



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 20th October 2021**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 9, No. 12**

**Present:**

**Mr William Tate, President**

**Members**

Mr Bill Abel  
Ms Annie Burgess  
Mr Ian Carter  
Mr Kevin Gentle  
Mr Christian Harris  
Mr Boyd Kelly  
Mr Graham McKinley, OBE  
Mr Steve Roberts  
Mr Alexander Snowdon

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr David Knight

## **Business transacted**

Welcome to His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor and Lady Corder .....	4
Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting held on 4th October 2021.....	4
Procedural.....	5
<b>Billet d'État for Wednesday, 20th October 2021.....</b>	<b>5</b>
I. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.8) Regulations, 2021; III. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) Regulations, 2021; IV Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021; V Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) (No, 2) Regulations, 2021; VI Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.9) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021; VII Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) Regulations, 2021; VIII Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021 – Approved.....	5
II. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.8) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021; VI. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.9) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021; IX. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.10) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021 – Approved .....	7
X. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 11) Regulations, 2021 – Approved.....	8
XI. The Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000 – Amendment of Legislation – Approved .....	9
XII. Budgets for 2022 and Revised Budget 2021 – Approved .....	11

XIII. Questions and Reports – Eight questions for verbal reply and one Report.....	21
Aurigny Strategy 2021-25; feasibility study .....	22
Alderney Commission for Renewable Energy (ACRE) – Review of role and mandate.....	24
Energy strategies – Renewable energies for the Channel Islands .....	25
Civil Service Reform in Guernsey – Steps taken by Alderney .....	25
Harbour Review and Harbour Plan – Progress and public involvement.....	27
The crane – Exposure on the quay.....	29
Angling Festival – Harbour access and insurance .....	30
Blocking of an ancient right of way to States land – Lack of action.....	32
Agricultural catering school – Update on progress.....	34
Harbour gates – Planning permission .....	35
Whitegates – Retention as a social housing zone.....	36
Reports – Island Planning Group Report.....	37
Farewell to Mr Geoff Workman, His Excellency’s Representative .....	40
Farewell to the Lieutenant Governor Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE, CB .....	40
Farewell address of the Lieutenant Governor Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE, CB.....	41
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.56 p.m.</i> .....	45

## States of Alderney

*The States met at 2.30 p.m. in the presence of  
His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor, Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE CB,  
of the Bailiwick of Guernsey and Lieutenant G T Workman RN (Rtd), a representative of  
His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

### **PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

### **ROLL CALL**

*The Greffier*

### **Welcome to His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor and Lady Corder**

**The President:** Before we proceed to this afternoon's business, it gives me great pleasure to welcome for the first, and for my part, the last occasion that His Excellency will be attending our meeting because, as I am sure you all know, His Excellency's term of office comes to end in November and during the course of my two and a half years we have been defeated by the weather and by Medivac on a number of occasions.

But I am delighted that he is here today, together with Lady Corder. So there is a tinge of disappointment that this will be his last meeting but, as I say, I am delighted to welcome them both.

### **Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting held on 4th October 2021**

**The President:** So, can we proceed to the details of the attendees at the People's Meeting please, Mr Harris?

**Mr Harris:** Your Excellency, Mr President, and fellow colleagues.

I was the Convenor of the People's Meeting, I was assisted by the Head of Finance and the Finance Manager. There were six States Members in attendance, excluding the Convenor, 13 members of the public, four members of the press, and you yourself were present, sir. We received apologies from the Chief Executive, Mr Jenkins, Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Harris.

**Procedural**

**The President:** Now, dealing with the Items on the Billet, Mr Greffier, I think that as a result of conversations that have taken place between yourself, Mr Abel and myself, we have a way of dealing with the COVID regulations which might short circuit the proceedings.

25

**The Greffier:** Yes, Mr President.

If we can deal with Items I-IX together and we will then split them in their subsections of general provisions and then move on to the matters of limitation of liability.

## Billet d'État for Wednesday, 20th October 2021

- I. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.8) Regulations, 2021;
- III. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) Regulations, 2021;
- IV Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021;
- V Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) (No, 2) Regulations, 2021;
- VI Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.9) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021;
- VII Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) Regulations, 2021;
- VIII Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021 –  
Approved

*Item I:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.8) Regulations, 2021"*

*Item III:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) Regulations, 2021"*

*Item IV:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021"*

*Item V:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) (No.2) Regulations, 2021"*

*Item VII:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) Regulations, 2021"*

*Item VIII:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021"*

30 **The Greffier:** So if we deal first with Item I, which is the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.8) Regulations, 2021; then Item III, which is the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) Regulations, 2021; then Item IV, Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021; Item V, Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.9) (Amendment) (No, 2) Regulations, 2021; Item VII, Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) Regulations, 2021; Item VIII, which is the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.10) (Amendment) Regulations, 2021. And so the States of Alderney is asked not to annul the seven Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) General Provisions.

40 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Now, Mr Harris, at the People's Meeting you took all these Items together, and I think that there were a couple of generic questions, if I can put it that way. So rather than you having to get up 10 individual times, perhaps you would care to give us your report at this stage?

45 **Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency, Mr President and colleagues.

As mentioned, the above emergency regulations were tabled as one Item. It was questioned that the booster jab is making people quite ill in the UK, does this affect the liability? Mr Abel advised that the liability covers the people who administer the vaccines.

50 It was also queried how long is 'not to annul'. Mr Abel stated that each regulation expires after 30 days and not to annul is a formality as these laws are already in force when they come to the States of Alderney. No. 11 Regulations do coincide with the changes for the Bailiwick for the end of October. The limitation for liability is now being managed by HSC. The CCA are still in session and will continue until further notice.

Thank you.

55

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Harris.

Now, Mr Abel, you are going to propose this Item.

60 **Mr Abel:** Yes, thank you, Mr President. Your Excellency, Mr President, and colleagues, thank you, Mr Greffier, for summarising those particular Items because to deal with them one by one may make a very long day, as the President rightly pointed out.

65 In terms of Items I, III, IV, V, VII and VIII, if I have got them right, which apply to the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)(Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations numbered 8, 9 and 10 on the amendments for Regulations No. 9 and Regulations No. 10, I propose that the States of Alderney is asked not to annul these Regulations, which have been revoked and re-enacted with modifications.

Thank you.

70 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Abel.

Mr Snowdon, I think you are going to second these Propositions.

**Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second the Item, sir, thank you.

75 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Do any of the Members have any questions or a statement? No. Thank you, Mr Abel. Well, I think in those circumstances unless anybody gainsay those are passed.

**II. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.8)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021;  
VI. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability)  
(No.9) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021;  
IX. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability)  
(No.10) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021 –  
Approved**

*Item II:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.8) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Regulations, 2021”*

*Item VI:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.9) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Regulations, 2021”*

*Item IX:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (No.10) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Regulations, 2021”*

**The Greffier:** And the remaining matters, Mr President, are the Vaccine Limitation of Liability Regulations, that is Item II, Item VI and Item IX and the States of Alderney is asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) Regulations.

**The President:** Thank you.

Again, Mr Abel, you are going to propose this Item.

**Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr President.

Your Excellency, Mr President and colleagues, in terms of Items II, VI and IX of the Billet, Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (Vaccine) (Limitation of Liability) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2021, Numbers 8, 9 and 10, I propose that the States of Alderney is asked not to annul these Regulations, which have been revoked and are provided for by the Medicines (Human and Veterinary) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law (Amendment) Ordinance, 2021, which was enacted on 7th October 2021.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

Again, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

Does any Member wish to speak on this Item or these Items? Then can we say these are also passed.

Thank you.

**X. Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 11) Regulations, 2021 –  
Approved**

*Item X:*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.11) Regulations, 2021”*

105 **The Greffier:** The next Item, Mr President, is Item X, the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 11) Regulations, 2021. The States of Alderney is asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 11) Regulations, 2021, proposed by Mr Abel, seconded by Mr Snowdon.

110 **The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr President.

Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues, in terms of this particular Regulation which is still in force, I thought I would remind everybody of some of the details with regard to the Regulations.

115 These Regulations are emergency regulations made by the Civil Contingencies Authority under Part 3 of the Civil Contingencies (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2012. They are made on the occurrence of an emergency within the meaning of the Law in the Bailiwick arising from the urgent need to prevent, control or mitigate the spread of the virus, Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 and the disease caused thereby, COVID-19.

120 They are prefaced with a statement by the Civil Contingencies Authority, as required by section 12(2) of the Law. COVID-19 was made a notifiable disease for the purposes of the Public Health Ordinance, 1936 on 10th February 2020.

125 These Regulations revoke and re-enact, with modifications, Regulations No. 10, and came into force on 4th October 2021, and shall have temporary effect only in accordance with the provisions of section 16 of the Law. These Regulations are made by the Civil Contingencies Authority in respect of the coronavirus pandemic and provide detail in Part 1, covering screening, assessment and powers to detain with regulated schedules and regulations and Part 2, covering miscellaneous and final items with related schedules and regulations.

130 Here is to note in terms of Regulation 11, Schedule 2 to these Regulations, which is given effect by Regulation 5, provides for reduced, or no self-isolation to be undertaken by persons who arrive from a place specified as a Green List Country or a Red List Country as specified on the States of Guernsey website, and those persons can elect to comply with or not with the testing requirements set out therein.

135 Green List countries and Red List countries replace the numbered country categories in previous iterations of these Regulations, and arrivals from Green List countries are treated differently depending on whether they have a full vaccination history within the meaning of the Regulations.

140 This Part also provides for ‘Blue Arrivals’, that is persons, including children, arriving in the Bailiwick from within the Common Travel Area and they are to be free from self-isolation on arrival. This Part also provides that a person, other than a child under the age of five, who does not wish to undergo any testing on arrival has to self-isolate for 10 days on arrival. Further details are provided in the Billet documentation.

145 Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues, I propose that the States of Alderney is asked not to annul the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.11) Regulations, 2021.

Thank you, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Abel.



Again, Mr Snowdon, you are seconding this Proposition.

150 **Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Would any Member wish to speak on this Item? I am assuming you are content with this Item passing.

Thank you very much indeed.

**XI. The Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000 –  
Amendment of Legislation –  
Approved**

*Item XI:*

*The States of Alderney is asked to decide:-*

*Whether after consideration of the Policy Letter entitled “The Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000 – amendment of legislation” dated 4th August, 2021 from the States of Guernsey Policy and Resources Committee, they are of the opinion:-*

- 1. To agree to amend section 9(2) of the Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000, to enable a court to award compensation to a person in respect of a judicial act done in good faith, in the circumstances set out in paragraph 2.5 of that Policy Letter; and*
- 2. To agree the preparation of such legislation as may be necessary to give effect to the above decision.*

155 **The Greffier:** Item XI, Mr President, the Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000, Amendment of legislation, the States of Alderney is asked to decide whether after consideration of the Policy Letter entitled the Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000 – amendment of legislation, dated 4th August, 2021 from the States of Guernsey Policy & Resources Committee, they are of the opinion to agree to amend section 9(2) of the Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey)  
160 Law, 2000, to enable a court to award compensation to a person in respect of a judicial act done in good faith, in the circumstances set out in paragraph 2.5 of that Policy Letter; and to agree the preparation of such legislation as may be necessary to give effect to the above decision.

Proposed by Mr Abel and seconded by Mr Snowdon.

165 **The President:** And I think there was a question asked, Mr Harris, at the People’s Meeting.

**Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency, Mr President and fellow colleagues.

Yes, there was a comment. Mr Abel clarified the Item for the public, referring to the Hammerton case in the UK.

170

**The President:** Which I suspect he is now going to refer to again! Over to you, Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr President.

175 Your Excellency, Mr President and colleagues, at the Policy and Finance Committee meeting of 20th May 2021, the Committee resolved to agree to the proposed amendment to section 9(2) of the Human Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000, and agreed for the same Policy Letter, once finalised by the Policy & Resources Committee, to be considered by the States of Alderney.

180 The Policy Letter included as part of this Billet has been received from the States of Guernsey Policy & Resources Committee. This sets out the background as to why the amendment of the Law has been proposed for consideration by the States of Alderney.

185 In summary, if I may, from one of the attached documents, the requirement for this matter to  
be placed before the States of Alderney is based on the 2016 judgement in the case of Hammerton  
versus the UK where the European Court of Human Rights found that the UK had breached certain  
rights of the applicant, Mr Hammerton, under the European Convention of Human Rights. The  
breach related to a statutory bar in the Human Rights Act 1998, the UK legislation, which  
prevented damages being awarded in the circumstances of a judicial act done in good faith, except  
to compensate a person in respect of any deprivation of liberty. The UK, under the terms of the  
Convention and as a member of the Council of Europe, is obliged to implement judgement in cases  
to which it is a party. Accordingly, the UK government has now amended the Human Rights Act  
1990 1998 to address the lack of domestic remedy available.

The Bailiwick legislation largely mirrors the UK legislation and, in a similar way, includes a  
statutory bar against the provision of damages being awarded in the circumstances arising in the  
Hammerton case. The UK government has invited the Bailiwick authorities to consider amending  
its domestic human rights legislation in a similar way to the UK to ensure compliance.

