



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 19th December 2018**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 6, No. 10**

**Present**

**Mr Stuart Trought, President**

**Members**

Mr Matthew Birmingham

Mr Mike Dean

Mr James Dent

Mr Kevin Gentle

Mr Louis Jean

Mr Graham McKinley

Mrs Norma Paris

Mr Steve Roberts

Mr Alex Snowdon

Mr Ian Tugby

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr Jonathan Anderson

**Business transacted**

Swearing in of new States Member – Mr Kevin Gentle.....	5
Welcome to Mr Gentle .....	5
Convener’s Report of the People’s Meeting held on 12th December 2018.....	6
<b>Billet d’État for Wednesday, 19th December 2018 .....</b>	<b>6</b>
I. The Fees (Alderney) Law, 2011 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018 – Item approved .....	6
II. The Fees (Alderney) Ordinance, 2018 – Item approved.....	7
III. The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No.2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018 – Item approved.....	8
IV. Proposed increase in mooring charges 2019 – Item approved.....	9
V. Amendment to the Occupier’s Rate Ordinance for Year of Charge 2019 – Item approved .....	17
VI. Declaration of Members’ Interests – Item approved.....	19
VII. Annual Reports of the States Committees 2018 .....	22
(i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee .....	22
(ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee .....	24
(iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee .....	26

VIII. Health and Social Care Delivery and Regulation – Debate without Resolution .....	30
IX. Questions and Reports – Three questions tabled.....	38
Matters of importance raised in Guernsey meetings – Question by Mr Dent to Alderney Representatives in Guernsey .....	39
Important ongoing projects and current challenges – Question by Mr Dent to the Chairman of the General Services Committee.....	41
Important projects and conflicts of interest – Question by Mr Dent to the Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee.....	42
Good wishes and thanks to outgoing States Members and Alderney Representatives; Congratulations to new Alderney Representatives in Guernsey; Season’s good wishes .....	44
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 7.48 p.m.</i> .....	44

*PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK*

## States of Alderney

*The States met at 5.30 p.m. in the presence of  
Lieutenant G T Workman RN (Rtd), a representative of His Excellency Vice Admiral Sir Ian Corder  
KBE, CB,  
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

### **Swearing in of new States Member – Mr Kevin Gentle**

**The President:** Before we are seated this evening, we would like to swear in our new States Member please. If you would like to step forward, Mr Gentle? Will you raise your right hand and repeat your oath, please?  
5

**Mr Gentle:** I Kevin Gentle do swear by almighty God that I will be faithful and bear true allegiance to Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II, her heirs and successors, according to law, and that I well and faithfully discharge the duties of the Office of Member of the States of Alderney, so help me God.  
10

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Gentle, please take a seat. Or if you just stand behind your seat for a minute?

Monsieur Greffier, if you would care to open the Meeting please?

### **PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

### **ROLL CALL**

*The Greffier*

15 **The Greffier:** All 10 Members are present this evening.

### **Welcome to Mr Gentle**

**The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
I would like to start the Meeting by welcoming our new Member, Mr Kevin Gentle. We are very pleased to have our numbers back up to 10 again. So a very warm welcome.

**Convener's Report of the People's Meeting  
held on 12th December 2018**

20

**The President:** We will then continue, Mr Roberts, if you would care to give us the Convener's Report from the People's Meeting, please?

25

**Mr Roberts:** This is for Item 1, is it?

**The President:** No this is the general report, prior to Item 1.

**Mr Roberts:** Right. The general report?

30

**The President:** That would be the number of people who were present, etc.

**Mr Roberts:** I do apologise sir. The Convener was Mr Roberts, assisted by the Chief Executive and the Treasurer. States Members were five, excluding the Convener, minutes' secretary, the President. The public were 12 and the press were four.

35

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

## Billet d'État for Wednesday, 19th December 2018

### I. The Fees (Alderney) Law, 2011 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018 – Item approved

*Item I.*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The Fees (Alderney) Law, 2011 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018'.*

**The President:** Monsieur Greffier, if you would move to Item I please.

**The Greffier:** I am obliged sir.

40

This evening, Item I is the Fees (Alderney) Law, 2011 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the Fees (Alderney) Law, 2011 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018.

45

**The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

**Mr Roberts:** There were no comments on this Item, sir.

50

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.  
Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this Item?

