



OFFICIAL REPORT
OF THE
STATES OF THE
ISLAND OF ALDERNEY

HANSARD

The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 20th November 2013

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Alderney website www.alderney.gov.gg*

Volume 1, No. 6

Present:

Mr Stuart Trought, President

Members

Mr Paul Arditti
Mr Raymond Berry
Mr Matthew Birmingham
Mr Neil Harvey
Mr Louis Jean
Mr Robert McDowall
Mr Steve Roberts
Mr Chris Rowley
Mr Francis Simonet
Mr Ian Tugby

Representative of the Lieutenant Governor:

Colonel Colin Mason

The Greffier of the Court

Mrs Sarah Kelly

Business Transacted

	<i>Page</i>
Billet for Wednesday, 20th November 2013	
I. Hangar 2 Limited – Lease granted.....	147
II. Questions and Reports.....	148
Report on restructuring of States Works	149
Report on revetment	149

The Assembly adjourned at 5.36 p.m.

States of Alderney

*The States met at 5.25 p.m. in the presence of
Colonel Colin Mason, a representative of His Excellency Air Marshal Peter Walker, C.B., C.B.E.
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Greffier

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

Billet d'État for Wednesday, 20th November 2013

Order of the Day

Hangar 2 Limited

Lease granted

Item I

The States is asked:

to approve the grant of a lease to the Hangar 2 Limited on terms summarised [in a letter from the Chairman of the General Services Committee].

5

The Greffier: Sir, Item I on the Billet is Hangar 2 Limited. The States is asked to approve the grant of a lease to the Hangar 2 Limited on the terms summarised above – and that is the terms as set out in the Billet, sir.

10

The President: Thank you very much, Madam Greffier.

Mr Rowley as Convenor, were there any comments on this at the People's Meeting?

15

Mr Rowley: Yes, there were, sir. There was one question. One contributor asked who would be drawing up the lease. The Chief Executive explained that straightforward leases were drawn up in his office, while more complicated leases are drawn up by the legal team in the Law Officer's Chambers. He said this lease will be drawn up by the legal team.

That was it.

20

The President: That is it. Thank you very much, Mr Rowley.

Mr Jean, I believe you wish to propose this.

25

Mr Jean: Thank you, sir.

Yes, I would like to propose it, and reserve my right to speak later.

The President: Thank you.

Mr Rowley, I believe you wish to second this.

Mr Rowley: Yes, that is right, sir. I second it.

30 **The President:** Thank you very much.
Does any Member wish to comment on this motion?

Mr Jean: Yes, if I may.

35 Just to say that this is an Item for our Committee that was inherited. It came from the previous Committee, and we have been processing it throughout the year. I am looking forward to it continuing and coming to fruition. I believe it will be an asset to the Island. The Airport is short of the hangar space and they need this. The inquiry has been going on for some time, now. I am just looking forward to it being completed.

40 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Jean.
I take it, as is no Member wished to speak, that will act as your summing up speech, will it?

Mr Jean: Indeed.

45 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Tugby: Sir.

The President: You wish to speak?

50 **Mr Tugby:** Just to say that I will not take any part in this vote, because they have asked me about doing the work for them so I am not going to vote.

The President: Thank you very much, Mr Tugby.
So Mr Tugby will not be voting, Madam Greffier.

The Greffier: Sir, I will mark that as an abstention when we take the vote.

The President: If you would be so kind.

60 **The Greffier:** Is that taken now, sir?

The President: Yes, thank you.

65 *A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

FOR	AGAINST	ABSTAINED
Mr Arditti	None	Mr Tugby
Mr Birmingham		
Mr Berry		
Mr Jean		
Mr Harvey		
Mr Simonet		
Mr McDowall		
Mr Rowley		
Mr Roberts		

The Greffier: Thank you.

70

QUESTIONS AND REPORTS

The Greffier: Item II, sir, Questions and Reports, we have received two Reports: the one from Mr Simonet, in relation to the Report on the proposal to restructure States Works; ad one from Mr Rowley in relation to the Harbour.

75 **The President:** Thank you very much.

Report on the proposal to restructure States Works

80

The President: If we start with Mr Simonet, please.

Mr Simonet: Than you, Mr President.

85 Earlier this year the Policy Committee agreed to a proposal from the Chief Executive to undertake an internal audit of the States Works Department. The report from that process has been published and since then, the staff in the States of Alderney have been working on a new structure for States Works.

90 The audit report raised a number of critical concerns about corporate governance structures, current operations and overall management and made a number of recommendations for improvement.