195 The Policy & Resources Committee recommends that the required legislative changes should  
be made to fulfil these obligations for Guernsey. As the legislation applies to the Bailiwick,  
Alderney has been consulted and needs to agree that the legislative changes should be made.

Your Excellency, Mr President and colleagues, I propose that the States of Alderney agree to  
the Propositions tabled by the Greffier.

200 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr Snowden, anything to add?

205 **Mr Snowden:** Happy to second, nothing to add, and thank you to Mr Abel.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Does anybody wish to speak on this Item? Can we take a vote then on this one, Mr Greffier, or  
two votes in fact.

210 **The Greffier:** If we first take a vote on number 1, to agree to amend section 9(2) of the Human  
Rights (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2000, to enable a court to award compensation to a person in  
respect of a judicial act done in good faith, in the circumstances set out in paragraph 2.5 of that  
Policy Letter.

215 *A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Abel	None	None
Ms Burgess		
Mr Carter		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr Kelly		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Roberts		
Mr Snowden		

**The Greffier:** That passes unanimously, Mr President.

And then to move on to item 2, to agree the preparation of such legislation as may be necessary  
to give effect to the above decision.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Abel	None	None
Ms Burgess		
Mr Carter		
Mr Gentle		
Mr Harris		
Mr Kelly		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Roberts		
Mr Snowdon		

**The Greffier:** Both parts pass unanimously, Mr President.

220

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

## **XII. Budgets for 2022 and Revised Budget 2021 – Approved**

*Item XII:*

*After consideration of the Budget Report, the States of Alderney is asked to:-*

- (a) Note the States of Alderney Revenue and Capital Budgets and Revised Budgets for 2021*
- (b) As per the Budget Strategy note that Fuel Duty will be kept consistent with the States of Guernsey for 2022*
- (c) Note that Document Duty will be maintained at existing levels for 2022*
- (d) Note the Reserve Strategy as detailed on page 5 of the Budget Report*
- (e) Approve an increase of June 2021 RPIX (2.3%) on all Alderney Property Tax tariffs for the year of charge 2022*
- (f) Approve the States of Alderney Revenue and Capital Budgets for 2022.*
- (g) Note the States of Alderney Water Board Revenue and Capital Revised Budgets for 2021*
- (h) Note that the Water Rates for 2022 will be maintained at 2021 rates of charge*
- (i) Approve the States of Alderney Water Board Revenue and Capital Budgets for 2022*

225

**The Greffier:** The next Item is Item XII, Budgets for 2022 and Revised Budget 2021. After consideration of the Budget, the States of Alderney is asked: (a) Note the States of Alderney Revenue and Capital Budgets and Revised Budgets for 2021; (b) As per the Budget Strategy note that Fuel Duty will be kept consistent with the States of Guernsey for 2022; (c) Note that Document Duty will be maintained at existing levels for 2022; (d) Note the Reserve Strategy as detailed on page 5 of the Budget Report; (e) Approve an increase of June 2021 RPIX (2.3%) on all Alderney Property Tax tariffs for the year of charge 2022; (f) Approve the States of Alderney Revenue and Capital Budgets for 2022; (g) note the States of Alderney Water Board Revenue and Capital Revised Budgets for 2021; (h) note that the Water Rates for 2022 will be maintained at 2021 rates of charge; and finally (i) to approve the States of Alderney Water Board Revenue and Capital Budgets for 2022.

230

Mr President, again, I think this is in two halves so items (a), (b), (c), (d), (g), (h) and (i) are simply for this House to note and items (e), (f) and (i) are to approve.

235

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. And again, proposed by Mr Abel and seconded by Mr Harris. Mr Harris, as the Convenor, were there any comments by members of the community at the People's Meeting?

240 **Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, there were plenty.

Your Excellency, Mr President and fellow colleagues, it was queried why the numismatic and philatelic profits are not split within the accounts, as requested earlier in the year. The Head of Finance advised that a commitment to split this income further could not be given at this time due to the information being commercially sensitive and subject to contract. It was also stated by a member of the public that Alderney deserves a much better deal on stamps. The Convenor advised that the CEO of Guernsey Post will be invited to a future finance committee meeting to review the existing stamp contract.

245  
250 It was asked if the ability to redeem Alderney coins could be advertised in a press release for six months before the change in the reserve fund. The Head of Finance advised that the proposed reduction in the coin reserve fund did not preclude a member of the public from redeeming coins in the same way as they have always done.

Regarding BDCC expenditure, confirmation in regard to the current process relating to works inspections, start date and completion date was requested. It was asked if the procedure is applied to all building applications. Mr Gentle stated that he would clarify the process and advise accordingly.

255  
260 Another comment was made stating that planning approval used to have start and finish dates applied, perhaps property taxes could be applied to assist in completion of timeframes. The GSC vehicle replacement programme, a query was raised as to why the budgeted capital expenditure on vehicles was considerably higher in 2022. It was stated that there were a number of high value items that require replacement in 2022, which is reflected in the 2022 Budget. This is partially the result of some delayed purchases from previous years. Mr Kelly advised that he would confirm if the old dust cart is still on the Island.

It was queried if the monies have been recuperated for the removal of the bus and boat at Telegraph Tower. The Head of Finance advised that whilst she was unable to comment on any specific cases, it is standard practice to recharge such works back to the owners.

265  
270 Regarding the water taxi and mooring fees, this was free last year which was very positive, if this could be done again this would stimulate the economy, increasing business and trade on-Island. It was noted that Dielette advertised 50% off mooring fees for September and October. This is something that Alderney could perhaps look at. Mr Kelly again stated he would take this to GSC for further discussion.

Regarding the capital programme, Mouriaux to Platte Saline, £220,000 for 2022, the Head of Finance advised that this is an ongoing project which has been budgeted for a number of years. Due to further investigations into the Fort Doyle sewer proposal it had been concluded that this was not a suitable option and therefore this project had now been closed and combined with the Mouriaux to Platte Saline project. The funding included preliminary works and an estimated sum for Phase 2. The Convenor also clarified the current status of the Fort Doyle project.

275  
280 Regarding the Energy Group initiative it was queried what this funding was for. Mr Abel implies that it is provision to advance renewable energy projects for next year. Currently the Group are looking at the creation of an energy policy for the States of Alderney.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Now, I suspect, Mr Harris, you were pleased to get through the first sentence of that.  
(Mr Harris: Yes, sir.) Mr Abel.

285 **Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr President.

Your Excellency, Mr President and colleagues, the Budget Reports for 2021 and 2022 are attached as part of this Billet and provide a full explanation relating to the States of Alderney and the States of Alderney Water Board income and expenditures, it meets the requirements of section 58 of the Government of Alderney, Law 2004.

290 In 2021 the States of Alderney were once again in a position to report good news as the impact of COVID-19 on Alderney's finances has been much less than in other jurisdictions and costs have

been managed and contained. Sadly, COVID-19 will remain with us, and this is recognised in our budgeting strategy.

295 Document Duty has been a significant revenue stream with a surge in the property market in Alderney for this first year where we are able to retain all our incomes.

The main points from the 2021 and 2022 Budget Reports are as follows: in terms of the cost of services, the Budget for 2021 was some £3.11 million. The revised Budget now stands at £3.29 million. The Budget for 2022, in comparison, is some £3.07 million. The surplus at year-end for those three Budgets, the original 2021 Budget projected a £136,000 surplus, and in fact with 300 the surge in the property market we now stand at a surplus projected at some £547,000. The Budget for 2022 stands, in terms of the surplus, at £164,000. So as it stands we are managing to contain and hold our expenses going forward.

The 2021 revised Budget, the points to note are the continued pressures of COVID-19 has led to increased costs and lower revenues, which were significantly offset by the Document and 305 Property Transfer Duty, as mentioned. The costs directly attributable to the pandemic stand at some £125,000 for the year, with the majority of costs relating to the testing and Welcome Centre and Welcome Team staff costs. For the 2021 revised Budget the points to note are the Budget has been prepared in line with the agreed Budget process to achieve a prudent and sensible outcome. It has also built on the positive outcomes from the 2021 revised Budget and has continued 310 emphasis on value for money, challenging the existing budgets and delivering efficiencies to contain and reduce costs. Alderney Property Tax, Fuel Duty and Document Duty income is being retained by the States of Alderney and income from these areas is estimated to be such that the loss of the 2021 Guernsey grant of £300,000 is considered to be manageable in 2022.

It is recognised that the future is always uncertain and that the last two years have shown that 315 anything can change, with very little notice. As the States of Alderney are now in a position to retain any revenue surplus the Committee has considered and agreed a reserve strategy, an amount of £850,000, equivalent to three months' expenditure, which is considered to be prudent, has been set aside in 2021 and is included in the 2021 revised Budget.

The capital programme is mainly funded by the Alderney Gambling Control Commission (AGCC) 320 and its surpluses together with local raised income from asset sales. The gross Alderney Gambling Control Commission distributions for 2021 are expected to be in the region of £2.1 million and the increase on the revised income from 2021 of some £1.85 million. Alderney eGambling Limited is funded to the tune of some £500,000 from the Alderney Gambling Control Commission distributions. The increased levels of Alderney Gambling Control Commission income for both 325 2020 and 2021 are very welcome, considering our concerns in previous years. Discussions early in the year with the AGCC – and I will summarise because I keep tripping over my tongue, Mr President, if you will excuse me – with the Gambling Control Commission now indicate a more positive picture going forward.

Capital expenditure for 2021 is projected to be marginally down to some £2.02 million due to 330 the continued COVID-19 delays. Budget expenditure for 2022 is projected as some £2.86 million, with major expenditure on the Connaught extension and projected expenditure on items such as road resurfacing and the sewage pipelines covered in this number.

The Water Board income balances the annual cost and with the £117,000 contribution to reserves has been revised to £742,000 in 2022. The original number of £742,000 is referring to 335 2021 and the budget for 2022 has been set at a similar level as in 2021. Expenditures on the Water Board capital programme are estimated at £290,000 and £425,000 for the 2021 revised Budget and for 2022 respectively. States of Alderney funding of the capital programme for 2021 totals some £175,000 and for 2022 is budgeted at £325,000 with additional funding provided from Water Board reserves.

340 In summary, it is acknowledged that the current property sales trend is unlikely to continue but this year's performance has given us an unexpected opportunity, in year one of the new financial relationship with Guernsey, to make a major contribution to our target of built-in strategic reserve for the longer term. However, we must keep pace with rising costs alongside

345 creating sensible reserves. Our Budget proposal to increase the Alderney Property Tax (APT) by RPIX, based on June of this year to a sum of 2.3% is considered to be the minimum increase to APT, while continuing to recognise the everyday struggles of our hardworking population.

Document Duty and Water Rates will be maintained at 2021 levels and Fuel Duty will be kept consistent with the States of Guernsey for 2022.

350 We continue to face the ever-present issue of a lack of affordable housing, social and key-worker housing and rental property. In 2022 options for streamlining the current document duty and congé rates will be assessed to determine how this may be used to incentivise first-time buyers.

355 This year we were faced with the issues caused by the requirement for further funding for the Connaught extension. Global prices for materials caused an almost exponential increase in the cost of this project. The increase is allowed for in the revised 2021 Budget and funds are available to allow the project to continue as planned. The importance of providing facilities for our increasing ageing population and for social care needs to be addressed with the greatest of urgency.

360 The key priority for States Members in 2022 is the development and approval of our Island Plan. This is essential for identifying and prioritising our financial needs and links strategic implementation and financial plans. I am happy to report that the revised 2021 Budget and 2022 Budget present much more positive reading than could have been anticipated following the events of the last two years.

365 Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues, after consideration of the Budget Reports I would request that the States of Alderney acknowledges the points noted and approves the Propositions for the Budget as tabled by the Greffier.

Thank you, Mr President.

370 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Abel.  
Mr Harris, you are going to second this one.

**Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, I would like to reserve my right to speak.

375 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Who would like to speak on this Item? Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Your Excellency

380 Thank you. I am going to start off actually with something that I think I have highlighted in this Chamber a number of times and publically and I just thank the Treasury for spending time with me going through all the bits of detail this morning.

385 The capital programme is mainly funded by the AGCC cash, and I thank Mr Abel for highlighting that the revenue streams are very strong and that is really good to see. A question that I would like to put to this Chamber is what happens if AGCC cash is not there in the future. I really hope that is not going to be the situation; *however* I feel that we do need to start looking at Plan B for replacement if that funding capital is not there because our capital programmes are so heavily reliant on the gambling revenue coming in that it really does concern me. So I think moving forward we need to look at new revenue streams as a priority as we have actually become too reliant on the gambling money. I do thank everyone involved in the gambling, it is fantastic that the States of Alderney gets that sort of cash in but I do think there is quite a high risk factor maybe  
390 in five or 10 years' time, I do not know what the timeline will be, but we need to start moving to looking at what our Plan B is.

395 I would also like to thank the States of Guernsey with a £300,000 grant that they basically gave us when we took back control of setting Property Tax, I think that was good. I think we hopefully seem to be managing it quite well so far so that seems quite positive. I have gone through the Report in quite a lot of detail. I would also particularly like to say thank you to Visit Alderney and

all the volunteers involved with the Odeon, which is referred to in the Report, that is a really good heritage site and hopefully there will be some more heritage projects on the way.