55 **Mr Dent:** Thank you. Mr President, colleagues, this is basically a bit of homework, uncontroversial homework I hope, but needed before we can move on to Item II. Item II, as you will have seen, seeks to adjust a range of fees that the States of Alderney charges for the services it provides. The fact that this Law has remained dormant since 2011 tells a tale in itself.

Mr President, colleagues, I commend this legislation.  
Thank you.

60 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.  
Mr Dean, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr Dean:** Yes sir, I wish to second this and I do not have anything further to add. Mr Dent has covered it all.

65 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Does any Member wish to speak on Item I? No Member wishes to speak on Item I. I will take Item I as read, please, Mr Greffier, and move to Item II.

## II. The Fees (Alderney) Ordinance, 2018 – Item approved

*Item II.*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The Fees (Alderney) Ordinance, 2018'.*

70 **The Greffier:** Thank you sir.  
Item II this evening is The Fees (Alderney) Ordinance, 2018. Again a letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the Fees (Alderney) Ordinance, 2018.

75 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

**Mr Roberts:** No, sir. The Chief Executive clarified the Ordinance.

80 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this item?

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, sir.  
Mr President, colleagues, as I have just noted, the fees we charge for a number of States services have not been increased for some time. As background, I note the amendment to Building and Development Control Ordinance 2014, which removed building fees from that Ordinance. I note also our review of the fees for the import of vehicles, which were approved by the Policy and Finance and the General Services Committees in 2017.

90 I note, finally our budgetary review of 2018, when it was noted that there other areas where fees needed to be increased, if only to cover the administrative and associated other costs. I must note that it was during the 2018 budgetary review that it came to our attention that the Ordinances to implement 2017 changes to the fees for the import of vehicles were not properly in place. Following that discovery, we have found that in order to correct this, we needed the Ordinance that was Item I, followed by this second Ordinance.

95 As we are now hearing regularly, delays have been caused by the unusually heavy load on the Law Officers caused by Brexit. No matter, we are where we are and tonight we have the opportunity to finally put to bed these changes.

Thank you.

100 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.  
Mr Dean, do you wish to second this?

**Mr Dean:** Yes, sir. I second this and I do not have anything further to add. Mr Dent has covered all points.

105 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.  
Does any Member wish to comment on Item II? No Member wishes to comment on Item II. Monsieur Greffier, as nobody wants to comment on this, we can take that as approved.  
Thank you very much indeed.

**III. The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and  
the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No.2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018 –  
Item approved**

*Item III.*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve 'The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No.2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018'.*

110 **The President:** We move to Item III.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.  
Item III is the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No. 2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018. A letter has been received from Mr Dent as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked to approve the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No. 2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance 2018.

115 **The President:** Thank you very much, Monsieur Greffier.  
Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

120 **Mr Roberts:** There were no comments on this Item, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Roberts.  
Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this?

125 **Mr Dent:** Thank you. Mr President, colleagues, this Item is similar to Item I, in that it is a commencement order for two pieces of legislation, the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No.2) Law, 2018. These pieces of legislation were both approved by this Chamber earlier this year. All that is now needed to bring the legislation into effect is the commencement order. I therefore commend the legislation to the Chamber.

130 Thank you.



135 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.  
Mr Roberts, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes I do, sir, thank you. I have nothing to say.

140 **The President:** Thank you very much. You have confirmed that you are seconding it?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes I do.

145 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Does any Member wish to speak on Item III? Mr Birmingham?

**Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow Members. I would just like to say I fully support these Ordinances. However, as a director of AeGL Limited, as has been my custom since my appointment to the board, I will abstain on this one.

150 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Birmingham.  
Does any other Member wish to speak on Item III?  
Monsieur Greffier, for the record, would you call a vote please?

155 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.  
The States of Alderney are asked to approve the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2018 and the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) (No. 2) Law, 2018 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2018.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Tugby	None	Mr Birmingham
Mr Jean		
Mr Roberts		
Mrs Paris		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Dent		
Mr Snowdon		
Mr Dean		
Mr Gentle		

**The Greffier:** Sir, that is nine votes with one abstention. The motion passes.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

#### **IV. Proposed increase in mooring charges 2019 – Item approved**

*Item IV.*

*The States is asked:*

- 1. To approve the rates for mooring charges and exemptions (sections a to d) as set out in the schedule of charges attached, with effect from and including 1st January 2019, and revoke the previous resolution of 15th November 2017, and*
- 2. To approve the rates for boat storage charges and exemptions (section e) as set out in the schedule of charges attached, with effect from and including 1st January 2019, and revoke the previous resolution of 15th November 2017*

160 **The President:** We now move to Item IV.

