specific comments, Mr Dent, on this particular Item? I think you dealt with them all in relation to Item I.

**Mr Dent:** I would agree with you, sir.

310

**The President:** Thank you. So could we deal with Item II please, Mr Greffier?

315

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. Item II this evening is the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Amendment Regulations, 2020. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy & Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations of 2020.

320

**The President:** Again, Mr Dent, you are to propose this Item, I understand?

**Mr Dent:** Indeed, thank you, sir.

325

Mr President, these other Regulations are important to Alderney because they are, in fact, the Regulations which, amongst other things, are allowing this Meeting to take place remotely. They were approved by the CCA on 23rd April and, I believe, approved by the States of Guernsey the next day. So I would be grateful if you, my colleagues, did not annul them because, if you did, we would all now have to abandon this Meeting and go home – I presume we are all at home anyway – that is where we would have to turn the Meeting off.

Thank you.

330

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Again, Mr Snowdon, I understand you are going to second this Proposition?

335

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes please, sir. Could I reserve my right to speak, if that is okay, and the other Members can speak first? Thanks.

**The President:** Does any other Member, Mr Greffier, wish to speak on this Item?

**The Greffier:** Yes sir. Ms Burgess.

340

**The President:** Ms Burgess, please.

345

**Ms Burgess:** Hello Your Excellency, Mr President and my fellow States’ Members. Apologies, I am able to reply to this section as I was meant to reply to the first, it is just that I did not get the hang of my technology quickly enough, so apologies. As I say it is a continuation of what we are looking at now and that is my support for and confidence in the CCA. I also would like to extend

thanks to the work that is being done there and to James Dent for his forwarding all the information back to the States' Members. Thank you.

350 **The President:** Thank you, Ms Burgess. Any other Member, Mr Greffier?

**The Greffier:** I am just waiting sir, and it appears not, no sir.

**The President:** So over to you, Mr Snowdon.

355 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

I just wanted to pick up on what Mr Dent said in his opening speech for this Item. The items have already been passed by the States of Guernsey and I think it is very important we show our support today.

360 Just one other thing I would like to highlight. There is now a restriction for the Director of Health to have the power with difference between Bailiwick travel, inter-Island travel, so therefore our travel restrictions could be different if that was imposed, if she wished that to be the case. I just wanted to highlight that, sir.

Thank you.

365 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Mr Dent, do you wish to exercise your right to sum-up?

**Mr Dent:** I do not think there is anything to say, thank you, Mr President.

370 **The President:** Thank you. In that event, we will move to the vote please, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. The States of Alderney are asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations of 2020.

375

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

| FOR         | AGAINST | ABSTAINED |
|-------------|---------|-----------|
| Mr Jean     | None    | None      |
| Mr Roberts  |         |           |
| Mr McKinley |         |           |
| Mr Dent     |         |           |
| Mr Snowdon  |         |           |
| Mr Dean     |         |           |
| Mr Gentle   |         |           |
| Ms Burgess  |         |           |
| Mr Harris   |         |           |
| Mr Earl     |         |           |

**The Greffier:** We have eight of the votes in, just waiting for Mr Dent. (**Mr Dent:** I have voted.) That has just come through. And Mr Jean. (**Mr Jean:** For.) All 10 Members have again voted in favour.

380

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

**III. Regulations Laid Before the States of Alderney**

*The President asks for the following legislation to be laid before the States of Alderney and for the States of Alderney to note the following emergency legislation enacted as a result of the Coronavirus Emergency and which has subsequently ceased to have effect or has been otherwise superseded by other legislation on this Billet d'Etat.*

*The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Schools) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Control of Premises) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Control of Events, Gatherings and Meetings) (Bailiwick of Guernsey);  
Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (States Procedures) (Alderney) Regulations, 2020  
Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Chief Pleas Procedures) (Sark) Regulations, 2020;  
Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Population Management and Miscellaneous Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Mental Health) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Parochial Matters and Miscellaneous Provisions) (Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Registration of Deaths etc. and Cremation Procedures) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Temporary Registration of Health Professionals) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2020;  
The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (States Procedures) (Guernsey) Regulations, 2020.*

**The President:** We will now move to Item III, please, Mr Greffier.

385 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item III this evening is Regulations to be Laid Before the States of Alderney. You have asked for a number of pieces of legislation to be laid before the States of Alderney and for them to be noted in line with the emergency legislation requiring them to be placed before the States of Alderney. Two of the 14 items of legislation included in that list do not directly apply to Alderney but have  
390 been included in the Billet for the sake of completeness. If you wish, sir, I will run through those 14 pieces of legislation, otherwise I will move onto you.

**The President:** I think we can take those as read, Mr Greffier. This is simply a methodology for noting that these Regulations, which have since expired, were in fact placed before our States and we have noted them and, in terms of the historical reference, when people want to look back, they will see that they were here and before the States. So it is really again, as  
395 Mr Dent said earlier, a matter of housekeeping. I do not know whether anybody has any comments to make on that.

400 **The Greffier:** I have no indication that anyone wishes to speak sir.