400 The company register; illustrations for company returns, I believe in 2021 the income is £35,000; 2022, projected to be £15,000. I think it is worth us noting, and I have not got the figures for company returns in Guernsey and other places, but £61 return fee, £100 Document Duty, personally I think we should be maybe looking at ways of increasing that, maybe if a company has got a turnover worth more than £1 million, we have got over 300 companies registered in Alderney so I think, personally, that is quite a low fee. However, I am willing to listen to consultation on that one.

405 I think Mr Abel has highlighted the tremendous property sales that we have recently had, with an estimate this year being £1,325,000, which is a tremendous amount of money, and I think the projection for 2022 is £705,000. I actually had a question down here but I think the Chairman has kindly answered it for me as to what action we are doing to take first-time buyers – which I know Mr Jenkins, who is unfortunately not here today, would be asking probably as well, and when will that review be put forward. Because I think if we are getting that sort of money in from the property market it is important we try and rebalance it for those people that may be struggling to get onto the property ladder, if they can find a property at the current time as well in their price range.

415 Duty free: I do not know quite what is going on with the duty free stuff. It is referred to in the Report but are we going out for tender? Is there a contract in place with anyone? What is the future with duty free? I cannot quite understand what is moving forward with that one.

420 I know it is raised quite a lot but, coins and stamps, are we happy we are getting the right deal? Are we actually getting the revenue streams that we should be getting? Do we need a bit of outside professional advice to say that we are happy with the advice that we are receiving? I have got nothing against the advice that we are receiving but I am just a little bit concerned that maybe some independent person, body or whatever you want to call it could actually say this is a good deal, keep going with it. I am not quite sure we have actually got that at the moment but I do thank everyone involved in it. But I would just like a bit of reassurance that we are getting the right deals because this conversation seemed to come quite a lot.

425 I think the reserve fund which Treasury have put together is a very good idea which, as the Chairman has highlighted, is £850,000, hopefully, it will build up to £850,000 reserve funds that would fund the States of Alderney for three months. My question being once you have reached that £850,000 would you still be looking at putting increases or are you happy and content that when you do reach that £850,000 goal. I would just like to understand the strategy with that moving forward.

430 The Water Board, that we are noting in here, I think the infrastructure has improved a lot but I think we do need to start looking a little bit at the funding of the Water Board. I know it is referred to in the Report a few times. The reserves stood at £867,000 at the end of 2020. My understanding is that they will hopefully be self-funding in the future, not needing funding from the States of Alderney. I do not know if that goal is to have a million pounds worth of reserve funds, then they can start paying for their own infrastructure upgrades. I would just be interested to understand if there was a Water Board review happening and when that will take place and the outcomes of that going forward.

440 I am going to refer to this one, because I actually think it is quite important – I get told off for talking about it – the new pontoon, 2021 it states £25,000, 2022 the Budget states £25,000 for investigation of the future pontoon. However, somewhere it states, and it might be in the GSC minutes, that the replacement, potentially, will take place in 2022 to 2023 but I do not see any budget for the replacement of the pontoon if it is going to take place in 2022. So I would just like clarification about what is happening with the pontoon, are we going to be revamping the one we have got or are we going to be buying a new one? If we are going to be buying or commissioning a new one what are the costs associated? Because I think it probably should be highlighted a little bit more in this plan.

450 It also refers to the harbour development plan, and I think we are probably going to come on to that a bit later with questions in Q&A at the States of Alderney; however, what is that looking at? You have got the Harbour House, you have got marina ideas, does that incorporate all of those different areas? I would just like to understand what we are actually potentially spending that money on, but I think that will be answered later on or maybe during this debate, and I look forward to the answers.

455 I do understand peoples' concerns that the States of Alderney seems to keep increasing the single property tax year after year and I know people are struggling and they are finding it hard. However, I think this is a small increase. I know we do not like increases at all but it is a small increase and I think we have to give a confidence to our Treasury with the budgeting that they are doing to give them confidence to go forward, so I will be supporting all the items in front of us today.

460 I would also like to say special thanks to Treasury for the amount of hard work they have taken to put this report together, I know it has been a lot of work. And again, special thanks to Penny Oakman, who retired in June this year, for all of the hard work she has done in a number of years in Treasury.

465 So just to sum up, I think we need to probably look at quite a lot of things in detail. I thank everyone for their time in putting this all together but it leaves me with quite a lot of questions for clarification and ways that we look forward in addressing stuff. But I will just go back to the first point: the gambling revenues do concern me that we do not have a Plan B, unless I have missed something, and I think it is important we actually look at our Plan B because we may need it one day.

470 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

Would any other Member wish to speak on this Item? Mr Carter.

475 **Mr Carter:** Thank you, Mr President.

I will try not to compete too much with the motor mower outside and I am sure His Excellency will be able to hear that but hear me as well.

480 Budgets, they are funny things; some people love them, others see them as the black arts in numbers; I think I sit somewhere in between. But the one thing I do know is that if you are trying to execute any capital project you need to plan, you need to plan well ahead and you need to ensure that that planning is as accurate as you can make it.

Now, having sat on the Finance Committee this year, again I would thank all those in the finance department for helping me understand what goes on. Inane questions, I find them quite useful, playing the fool does actually get the answers.

485 I would absolutely agree with Mr Snowdon about the issue that we have with regard to capital expenditure and where the money for that capital expenditure comes from, and it comes back to planning. Ten years ahead, Mr Snowdon mentioned that we should be thinking about; I wonder whether five years ahead might be something a little bit more appropriate. When you have a capital programme you have to plan well ahead. We have a Connaught Care Home extension. 490 Members of this particular body will have proposed it, probably three or four years ago, and there is the lead-in time to have it built. We now know that it is full the day that it is opened. We are also told by the manager that actually you could double the size of it and that would be full the day that would be opened. So what concerns me with regard to capital projects is that we do not appear to have what I would see as a timed approach in terms of the lead-in times for the things 495 that we actually need for the Island. Hence the focus, as Mr Abel said, on an Island Plan. Why don't we have those particular projects lined up? Yes, we have 40 projects, I think, cited in this particular budget document which are subject to, as it says, PLUMP planning and specific budget planning. But what we should have, perhaps, are those budget plans already in place so that we can actually decide what is the priority and take those forward at an appropriate time. But we are not going



500 to be in that situation where, I daresay, in two years' time, when the Connaught extension is completed, there will be the question, 'Well, where does my aunt go? Where does my mother go?' There is nowhere because there was a gap in planning.

One thing I would ask that we do or we think about for next year when this particular budget is re-tabled is that rather than just some aspirational plans of things we would like to do there are  
505 fully budgeted plans so that we could actually instigate them and we could actually go forward with them. That takes time, it takes expertise. Whether we have it on the Island at the moment or not I do not know, but I think we need to have the plans in place. In what is perhaps my naïve way, those lead-in times, as I say, for major projects just are not there at the moment and it is something that I think we do need to focus upon.

510 Mr Roberts helped me immensely when I joined the States. He had the very pithy comment, which resonated with me ever since, and he said, 'Just remember, Ian ...' Forgive, me, Mr President, for using a first name but this is a quote, he said, 'Just remember, Ian, if six people put their hands up they can stop or start anything in the States.' Now, if that is the case then I would hope that six hands will go up for ensuring that we do have a proper, planned capital  
515 programme, properly funded and again, taking Mr Snowdon's point on board, that we do have that Plan B.

We are now in a much more financially independent position and along with that comes responsibility for those finances. I would also hope that in that planning we start to think about maybe, rather than just being accountable to the States of Alderney law, that we do actually  
520 actively consider the pros and cons of proper international accounting standards. They may actually cause some investors to think, yes, this is a place that they want to invest in.

So I would commend this Budget, this series of budgets, to you but I would ask that you do think very carefully for next year about international accounting standards and a properly funded and positive capital projects programme.

525 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Carter.  
Would anybody else like to speak on this Item? Mr Kelly.

530 **Mr Kelly:** Thank you, sir.

Your Excellency, Mr President, just to answer Mr Snowdon's first point in relation to the pontoon – the cursed pontoon. The budget for this year is to ensure that we have had the research to make sure that what is left of the piles and the pontoon structure is capable for servicing our immediate needs next year, rather than to stumble into it, as occurred this year, we are saying,  
535 'Well, it was okay last year, it will do again.' When, of course it did not do again did it? It broke down. So we are going to have the research this year to make sure that it will be okay for next year. The money for next year's project is to do the scoping for a new pontoon area, not a replacement for this one. Hopefully one that is capable of taking a much larger craft.

In relation to your questions concerning the Harbour review, I will answer that in my reply to  
540 your questions.

One final thing, sir, as a member, together with Mr Harris, I have the pleasure of being a director of Alderney eGambling Limited (AeGL), that is the company that is responsible for marketing the jurisdiction as an eGaming jurisdiction. I agree, that we should broaden our capital income but I would hate it to be thought that that is in jeopardy at the moment. We are aware,  
545 the people who work for us are confident in the immediate to medium future. I would hate the members of the press to go away thinking that there is a problem, sir; there is not a problem at the moment.

Thank you.

550 **The President:** Thank you for that clarification, Mr Kelly.

Would any other Member like to speak to this Item? No, then, Mr Abel, do you want to exercise ...? Sorry, Mr Harris, you do?

**Mr Harris:** Yes, sorry, I beg your pardon, sir.

555 Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues, thank you to all of my colleagues for their comments up to this point, many of which I agree with.

I am going to read some of the conclusion I have put together for the Budget Report, and I apologise if I repeat anything that Mr Abel may have said. But last year, in this very report, we described 2020 as unprecedented, which it absolutely was due to a worldwide pandemic and  
560 thankfully this year has been slightly less so, but not without its own COVID related problems. However, we are once again in a position to report good news as the impact from COVID-19 on Alderney's finances has been much less than other jurisdictions and we have survived and continue to survive without too many negative repercussions. Of course, this has obviously been helped by our fiscal union and wider relationship with Guernsey and it is the Bailiwick's finances that on the whole have suffered. However, we as the States of Alderney have a responsibility to produce a prudent and sensible Budget, words again mentioned by Mr Abel there, and we have managed to do that so far for 2022 by building on our positive outcomes from the 2021 Budget, reprioritising some of our capital projects, seeking to operate more efficiently and looking for savings in all service areas where this does not compromise delivery quality and the commitment  
565 to developing new income streams, and I think hopefully Mr Snowdon as a member of the Economic Development Committee along with several others of our membership will be contributing to that in the future. So, yes, I agree that we do need to branch out as much as possible.

We mentioned last year about the introduction of the Alderney Property Tax, together with Document and Fuel Duty changes could only be good for the Island and we are obviously delighted that APT was implemented smoothly at the start of this year, thanks to prompt payment by property owners, collection rates are currently on budget. It should be noticed that if we had remained with TRP with Guernsey we would have had a 4% rise instead of an RPIX increase of 2.3%, so I think that was also rather good to report.  
575

In this first year where we were able to retain all document duties we have benefited significantly from a surge in the property market. As a result we have seen our surplus for the year swell beyond budgeted expectation, as detailed by Mr Abel. We acknowledge, however, that the current property trend is unlikely to last very long but this year's performance has given us an unexpected opportunity in year one of the new financial relationship with Guernsey to make a major contribution to our target of building a strategic reserve for the longer term. Or budget proposal is noted and therefore to increase the APT by RPIX of 2.3%, which was using June 2021 rates, whilst keeping Document Duty rates the same as 2020. Next year we will also be looking at options for streamlining the current Document Duty and congé rates and how this might be used to incentivise first-time buyers. I think that is very important that we address that issue head on  
580 as much as we can.

Obviously, in a perfect world, there would be no raising of any taxes at all but this minimal increase to APT is considered to be the bare minimum we could implement whilst continuing to recognise the everyday struggles of our hard-working population.

Of course, whilst money in the bank for congé etc. is always hugely welcomed, we continue to face the ever present issue of a lack of affordable housing, rental property, social and key-worker housing and so forth. We must not forget our community and we must address these issues head on as the greatest of priorities.  
595

I am happy to confirm that we will once again maintain Water Rates at 2020 levels, which is a fantastic result and testament to the hard work and diligent budgeting of the Water Board team, and we of course thank them for all their hard work in this and previous years. As mentioned by Snowdon, the intention over the coming years is for the Water Board to be self-funding, without requiring any further input from the States regarding any finance.  
600

605 Last year we had the issue of the Harbour deficit due to COVID and the impact of that pandemic. This obviously remains a matter for scrutiny. We will be discussing the Harbour in greater detail in the question part of this meeting but we will continue to seek ways of reducing that deficit over time.

610 This year we were faced with the issue caused by the requirement for further funding for the Connaught extension. Global prices for materials and so forth caused the cost of this project to sky rocket but thankfully funds were budgeted for and were available and the project continues as planned. We all know the importance of providing facilities for our increasing ageing population and we need to address this issue as a whole going forward. I appreciate Mr Carter's comments as well that obviously the current extension is merely just a drop in the ocean, I think, regarding the larger issue that is coming down the line.