Key to these recommendations was a need to review the current culture, management and organisational structure, to ensure that it is fit for purpose for the future.

95 A number of issues arose during the audit in relation to management of the workforce. While we all recognise that these issues have been present in States Works for many of years, we should take some comfort from the fact that they are at least being dealt with.

100 Currently, the States Works Department covers a range of diverse activities, not necessarily in the most efficient way and in the future it is important that it is led by managers with the appropriate skills, as well as ensuring the staff in those posts have all the necessary tools to do the job. We have reached a number of important points where key decisions have to be made. We have considered where there could be efficiency savings and listened to comments from States Works Department employees to propose the new structure from 2014. While there will be a number of instances where existing jobs are almost identical to those in the proposed new structure, some jobs will change. Existing staff will be able to register their interest in the new posts.

105 It is not intended to make anyone redundant, although in order to facilitate the new structure, a proposal will be made to offer voluntary early severance to a limited number of staff.

110 Job descriptions have been prepared for all posts in the organisation, the first time this has ever happened, or at least the first time it has been done properly, and there will be a process by which the performance of staff can be measured against a competence framework. The trade union has been informed of these changes and the process of consultation will continue until we are ready to launch the new organisation.

I am mindful that this is a stressful process for those who work for us and they all need our support. At the most recent Policy Committee meeting, States Members have indicated their support for the changes.

115 Thank you, Mr President.

The President: Thank you very much, Mr Simonet.

Does any Member have questions for Mr Simonet on this Report?

120 Thank you very much. Madam Greffier, if you would ensure that is recorded in the deliberations, please.

The Greffier: Yes, sir.

125

Report on the revetment

The President: Could we move on to Mr Rowley's Report, please?

Mr Rowley: Yes, sir.

This is a Report on the revetment, which was recently completed.

130 As many of you will be aware, in March 2008, following a period of pre-contract discussions, the States entered into contracts with Beckett Rankine for the design, project management and supervision of renovation works to the Commercial Quay at Braye Harbour, at a fixed design fee of £212,000, an estimated project management fee of £240,000 and a site supervision fee of £105,000, together with other costs and disbursements estimated at £65,000, being a total cost of
135 £622,000.

There were a number of issues which led to an overspend on this initial budget. The actual costs paid to date are in the region of £838,000.

140 Geomarine Limited was appointed to undertake the civil engineering for the works. Beckett Rankine was solely responsible for the design of the whole of the works, and identified as project managers in the construction contract. The Project Board mandate was clearly established by the Board and approved by the States from the outset, namely to re-build the Commercial Quay at a cost not to exceed £9.5 million, with a design life of 60 years. The agreed construction cost was £8.4 million.

145 At the south end of the Commercial Quay, a rock revetment had been constructed. Construction of the revetment was almost complete in May 2009, when it was first observed that movement of armour stones had occurred. This occurred prior to handover in September 2009 and the States of Alderney asked for the matter to be resolved. Further movements and extraction of armour stones occurred in September 2009 and January 2010.

150 The States of Alderney commissioned Mouchel Ltd to undertake an independent review of the design and construction of the revetment. This Report considered the design, construction and construction supervision of the revetment. A number of issues were identified by Mouchel and further clarification was sought. Assessments of the design, the construction and the supervision were undertaken and there was a revised design submitted by Beckett Rankine in September 2010.

155 It was subsequently agreed that the revetment needed to be rebuilt to protect the Commercial Quay, which is of course a vital asset for Alderney. Following a commitment which was project managed by Mouchel Ltd the States agreed in December 2012 to appoint Mackley Construction Ltd to reconstruct the revetment using the revised design with a budget of £698,627.57 to be taken from Capital Funding.

160 The project has been overseen by a Project Board consisting of: myself; Roy Burke, the Chief Executive; Julie Turner, States Engineer; Mark Gaudion, Harbour Master; Alan Cluley, the Project Manager for Mouchel.

165 The works were certified as substantially completed on 5th September, in line with the revised contract at a total cost of £718,531.20, or £19,903.63 over the original budget, which represents an overspend of 2.8%. The additional costs are primarily associated with the need to source additional rock, together with a repair to some damage which was discovered in the deck slab and infill.

A full project closure report will be produced in due course.

170 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Rowley.
Does any Member have any questions for Mr Rowley on his Report? Thank you very much. I believe that concluded today's business, Madam President, Greffier?

The Greffier: Yes. it does, sir.

175 **The President:** If you would be so kind as to carry on and close.

PRAYERS

The Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 5.36 p.m.