

BUILDING AND DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE

Anne French Room

5th April, 2011

0915 hrs

Present:

Mr G Sargent, Chairman

Mr A Llewellyn

Mr P Allen

Mr M Birmingham

Mr R Berry

Mr R Burke, CEO

Ms J B Turner, States Engineer

Ms R Sowden, Planning Assistant/
Minute Secretary

ACTION

- 20/2011 **Minutes of previous meetings** of 1st March 2011 and 10th March 2011 were confirmed and signed.
- 21/2011 **Matters Arising**
21.1 2 Le Bourgage / 1 Well Lane Letter from Advocate Clare Tee dated 31.03.11 tabled and noted. It was noted that the matter was currently with the Law Officers. **Engineer to deal.**
- 21.2 Letter re B3038** Letter from Andrew Millear dated 25.03.11 tabled and noted.
- 22/2011 **Planning Matters**
22.1 Planning Report tabled. Comments from Alderney Society dated 26.02.11 tabled and noted.
- A4868 Jackie Gillingham** 28 Le Banquage, Rue de Beaumont. Replacement of existing wooden windows with uPVC. Block-up window to rear of property and make new window opening to side. Garden fencing. The Committee considered that the proposed 6'6" and 6'4" fencing, forward of the elevation facing the highway, would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the area, and set an unwanted precedent for similar boundary treatments on the estate.
RESOLVED to approve the application for the works involving the windows. Further resolved to approve the application for the fencing, subject to any fencing forward of the elevation facing the highway being no higher than 1.2m.
- A4869 Alison Osborne** Valley Gardens Allotment. Greenhouse (8' x 6').
RESOLVED to approve the application.
- A4870 Peter Arnold** Pottery Garden, Les Mouriaux. Felling two pine trees.
RESOLVED to approve the application.
- A4871 Andrew Moore** 16 Little Street. Replace timber windows and door to front of house with uPVC. **See 25.2 below.**
- A4872 Mr S G & Mrs E M Hope** 9 Victoria Street. Replace existing timber windows to front elevation with heritage style uPVC. **See 25.2 below.**
- A4873 Mr Simon Simonet** 9 Le Banquage Removal of pine tree in front garden
RESOLVED to approve the application.
- A4874 Alderney Animal Welfare Trustees.** Replace existing garage door with new window and door.
RESOLVED to approve the application.
- A4875 Keith Webster.** Alderney Airport. New perimeter fencing.
RESOLVED to approve the application, subject to approval of the General Services Committee, as States landlords.

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT

JBT/GSC

A4876 Mr & Mrs R Cairnduff. Apple House, Rue Les Joy. Install doors to existing first floor balcony opening to rear of property.

RESOLVED to approve the application, subject to compliance with Building Regulations.

JBT

A4877 Mr & Mrs A Fryatt. Surfside, Platte Saline. Replacement of uPVC fascia, soffits, cladding, windows and doors with timber.

RESOLVED to approve the application.

JBT

B3047 Mr J K Ayrle-Gardner & Ms A C Burgess 13 Little Street. Formal sub-division. It was reported that the property had been used as two separate dwellings for some time, and that the owners were requesting that the properties now be legally separated. It was noted that this would require the granting of an Exemption Ordinance by the full States. No objection was raised in principle to the application. **Proposal to be checked for Building Regulation compliance prior to an Exemption Ordinance being drafted.**

JBT/DEFER

B3048 M G & K Smith. Westering, The Butes. Detached garage (7.2m x 6.7m).

RESOLVED to approve the application in principle, subject to compliance with Building Regulations.

JBT

B3049 Dr & Mrs R Petty 7 La Bourgage. Replacement balustrade to existing balcony.

RESOLVED to approve the application in principle, subject to compliance with Building Regulations.

JBT

B3050 C Rivett-Carnac The Pool House, Mare Jean Bott. Summerhouse (3.6m x 2.4m) & hot tub / garden works. Letter of objection tabled and noted (see Confidential Annexure). The Committee was concerned that the summerhouse, because of its height, would cause overshadowing and loss of sunlight to the neighbour's limited amenity area. It felt that a modified design and / or position of the summerhouse would help to ameliorate this.