**The President:** Okay, thank you very much indeed. So that concludes that Item.

**IV. Questions and Reports –  
Seven questions for verbal reply  
and one Report**

*Four questions from Mr Snowdon for Chairman of Policy & Finance Committee:*

*(1) Could the Chairman of the Policy & Finance Committee explain the steps which are being taken in light of the COVID-19 health and economic crisis?*

*(2) Have the States heard anything from Guernsey about the Public Service Obligation (PSO) process, will this now be withdrawn?*

*(3) Can the Finance Committee confirm savings will be made across the board and explain what the Committee is doing to help the community?*

*(4) Will the Chairman advise whether he is working with the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development on a recovery strategy?*

*Mr Snowdon for Chairman of General Services Committee:*

*Would the Chairman explain if the projects funded by capital funds will now be redefined with a new General Services Committee priority list, also is the committee taking any other action in light of the crisis?*

*Mr Snowdon for Chairman of Building and Development Control Committee:*

*Could the Chairman outline the process for planning applications to the Building and Development Control Committee following the lockdown?*

*Mr Steve Roberts for the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee:*

*Would the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee please explain the reason of not requesting to Guernsey, a tightening of restriction on our ports which could lead to a request of relaxation of other work and recreational restriction rule as many of the work force business are now suffering greatly?*

*Mr James Dent for Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation:*

*Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise their activities in the States of Guernsey since the last meeting of the States of Alderney?*

**The President:** We now move to Item IV please, Mr Greffier, Questions and Reports.

405 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir. Item IV this evening today is Questions and Reports. Sir I believe you have received a number of questions, copies of which have been circulated to the various States' Members, and also one Report.

**Covid-19 Crisis – response**

410 **The President:** So Mr Snowdon, I am going to start, if I may, with you, and I think you have firstly some questions to the Chair of the Policy & Finance Committee. Would you wish to read the questions or should I read them?

**Mr Snowdon:** I am happy for you to read them sir, thank you.

415 **The President:** Okay, so the first question for Mr Dent, from Mr Snowdon, is could the Chairman of the Policy & Finance Committee explain the steps which are being taken in light of the Covid-19 health and economic crisis? Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, as you are aware, the current arrangements for managing in an emergency are somewhat different from those which are in place in normal times. Those functions of Government that need responses to the Covid-19 crisis are being led by the Civil Contingencies Authority. The Civil Contingencies Authority is an authority set up under the Civil Contingencies (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2012. There is actually a Committee of the States of Guernsey now heading much of the Bailiwick's wider response to the crisis.

The Law was envisaged only to be used in extreme circumstances, such as the one we now face, and economic damage is not directly considered. The Civil Contingencies Authority drafts the Regulations. These Regulations empower others to draft more detailed directives. Because this emergency is one that centres on our health and protect of lives, it is mainly the Committee *for* Health & Social Care that has been empowered to draft and then promulgate the directives. Now, having said this, the Civil Contingencies Authority is consulted and gives advice.

It is therefore directives from the Guernsey Committee *for* Health & Social Care that are driving the response on the health side. Operational issues within Alderney and our co-ordination with the Guernsey Civil Service are of course the responsibility of our own Civil Service. There is a tactical co-ordination group, a strategic co-ordinating group and our own Alderney operational group led by the CEO.

It is, however, the Committee *for* Health & Social Care directive that has closed our schools and which has imposed social distancing.

Your question of course has two aspects, health and economics. This emergency began as a health emergency, though it is of course also an economic emergency. There is therefore much call for the wider economic impact to be given greater prominence in decision-making. The Civil Contingencies Authority Law currently sees economic impact to be a consequence of an environmental, health or infrastructure-focussed emergency, not a *prima facie* cause in itself to declare an emergency. There could, however, be changes around this.

Really, if we damage our economy, we can do much collateral damage to the health of our community, possibly even more damage than the coronavirus itself. After all, we need money to keep our health services operational.

The political parts of the States of Alderney, although not directly engaged with whole public health issues, are consequently now engaged on the economic impact and in three separate areas. Firstly through our Alderney Representatives. This is to ensure that Alderney can access funds from the emergency finance and packages the States of Guernsey has recently approved and should now be negotiating and which, I am pleased to say, refer to the Bailiwick as a whole.

Secondly through our pandemic response subcommittee. This is in regard the exit from the lockdown processes, which will of course impact our economy. It may be that we can negotiate derogations that will help us minimise economic damage. We will have to convince the Committee *for* Health & Social Care that we are properly able to social distance and maintain hygiene.

Thirdly, our Finance and Economic Development Committees have been asked and have agreed to work together our recovery strategy. P&F have additionally received updates on our financial position and first draft revised budgets.

Thank you, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Mr Snowdon, do you have a supplementary question?

**Mr Snowdon:** I do, thank you, sir. I am not quite sure if my question was worded correctly, actually, but I thank Mr Dent for his answers. My question was really asking what Policy & Finance were doing in response and I thank him for highlighting the subcommittee. In one point, could Mr Dent highlight that Policy & Resources, I think it might be answered in the next question, will be working with a recovery plan and re-looking at the budget and re-prioritising money as a whole? Thank you.

470 **Mr Dent:** I think the only thing I can say to this is that this is early days for asking a question such as this sort, because things change day on day, but we have had a first appraisal of the budget situation and I think that I will be answering that question later in this series of questions. Thank you.

475 **The President:** Now, does any other Member have a question for Mr Dent, arising out of his response and may I just gently remind Members that it is *a* question. Have you had any notification, Mr Greffier?

**The Greffier:** No sir, I have received no notifications of a request for a supplemental question.

480 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

### Public Service Obligation

485 **The President:** In that event we can move on now to the second question, again from Mr Snowdon to Mr Dent: have the States heard anything from Guernsey about the Public Service Obligation process? Will this now be withdrawn? Mr Dent.