615 However, 2021 has seen our Bailiwick relations continue to thrive and we have again welcomed staycationers throughout the year, and together with the return of our UK visitors we have seen our hospitality sector thrive. New attractions such as the reopening of the Odeon have seen our tourism product increase and we hope to continue with such projects in the coming years. We thank everyone involved for their hard work and their dedication has been welcomed by Islanders and visitors alike, so special thanks to Visit Alderney and all involved in that project. Which I have to say, personally, is fantastic.

620 And finally, I would like to thank our Treasury team, led by the Head of Finance, Liz Morris, supported by Steven Taylor, our strategic financial advisor, for their exceptional hard work throughout the year. Again, facing many of those difficulties experienced in 2020. In particular, our thanks go to Elanja O'Toole, who during Liz's maternity leave worked above and beyond to assist the Finance Committee and the States. Special thanks also go to Penny Oakman who retired from the Treasury department earlier in the summer, and we thank her for the many years dedicated to her role – she did not want to mention how many years she had been working for the States, so 'many years' will have to suffice! We do, however, wish her all the very best in her well-deserved retirement.

630 In conclusion, I give enormous thanks to all involved in preparing this Budget and once again I am happy to report that it presents much more positive reading than could have been anticipated following the events of the last two years. And from that we can approach the coming years with a continued strength in Alderney's future.

Thank you, sir.

635

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Any other contributions? Ms Burgess? (**Ms Burgess:** No, sir.)

Do you wish to respond?

640

**Mr Abel:** If I may please, Mr President.

**The President:** Please do.

**Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr President.

645

I think to start off with the easy ones before I get to Mr Snowdon's lengthy set of questions.

Just to say thank you to Mr Harris for his summing up or conclusions, it is much appreciated and certainly I think all States' Members would endorse his comments with regard to the hard work being put in by the Finance department and also to pass our thanks on to them. Without you would we battle? Probably yes would be the answer, thank you very much indeed.

650

I think in terms of Mr Harris he also confirmed some of Mr Carter's comments on the provision of good capital planning.

With regard to Mr Kelly I would like to thank him for his answering of some of Mr Snowdon's questions and to anticipate some more answers for other questions to come up for Mr Snowdon.

655 With regard to Mr Carter I think his comments are very valuable and again, link back to the  
Island Plan process that we are engaged in and the report that he will present a little bit later on.  
I would agree with him and support and we are also progressing, I think, moving towards a better  
set of public service accounting ... I am trying to think of the acronym, the public service accounting  
principles, is it? I cannot quite think of it, anyway, we will get it right at some time, Mr President.  
660 But basically we are looking at that and I do agree with him, the States needs to reflect itself with  
competent and understandable accounts going forward. Certainly capital planning is key to any  
success and the Island needs to start thinking about its future not just tomorrow.

665 With regard to Mr Snowdon's – I nearly ran out of paper, Mr President – certainly Mr Snowdon  
has highlighted the need to have a Plan B and it is certainly something we need to deal with  
because for some years we have nodded but done nothing so I think that needs to be taken away  
and considered in more detail.

I think his thanks going to the Visit Alderney team is well placed and needs to be concerned by  
colleagues. Certainly they have had a successful couple of years and we can now peer out of the  
Odeon with some confidence of not falling out of the Odeon as we visit it, and they should be  
thanked for pushing that ahead.

670 In terms of the company registration those numbers I have not seen before or actually pulled  
them out and certainly I know that the Economic Development Committee is starting to look at  
the Companies Law and what it means for Alderney in terms of both residents and in terms of its  
reputation.

675 With regard to property taxes and with regard to being able to facilitate first-time buyers, that  
I think, is a valid comment and certainly is an item that has been discussed internally in terms of  
changing the focus of the Document Duty and the Congé going forward.

680 With regard to the reserves, just to point out that we actually have now budgeted in 2021 for  
the total amount of £850,000 what it means there in future budgeting will be for us to consider  
whether that level is still appropriate for the risks we face and if it is sufficient. Obviously any  
surplus should be able to be put back into offsetting some of the budget increases we need to  
accommodate, so there is some positiveness there by having this reserve now in place.

685 In terms of the Water Board, that certainly has been in discussion in terms of the level of  
reserves and the ability for the Water Board to fund itself, and I know GSC is reviewing that and is  
taking that in hand.

The new pontoon, I am glad you have floated that, if I can use the word, and certainly there  
will be plenty of debate over that coming forward. The Harbour development plan is certainly  
important to us as it does not just focus on some of the operational issues, which is one part of  
the review programme for the Harbour but also focusses a bit more broadly on how best to utilise  
the total Braye Bay area. So it is a bit broader than just looking at the Harbour in this particular  
690 case, but again that project needs to develop, terms of reference need to be drawn up and  
debated within P&F and possibly even at the States level.

695 I think, Mr President, I have covered the majority of the issues that have been tabled and I  
would like to thank Members for those questions because it is always of use to everybody around  
the table and in the Public Gallery to understand some of the questions which I would like to say  
I have not hidden in the detail of the Budget but are not as apparent, thank you for those  
questions.

Thank you, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Abel.

700 Now, in terms of the voting on this, Mr Greffier, I get the sense that the Members are all in  
favour of all of these Propositions. That being the case, Mr Greffier, I think unless anybody has  
any further thing to say on that we could say all these are passed, those are noted which need to  
be noted and those approved which need to be approved.

705 **The Greffier:** Yes, Mr President. That means the items (e), (f), and (i) are approved and the remaining letters are merely noted.

**XIII. Questions and Reports –  
Eight questions for verbal reply  
and one Report**

*Item XIII.*

*The following questions had been received:*

*Four question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee:*

- (1) Could the Chairman outline Alderney's support for the 'Aurigny strategy 2021-2025', also do we know when the feasibility study will be concluded and public engagement?*
- (2) Should the States of Alderney be reviewing ACRE's role and new mandate for the regulator?*
- (3) The President of Guernsey's Committee for Environment & Infrastructure has recently highlighted being keen to talk with Alderney over energy strategies, should the Channel Islands be working together on securing renewable energies?*
- (4) Following the 'Civil Service Reform' in Guernsey, is Alderney taking the same steps?*

*One question from Mr Snowdon for the Chairman of the General Services Committee:*

- (1) Can the Chairman outline progress with the Harbour Management Review and Harbour Plan, will members of the public be able to feed into the review and plan?*

*Three questions received from Mr Roberts for the Chairman of General Services Committee:*

- (1) Will the chairman explain why the crane remains exposed on the quay when it could be stored by the shed as repeated requests still remain ignored?*
- (2) At the recent fishing competition access was promised to visiting anglers. Banned in the name of health and safety. Was extra insurance taken in case of an incident, or is that already in place?*
- (3) Can the chairman of GSC explain the lack of action on the recent blocking of an ancient right of way to States land and why does he continuously fail to forward this important issue and take the lead as Chairman's as I do not agree he is conflicted?*

*Three questions received from Mr Roberts for the Chairman of Building and Development Control Committee:*

- (1) Could the chairman of BDCC please give an update on progress of the agricultural catering school, an economic enabler for Alderney?*
- (2) Could the Chairman please advise was planning permission granted for the Harbour gates, when and what date it was given please?*
- (3) Can the Chairman please assure every effort will be made to retain Whitegates as a social housing zone?*

*The following Report was delivered by Mr Carter: Island Planning Group Report.*

710 **The Greffier:** The next Item on the Billet is Item XIII, which is Questions and Reports. We first have questions from Mr Snowdon for the Chair of the Policy and Finance Committee and then for the Chairman of the General Services Committee followed by questions from Mr Roberts for the Chairman of the General Services Committee and for the Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee.

715 **Mr Snowdon:** Sir, sorry to interrupt. Can I just ask for clarification? The Island Plan report, do we get to debate that at all or is that just for noting?

**The President:** No, that is subject to the normal process.

**Mr Snowdon:** Okay, thank you.

### **Aurigny Strategy 2021-25; feasibility study**

720

**The President:** So, Mr Snowdon, would you like please to ask your first question of Mr Abel?

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency.

725 This is to Mr Abel, Could the Chairman outline Alderney's support for the 'Aurigny strategy 2021-2025', also do we know when the feasibility study will be concluded and public engagement?  
Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Mr Abel.

730 **Mr Abel:** Your Excellency, Mr President, colleagues and Mr Snowdon, with regard to your question.

The Alderney strategy, if you want to look at that in a little bit more detail in terms of public access, is covered on the Government of Guernsey's website, gov.gg, under the previous Billet for last week's States of Deliberation meeting. It is quite comprehensive and extensive and we have  
735 been fortunate here in Alderney that P&F were given a presentation by Mr Nico Bezuidenhout, the CEO of Aurigny, and he was accompanied to underline the importance of the relationship we have by Mr Kevin George who is the Chairman of Aurigny as well. The presentation he gave to us is within or aligned with obviously the strategy presented. It gave a clear view, shall I say, of the situation going forward and how it links in to the PSO.

740 The CEO of Aurigny, Mr Bezuidenhout, uses the current situation where we have two Dorniers in place and does not look, at this particular time, at any of the upside in terms of their strategy.

His strategy is to manage the situation around the two Dorniers. He is challenged obviously with regard to some of his routes between Guernsey and the UK, plus also he is challenged with regard to the multiple fleets that he runs and the challenges around that with both one or two  
745 types of plane.

In terms of the PSO they have been involved directly between the States' Trading Supervisory Board of Guernsey and P&R and to a certain extent we are really just sitting on the side hoping that we get a resolution which is workable for Alderney. From the discussions we have had with both P&R in Guernsey and also from the presentation certainly the PSO is felt to be workable. And  
750 again they projected in the presentation that the general level of services that have been discussed will be met within the £2 million allowance within the PSO.

Overall I think the Aurigny CEO was confident he could deliver what he has. When I looked at the bottom line of his figures and they were not looking too exciting, he was really maintaining a break even situation which reflects an Island-owned company, so there are some real positives  
755 there. He certainly has spent a lot of time on assessing the various challenges he has got and he certainly is a very competent person, and I think the Bailiwick is very fortunate they have managed to – I do not know what the word is – find him, or whether it is to actually attract him to come and live and work in the Bailiwick. Certainly the relationship that we now have with Aurigny is very positive and the support we are getting is also very positive. I think all of us were impressed with  
760 the presentation and feel a lot more confidence than we have for many years in dealing with Aurigny.

765 With regard to the runway extension and the feasibility study there, this is becoming quite a mission in terms of when it is going to be completed and what are the results of it. We keep hearing good noises, which is fortunate, but again we were initially promised way back some months ago to be given the presentation of this. We were also promised, or it was indicated to us, that this study should be available roughly in September. More recently it has been rolled through to October and if I look at the date we are not too far from November so as it stands in terms of your question, Mr Snowdon, I do not see us getting much or many answers on this particular item until November. But certainly both the Supervisory Board who are overseeing this and also P&R, 770 for which this is also part of their project, the commitment to presenting this project and involving the community here in Alderney is there and is a key part, I think, to this project being assessed and having the community getting on board – can I use the word – this particular project.

775 Again, for Alderney, it is extremely important and if we can get confidence that that will go forward obviously it gives us a lot more confidence in the transport links for the Island and also gets rid of one of the big concerns we have had for many years in Alderney because of the lack of understanding on whether we have a future in terms of the air transport strategy for the Bailiwick. Thank you, Mr President.

780 **The President:** Thank you. Do you have a supplementary question, Mr Snowdon, arising out of that answer?

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, I think so. Thank you, sir, Your Excellency.

785 It was just basically to ask the Chairman would he agree that when he is looking at making savings in the medium- and long-term, therefore talking with the Alderney community, Aurigny themselves and also the States of Guernsey, is absolutely essential if that feasibility does say that a longer runway is the way we are headed?

Thank you.

790 **The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** I think, Mr President, Your Excellency, I can only say, yes.

**The President:** Very succinct, thank you.

795 Does any other Member have a question for Mr Abel arising out of the answer he gave to Mr Snowdon? Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir

800 We have got two aircraft only. One going in on check in November. Will he agree if the other one goes technical in November these times could be extremely challenging for Alderney?

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Mr President, Your Excellency, colleagues.

805 Certainly that has been an area that has been discussed extensively with Aurigny because the single plane, while the other plane is maintained, obviously exposes us to risk. In the presentation and the discussions with Mr Bezuidenhout he has indicated that the fall-back plan is obviously to get support from the Isles of Scilly who will provide access to a plane of similar size, a Twin Otter, which I think you know well, to support us during that particular time.

810 One hopes it will not come to a point where we have to ask for that service, but certainly there is that commitment from Aurigny to provide it and to maintain services.

Thank you for that question.

**The President:** Thank you.

815 Any other questions for Mr Abel? No, then, Mr Snowdon, your second question, please.

**Alderney Commission for Renewable Energy (ACRE) –  
Review of role and mandate**

**Mr Snowdon:** Your Excellency, thank you, sir.

Should the States of Alderney be reviewing ACRE's role and a new mandate for the regulator?  
Thank you, sir.