RESOLVED to defer making a decision on the application, pending receipt of comment or revisions from applicant.

JBT/DEFER

B3051 Mrs H Ackrill Petit Normandie, Rue Les Joys. Sun room extension to west.

RESOLVED to approve the application in principle, subject to compliance with Building Regulations.

JBT

B3052 Mainbrayce Ltd Inner Harbour. Installation of petrol tank and pump in SW corner of Harbour. The Committee was in favour of the scheme in principle, but was mindful of the requirement to minimise the aesthetic impact of development in this historic area. It was noted that the scheme required the approval of the Health and Safety Executive. **Applicant to be advised to liaise with Engineer when the exact Health & Safety requirements are clear and full details of fencing and operation method are known, prior to permission being granted.**

JBT

23.2 Deferred items

a) B3042 Mrs G Whittaker Mouriaux House, Les Mouriaux. Replacement windows with new timber to same design. It was noted that information from the applicant was awaited.

JBT/DEFER

b) B3044 Mr & Mrs P Crowcombe Les Source, La Vallee. Extension to form attic floor providing two ensuite bedrooms and balconies. Letter and sketches from Doug Hamon dated 27.03.11 tabled and discussed. The Committee was generally in favour of the extension and the proposed aesthetic modifications, which it considered were successful in unifying the external appearance of the house.

RESOLVED to defer making a decision on the application, pending formal advertising of the aesthetic modifications to the external appearance of the property.

JBT/DEFER

c) B3045 Mr & Mrs Dean Bank House, Bluestone Hill. Construction of 3 bungalows. Letter from Mr & Mrs F Dean dated 15.03.11. The Committee reconfirmed its support for the

scheme, and noted the applicants' proposal to contribute towards the improvement of services and infrastructure in the area.

RESOLVED to promote an Exemption Ordinance to the full States for the creation of 3 new two bedroom, single storey dwellings.

JBT

d) B3040 Ace Parts Proposed new storage building on land adjacent to existing premises at Les Coutures. It was noted that the matter was still under consideration.

JBT/DEFER

e) C1043 E Bohan Proposed new dwelling at AY2275 Vert Cotil. Letters from Colin Partridge dated 29.03.11 and States Engineer dated 24.03.11 tabled and discussed. Following discussion, the Committee agreed that the Officers meet with the applicant and/or the applicant's agent, Mr Partridge, regarding the modifications outlined in his letter, to establish whether this would go some way to make the design of the proposed house less bulky and obtrusive.

JBT/RS/DEFER

f) C1045 A Bohan Proposed new dwelling at AY185 Vert Cotil. The Committee agreed that the application for the house on the lower site should be resolved before a decision was made on this application. Officers to discuss the design with applicant's agent.

JBT/DEFER

A discussion followed about the possibility of holding open planning meetings, as Guernsey had recently started to do. The Officers explained how the planning process worked in Guernsey and elsewhere: The majority of planning applications were delegated to qualified, experienced Planning Officers, who made decisions based on established policies. Large scale or controversial applications, and those which were contrary to planning policy were referred to the Board of elected members, where a qualified Planning Officer would always make a formal recommendation and offer professional advice to the Board to support members in making their decision. The members indicated that they supported the establishment of a more transparent, professional system in the future. The Committee also discussed the problems associated with making planning decisions in a small community where members were so easily accessible and often contacted personally by applicants, and the suspicion this can create. **The Officers were asked to investigate the options regarding professional advice, for further debate at the following meeting.**

JBT/RS/RB

23.3 1-2 St Anne's Walk Proposed Change of use to residential. Letter from Ian Waterfall dated 15.03.11 tabled and discussed. The Committee, whilst having sympathy with owners of empty offices, was concerned about the potential effect of such conversions should the economic situation improve, resulting in a lack of rentable office space in the central hub of town.

RESOLVED that the Committee would not be minded to permit a change of use to residential at this time, but would be willing to revisit the matter at the end of the year.