**The Greffier:** Thank you sir.

Item IV this evening is the proposed increase in mooring charges 2019. A letter has been received from Mrs Paris, as Chairman of the General Services Committee, and the States of Alderney are asked to make the following Resolution: firstly, to approve the rates for mooring charges and exemptions (sections a to d) as set out in the schedule of charges attached, with effect from and including 1st January 2019, and revoke the previous resolution of 15th November 2017, and secondly to approve the rates for boat storage charges and exemptions (section e) as set out in the schedule of charges attached, with effect from and including 1st January 2019, and revoke the previous resolution of 15th November 2017.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

175 **Mr Roberts:** Yes sir.

It was suggested that CCTV on the Boat Park to protect against vandalism and theft should be provided, with the annual charges to cover this.

The Treasurer clarified that the charges are from 1st January to 31st December, with invoices for boat storage sent out mid-year once the Harbour Office have established which boats had not been returned to the water for the season.

It was suggested that it would be easier for the public to understand if the old and new charges were set alongside each other in the Billet Item.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.

185 Before we move into this debate, I would just like to remind Members that, under the Rules of Procedure, Rule 21, any owners of boats should declare their interest prior to debate. They may take part in the debate and vote according to their conscience. Having said that, Mrs Paris, I believe you wish to propose this Item?

190 **Mrs Paris:** Yes, thank you sir.

Mr President, fellow colleagues, our harbour runs at a deficit. It is budgeted for 2018 at nearly £88,000 and budgeted for 2019 at nearly £95,000. As a result of the 2014 harbour audit report, steps were taken to reduce costs. There has been a reduction in manpower and some changes were made to working practices. We run an efficient, professional harbour, meeting a myriad of legislative requirements. A tight ship, in other words.

The harbour staff received much praise just the other day for their helpfulness and flexibility, from our freight contractor. Sometimes, unfortunately, it is the right course of action to put up prices and this is one of them. We may lose some customers, although it has to be said that there is a waiting list for both the inner and outer harbour moorings and, interestingly, the quite substantial increase in visitor mooring fees, which was made last year, did not lead to a fall in the number of visitors. In fact, there was an increase in visitors.

So this rise, of 10% on local mooring charges, does not even cover the Retail Price Index increases, which in my opinion should have been made as a matter of course in every year since 2012, which was the last time these charges were increased.

205 It cannot be right for general taxation to subsidise those fortunate enough to be able to own a boat. The increase in boat storage charges, which will bring storage on the hard to the same level as the annual mooring fee, will help to improve harbour finances in the first instance. But it is also set to discourage the abandonment of boats that will never enter the water again. Space is at a premium on our hardstanding and access to the power and water supplies can be problematic because of the number of boats. As one of the gateways to our Island, a tidy up is long overdue.

It is often argued that we offer very few facilities and we must be careful not to price ourselves out of the market or seem to be unreasonable in a largely captive market. We have recently made substantial investment in a new boat hoist and better shower and laundry facilities and the cost of maintain our moorings is not insignificant either.

215 So I will finish with a quick comparison of our charges with those that apply in Guernsey. Taking a 10-metre to 11-metre boat as the example I will use, our outer mooring harbour charges will rise to £772 *per annum*. The equivalent charge in the Guernsey marina, is £3,310.05. Taking the same length of boat again, the boat storage charge will rise to £772, that is *per annum*. That is a cost of just over £2 a day. The equivalent charge in Guernsey is £1,277.50.

220 These proposals were passed unanimously by the General Services Committee and I hope I can rely upon my Committee's continued support for measures, which may be unpopular in the short-term but have the long-term viability of our harbour at their heart.

Thank you sir.

225 **The President:** Thank you, Mrs Paris.  
Mr Dean, I believe you wish to second this?

230 **Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow Members. I too do not take a delight in seconding any proposal that involves an increase in cost to some members of the community. Previous States, regarding mooring fees and the functions of General Services oversee, have neglected to address many issues: the deficit for the harbour being one prime example.