820

**The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Mr President, Your Excellency.

825 The ACRE legislation, which I think goes back to 2007, is quite a document when you read it.  
Our focus over the last few years has been really around its duties as the commissioners with  
regard to the sea bottom and renewables inside the sea. Only recently was it pointed out to me  
that the ACRE or the Renewable Energy (Alderney) Act actually looks at total renewables across  
the Island, not only in the sea but also on land.

830 So, yes, I think it is something that we need to look at going forward because as we move  
towards land-based renewables, which are some of our first steps that we wish to obviously adopt  
as the marine alternative has not come to fruition, we need to have a look and see whether that  
legislation is in line with our needs and also whether the way it is managed or operated as a  
commission is suitable for what we need going forward. At the present time I think it is something  
that is probably in the lower bracket of our priorities but I think it is a good question and we need  
835 to have a look and see what it needs going forward.

Thank you, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you.

Do you have a supplementary question, Mr Snowdon?

840

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you.

Would the Chairman agree that ACRE is currently potentially mothballed and we need to try  
and ensure that the experience and expertise is available to ACRE as it moves forward, but once  
we understand how it is going to move forward?

845 Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** I think again, Mr President, a succinct answer, yes.

850

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Does anybody else have a question on this one  
for Mr Abel? No, then your third question please, Mr Snowdon.



**Energy strategies –  
Renewable energies for the Channel Islands**

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

855 The President of Guernsey's Committee for Environment & Infrastructure has recently highlighted being keen to talk with Alderney over energy strategies, should the Channel Islands be working together on securing renewable energies?

Thank you, sir.

860 **The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon, for the question.

As you are aware, I think the ink is not quite dry based on the conversation that we had last week with Deputy de Sausmarez, who is head of their environmental committee on that side.  
865 Certainly the working group between Alderney and Guernsey have also been discussing this in the past with regard to the Bailiwick grid and also how this can be extended.

The extra question on whether we can get Guernsey and Jersey, Sark and ourselves into the pot is certainly quite a challenge and my initial answer was going to be I am quite happy to leave that in yours and Mr Roberts' capable hands to move forward.

870 At the current time, as everybody is aware, we really need to focus our priorities on moving to the first step of reducing our carbon footprint and introducing renewables into the Island to offset some of the diesel that we are using. Again, this has been talked about for some years and we have gone around, I would say, not just in round circles but I use the term 'squircles', which is a square circle where you get lost in the middle and I think the commitment is, and in line with the  
875 Island Plan, which Mr Carter is going to talk to, has to be advanced as a matter of priority.

Thank you for the question.

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Snowdon, further question?

880

**Mr Snowdon:** Nothing to ask, just to thank Mr Abel for answering.

**The President:** Thank you.

Does anybody else want to ask a question? No, then we will go to your final question for  
885 Mr Abel please, Mr Snowdon.

**Civil Service Reform in Guernsey –  
Steps taken by Alderney**

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

Following the 'Civil Service Reform' in Guernsey, is Alderney taking the same steps?  
Thank you.

890

**The President:** Mr Abel.

**Mr Abel:** Mr President, Your Excellency.

I am going to be a little bit flippant if I may, Mr President. I think Alderney's Civil Service and  
895 Guernsey's Civil Service are not quite the same size. Again, the question is valid though and I will try and answer it as best I can.

900 One of the reasons that I stood to be a Member of the States was because I could see that our own Civil Service is not fit for purpose. It is a year now since I have been on the States and from my own appraisal of the situation our Civil Service is not fit for purpose, it needs to be bolstered and also its focus altered, adjusted and focussed on delivering a good level of service to the Island. Certainly that discussion has been had with our Chief Executive. Part of the steps that we have taken and we have all seen, and a positive one, is we have a Chief Executive who we are confident in and we have a way forward.

905 Sadly, some of the legacy items from the past require us to deal with those issues before we can actually advance, and I know our Chief Executive is frustrated by having to deal with those, she is successfully doing that, but there are a lot.

910 So with regard to the budget, and as you are aware, the budget has allowed for additional staff and again the discussion is how they will be utilised and how the effectiveness of the Civil Service will be improved, and that certainly has been in discussions in P&F in past months and will be in P&F in coming months.

915 So when we look at the reform question you have placed to us, I would like to reform something but unfortunately we need to actually form it first before we can reform it. However, I think there are some real positives for ourselves from the Guernsey reform process, partly based on the relationship we have also built up with the Civil Service in Guernsey and with P&R in Guernsey and there we are getting support already with regard to minimised duplication of services. Also I see a big positive is as Guernsey gets into its reform process they hopefully will develop better systems which we can also utilise going forward and also their systems that they implement to improve efficiencies we can learn from and utilise and develop as well. So it is a good question and a big challenge I think to the Civil Service in terms of moving forward and delivering the level of service and support that the community requires.

920 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

925 Mr Snowdon, supplementary question?

**Mr Snowdon:** No, just thank you to Mr Abel for the detailed answer.

Thank you.

930 **The President:** Thank you. Anybody else wish to ask a question? Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir, Your Excellency.

935 I too am changed with the CEO changes. Is the President of P&F supporting expansion of the Civil Service?

Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Abel.

940 **Mr Abel:** Expansion of the Civil Service is always a very tricky question and becomes very sensitive to everybody around, Mr President, Your Excellency.

I do not actually believe we need to expand the Civil Service but if we could actually get the positions that we have currently filled and having the right expertise, capabilities and experience built into those positions will certainly move the Civil Service where it needs to be.

945 I think in terms of the budgets, if we go back three to five years ago the number of people was a lot higher than we have today and by default those people have disappeared and obviously when I look around I see the level of service and support and capability disappearing so to a certain extent we are going through a loop and yes, this year's budget is slightly more than last year's budget but is no bigger than a budget from two or three years ago. We need to have a Civil Service

which is fit for purpose and that is the discussion we are having and will continue to have in coming months.

950 Thank you for the question.

**The President:** Thank you.

Any other questions for Mr Abel? Thank you, Mr Abel.

955 Now, Mr Snowdon, you have got a question for the Chairman of the General Services Committee.

### **Harbour Review and Harbour Plan – Progress and public involvement**

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency.

Can the Chairman outline progress with the Harbour Management Review and Harbour Plan, will members of the public be able to feed into the review and plan?

960 Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Mr Kelly.

965 **Mr Kelly:** Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow Members, first of all thank you to Mr Abel for partially answering the question but I think the question does call for a more comprehensive response.

I thank Mr Snowdon for asking the question, thereby allowing me to continue to inform the public of the General Services Committee's continuing monitoring of the Harbour, both in the immediate term and Policy and Finance's desire to look at the medium- to long-term situation. In relation to what Mr Snowdon refers to as the Harbour Management Review, if I may correct him, it is in fact the Harbour Review not purely management. This is being conducted by the States of Guernsey Harbour Master as a peer review. The terms of reference have been approved by the Chief Executive and communicated to members of the General Services Committee and the Harbour staff. Where issues such as maintenance, of the highly technical equipment that we have that is not present in Guernsey and it will not be covered in the terms of reference but is being organised by the Chief Executive to cover that point.

975 Once the review with recommendations is complete this will be presented to the General Services Committee for consideration. Most probably and hopefully by the December meeting. Implementation of any changes that come from this review will be reflected in how the Harbour is run from 2022 onwards. The scope of the review will include governance and management, port state responsibilities and coastal state responsibilities.

980 In relation to the Harbour Plan or the Harbour Master Plan as it is sometimes known, up until recently, sir, this was a mythical beast; everybody referred to it – a bit like the yeti – but no one had seen it! (*Laughter*) It was subject to a decision by P&F in September that we have actually had a Harbour Plan and Members will have noted from the Budget report that a suitably qualified third party will hopefully be engaged to conduct the work and the aim is to have the third party in place by the end of this year, as the States has neither the capacity or capability to manage the process itself, and that is no reflection upon any of the Civil Service.

985 Members will be kept aware of progress and stakeholders in the community will be given the opportunity to comment on proposals through a consultation process.

990 Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Snowdon, do you have another question?

995

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, just one, and thank you to Mr Kelly for the detailed answer, it was basically just to ask will the review, whatever it is called, and plan, be made public at all?  
Thank you.

1000

**Mr Kelly:** Which review? If we are talking about the first review, if we want to call it that, let's not worry about semantics, the Harbour Review then that, no doubt, will be made public because it is a peer review. In relation to the larger-scale review, which as my friend Mr Abel said earlier, will cover the whole of Braye Bay and not just the immediate vicinity of the Harbour, then yes, that too will be made public.

1005

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Kelly. Does anybody else have a question arising out of those answers? Mr Roberts.

1010

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir.  
This is pertaining to the Harbour Review, would the Chairman regard the review being carried out by the Guernsey Harbour Master, who works closely with Alderney Harbour, totally independent and unbiased?

1015

**The President:** Mr Kelly.  
**Mr Kelly:** I think the answer to that, sir, I will follow Mr Abel's example, I will be succinct, is yes. However, I will expand slightly. If we were to get a peer review where do we go? Do we go to Southampton? I doubt it because the Harbour Master in Southampton has got a different scale to the problems we have. Do we go to the Scottish Highlands? Well, that is a good idea, but there again the same accusation could be made because the current Harbour Master served there too.  
I have no doubt about the capability and professional ability of the Guernsey Harbour Master and I do hope you are not casting assertions against his ability.

1025

**Mr Roberts:** I was asking a question, sir.  
**The President:** I think you have answered that question, thank you, Mr Kelly.  
**Mr Kelly:** Thank you, sir.

1030

**The President:** Any other questions for Mr Kelly arising out of ...? That being the case, I think, Mr Snowdon, that completes your list of questions.  
Now, Mr Roberts, you have one question for the Chairman of the General Services Committee.

1035

**Mr Roberts:** Not one question, I have got three, sir.  
**The President:** Oh sorry, yes. Three questions in fact.

1040

**A Member:** Make it one!  
**A Member:** Just pick one! (*Interjection and Laughter*)

**The crane –  
Exposure on the quay**

**Mr Roberts:** Will the Chairman explain why the crane remains exposed on the quay when it could be stored by the shed as repeated requests still remain ignored?

1045 **The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow Members, like Mr Roberts, I totally agree that when the crane is not in operation it should be stored away from the quay, there is no argument there. Mr Roberts is fully aware of the preparatory work on the suggested storage place at Fort Grosnez and why it has been delayed. I am as anxious as he that this should take place, that is the removal of the crane off the quay, and have reminded the States' Chief Executive of our Committee's policy on the matter of crane storage.

1050  
1055 I am aware of the tremendous pressure the Harbour staff have been under over the last few months, monitoring our borders because of COVID restrictions. However, as that requirement is now easing due to the seasonal nature of marine leisure traffic, I fully expect the Harbour Master to ensure his staff carry out the stated GSC policy.

I would like to remind Members that we are policy makers, not managers, no matter how tempting it is to forget that and that is something that I am often guilty of.

Thank you, sir.

1060

**The President:** Thank you. Mr Roberts, do you have a supplementary question?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes. Does the Chairman not then feel that that policy should be implemented?

1065 **The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** I am going to do a Mr Abel, sir, yes.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Does anybody else ...? Mr Snowdon, you have a question of Mr Kelly arising out of his answer?

1070

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you.

I just wanted to pick up on this one: would the Chairman agree that the crane is a very expensive asset that has just been replaced and if a resolution is passed by General Services it needs to be implemented?

1075

Thank you.

**Mr Kelly:** Yes and yes.

1080 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Well, anybody else?  
Moving swiftly along, Mr Roberts.

**Angling Festival –  
Harbour access and insurance**

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, thank you, sir.

At the recent fishing competition access was promised to visiting anglers. Banned in the name of health and safety. Was extra insurance taken in case of an incident, or is that already in place?

1085

**The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Your Excellency, Mr President, fellow Members, in relation to Mr Roberts' question on the fishing festival I am not sure whether the second sentence of that question re: health and safety was a question or a statement. If it were the former, no, if the latter, it is an incorrect statement.

1090

Mr Roberts may recall that as a member of GSC last year, before I was a member of the Committee at its July meeting the GSC discussed the Commercial Quay. And if I may, sir, I may quote from the minutes of that meeting, 'It was noted that following a tour of the Commercial Quay by the Harbour Master with members of the GSC, the Harbour Master will review feasible options with regard to public access to the Commercial Quay subject to health and safety considerations and regulatory requirements. The GSC noted the above.'

1095

On 6th August that year a press release went out outlining fishing access to the Commercial Quay, through the gate next door to the ferry room, along the pathway and there remained no access through the main Commercial Quay gate. Now I appreciate Mr Roberts was absent at that July meeting. However, in September of that year the Commercial Quay access was again discussed, with Mr Roberts in attendance. As the report from the Harbour Master was tabled and considered the General Services Committee resolved to confirm its support of the Commercial Quay access criteria, that is no access via the main gate, and at times set out in the Harbour Master's report. Sir, I can find no evidence of Mr Roberts, or any other Member, dissenting from that.