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, Mr Snowdon, we have heard nothing recently. I have no reason to believe it has been withdrawn and it is not in my gift to direct matters. I would however consider it perfectly understandable should P&R, when the current crisis subsides, if they wish to reconsider the matter. Thank you.

490 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, do you have a question arising from that?

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

495 Would Mr Dent agree, as we are the stakeholder and the PSO will stand for our lifeline routes, that, really, going on with the PSO would be ridiculous? Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** I think, Mr President, that is a term I would not like to use. Until we actually see what Guernsey come back with I will –

500 **The President:** I think Mr Roberts has his microphone on. Mr Roberts, could you? Sorry, Mr Dent carry on.

505 **Mr Dent:** I think I have said what I wanted to say. I think it would be the wrong time for me to judge what response or anything that comes out of Guernsey might be until we see it.

**The President:** Okay, thank you for that. Mr Greffier, has any other Member indicated that they would like to ...?

510 **The Greffier:** No sir.

**The President:** In that event we will move to the third question.

**The Greffier:** Sir, Mr Roberts has just nipped in there. You may wish to defer to him.

515 **The President:** Yes I will do.

**Mr Roberts:** Thank you very much Mr President for that. Would Mr Dent not consider the PSO now sterile, with the Dornier system and the PSO, and other avenues need now to be explored and planned for the recovery?

520

**Mr Dent:** Mr Roberts, I would be very keen to explore other avenues, I have to say. But the PSO process is not dead but, yes, given half the chance I would be very keen to explore other avenues. Thank you.

#### **Policy & Finance Committee – community assistance**

**The President:** Thank you Mr Dent. Now the third question, can the Policy & Finance Committee, or can you as the Chair, confirm that savings will be made across the board and explain what the Committee is doing to help the community?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, yes. Thank you to Mr Snowdon for his question. The Policy & Finance Committee has approved initial recommendations from the Finance Committee to adjust the 2020 Budget, taking into account what we currently know about the financial impact on the States, and I do emphasise what we currently know. A revised budget has been approved, which takes into account significant reductions in income to the States and balances the budget by making savings across the board. So it is important to note that, on our current assumptions, we can balance the budget.

530  
535

As part of that decision to revise the budget, we have approved concessions for 2020 mooring fees for commercial fishermen. We have also provided for the deferral of commercial rent for two quarters, in States and commercial properties, where this is needed, and to defer the recovery of TRP where necessary.

540  
545  
550

These measures ensure that we are mirroring the States of Guernsey support to business. However, the budget is being kept under review, so that we can make further adjustments as the timescale for exit from the current lockdown becomes clearer. The big challenge will come in putting together a recovery plan for the Island, which will be done in tandem with the recovery planning for the Bailiwick as a whole. That recovery will need to help to build our economy and community once again, once we know how and when the danger of the virus will begin to pass.

This will involve a significant reprioritisation, I am sure it will, and rethink of our spending plans, including our plans for capital spending in order to fund the recovery plans, which will help the community to rebuild. We will, of course, be publishing the drafts of these plans as they are developed, so we can get the views of the public to help state them. I would like to say that I have discussed this with the Chairman of the Finance Committee.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Mr Snowdon, do you have a question?

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

555

I thank him for outlining the measures, but does Mr Dent feel those measures are going far enough to help the community in this crisis? Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Dent.

560

**Mr Dent:** I would like to reserve my response to that to a later date because I think the full impact of the current crisis is yet to be fully understood and we will of course may well have to revisit some of these things at a later date.

565 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Mr Greffier, have you had any indications that other Members wish to ask a supplementary question?

**The Greffier:** No sir I have not.

### Recovery strategy

570 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed and then finally for Mr Dent, from Mr Snowdon, will the Chairman advise whether he is working with the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development on a recovery strategy? Mr Dent.

575 **Mr Dent:** A very quick answer in this case. The Finance Committee and the Committee for Tourism and Economic Development have agreed to work jointly on this matter. The first joint meeting was held on Monday but, as you will clearly understand, it is very early days and I look forward, I am sure, to Mr Snowdon's questions on these matters at possibly our next Meeting, when more will be available.

580 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Mr Snowdon, another question?

**Mr Snowdon:** No, sir. Thank you for Mr Dent answering that question.

### Capital funding priorities

585 **The President:** That concludes your questions to Mr Dent but you have now got a question to Mr McKinley, the Chair of General Services. Would the Chairman explain if the projects funded by capital funds will now be redefined with a new General Services Committee priority list. Also, is the Committee taking any other action in the light of the crisis? Mr McKinley.

590 **Mr McKinley:** Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow States' Members, there have obviously been limitations on what the States' Works Department and other skilled workers have been able to do over the past eight weeks or so. The Committee will be reviewing a number of major projects at its next meeting on Tuesday of next week and on that list will be the Connaught Care Home extension, which has been delayed, obviously; work on the old Connaught, perhaps removing some of the scaffolding and doing some continual work inside; the rock face in the Cuttings, which  
595 has caused an awful lot of concerns; sewage disposal at Fort Doyle, which may have to be delayed, Corblets Wall coastal protection and the road to Fort Clonque.

Finally, the final clean-up around the Telegraph Tower. As Members will know the bus and the crane were removed a week or so ago by Mr Tudgay but there is still a lot of junk and rubbish there, which the States' Works Department have agreed to remove in the near future.