JBT

23.4 The Petit Chalet, Longis Common Proposed replacement dwelling. Sketch scheme / feasibility study tabled. No objection was raised in principle to the proposed replacement dwelling. **Applicant to be advised to submit full planning application.**

JBT

24/2011 Legal Matters /Systems & Procedures

24.2 Building Regulations The replacement of the current out-of-date regulations was discussed. Planning Assistant reported on the legal advice received regarding the introduction of new regulations. Matter deferred for further consideration.

JBT/RS

**1210hrs meeting adjourned
1400hrs meeting re-convened**

1400hrs Donald Hughes, Hon Secretary of the Alderney Society in attendance.**25/2011 Policy**

25.1 Conservation Areas & Historic Buildings Donald Hughes had been invited to the meeting to talk, in particular, to the new members about the Island's built heritage.

Mr Hughes gave a brief outline of his professional background as a surveyor, who had a passion for old buildings and a masters degree in building conservation.

Mr Hughes outlined the concept of a historic building & a conservation area, how they were chosen and what the significance was of being listed as a historic building in terms of development. He went on to state that Alderney had an unusual unique heritage, which is a major factor for tourism. Previous States had realised that the protection of the townscape was very important, and had thus far been successful in preserving the buildings for future generations. He explained that the preservation of buildings did not necessarily mean keeping them 'in aspic', but that development of them should respect the original structure and materials. He considered that good modern architecture may not be out of place adjacent to an old building in a Conservation Area, provided that it was well designed. He went on to explain that Registered Historic Buildings were specific buildings registered because of their architectural or historic importance, whereas Conservation Areas dealt with the spaces about the buildings - roads, cobbles, walls etc. The process and legal procedure of how properties become 'listed' was explained. Mr Hughes again recommended that buildings' 'listed' statuses were noted on their title deeds at the Land Registry, so that owners were aware of the buildings' registrations.

25.2 Windows Proposed policy document for replacement windows in conservation areas tabled. Mr Hughes felt that the main issue with uPVC windows was the aesthetics, which was a question of judgement and appreciation, but was aware of the difficulty of striking a balance between destroying heritage against affordability. Mr Hughes considered it extremely important that the whole façades of Registered Historic Buildings retain original windows in traditional materials. He felt that visitors coming to see our heritage would not expect to see uPVC windows in 'listed' buildings.

Some members raised concerns about the cost of making and maintaining timber windows, which often necessitated the use of scaffolding, which added to those costs. Mr Hughes informed the members of new products which made the painting of timber windows less of a laborious process. The Committee also talked about reviewing the policy on scaffolding in the town areas during the summer months, which may go some way to helping homeowners maintain their traditional windows.

Queries were raised about the qualifying criteria for grants for replacement or refurbishment of timber windows. Mr Hughes felt that it would be useful for Mr D Thornburrow to come to speak about this.

The Committee agreed that a review of the policy for replacement windows in the conservation areas and historic buildings should be undertaken. As part of the review, a site visit of buildings on the Historic Buildings List would be useful.

1515hrs Mr Hughes left the meeting

Planning Report (Continued from 22.1)

A4871 Andrew Moore 16 Little Street. Replace timber windows and door to front of house with uPVC. It was noted that the property was within the conservation area of St Anne. The Committee was reminded that its current policy on replacement windows in the conservation area is that ground floor windows facing a highway are to be of timber.

The Committee was mindful that this property was not an old property, being built in the 1980's, and was therefore sympathetic towards the use of non-traditional materials. **RESOLVED to approve the application for uPVC windows and door, subject to them being of 'heritage' style.**

JBT

A4872 Mr S G & Mrs E M Hope 9 Victoria Street. Replace existing timber windows to front elevation with heritage style uPVC. Mr Birmingham declared an interest. It was noted that the property was on the Register of Historic Buildings. The Committee discussed the application in the context of current and possible windows policies, and considered that no decision should be made until possible implications were researched.

RESOLVED to defer making a decision on the application whilst a review was undertaken on the current window policy.

JBT/DEFER

26/2011 Any Other Business

Publication of minutes The difficulties in preparing minutes before all necessary correspondence had been completed, and the requirement for members to approve the minutes before publication, was discussed.

Meeting finished 1605hrs

Date of next meeting: Tuesday 3rd May 2011

Signed : G Sargent

Dated: 3rd May 2011