235 We cannot continue to run and manage the harbour this way, or indeed the Island. Whilst any increase is unwelcome, unfortunately this is a necessity. It is the responsibility of the General Services to effectively manage the harbour. We cannot offer a service, year on year, at a loss. It is unsustainable and it would be a failure of the current Committee's responsibilities not to address these losses.

240 Local mooring fees have not seen any increase since January 2012. This proposed increase will be the first in seven years if it comes into effect. The General Services Committee have committed money to capital investment, a new boat hoist, an overhaul of the shower and toilet block, and general improvements and general ongoing maintenance that they do every year.

245 All of this comes at a price and the money must come from somewhere. It would be very wrong to let these fees be kept at the current rate without an increase. As Mrs Paris points out, the RPIX increase over that seven-year period would be 14.2%, so a 10% increase now is actually a saving, had RPI been added each year, as it should have been.

250 The visiting mooring fees were increased in January this year and this no proposed increase for next year. Some States Members did voice concerns and we trialled a pay for two days, get the third day free, for visitors. Although exceptional weather and glass-like sea conditions no doubt masked the actual success, it was an initiative that proved very successful and enabled visitors to stay for an extra day for free, that they might not otherwise have stayed, and the result was some increased spend on the Island. This initiative was very well received and it was good that the Committee did that.

255 Now we come to the sticking point. I would like to remind my fellow colleagues at General Services that when we discussed the fees at Committee level, it was a unanimous decision that was then taken to P&F where it was the majority decision. It would be very disappointing indeed if those GSC members did not back.

260 Now we come to the storage fees. I would like to look at it from a different tack. If you rent a garage for somebody for a car and that car never leaves the garage, do you get a discount from the owner for renting that garage if you never actually took the car out of it? No you do not. This is what is currently happening with boat storage. Some boats never see the sea from one year to the next and some of them, quite frankly, I wonder if they would float.

The Glacis is becoming a subsidised dumping ground. Storage fees should be the same for everyone, not half the rate because the boat does not go in the water. Owning a boat is a luxury

that not everyone can afford. With the harbour making a loss, non-boat owners are effectively contributing towards boat owners' storage. Is this right or even fair?

265 I understand some owners will be unhappy but you do have a choice. You do not have to store your boat on the Glacis, you could find somewhere else to store it or, if it is not seaworthy enough, maybe now is the time to save yourself some money and look at helping with Island pride.

Thank you very much.

270 **The President:** Mr Jean, I believe you wish to speak on this?

**Mr Jean:** Thank you, sir.

I am not at all happy about this. I have had one senior citizen come to speak to me about his boat, which he dearly loves and wants to keep. Some of these people are struggling with fees and with their pension and trying to manage and make things do. I am loath to disagree with Mr Dean, I have to say that to say that if you have a boat that you should get rid of it, if you do not want to pay the fees or save yourself the trouble, is not the answer.

275 My belief is also the harbour emanates other problems for us, in line with the fuel tank on the pipeline there, which was put towards the deficit on the commercial quay and has never been removed. That is to my mind another cost that senior citizens have to bear and working families. To me that is quite important.

You cannot possibly expect me to sit here and listen to anybody comparing Alderney with Guernsey and the service we give and the service we get? You cannot possibly. There are other things that need to take place, as well, in the Harbour Office, to streamline things. One of those is that any new staff employed there are asked before they take up contract that they would train to become a pilot. We suffer from pilot shortage here, we have had to bring pilots in from Guernsey. The present staff are not keen. What I am saying is that we have to sort this problem out and get the pilotage locally based. That is another thing that concerns me.

285 Now to the mooring fees themselves; I have no interest to declare, I am not a boating person. But I just do not think that is right, either. The boats swing on a chain. They have to pay a taxi charge. They do not have a marina they can hop onto, walk on and walk off. They pay a great deal in taxi fares when they are using their boats in the summer and I just do not agree with it.

There we are. That is it. Thank you.

295 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.  
Mr Snowdon, would you care to lead off?

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President. Thank you, fellow States Members.

To be honest I am a bit surprised to say this, but I am quite deeply offended that Mrs Paris and Mr Dean have made comments that people, if they have a boat, they can afford it. What about fishermen? It is their livelihoods out there and we are just saying, if you have got a boat you can afford it. We have got hobby fishermen as well. Anyway, I really am quite unhappy with that comment.