600 With reference to ongoing work projects, first I would like to clarify if I may the present situation with regard to the Breakwater and moorings. Work on the Breakwater is classified as essential, work on the moorings is classified as important. The annual check on the moorings has not been carried out for two reasons, first the company in the UK, which carries out checks, was due to visit in mid-March, but was unable to travel due to UK lockdown rules. Secondly, divers  
605 require the availability of a hyperbaric chamber for the treatment of a possible case of bends.

There is no hyperbaric chamber available in Alderney and the only one in Guernsey has been temporarily withdrawn from service at the request of the Health & Social Care Committee,

Guernsey, due to the fear of a possible shortage of oxygen being available to treat coronavirus patients.

610 With regard to the Breakwater, I have spoken to the appropriate authority in Guernsey and of course to the harbourmaster. As all will know, Guernsey has responsibility for routine and emergency maintenance of this iconic and essential part of our Island's infrastructure, which protects not only our harbour but also Braye Common and to the Le Banquage and, of course, commercial and recreational moorings.

615 There have been some delays to the start of the summer maintenance work this year, due to lockdown and concerns about hyperbaric chambers, but a team of Alderney based divers and Alderney States workers has been recruited and I am told they hope to commence survey and repair work on Monday next week, 18th May, if an agreed viable safety plan can be settled.

620 There is a health and safety requirement for a diver with bends to be able to access a treatment chamber within six hours. Evacuation to a hospital in Poole would take about three to four hours on board the *Spike Islander*, depending on the weather, of course. All workers on the Breakwater will be Alderney personnel, apart from the occasional brief visit by a Guernsey based engineer to check on progress. There will be no Guernsey workers on a routine basis.

625 I should clarify one other essential difference between divers working on the Breakwater and divers working on the moorings. Divers on the Breakwater will only be undergoing shallow dives, which is why they can delay essential treatment for the bends for up to six hours. The dives on some of the moorings are much deeper, resulting in a delay shorter than six hours for essential life-saving treatment.

630 I fully understand the concerns of a number of boat-owners and I myself am a boat-owner and I assure them that we shall continue to seek a satisfactory resolution of this unique problem.

635 Other issues for discussion at our next week's Meeting include the marina, discussions about a marina in Braye Bay, close to the Arsenal, are ongoing and we hope to hold a Zoom or Teams meeting in the next couple of weeks, with Mr Gordon Owen and his engineer, Mr Derrick. I am very happy to say that Gordon Owen is still showing interesting and will be only too happy to answer any questions at that meeting.

640 Other issues arising over the next meeting will be an annual report from the Alderney Wildlife Trust, Longis Action Plan and Alderney Community Woodland Plan. I believe there may also be a discussion issue arising, relating to the Alderney Bird Observatory. We have also received a request from the owners of the Fort Corblets, regarding the installation of a sewage disposal plant, which will require the use of a very small area of States land and also Fort Quesnard and Fort Clonque and maybe others already have their own individual sewage disposal plants, so this will be nothing new.

645 Finally we had a letter from somebody requesting that the rules on dogs on the beaches be relaxed due to the lockdown because we will not be getting quite as many visitors this year, perhaps, and the moving dogs off the beach is meant to come into effect on 1st June. He is requesting that Braye Beach and Longis Beach be free to dogs walking, providing they are on a lead. That, sir, is all I have to say and I am very happy to answer any questions.

650 **The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley. Mr Snowdon do you have a question for Mr McKinley?

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

655 Thank you for Mr McKinley giving such a detailed answer. Just going back to the moorings, with the importance of people being able to use their pleasure boats for mental health and wellbeing and a spot of fishing, could Mr McKinley outline some sort of timeline for when those moorings will be checked or when they can be used, so that season is not completely lost for the year? Thank you.

**The President:** Mr McKinley.

660

**Mr McKinley:** Yes sir, I am hoping that work on the moorings will start on Monday and maybe finish in two or three weeks. So, hopefully, by the end of May we may be able to moor our boats on our moorings. There is also a suggestion that perhaps we should allow mooring on the shallower areas of the bay, not in the deeper areas, because shallow areas are much safer for the guide ropes. We shall be considering this but I should just add one point that sadly coronavirus is a public health emergency which threatens life and we all need to keep a sense of perspective about things in life which are nice to have but, I am afraid, not essential. Sir.

665

**The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley. Mr Greffier, has anybody else indicated they would like to ask Mr McKinley a question?

670

**The Greffier:** Yes, sir. Mr Roberts.

**The President:** Mr Roberts then, please.

675

**Mr Roberts:** To the Chairman of the GSC, I would just like to ask, the coronavirus issues have affected the Impot and there is a very dangerous situation down there with a stairway and scaffolding and for elderly people to go up presents a danger, actually, that if they fall the States of Alderney could be held responsible. Has he been down and looked at that yet, please?

680

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.

**Mr McKinley:** I have tried to go down on two occasions but I was not aware that the opening hours were, I think, between eight and 12, and was going in the afternoon. But I would like to go down and look. I have discussed this with one or two people and they say that the dangers to which you refer have actually been removed now and the place is much safer. That was recognised at a fairly early stage.

685

**The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley. Mr Greffier, anybody else?

690

**The Greffier:** Yes sir. Ms Burgess.

**The President:** Ms Burgess, please.

695

**Ms Burgess:** Hello Your Excellency, Mr President and fellow States' Members. Just a very quick question, Graham. Understanding all the restrictions that are happening with the situation presently, are we still actively looking at our erosion problem, particularly at The Cutting, which is an ongoing problem?