1100

1105

This year a press release was issued again outlining the access criteria, as per last year, via the side gate but in addition to last year's access, access was allowed for the disabled and elderly. If I may remind Members by reading two short paragraphs from that press release:

Supervised vehicle access will also be permitted for the disabled and elderly during times that the Harbour Office is staffed this weekend.

"The Harbour Office and the General Services Committee both recognise how important this event is to the local community and we look forward to welcoming visiting anglers," ...

1110

That was a quotation, sir. I emphasise the last paragraph, and if I am still Chairman of General Services next year, in September, I will be liaising with the fishing festival organisers to ensure they are aware of the facilities offered to them and despite the perceptions of some, the willingness of the States and its employees to assist that festival.

1115

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Kelly.  
A question, Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir.

Health and safety is of course part of today, however, the people of Alderney have had right of access passed by the General Services Committee, I believe it was in 2004, and implemented where they overruled them and actually gave public access to that when we were not using the boats, unloading the boats ... I am looking for a question here! (**The President:** Yes!) Sorry.

1120

Would he not agree that this has been eroded by regulation in an area that sees two boats a week with regulations related to busy city container ports, like Rotterdam and Folkestone?

1125

**The President:** Well recovered, Mr Roberts!

**Mr Roberts:** I beg your pardon?

1130 **The President:** Well recovered.

**Mr Roberts:** Thank you.

1135 **The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Yes, sir. I was not around in the States in 2004 and to be frank my research did not go back to 2004. I deal with the current and the present, sir.

1140 We are *presently* required, under both the Port Maritime Safety Code and International Shipping Port Security Code to have a secure area. If we did not we would not be able to have international shipping, it would be banned. The Harbour is regularly inspected by international inspectors to see that we are complying with the code.

1145 All we are asking for, sir, is for one small area in the middle of the quay to remain secure. We are not banning people from going to the end of the quay to fish. As one of my junior Members of the States said the other day, would we allow skateboarding on the Airport if it was shut? And the answer is we would not, clearly not. And the same applies to people fishing in the quay, sir.

Next year – *(Interjection)*

**Mr Roberts:** Point of order, sir.

1150 We used to allow at the Airport people flying their planes, their toy planes!  
Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Not a point of order but informative. *(Laughter and Interjections)*

1155 **Mr Kelly:** I do not know how to respond to that, sir!

**The President:** Well, I am still trying to work out who the junior Member on the skateboard is!  
*(Laughter)*

1160 **Mr Kelly:** There are only a few, sir, he is not too far away.

Yet again, sir, I do not know how to respond politely to Mr Roberts –

**The President:** I am sure you will find a way.

1165 **Mr Kelly:** Yes. I will just ignore it, sir, if I may. *(Laughter)*

For international shipping to be allowed into this Harbour we need to have a secure area.

I am mindful that we have a review of the Harbour coming up in the next few weeks and I will be interested to see the States of Guernsey Harbour Master's report on that matter.

1170 But I will repeat what I said in my main reply that I will be working next year, if I am in post, to assist the fishing festival with access because I do appreciate how important it is to the shoulder months of the economy.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Ms Burgess.

1175 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President.

Sorry to prolong this conversation but can we also deal with access on to the quay, can we perhaps have it confirmed that the gates are unlocked when the quay is not in use as there have

been comments made from the public that they have found the side access gates locked when they have tried to access ...?

1180

**The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Your Excellency, Mr President.

Well, as my deputy, ma'am, I would have thought that –

1185

**Ms Burgess:** I was asking on behalf of the public.

**Mr Kelly:** – you are quite easily able to inspect and to speak with the Harbour Master. I do understand. I get the sailing club regularly popping down to make sure the gate is open, and I will continue to do that. I have already stressed, not in a management way, clearly, because that would be contravening the Chief Executive's role but as a policy maker that the gate be left open.

1190

**Ms Burgess:** Thank you.

1195

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

**The President:** Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, sorry, sir. I am just losing track of where we are going with this. I just wanted a bit of clarification. Regarding older people and people maybe with disabilities, if they wish to go fishing they can drive their car all the way to the end of the quay with permission from the Harbour Master or whoever is down there, is that correct? And is that all year round?

1200

Thank you very much, sorry to prolong this but I just wanted that ...

1205

**Mr Kelly:** Do not apologise, it is other people you have to apologise to, not me, sir. *(Laughter)*  
Your Excellency, Mr President –

**The President:** I think maybe we should all just take a breath. *(Laughter and Interjections)*

1210

**Mr Kelly:** Yes I can. If they contact the Harbour Master or his staff if they are disabled or infirm in some way through age or physical disability ... if you speak to the Harbour Master he will allow access. He has said that, the press release has said that.

1215

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
The next question, Mr Roberts, please.

**Blocking of an ancient right of way to States land –  
Lack of action**

**Mr Roberts:** Can the chairman of GSC explain the lack of action on the recent blocking of an ancient right of way to States land and why does he continuously fail to forward this important issue and take the lead as Chairman, as I do not agree he is conflicted?

1220

**The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Sir, Your Excellency, fellow Members.



1225 Concerning Mr Roberts' final question – hopefully final question – I was overtaken with three emotions: disappointment, perplexion and flattery. Disappointment as he knows that I agree with him that the customary practice – it is a customary practice not a law – of a Route de Souffrance means that a placing on statute or a court judgment be sought in order to give this ancient right legal footing by way of precedence. I have expressed that to him on a number of occasions, sir.

1230 I am perplexed in why he believes myself, as Chairman of General Services Committee, I should have a responsibility of the matter, since in February this year the matter has been in the hands of the Policy & Finance Committee when as a result of it being raised by me at the Committee it was resolved to seek Law Officers' advice on the issue before it could be taken any further. Part of the advice initially received was that I was conflicted as one of the parties involved in the original dispute was at that time working on my house. Members will remember, hopefully, no doubt it is etched in their minds, that in May, June and July Policy & Finance meetings, Mr Roberts  
1235 advised the Committee that he is in contact with the Law Officers on this ongoing issue.

At July's meeting the Chief Executive updated P&F, advising that discussions are ongoing with the Law Officers and a conversation had been held with a land user regarding the issue. All options are being discussed and researched. Since then I am aware the Law Officers have suggested that a States Member act as mediator in this individual dispute and Mr Roberts was approached by the States' Civil Service on 1st October to so mediate. I am equally aware that yesterday, 19 days later  
1240 after initially being requested, he declined to mediate.

This brings me on to my final emotion, sir, that of being flattered. Is Mr Roberts suggesting that despite it being a Policy and Finance matter, since February, him being a Member responsible for dealing with the matter for months, that I have greater powers of persuasion and can mediate or lead on the matter despite my connection with one of the parties? If that be the case, sir, I am  
1245 flattered. However, sir, I doubt whether that is the sentiment intended.

Emotions aside, I will stress that I believe the principal of a Route de Souffrance of the whole of the Island is very important to Alderney, not just because of the historic nature but because of the practical issues involved in this one individual dispute, that was first brought to our notice in February. I will continue to press the Chairman and all members of the Policy and Finance Committee for a resolution. To offer my assistance to Mr Abel, I have asked the Law Officers if I  
1250 am still conflicted and I await their written response.

**The President:** Thank you. Do you have a supplementary question?  
1255

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, please.

Pertaining to Mr Boyd's mention of my refusal to mediation, it is because I have spoken with the parties and they are adamant that there is no –

**The President:** This is not ...  
1260

**Mr Roberts:** Sorry, would he not agree – *(Laughter)*

**The President:** Yes, now then!  
1265

**Mr Roberts:** – that having spoken to those two parties about mediation I find there is an impasse between the two parties? I did not refuse. Would he not agree that was the right course for me to take?

**Mr Kelly:** I am unable to answer that question, sir, because I do not know, and none of us know, the result of the discussion between the parties because it has not been reported. The only things that have been reported to Policy and Finance, sir, is that Mr Roberts was in consultation with the Law Officers. If it was such that the conversations he had with both parties together failed then  
1270

1275 yes, I do agree, and perhaps I will take the flattery and then say perhaps I could do a better job, I do not know, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Any other ...? Mr Snowdon, do you have a question?

1280 **Mr Snowdon:** Yes, I think we have got to try and move forward on this matter, so would the Chairman agree that we should really discuss this at the next P&F and try and find out how we resolve this issue because it is going to go on for some time I think and P&F is probably the right place to do it?  
Thank you.

1285 **Mr Kelly:** Absolutely, sir, yes.

**The President:** Thank you.

#### **Agricultural catering school – Update on progress**

1290 **The President:** Now, Mr Roberts, you move on to the Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee. Would you like to put your first question, please?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir.  
1295 Could the Chairman of BDCC please give an update on progress of the agricultural catering school, an economic enabler for Alderney?

**The President:** Mr Gentle.

**Mr Gentle:** Your Excellency, Mr President, sir, colleagues.  
1300 I thank Mr Roberts for his question and I note he has had a bit of a hard time with the last couple of questions so I will try and go a bit easy on him, not treat him as a Part 3, I think that is a line that only His Excellency might understand. *(Interjection)*  
The BDCC mandate states, amongst other things, that it is:

to be the authority for approving plans in both the public and private sector.

And:

to be the Committee for the preparation, maintenance and operation of the Land Use Plan as per Part IV of The Building & Development Control (Alderney) Law, 2002, as amended.

1305 BDCC – and you were on it once – and planning is the end of the line. The Government puts in place the framework for both the public and private sector to work within and in the case of BDCC that framework is the Land Use Plan, alongside the previously mentioned law. So basically you tick all the boxes, you satisfy all the criteria and it is pretty settled that your commission will be granted. Policy S4 of the Land Use Plan states, and I quote:

Development proposals which support economic prosperity and/or growth in jobs on Alderney may be permitted, subject to other relevant policies in the Land Use Plan,

1310 Now, anything that is an economic enabler is to be welcomed and grabbed with both hands. The BDCC are not involved in any shape or form in progressing an agricultural catering school. As

stated, we are last in line. Until a planning application is received and dealt with on its own merits at the time, I must stress that the BDCC are oblivious to anyone's wishes.

1315 I am obviously not as succinct as Mr Abel, the answer is no, so I am sorry it is not the answer you or others may have wanted to hear.

Thank you.

1320 **Mr Roberts:** That is not quite true. I am not going to give him a hard time. I do not wish to ask a supplementary, sir.

**The President:** Well, thank you very much indeed for that, Mr Roberts. Does anybody else want to ask Mr Gentle a question on that one? No.

### Harbour gates – Planning permission

1325 **The President:** Question number two then Mr Roberts, please.

**Mr Roberts:** Could the Chairman please advise was planning permission granted for the Harbour gates, when and what date it was given please?

1330 **Mr Gentle:** Your Excellency, Mr President, sir, colleagues, the Harbour gates, it is like I have just stepped into the *Twilight Zone*! The Commercial Quay renovation took place between 2008 and 2011 so I am probably right in guessing that the gates were one of the last things to be put there, sometime around the end of 2000 and beginning of 2012.

1335 Having spoken to a previous chair of BDCC and sought the advice of the Law Office, I have been informed that prior to when the BDC Law was updated no permission was needed as the States of Alderney were exempt from requiring permission on land belonging to themselves. They could do whatever, wherever, whenever the mood took them on land belonging to themselves.

1340 Under section 67(1) of the Building Development Control Law, 2002, as originally drafted, nothing in Part 2 of the Law relating to control of development applied to the States. Parts 3 and 4, also of that Law, similarly did not apply. The provisions of the Land Use Plan, which was made under Part 4 of the Law, did not apply to any development carried out or any use of the land by the States but this legal loophole was closed when Section 67 of the Law was amended by Ordinance with effect from 14th March 2018, and this is covered in Parts 12 and 13 of the Ordinance. In practice the States, and I think it is probably through GSC, but I am not asking Mr Kelly to comment, (**Mr Kelly:** Thank you.) should have been in the habit of seeking to ensure that any development was consistent with planning law.

1345 But once again the answer to your question is sorry, no. Planning permission would not appear to have been granted as it was not required back then. It would be needed today.

Thank you.

1350 **The President:** Do you have a supplementary question, Mr Roberts?

**Mr Roberts:** No, sir, I am going to let him off, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

1355 Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency.

1360 Would the Chairman agree that from the accounts for the Harbour from I think he said the 14th ... I can't remember the month, March, whenever it was, 2018, accounts after that time for the Harbour would indicate or show if there was any expenditure on fences or anything so we could go back and look if that was wanting to be done?

Thank you.

1365 **The President:** Could you do that, Mr Gentle?

**Mr Gentle:** I suggest Mr Snowdon liaises with Mr Kelly and/or the Treasury to find out the answer.

Thank you.

1370 **The President:** Thank you. Any other questions?

### **Whitegates – Retention as a social housing zone**

**The President:** Your final question then, please, Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Thank you, sir.

1375 Can the Chairman of BDCC, and I thank him for his answers, please assure every effort will be made to retain Whitegates as a social housing zone?