305 Firstly the boat storage fee is to go up by 100%. That is quite an increase. You talk about the premier harbour space, but it is not premier storage down there, that is for sure. You have got, even in the last *Journal*, a complaint about a boat getting damaged and theft down there. No security fencing, which I am sure we might see in Guernsey, if we are referring to Guernsey now. We see CCTV in Guernsey, which they do not have down there. I do not really know how we can actually justify an increase until you put those safety measures in and actually look after those assets down there. You are talking about hundreds of thousands of pounds' worth of boats; whether they be luxury boats or fishing boats, there needs to be safeguards down there.

310 The Land Use Plan does say it is a boat storage facility but what gets me a little bit is if there is some sort of action against an owner because we are charging a boat storage facility down there, the Ordinance, which is 1983 as amended, which is actually before boat storage charges came in,

315 2002, does not seem to cover us if we have a lawsuit against us for a boat that is damaged or a theft that takes place down there.

So I would actually like to have a little bit of Law Officers' advice to see have we got the cover to actually charge money for those facilities at the harbour? It is very well putting it up but if you have not got those controlling measures in place then we are actually opening ourselves up for  
320 litigation.

A few other things I could go on about but facilities, electric and water; well you could actually put electric and water in all of the places down there, if you charge a higher rate, agreed. However you should be looking at bringing those services in first before increasing the rate. Then you talk about the civic pride initiatives. Well, being part of tourism, I have not heard anything about this  
325 boat storage thing and I am really sorry but it reminds me of GSC over and over again, just doing things without actually consulting people that are meant to be involved in these initiatives.

So I do ask my fellow States Members not to support this at the current States and hopefully an amendment can be brought addressing the issues that I have raised in this speech.

Thank you for your time in listening.

330

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.  
Mr McKinley.

**Mr McKinley:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

335 I will declare an interest as a boat owner of a 21-foot fishing boat, which is moored usually in the outer harbour, at a cost of £511 a year. Of course I do not want to see a rise in charges, nobody does with anything. But the fact is that the cost of maintenance of our unique beach, our harbour and our breakwater – well, our breakwater is totally different – has to be upkept and costs go up. We cannot deny that fact. The cost of everything is going up.

340 I hear what Mr Snowdon says about fishermen but they will have to perhaps raise the price of fish in order to pay for it. We have to do some work on the upkeep at present. I do not know what has happened to the damaged pontoon or the rock feature at the end of the pontoon, or the lights in the harbour, one of which is broken. Those are just three issues which need to be dealt with and they cost money. I do not want to pay more but I am going to have to pay more.

345 I would just ask two questions of Mrs Paris and perhaps I should know this as a member of the GSC, but if you pay an annual mooring charge and you take your boat out of the water for the winter and you have to store it somewhere, are you also paying a storage charge on top of that?

The other question I have slightly forgotten, I am afraid, but generally I am afraid I have to support this but I would be interested in an answer to my question.

350

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr McKinley.

Does any other Member wish to speak on the Item? Mr Roberts.

355 **Mr Roberts:** Yes sir. I am very sorry to disappoint Mr Dean and I did actually support this Item, but I have evaluated it since and I have been spoken to and I have decided I am going to take a different tack.

360 I fully support the 10% charging for boats in the Little Harbour and outer moorings. This is sensible and could have been slightly more, considering the increase with inflation it should have been 14%. I will agree with that and I would support that with an amendment.

What I do not support is the charges of 100% increase for parking on the Glacis, 100%. At more risk on the Glacis, with less security than the Little Harbour, with higher charges than the Little Harbour, slightly, it is simply something I cannot now condone. I regard this as Dick Turpin charging tactics, only worthy of our airline.

365

It is for this reason I will not be supporting this highway robbery, for that is what it is, a 100% increase. Not so Tiny Tim keeps his boat on the Glacis and the States Scrooge doubles his rent,

casting him out on the street. The States opposes people keeping boats outside their property, so where do they go if they have no room? Bah, humbug!

370 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.  
Does any other Member ... Mr Birmingham?

**Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.  
Well, I fully support these proposals. The States needs to take a pragmatic approach to funding,  
375 not just the harbour, but all States services, and not stick its head in the sand and hope the  
problems go away, because they will not.

Let us not forget the longer term issues as well, of the capital cost of the harbour crane replacement, which this does not even approach.

I fully support these proposals.

380 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Birmingham.  
Does any other Member wish to speak on this Item? Mr Tugby.