700

**Mr McKinley:** Yes, I did actually mention The Cutting as an issue and we are hopefully going to get someone to review it once again. There have been various plans put in, in the past, some costing up to £600,000. Clearly, under the present economic circumstances, that is going to be difficult to meet. So we are reviewing it, but well aware, Ms Burgess, of the issues and the concerns that people have driving along The Cutting.

705

**The President:** Thank you. Mr Greffier, anybody else?

**The Greffier:** Not at this moment sir, no.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

### **Planning application process during lockdown**

710

**The President:** We will now move, Mr Snowdon, to your final question, and this is to Mr Dean, the Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee and your question is could the Chairman outline the process for planning applications to the Building and Development Control Committee following the lockdown? Mr Dean.

715

**Mr Dean:** Thank you, sir.

Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow States' Members, our last open planning meeting was on 5th March, our April meeting was cancelled due to Covid-19, although there were only a few applications and we opted to move that to our scheduled May meeting. We have a virtual planning meeting scheduled for 2 p.m. tomorrow. This will be a policy meeting and a planning meeting. Usually our planning meetings are open to the public, however this is going to be a virtual meeting and it is not open to the public.

720

The planning side of the meeting will be to deal with the live applications and the fast-tracked application approvals and also the deferred applications from the March meeting, where the Committee requested further information to be made available to them before they discussed a particular application.

725

Live applications are defined as the following criteria being met: the appropriate flat planning fee and the relevant information supplied by the agent or the applicant and a fully filled out planning application form to the Planning Office and sites poles being erected. Once the planning officer has inspected the site, a site notice is issued and the application is advertised in the Gazette and at the Courthouse and on the planning noticeboard for the required 21 days for members of the public to have the ability to view the plans and make representations to the Committee. Once all that has taken place, the planning officer prepares the Committee's packs and they are made available to the Members. That application is live and ready for the Committee.

730

Usually the day before the advertised planning meeting, the Committee Members go on site visits to familiarise themselves with the application within its setting and are also accompanied by the planning officer to assist them with any questions they may have regarding the site and the application. We then sit in a formal setting to discuss the application on the advertised planning meeting date.

735

Currently any planning applications that have come in since Covid-19 are being processed by the planning officer and some preliminary work is in process. These are not yet classed as fully live applications as all the work has not been done and uploaded and the planning officer cannot attend site due to the current restrictions being in place. Currently the Committee is not in a position to sit and deal with any new applications. I believe this is currently the case in other planning jurisdictions also.

740

745

However, I would like to reassure the Members and the general public, we are constantly reviewing procedures to enable as swift a return as possible to deal with live applications, as is required under the requirements and under our BDCC Law as amended.

If needed to deal with any backlog of applications, we will be reviewing the possibility of extra meetings, to alleviate any issues that arise. The current restrictions, however, do not stop applicants or agents from starting the process while submitting a planning application and, just for Members, I will not be making any comments regarding specific individual applications but I will endeavour to answer any generic questions you may have regarding the process.

750

755 Currently, including tomorrow's applications, we have dealt with 32 applications so far this year. In the planning officer's in-tray are 12 applications in various stages of process. Three of them are waiting for further information to be made available from the agent of the applicants to the planning officer and our planning officer is currently processing nine, starting to do some reports ready for the Committee when we are able to sit and formally discuss those applications.

Thank you, sir.

760

**The President:** Thank you. Mr Snowdon, do you have a question?

**Mr Snowdon:** I do not but thank you for the update. Thank you, sir.

765

**The President:** Mr Greffier, has anybody else indicated that they would like to ask a question to Mr Dean?

**The Greffier:** No they have not, sir.

770

**The President:** Well then that, Mr Snowdon, I think concludes your questions this afternoon.

#### Port restrictions

**The President:** The next question I have is from Mr Roberts and this is for the Chairman of Policy & Finance. Would the Chairman of Policy & Finance Committee please explain the reason for not requesting to Guernsey a tightening of restriction on our ports, which could lead to a request of relaxation of other work and recreational restriction rules, as many of the workforce business are now suffering greatly? Mr Dent.

775

**Mr Dent:** Mr Roberts, Mr President, firstly the Policy & Finance Committee would need to resolve to take this course of action and, as you know, it has not done this; possibly because a compelling case has not been made. Secondly, the CCA – I am assuming this is a question to me in my role as our representative to the CCA – has been guided by medical advice and that advice has been that such a move would in fact be counter-productive. There are very few people moving between Alderney and Guernsey.

780

I, and indeed you, have given your support for medical advice coming from professionals and I hope that continues. Most of those who are travelling to Guernsey are doing it for medical purposes and we are taking precautions. No unnecessary travel within Guernsey is in fact permitted. The health needs of these persons visiting Guernsey hospitals needs to be respected just as much as the health needs as everybody else.

785

There is additionally the need for occasional essential workers, both medical and non-medical, to visit our Island. I believe there have been no new cases of active Covid-19 patients in Guernsey over the first two weeks that were caused by unaccounted-for seeding and I believe that the lockdown has reduced the number of active Covid-19 patients in Guernsey now to eight.

790

As you are aware, the Civil Contingencies Authority has granted the Committee *for* Health & Social Care and the regulatory authority to restrict intra-Bailiwick travel should it deem this to be appropriate. I believe that should they ever consider it appropriate they would consult with the Island Medical Centre and other medical professions here. In the first circumstances I believe we as politicians would all be willing to take that advice.