**The President:** Mr Gentle.

**Mr Gentle:** Your Excellency, sir, Mr President, colleagues.

1380 I thank you for the question. And I am going to start by saying I know exactly what you were doing four years ago today as a member of BDCC (*Interjection by Mr Roberts*)

**The President:** Mr Roberts, please.

1385 **Mr Gentle:** A policy meeting on 20th October 2017 noted that Whitegates is zoned for social housing, and you were there, sir. Nothing has changed.

1390 Whitegates is still currently zoned for social housing. In order for it to change then at the Land Use Plan review a cogent case would need to be put forward in the call for sites. Section 31 of the BDC Law deals with changes to the Land Use Plan. Section 1(b) is the most relevant part where it states that BDCC can affect alterations to the Land Use Plan if they are desirable but it also states that an inquiry can be called if deemed necessary, and this is an occasion where it certainly would be required.

1395 I believe that section 16 of the Law allows for an agreement to be drawn up between the States of Alderney as the owners of Whitegates and the States of Alderney as land owners of a new site elsewhere for social housing and this means that the States of Alderney would relinquish the use of Whitegates for social housing but only on the strict understanding that land of a similar capacity was made available somewhere else for social housing.

1400 As previously stated by myself in this Chamber, I think it might have been in the last meeting, from a personal perspective I can acknowledge the idea of relinquishing somewhere like Whitegates, for example, if proceeds from that were utilised to replace social housing elsewhere but it would certainly not be logical and justifiable if the alternative was a greenfield site. However, acknowledging an idea and agreeing with it are two different things. The view of the Committee presently is that we follow the Land Use Plan and ensure that land is made available for the

1405 construction of new social housing and to ensure, in the case of Whitegates, that it is designed to be in keeping with its sensitive location surrounded by the designated area.

Thank you.

**Mr Roberts:** No further questions, sir.

1410 **The President:** Thank you.

Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

1415 It is just a question which I am happy to be corrected on but if we could just go through that process again, the independent inspector would have to approve that, is my understanding, when it was presented in the Land Use Plan if you were rezoning elsewhere. I just wanted that to be on record, if Mr Gentle agrees that that submission to the independent inspector would have to be approved, I understand, to change the use from the BDCC.

1420 **Mr Gentle:** Your Excellency, Mr President, sir, colleagues.

You drifted off and got quieter and quieter towards the end. (**Mr Snowdon:** Sorry.) No, I am happy to answer the first part, an inspection would be called having asked the President to appoint an inspector. It is not a matter for BDCC to worry on.

1425 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you.

#### **Reports – Island Planning Group Report**

**The Greffier:** There being no further questions, sir, if we can move on to Reports, which is the Island Planning Group Report received from Ms Burgess.

1430 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

There were some comments at the People's Meeting, Mr Harris.

**Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, Your Excellency, Mr President and fellow colleagues.

1435 There were quite a few comments on this Item. The Environmental Strategy produced in 2020 seems to be an internal document, this should be publically available. That was a comment that was noted.

Mr Carter advised that the consultation process opens on 15th October and closes on 8th November. The press release will be issued on Friday 15th October, which was last Friday, along with articles on social media, Quay FM, local publications and the States of Alderney website.

1440 Regarding energy, it was queried how this was going to be achieved. Mr Carter advised that how it would be achieved would follow the consultation process. The Energy Group are also in consultation with Alderney Electricity Ltd and other appropriate professionals. This will enable the States to look at a clear policy for the Island with the input from the public.

1445 It was noted that progressing energy renewables will be beneficial for future generations. Consultation is also planned for the school. A query was raised as to how many consultants will be required. It was queried who will finance it as renewable energy costs a lot of money. Mr Carter advised that commercial engagement would obviously be required. Tidal energy is the way forward as it is always there, it is more reliable than wind or solar, and it was noted that all options will be considered.

1450 Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
So, Mr Carter, your Report.

**Mr Carter:** Thank you very much, Mr President, Your Excellency, fellow Members.

1455 You have a Report in front of you, this is the distilled thoughts of the Island Planning Group. In effect three areas here: there is a vision statement, a value statement and six key themes. The six key themes are: the economy; energy; accessibility and connectivity; community development; natural and man-made environments; and governance.

1460 The Group were only too aware that there has been a failure of plans in the past. Looking back to 2004, £30,000 was devoted to a plan. That money I do not think saw the light of day in terms of action. So we are very aware that this particular plan, this particular attempt, is built on a history of non-achievement.

1465 Effectively the stage we are at now is that this is a draft set of proposals. The public are now being asked to comment on it as are discussions with the States of Guernsey. I have a meeting with Mark Hellier in two weeks' time to, again, make sure that what we get back is information that we can then do the difficult bit which is the *how* do we then make these things happen.

1470 This is the easy bit. Anyone can write a plan in terms of a document of this nature, a vision statement and headings. The difficult bit will be the action plans and that is where the next stage goes, which will be after 8th November when we have the feedback and the start of an analysis. That analysis will take place with the P&F Committee for all to take part and there will be a public meeting in terms of presenting to the public where we think we might get to, and obviously feedback from that is vital.

1475 So in terms of a report, this is very much a staging point and we wait, I think as of 12 o'clock, Monday lunchtime, there had been about 190 responses to the consultation, which I think was quite remarkable.

And that is my report to you, ladies and gentleman.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

1480 Now, just for the assistance of Members, can I just briefly read to you the provisions of Rule 19.3. After a report under paragraph 1, which is the report you have just heard, is presented any Member may:

Offer a personal opinion on the report and may ask a question relating to the content of that report.

Mr Snowdon.

1485 **Mr Snowdon:** Just one question you can ask, is it?

**The President:** Yes, but you can make a statement. Now, does anybody wish to take advantage of that opportunity? Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Nearly there. Your Excellency, thank you.

1490 Firstly, I just want to say thank you to Mr Carter. I think he was very strong on this before he stood as a States Member. I think he has delivered the goods in moving this forward and also thank you to the other Members that have been part of the working group, or whatever you call yourselves.

1495 Just a little observation was I did actually go and do the survey online with, is it the monkey survey? (**Mr Carter:** Survey Monkey.) Thank you. It feels a little bit that the questions and answers are a bit narrow, I do not know if they can be broadened out a little bit to push it ... you are probably going to tell me that is what it is meant to do but it seems to push maybe a little bit too much in a direction than potentially in my personal view it could be a bit broader just to get a bit more of a flavour but I think that is very good.

1500 Also, if I can get my one question, is the survey available to people that do not have the internet? Is it something that is going to go around to every household or something and they feed back so those people that cannot go on the internet can do that?

I just wanted to touch on a few little points moving forward with this. I think you are absolutely right, these are the headings that we need to concentrate on. I think it is a very positive document and it is good that this is all lined up but I think, as Mr Carter has said, the hard bit is the bit where we think about the strategies for all of these different items and how we implement them and, I think it is probably at a late date, but it just concerns me that we need to be aligned with certain other areas. For example, we had a little bit about the Aurigny talk earlier today so it is important that the Island and Alderney is aligned with other factors, so you have got Aurigny which may be one factor so we need to make sure we are aligned with those factors hopefully if the community is happy with that. You have got energy obviously which I think came up at the People's Meeting. Unfortunately I missed that, but how we move forward with that and how the community is happy with those strategies and then the governance stuff which I think we are talking about tomorrow.

1515 But I think we need to just make sure that this is a stepping stone to quite a long path, and I really think it is positive that you have presented this to the States of Alderney today and thank you for all the help. But I think we just need to make sure that long path that the strategy is that we keep public consultation going with this and also public input because there are a vast amount of people in the community that know quite a lot on these different subjects, let's try and use them to feed in as well.

1520 So I go back to saying thank you very much to all of this group for presenting this and I look forward to us working with the community and other parties, as I have highlighted, to hopefully move things forward in a positive manner.

Thank you.

1525 **Mr Carter:** Can I respond to that?

**The President:** Yes, please.

1530 **Mr Carter:** Just the response in terms of the specific question about non-internet access. Yes, paper copies are available. Barbara Benfield is working with the older members of the community so see what they will do with regard to their responses.

From the perspective of closed and open questions, the boxes are there in effect for anyone to write anything so that gives us a positive openness there.

1535 I would absolutely concur with you that this should be an ongoing process and would be of the opinion that we in effect on an annual basis are reporting back on where we have got to and when we fail to put our hands up that we have failed and this is why, and we try again. So the goals are there. It is just the methodologies that we need to perhaps each time retry and try again.

1540 I think your key point here though is that prioritisation is absolutely essential. Looking back at past plans everybody wanted us to do everything, to be all things to all people. In the end, we have a limited amount of resource and those resources need to be aligned with all of those other external stakeholders that we work with, like Aurigny, like the States of Guernsey, like the UK government. That we actually have to make sure that we do align and then put in place resources that will actually achieve what we want and obviously what I am looking for is some very quick wins to show people that the plan is worth doing.

1545 Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Roberts.

1550 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, just a short ... I think it is very good and I would like to thank Mr Carter for his very hard work. It is a very concise list of our aspirations and I think he should have aspirations. I have got a few concerns, very similar to what Mr Snowdon has said that we need to get out to

the whole public and particularly on any major changes to Government, the public have to have an input into that. You cannot just do it without the public.

1555 So I would like to see a public meeting of this consultation as well as everything else that is being done down the line because the public are the people that vote us in, they have every right to have a say in how we do it so that is just my one concern.

But again, I would like to congratulate you on a very good document.

Thank you.

1560 **Mr Carter:** Goodness me, praise indeed. But, yes, just to reiterate there will be a public meeting for people on this particular project effectively or the plan itself and we will together, I hope, achieve something.

**The President:** Well on that very positive note I think that concludes the afternoon's business.

**Farewell to Mr Geoff Workman,  
His Excellency's Representative**

1565 **The President** There are a couple of further items which do not appear on the Billet.

The first one is in relation to Mr Geoff Workman, who sits today to my left, who would normally sit to my right, the reason being that His Excellency is here today so his role as His Excellency's Representative is slightly different.

1570 Geoffrey Workman was appointed to the role of His Excellency's Representative on the States of Alderney in January 2013 where he was referred to as the 'stand-in rep', so he did that until September 2018 and undeterred he then put himself forward and was appointed to be the full-time Representative. And those of you who attend these meetings regularly and those listening online will know that he has attended with great regularity. I am sure in some ways it is a slightly frustrating role because he is the only one of us who does not get a speaking part but nevertheless  
1575 he has always maintained a poker face throughout the years and his contribution has been extremely helpful, and it is always helpful to have a connection between our States of Alderney and His Excellency, and Geoff has performed that role well over the last number of years.

But today will be his last appearance in Court. You may see a sort of look of relief on his face; *(Laughter)* it is either that or the end of this meeting! But either way, we wish him a long and a  
1580 happy and healthy retirement. We all give ourselves to public service on this Island and his role has been a voluntary role, not always the most attractive, I suspect, but nevertheless a very important one so I think you will all join with me in extending our thanks to him for his contribution.

**Farewell to the Lieutenant Governor  
Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE, CB**

1585 **The President:** Now, we turn to His Excellency himself, who as I said at the outset will be attending this, his last meeting, as his posting comes to an end at the end of November when he and Lady Corder will return to live in the UK.

Now, I am not going to say a great deal other than this, that I would like to express our thanks on behalf of the States of Alderney and the community for the level of interest and support and co-operation we have had from His Excellency over a period of now more than five years.

1590 It is an extremely important and vital part of our structure as a community and it has certainly, as far as I am concerned, always been very reassuring to me that I could always seek advice and



1595 support if there were any areas in which I felt that I needed that sort of input. So he is not always in the foreground but he is always in the background. He assists and supports us wherever he can and I have to say, he and Lady Corder will be very sadly missed. We are having a *vin d'honneur* in their honour at 5.30 p.m. and I shall drone on, I think, a little bit longer then! (*Laughter*)

But for the purposes of this afternoon, I think I should now leave the final words to the top of the bill, so if I might hand over to His Excellency. It is a convention, I am told, that the Lieutenant Governor only gets to speak once in this Chamber, and that is when he is leaving! There is obviously a good reason for that! (*Laughter*) Your Excellency.

**Farewell address of the Lieutenant Governor  
Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder KBE, CB**

1600 **The Lieutenant Governor:** Mr President, distinguished States Members and residents of Alderney, first of all, thank you very much for those kind words. And can I begin actually be echoing your words of appreciation to my Representative here in Alderney for the last three years, Geoff Workman.

1605 It is a crucial role of the Lieutenant Governor to sit in the elected Assemblies of the three jurisdictions of the Bailiwick; to sit there silent! But to sit there absorbing what is going on because nothing more helps my understanding of the complex dynamics and issues facing these very special Islands than listening to the elected Members discussing the issues of the day. But there is a tyranny of geography here, not to mention the tyranny of the weather, and also a tyranny of programming because having to sit in the States of Guernsey, the States of Alderney and the Chief Pleas of Sark, who conveniently programme many of their meetings to be at the same time as yours, it does mean it is impossible to be in the two places at once and so I am hugely grateful to  
1610 Geoff for sitting in this place and absorbing those same dynamics and where necessary telling me what is going on and keeping me informed.