**Mr Tugby:** Yes I wish to speak and I am a boat owner, even though I keep it in the UK for 11  
385 months of the year. When it was brought before Policy and Finance, I pointed out that before  
doing anything we should look at cutting costs of what is going on down at the harbour. Because  
at the present time there is a lot of wastage. There is no getting away from that.

I was told at the meeting that there had been major savings, but then the person who had  
done the report on the harbour for the States, Mr Stephen Taylor, he said he agreed with me, a  
390 lot of the things in the report had not been carried out. So that is why I am really concerned about  
these charges.

They have bought a new boat hoist. The previous one had been totally overhauled and it has  
only got rams and hydraulic hoses. The hydraulic hoses have been renewed, the rams have been  
stripped down and serviced. All it needed was a good clean-down and paint and nobody can tell  
395 me differently. The new hoist, the only difference is it has got a ram on the front that lift its up to  
put it on the tractor, easy. That could have been adapted quite easily on the existing one, sir. That  
was another £70,000 down the pan.

Next year in the Budget they have got for another tractor, when the tractor they have got is in  
perfectly good condition and nobody will tell me anything different about that. Do not tell me that  
400 I do not know anything about tractors, I have got five of them. So I can guarantee you, that tractor  
down there, if it was serviced and looked after properly and put in the shed every night, that would  
go on for another 20 years and that is not an exaggeration.

Buying a pick-up, well I agree with that one because that would save them running around  
using the tractor with the taxi. So I would go along with them buying a new pick-up for down there  
405 and that would make the tractor last even longer.

One thing about the crane that I cannot figure out is that Guernsey's cranes seem to go on for  
30 or 40 years, ours seem to run out at six years. So it is costing roughly £100,000 a year for the  
crane to run, and then you do not gain anything. After the depreciation, if you have charged  
£100,000 a year for it, after that it would not be costing you anything, so there would be a saving  
410 there, apart from the bit of maintenance that might cost £20,000, £30,000.

It is things like that which need to be looked at. When the boat comes in of a night, is it  
necessary for somebody to be stood on the gate. You have got gates. Lock them. Simple. So  
nobody can go in there. You eliminate that person standing on the gate. There are so many things  
you can do without increasing these charges.

415 I had better abstain from voting against it because I know what people will say, that I have got  
a vested interest, so I will abstain on voting for it.

**The President:** That is entirely to your conscience. You do not have to abstain, it is according to your conscience.

420

**Mr Tugby:** Okay, right. But if we looked at these things, where we are wasting money, maybe we would not have such a large deficit in the harbour and it is things like that which need to be addressed before putting up some of the charges.

425 **Mrs Paris** commented about the difference in Guernsey. Guernsey Marina is totally different. You can leave your boat in all year. You can use it all year. Here, the insurance, they charge you an extra £1,000 if you leave it in a day over the end of November. So you have got to put it back in until the following April at the earliest, unless you pay a much higher insurance premium. It is things like that. Do not ever compare Alderney with Guernsey, I am afraid. That is about it, sir.

430 **The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Tugby.  
Mr Dent, do you wish to comment on this Item?

**Mr Dent:** No thank you, sir.

435 **The President:** Does any other Member? Please, Mr Gentle.

**Mr Gentle:** Mr President, fellow colleagues, as the new boy I have not heard sufficient arguments for or against in order to draw a conclusion. I therefore abstain.

440 **The President:** Thank you very much.  
Right, Mrs Paris, do you wish to exercise your right of reply?

**Mrs Paris:** I certainly do, sir. Many of the points, which are being raised, are general harbour points and really nothing to do with the mooring charges, so I think should probably be left aside.  
445 Although I will say that the old boat hoist was sold while it still had some capital value, which of course helped towards the purchase of the new boat hoist, and this is the policy that the States have been pursuing with much more vigour recently; that we do not actually work our assets completely into the ground, where they become totally unreliable and then we have to have a terrible rush to replace them. This was part of a planned acquisition of a new boat hoist.

450 Taking up Mr Jean's point that, if you have a mooring here, you simply swing on a chain and Mr Tugby's point as well that, of course, in Guernsey you are offered a huge amount more, I think that is reflected in the costs, which is why I have decided to use them in this speech. For swinging on a chain, and that includes your part of the year, Mr McKinley, when you are on the hardstanding, your entire year's fee is £772. In Guernsey you would pay more than £3,000 and  
455 that is surely a reflection on the different standards and the greatly increased offer that you get out at Guernsey?