795

Finally the continued restrictions on our businesses relate not so much to the extent of any further controls on the border between ourselves and Guernsey but much more on our ability to convince the Committee *for* Health & Social Care that we can practise social distancing and good hygiene in our business and social activities.

800

I hope this answers your question and I do hope that our efforts in the next few weeks can now be focussed on the exit and recovery strategies and rather less on tightening the lockdown. Thank you very much.

805

**The President:** Mr Roberts, do you have a question arising from that answer?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes I do sir. If Guernsey had a Covid-free Island and Alderney had 10 cases, would he seriously believe that Alderney residents would be allowed to travel and visit Guernsey without self-isolation? Would they allow us to go into Guernsey if we had 10 cases, without self-isolation?

810

**The President:** Thank you Mr Roberts. Mr Dent?

**Mr Dent:** It is really not for me to say what Guernsey would do, but I think Guernsey have made it very clear that actually in almost all circumstances we would need access to the Queen Elizabeth Hospital in Guernsey and I doubt it very much that they would be restricting access. Thank you.

815

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent. Has any other Member, Mr Greffier, indicated a wish to ask a question?

820

**The Greffier:** No sir. I have just received a point of correction from Mr Dean.

**The President:** Please do.

825

**Mr Dean:** Sorry sir, just to correct Mr Dent, it is the Princess Elizabeth Hospital, not the Queen Elizabeth Hospital.

**Mr Dent:** My apologies. I am getting old! Thank you.

830

**The President:** Well spotted, Mr Dean.

### **Alderney Representatives – summary of interactions with Guernsey**

**The President:** The next question, from Mr Dent, is for our two Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation. Would our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise their activities in the States of Guernsey since the last Meeting of the States of Alderney? Now who is going to kick this off, Mr Snowdon or Mr Roberts?

835

**Mr Roberts:** I will let Mr Snowdon go first this time.

**Mr Snowdon:** Okay, thank you, Mr Roberts. Thank you, Mr Dent, for the question. I will just go through it briefly. The General Election for the Guernsey Deputies will now take place in June 2021, as predicted. That was quite a long debate. As you know, it is Island-wide voting. There were concerns that people would not be able to canvass properly and knock on doors because of the coronavirus and actually that the Deputies at the moment may have an unfair advantage over candidates that may be coming forward because those candidates may not be able to actually go out and canvass strong enough. So the majority of the States of Deliberation took the amendments and Propositions to delay their General Election to June 2021.

840

845

There were some other items that were, because the coronavirus has taken over everything, understandably, that have actually been withdrawn from debate. We touched on what we have

850 done here today with the CCA Emergency Regulation Powers. They were passed in Guernsey recently as well.

I will just cover that point again that the Director of Health now has the power to bring in different restrictions for travel between the Islands, so I think as Mr Dent and Mr Roberts were touching on before, there is now a process if there was, maybe, some situation where the Islands  
855 need to be treated differently, that process is now in place and before that was not an option for there to be different restrictions.

I will come to the important aspect for us. We have the Policy & Resources paper, which was the Covid-19 pandemic funding of financial response. As you can imagine these are one of the biggest decisions the States of Deliberation will be taking for a long time. The feeling that from  
860 the original Propositions, there were quite a multitude of amendments submitted during that quite lengthy debate, the feeling was, basically it is not the right time to sell off Guernsey's assets. It was better to borrow, so the borrowing is agreed for up to £250 million, which is an eye-watering amount, and there is also £100 million from the Core Investment Reserve, and then there is the additional option, and this is what was mentioned quite a lot, which is the additional £250 million.

We were involved, quite a few Deputies, to make sure – I think I sent Members the actual Propositions today, just so you have got it in black and white, which were agreed. We lobbied quite hard and made sure that it said a recovery strategic for the Bailiwick. That word 'the Bailiwick' is very essential. We are actually all in this together and Alderney's situation, the 1948 Agreement and the fiscal union, I think it is important that we remember that the staggering  
870 amount of money that is borrowed, we will have to pay that back somehow in our own sort of way. So any new things that Guernsey may bring in, like GST, or getting rid of Zero-10 will obviously apply to us as well with our fiscal union, but I am pleased that that Bailiwick strategy is included in the amendment for that additional £250 million.

Just taking that one step further, I think there is a group that has now been set up, I think  
875 Mr Dent touched on that with some of the remarks he made earlier about the CCA, very much in regards to help in making those decisions quickly with the Health & Social Care Committee, but I would just like to touch upon that I think there is a group that is being set up by the States of Deliberation or by Policy & Resources that will be looking into the recovery stages for the Bailiwick and the strategy.

I think it is important that Alderney has some sort of input into that so I will be making sure that our voice is heard and we really do work to make sure that our voice is heard and we put into that strategy, which is going to be absolutely fundamental for our recovery as a Bailiwick. I could go on but I will not go on. Just one further point, as you know the Bailiff has retired and Mr Jean and Mr McKinley will know him very well from when they were Alderney Reps at the States of Guernsey and I wish him, I think we all would, all the very best for his future and an enjoyable retirement.  
885

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Dent, do you have any questions?

890

**Mr Dent:** No, I have no further questions, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you. Does anybody else have a question for Mr Snowdon, Mr Greffier?