1615 Mr President, some of you may have watched the recent BBC programme called *Vigil*. I will not comment on its accuracy! (*Laughter*) Mr Gentle just shook his head with despair there, and I rather hoped he would have kept you up with a running commentary of its accuracy, or lack of, probably in language that he would not care to use in the Chamber! But at least it means you are familiar a little bit with the submarines that have been conducting his mission for so many years. It is an extremely important mission, it is the ultimate deterrent and the ultimate defence of the United  
1620 Kingdom and the British Isles.

1625 Longer ago than I care to remember, it was in the early 1990s, I was a desk officer in the Ministry of Defence and my responsibility was for the operational conduct of those submarines, and we were at the process of handing over from the previous class of submarines the Resolution-class to the current class, the Vanguard-class and we sailed a certain submarine – I will not mention its name – on its last patrol. It was a very old submarine and it got back having completed the mission, as always, with a certain sense of euphoria. The boat that was meant to relieve it had gone out and was going on patrol and it had a mishap and had to come back, so the first boat had to go back out on its *second* last patrol, which it conducted, again with appropriate professionalism and diligence and came back, and they were about to put their feet up when the  
1630 first of the new class was slightly delayed, so that same boat had to down on its *third* last patrol. So there were a couple of things that arose from that, one was an extremely tired crew, the second was a certain cynicism and about every use of the word of the 'last' in the submarine community and I sort of share that cynicism, also having been extended twice in this current role, because originally we were due to depart in March and then the end of August and now the end of  
1635 November *but* with five weeks only to run I maybe am a bit more confident that this will indeed be my last appearance at the States of Alderney.

1640 Five weeks to go, never to return, so the convention has it. The convention is that once you have fulfilled this highly privileged post you go away and you never come back to get under the feet of one's successor as you could say. Well, I say never, if you do come back then you do so with the utmost discretion, quietly and incognito.

1645 But I have to say, after five and a half years in the post Kathryn and I are probably in a slight degree of denial about what is going to happen and suffering quite a lot of ground rush, to be honest, because over those five and a half years we have developed an enormous affection for these Islands, and I cannot say that sincerely enough, a huge affection for these Islands. But it is the right thing to do. It is good. It is time for a refresh, it is time for new perspectives and new ideas.

1650 So, Mr President, I am very grateful to you for observing the tradition of inviting the departing Sovereign's Representative to address this body and delighted actually to have made a States during your tenure (*Laughter*) because events were contriving to try and stop that. It is an important tradition actually because the elected bodies of a jurisdiction are arguably the most, if not the most, certainly one of the most, important institutions that you have. It is an institution by which the outside world judges you and it is certainly an institution, as you all know, by which your own residents judge you and it is a dignified body with a proud history. And by ... I was going to say, and of course Members always, but I think I will qualify it, by and large Members conduct themselves with that level of dignity and it is only, of course, through natural exuberance and passion for the issues of the day that maybe occasionally they let their excitement get the better of them. But it is important given the dignity and the status or stature of these bodies that the Sovereign's Representative pays his or her respects to you and through you to the people of Alderney.

1660 Now, the relationship between the Crown Dependencies and the Crown and through the Crown to the UK and the wider British family and internally within this Bailiwick is an extraordinarily precious thing. It is an extraordinarily unique thing. It is a *very* historic relationship. It is a subtle and nuanced relationship and it has evolved over many years and it is absolutely fundamentally the basis on which the Bailiwick of Guernsey, Alderney and Sark exist and their constitutions function. So it is hugely important and I cannot emphasise how much importance the Crown places on that relationship.

1670 Over the years, of course, the relationship has evolved, the various parties to the relationship test the boundaries, it is human nature, we are a restless species, we will test the boundaries but it has stood the test of time. And to have had the role of maintaining oversight of that relationship has been a huge privilege. And it is a very privileged role in many ways, not least because it has such a wide and discretionary access to just about every aspect of the Bailiwick's business, and so over the past five and a half years I think Kathryn and I have visited every school, every care home, every public service, *many* businesses and pretty much every charity within this Bailiwick and it is an extraordinarily rich mix of people and we are *very* privileged to live here. Kathryn even had the opportunity to let off about £500-£600 worth of explosives in Les Vardes Quarry which is not something you get to do every day. So it has given us an extraordinary oversight of the richness of the place in which we live.

1680 It is also one of the very few appointments that has a genuine Bailiwick-wide purview and a Bailiwick-wide responsibility and through that access, I have to say, we have come to know and meet many extraordinary people and as a Bailiwick we are very rich in the human resources that we have, and to count many of those people as our friends. We have been hugely fortunate to have been very widely welcomed and embraced into the life here for which I thank all of you and that is as true in Alderney as much as anywhere else, and to you specifically I am very grateful and so is Kathryn for the warmth of your welcome and hospitality and your openness to us.

1685 But I have to say, the engagement with Alderney has certainly been one of the most enjoyable aspects of our role. All three Islands have distinctive characteristics, and that is true of Alderney as much as anywhere else. Potentially it is not an easy thing in Alderney to capture in one strapline or one headline as to what makes this place unique. Is it your own distinctive – and it is

1690 distinctive – natural beauty? It is different to the other two Islands. Is it the distinctive closeness of the community here? There are divisive issues, or there certainly have been divisive issues here, as there are in any community, but my sense is you have never let it stop you caring for each other, which is so important.

1695 I have also enjoyed your very distinct determination to enjoy yourselves, whatever the circumstances or whatever the world may throw at you. All, of course, captured in what is described as your annual collective outbreak of lunacy as in Alderney Week. But it is a sense of character and spirit of the Island that you will always enjoy yourselves, enjoy each other's company and work together as a community irrespective of those inevitable little niggling disputes that arise in any society.

1700 It has also of course been a great privilege to be educated in your very unique, and genuinely unique, war time experience. And certainly one of the most moving experiences I think Kathryn and I have had in the five and a half years was the first time we came here to witness a Homecoming and to have the privilege of meeting some of the homecomers but also to experience a very different atmosphere here on a cold, bleak December day celebrating events in 1945, which is quite different to the atmosphere around the rest of the Bailiwick, and again a huge  
1705 privilege.

And it has been quite an extraordinary five and a half years actually. I do not really genuinely like hyperbole and, of course, we always live in interesting times but the last five years does seem to have been a little bit more interesting than normal. If we just cast back: we came here in the spring of 2016 and at that particular time Brexit was actually being derided by the intellectual elite  
1710 within Europe as absurd. The British Prime Minister, Cameron, had just won his second election and for the first time in quite some time the UK had a majority single party government. I seem to remember the President of the United States, President Obama, was cracking some jokes about one of his potential successors ... be careful what you wish for! So things have changed a lot.

1715 Of course, Brexit has occurred and that has been a very challenging process. Just think, over that time we have had two UK elections, three Prime Ministers, we have had six Lord Chancellors responsible for the relationship with the Crown Dependencies. Nerve agent attacks in Salisbury, who would have ever thought that would have happened? So there is a big wide world out there that is changing its context all the time, and that presents a huge challenge for you as the political leadership of a small place like this.

1720 And of course I absolutely must mention, mustn't I, the events of the last 18 months, the pandemic. I must recognise, of course, that despite the many months of Alderney avoiding the ravages of the pandemic ... inevitable you could not avoid it forever and I do acknowledge the sadness that has come to Alderney as much as anywhere else in terms of losing some of your loved ones. But it has been impressive, genuinely impressive, to see the way that Alderney as a  
1725 community and the jurisdiction acquitted itself. I have been genuinely impressed and the President and I have talked regularly throughout the progress of the pandemic. It has been genuinely impressive to see how the community has come together to look after itself and look after each other, the responsible and mature way which you as a community have responded to these extraordinary, unprecedented restrictions on public liberty, or certainly unprecedented in most of our lifetimes. The strong community leadership that has come from you, Mr President,  
1730 from you as States' Members from your Island officials and from your public health workers it has been a very significant achievement for such a small place.

1735 I have also been particularly pleased to see the way in which as an Island and as an administration you have interfaced with the Bailiwick-wide structures which obviously had to take decisions at incredible pace, and the way in which the smaller Islands, and this is true of Sark as well, the way Alderney and Sark have interacted with that process has done you much credit I think.

I am also genuinely pleased to see the way in which the pandemic has brought about such a shift in the atmosphere between the people of Guernsey and the people of Alderney. I think it is  
1740 true to say that Alderney has been rediscovered by a lot of Guernsey folk who have genuinely

regained a huge affection for their fellow Island, so I think that is a great positive out of a very difficult circumstance.

1745 But of course – and Lieutenant Governors cannot make a speech without saying this – we have to recognise that many big challenges remain. I think collectively we all have to reflect on the enduring challenge that exists in maintaining modern, democratically accountable functioning institutions in a small community like this. The world is getting more complicated, government is getting more complicated, regulation is getting more complicated, it is less and less of an amateur sport, to be honest. So in a world league of seasoned professionals you have a couple of big games on your hands to keep going. There is an enduring challenge to ensure that you get a willingness  
1750 in the community to continue to do the work as States Members. Being an elected representative is a contact sport, it is not easy – and I like the way you are grinning when I say that, it is not easy – and I would strongly urge you to continue to go about your business looking like you are enjoying yourselves, because it is so important that you pull through your successes because the fragility, the difference between success and failure in a small jurisdiction like this is tiny, and so I cannot  
1755 emphasise that enough.

You clearly have the continued issues of sustaining modern, high quality public-sector services in a tiny jurisdiction and pragmatism has got to be the answer there, pragmatism and co-operation and picking the best solution for you in your circumstances, drawing on everything that is available to you, including as much as you can from your bigger neighbour.

1760 And, of course, one of the problems of leaving in the Autumn is that everybody is talking about budgets and fiscal challenges and this is an annual conversation but it is a more difficult conversation I think this time than I have ever seen it before because it is such a confused picture. On the one hand we are coming off the back of a totally abnormal 18 months so the economic reforms, the fiscal performance of jurisdictions and governments over this last 18 months is no  
1765 real indicator about what is going to happen in the future. It is extremely pleasing that so many Islands in the Bailiwick have done so well in comparison to what they were expecting to do but it is very difficult to draw conclusions from the last 18 months about what is going to happen in the future.

1770 We all know that there are some very significant challenges coming. We know that there is a significant debate going on in Guernsey which affects Alderney with respect to tax structures and all I would say is do not let that debate fracture the Bailiwick. It is absolutely essential that that is approached on a Bailiwick-wide basis and that you, when the pressure comes – and I have seen this so many times in my career in UK government when I have had more savings rounds than most people here have had hot dinners – it is very easy when the pressure comes on to fracture  
1775 and it is so important, given the gains that have been made in relationships with Guernsey recently, that you address these issues collectively.

And also it is very easy – if I may use a bit of a cliché – to start counting the cost of everything and forgetting about the value of anything and you will have to make some quite difficult and profound judgements going forward where you retain that sense of value; value in your  
1780 institutions, value in your community and value in the trust and integrity with which you regard each other so *please* try to remember that when the pressure comes on because it gets difficult.

But I am genuinely confident about the future. Why am I confident? I am confident because having met and interacted with so many people around Alderney, the sense of resilience and resourcefulness that you have as an Island community is absolutely tangible and your sense of  
1785 willingness to get on and fix problems is tangible.

I also think that you have many friends that want to help you. I have already talked about the relationship with Guernsey, it is tangibly better than it was when I first came to the Bailiwick, genuinely tangibly. I am also delighted to hear the comments I have heard here, as indeed I heard  
1790 in Sark, about the co-operation that is ongoing, the relationships that have been built, particularly with the pandemic, and they will serve you so well if you work hard to maintain them.

The broader Channel Island community is rooting for Alderney as a bigger collective body and you genuinely have friends in Whitehall, in London and in the corridors of power, I liaise with them

regularly. The Department that is responsible in the Ministry of Justice is genuinely there and trying to help. Quite often the challenge is to ask for the help in the right way or even decide what you actually want to ask for help with in the first place. But do not be afraid of approaching them.

1795

And, of course, the Crown herself, Her Majesty. Kathryn and I have had the enormous honour of having a personal audience with Her Majesty alongside the Lieutenant-Governors of the other two Crown Dependencies and their wives, and be under no illusions, that Her Majesty knows about the Bailiwick of Guernsey and she knows about Alderney, and if Her Majesty does then her officials do so you have a lot of friends there.

1800

So in summary, ladies and gentlemen and Mr President, Alderney is an extraordinarily special place. You are very lucky to live here. It is a special place in our hearts. We will leave with very fond memories. We will continue to watch your progress from a distance – who knows I might even, as a special treat to myself, allow myself to tune in to the States of Alderney's discussions in the future. *(Laughter)* We may even, as a rather more credible special treat, try to sneak back here, especially with my newfound love of light aircrafts and your particularly well-placed Airport, St Anne's, for one of our great guilty pleasures, which is a quick Indian curry at Nellie Gray's. If we are seen furtively sneaking around the back streets don't call the Police and have me arrested, we will try to come back at some point and I genuinely wish you all the very best of success for the future, Mr President.

1805

1810

Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you, Your Excellency. *(Applause)*  
And finally, the closure of the meeting please, Mr Greffier.

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 4.56 p.m.*