895

**The Greffier:** No sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much. Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Your Excellency, Mr President. It is great to hear Mr Snowdon's reply, which was  
900 totally accurate and right to the point. There are a lot of points that I was going to add to. This will be a little bit extra. Some of it will concur but nothing of it will disagree. Most important issue was

the proposed half-billion pound borrow to see the Bailiwick through the C-19 outbreak. There were many concerns voiced within the Guernsey States, ranging from did we need that sum to how it would be returned and who would get a say in how that money was spent.

905 It seems it will be paid from General Revenue and shorter term. The possibility of selling utilities was also raised as an alternative, but not popular. The £140 million existing bond may not be used. A 15%-20% shrinkage was expected in the second quarter of 2020 in Guernsey's economy. GST was talked about but if that figure was 5%, it takes 3% needed to collect it. I am no economist, so I will not quote the innards of how the plan would pan out, but Alderney is included in all these  
910 plans.

The first £250 million will be borrowed, with the next £250 million coming back to the States for approval; also on just how it will be allocated, forwarded by an amendment by Alderney, supported by Deputy Dudley-Owen, seconded by Deputy McSwiggan. This did not make us the most popular in some quarters; however it was the best option for Alderney, because it was  
915 Bailiwick wide.

I quoted Lord Baron Keynes, Britain's greatest economist, in the States. He steered us out of Great Depression in the 1930's and was fundamental to the Marshall Plan after the Second World War. He believed in funding aggregate demand, which means total spending on the economy. Inadequate aggregate demand leads to high unemployment, resulting in depression and recession  
920 and Lord Keynes led an economic revolution and resurgence that has influenced modern fiscal thinking and resulting in Marshall spending \$15 billion dollars on capital projects to rebuild Europe after the First World War.

My point was then put over that Alderney had suffered from under-investment over the years, resulting in severe downturn over the last few years and the only way to make Alderney pay its way was to invest in large capital projects here, like the new types of cheaper aircraft, longer  
925 runway, refurbishment of the terminal and perhaps a ferry in the meantime to tide us over.

In Alderney we have a saying: never a lender or borrower be. Clearly times have changed. The Meeting was very challenging but many of them are and we do have many friends in the House, I want to really reiterate that and something that needs to continue for the future, because we  
930 need those friends and they are good friends.

Earlier, I had voted against the spending of £12 million on the sea wall, which was won by just one vote, I might add. I had listened to the arguments and decided it was not needed and my conscience was that it was best to save that money from the joint taxpayers' purse. That is less than needed to pay for our own runway.  
935

One complaint came in that it was a Guernsey matter, but my argument was that Deputies vote on Alderney matters all of the time. Any other matters were little concerning Alderney and apart from the issues that I have raised. But it was a challenging Meeting and we got through it.

Thank you.

940 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts. Mr Dent, do you have a question?

**Mr Dent:** No I do not. Thank you very much. Does any other Member, Mr Greffier, wish to ask a question?

945 **The Greffier:** Yes sir, Mr McKinley raised a question just before Mr Roberts spoke, so I am not entirely sure if it was for him or Mr Snowdon.

**The President:** Mr McKinley, who is your question for?

950 **Mr McKinley:** The question was for Mr Snowdon as a result of ... *[Inaudible]* It is fairly simple really but having read the paperwork that Mr Snowdon circulated this morning, everything is down to Policy & Resources Committee, Policy & Resources Committee. That Committee does not have the greatest reputation within the States of Guernsey and I wonder, if you are all given another chance to talk about it – the whole thing affects everyone, every States' Member and Deputy – are you able to voice your concerns?

955

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you. Can I answer that President?

**The President:** Yes I think you can in the circumstances, Mr Snowdon.

960 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you and thank you, Mr McKinley, it is a very good point you are raising there and I thank you for raising it. Just to give you some reassurance. No, with the next £250 million, that has to go back with the recovery plan and my understanding is that goes back to the States' Assembly for maybe the reasons that you have said.

965 It is a staggering amount and my understanding that the criteria set in the paper for that amount, the next £250 million, would have to go back to the States of Assembly and with any recovery strategy for the Bailiwick, which I think is absolutely key for all the Islands as we deal with this crisis.

Thank you.

970 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Snowdon. No more questions on that Item, Mr Greffier?

**The Greffier:** No sir.

975 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Well, that concludes the questions.

### Education Report May 2020

980 **The President:** We now move to a Report, which has been submitted by Mr Gentle. It is an education update from Mr Gentle, which I have decided in these exceptional circumstances, and given the importance of the topic, that it would be appropriate for him to give the community that update. So Mr Gentle, please.

**Mr Gentle:** Thank you, sir.

985 Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow colleagues, I thank you, sir, for your pragmatic interpretation of Rule 19, allowing me to make this brief Report and I assure you that this time I speak there is nothing tenuous and I will get to the end!

990 Our current Year 11 students, and there are nine of them, were due to take their GCSE exams this month. The Office of Qualifications and Examinations Regulations (OFQUAL), who are the over-arching body responsible, have stated that the school will provide a grade for each GCSE student for each subject based on guidance from OFQUAL, which aims to grade as if each student had sat their exams.

The guidance is aimed at judging the grade each student is most likely to have achieved and will be based on evidence held by the school and reviewed by subject teachers/heads of departments. OFQUAL have said that all judgements must be objective and based only on

evidence of student performance including classwork, bookwork, homework assessments and mock exams.

995

This is obviously a less than ideal situation but there is now some clarity about the process that the students who were entered in to the exams are now going through. They have been assured by the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture that this will not result in them losing out. An appeal mechanism is being put in place to enable any student being given the opportunity to sit exams, if they are unhappy with the grading, at the earliest reasonable time in the new academic year – so September this year onwards. But I have no idea and am unable to expand on how this may impact on future plans for students wanting or expecting to go to the next stage of their academic career and finding that they do not have the requisite grades now.

1000

Year 11 pupils have also been provided with bridging units from both Guernsey Sixth Form Centre and the College of FE to help prepare them for post-16 study. They should and will not be disadvantaged in their future studies as a result of OFQUAL's decision to cancel the GCSE examinations.

1005

Barbara Benfield started an initiative that involved school children writing letters for onward transmission to the more elderly residents in our community. It has been nothing short of a resounding success. I am not actually sure who is enjoying it more – the person receiving the letter, or the child receiving the reply. Well done.

1010

The school have been working hard to provide the pupils with the best education experience possible while the school remains closed. Distance learning will never be a substitute for the classroom but the parents have been, and continue to be, engaging with their child's teachers remaining supportive of getting through any minor teething problems.

1015

The challenge of rolling something out so new to the children at short notice was never going to be easy. Hard work by the teachers has put this in place and it appears to be working well for the majority of children and parents. The way that they have embraced these unprecedented enforced changes is to be applauded. With the date for reopening the school still an unknown the staff are ensuring that they are doing their utmost for their students.

1020

Home learning packs have been created and delivered to pupils from Reception class to Year 4 on a weekly basis. Parents send examples of work via email each week to class teachers who then feed back.

Virtual Learning using J2E/Google Classroom is in place for pupils from Years 5 to Year 11. Teachers use a variety of platforms to provide either live or virtual learning activities and pupils submit work online for feedback.

1025

Parents of all families are contacted each week via telephone or email by class teachers or form tutors to provide guidance and discuss any problems which may have arisen. Up to 20 pupils per day for families of key workers or those deemed vulnerable attend school and school staff are supporting this provision on a rota basis. Any changes to this above model will follow Public Health guidance and the guidance from Guernsey.

1030

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.

1035

Now it is somewhat unusual to have a Report of this sort so I will just remind Members that after this Report, any Member may offer a personal opinion on the Report and may ask a question relating to the content of that Report. So, Mr Greffier, have you received any indications that any Member wishes to speak on this Item?

1040

**The Greffier:** Not at the moment sir, you may wish to give it a few moments, just in case anyone does indicate.

**The President:** I think we can allow that indulgence.

1045

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes sir, Mr Snowdon has indicated he would like to speak.

**The President:** Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

1050 Just a personal comment and I think that is what you said we are allowed to do. I would just  
like to say thank you to all of the education staff during these challenging times and to  
Mr Gentle for highlighting that Report. I am not quite sure if Mr Gentle can answer this question  
but there may be some pressure from parents who are trying to get back to work as the relaxation  
takes place and I am just wondering what the situation was with children basically wanting to go  
1055 back for, not childcare, but back into school so they can actually get back to work if they have to  
look after their children.

It is probably essential that both things line up with the relaxations that come out in different  
stages and the kids going back to school, because otherwise you might have parents that cannot  
go back to work because they have got to look after their children. I do not know if that is really a  
question for Mr Gentle but it is something I wish to highlight for Mr Gentle.

1060 Thank you.

**The President:** I think Mr Gentle, are you able to answer that question or would that be better  
directed to the head master of the school?

1065 **Mr Gentle:** I think if the question is when is the school going to be open, I am happy answer it.

**The President:** Yes, please do.

1070 **Mr Gentle:** I believe that we as politicians should have no say in the possible fast track opening  
of the school. I am not even sure it is a decision that local education leaders should have too much  
of a say in, other than implementing the new guidance when it arrives and making suggestions on  
how it will work in our own particular school. On this occasion, we should certainly be following  
the guidance of the medical staff and the Committee *for* Health & Social Care in Guernsey.

1075 For example, there are 24 children in Years 1 and 2. In order to practise social distancing, which  
is not the easiest of tasks with five-to-seven-year-olds, then without removing furniture the class  
size becomes as small as six. So we have to let the powers that be in Guernsey discuss between  
themselves as to how to implement any and all the rules and at that point then the school here  
would I imagine get involved, saying, 'We can have this many or that many in a class.'

1080 Half-term is between Monday, 25th and Friday, 29th May. Deputy St Pier has said recently that  
schools will remain closed until the end of half-term. So children will be away from the school  
between Friday, 22nd and Monday, 1st June. I do not think we would be able to put a cogent case  
together quick enough, in less than a week, in order them to have them re-open instantly, before  
telling the parents, 'We are shut now.'

1085 As the final note the parents are fully aware of the situation and are supportive of the measures  
in place at present. I hope that answers Mr Snowdon's question.

**The President:** Thank you Mr Gentle. Mr Greffier, any more late entrants?

**The Greffier:** Yes sir, Ms Burgess.

1090

**The President:** Ms Burgess please.

1095 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you. Apologies, it is actually just to extend my thanks to Kevin for the Report  
and to those involved in meeting these new demands. It's been good to see the community and  
the school rising to the challenges.

**The President:** Thank you. Does that conclude the questions Mr Greffier?

1100

**The Greffier:** I haven't received any further notifications Sir no.

**The President:** That being the case I think we're at the end of proceedings so might I thank everybody for their involvement and invite you Mr Greffier to close the meeting.

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 3.56 p.m.*