That is why I made the comparison because, obviously, we could not possibly charge something like £3,000 for what we offer. I would still say that £772 is probably quite cheap to swing on a mooring and certainly, if one moved onto the hangarage of aircraft, you do not know how lucky  
460 you are with how cheap this is.

As to Mr Snowdon's points, currently we are under a situation, which I am sure he is well aware of, of Law Officers' advice on the safety and security issues down at the harbour on the hardstanding so I do not feel it is appropriate to comment and possibly neither should he have done. I would also say that there is water and electricity already down there on both parts of the  
465 boat park. It is not a question of when are we going to do it.

**Mr Snowdon:** Can I ask a point of order?

470 **The President:** If you have a point of order, please ask for a point of order and then raise and make it. You are well aware of what issues points of order can be made on. Please rise and make your point of order.

475 **Mr Snowdon:** Just a point of order. I am actually talking about the Ordinance 1983, as amended. I am saying I believe it does not have any powers for what you are talking about with the boat storage fee that you are trying to charge. That is what I am asking clarification on. That you actually have those powers to protect the States of Alderney.

Thank you.

480 **The President:** Thank you. Please continue, Mrs Paris.

**Mrs Paris:** Thank you. I will leave Mr Snowdon's point, because I think that is a question for the Law Officers as well.

485 I am disappointed that Mr Roberts has changed his mind. You know, one of the roles of Government is to take unpopular decisions which are long-term decisions for the good of all of us and I am sure a few people have been quite vocal about these increases. I do not think that is, personally, any reason to change one's mind.

490 I hope this will get through. I think it is very important. It is not going to make that much difference to the harbour deficit but it sets the standard that we need to be looking at, the States, all of the time, which is that we cannot offer services for which we make a gross loss in the doing of. We have to charge what it costs us; otherwise general taxes will go up.

That is a choice that you are all going to have to make in the future. It will not be down to me, but I would just say I think sometimes one has to bite the bullet and take the hard decisions.

Thank you, sir.

495 **The President:** Thank you, Mrs Paris.

500 Monsieur Greffier, in light of the debate we have had, I think we had better take the vote in two parts. The first part to approve the rates for the mooring fees and exemptions and the second vote to approve the boat storage charges; i.e. take item 1 and item 2 as two separate votes. So if you would like to make very clear to the Members what they are voting for, we will go for part 1 to start with, please.

505 **The Greffier:** Obligated sir. In that case the States of Alderney are asked to make the following Resolution: to approve the rates for mooring charges and exemptions, such as a to d, as set out in the schedule of charges, with effect from and including 1st January 2019 and to revoke the previous Resolution of 15th November 2017.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*



**FOR**

Mr Birmingham  
Mr Roberts  
Mrs Paris  
Mr McKinley  
Mr Dent  
Mr Dean

**AGAINST**

Mr Tugby  
Mr Jean  
Mr Snowdon

**ABSTAINED**

Mr Gentle

**The Greffier:** With 6 votes in favour, 3 against and 1 abstention, that passes, sir.

510 Moving on in that case, the States of Alderney are asked to make the following Resolution, to approve the rates for boat storage charges and exemptions, section e, as set out in the schedule of charges, with effect from and including 1st January 2019 and to revoke the previous Resolution of 15th November 2017.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

**FOR**

Mr Tugby  
Mr Birmingham  
Mrs Paris  
Mr McKinley  
Mr Dent  
Mr Dean

**AGAINST**

Mr Jean  
Mr Roberts  
Mr Snowdon

**ABSTAINED**

Mr Gentle

**The Greffier:** Again sir, 6 votes in favour, 3 against and 1 abstention. That also passes.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

**V. Amendment to the Occupier's Rate Ordinance for Year of Charge 2019 –  
Item approved**

*Item V.*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve the Occupier's Rate (Level for 2019) (No. 2) Ordinance, 2018*

515 **The President:** We now move to Item V, please.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

520 Item V this evening is the amendment to the Occupier's Rate Ordinance for the Year of Charge 2019. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, and the States are asked to approve the Occupier's Rate (Level for 2019) (No. 2) Ordinance, 2018.

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item?

525 **Mr Roberts:** Mr President, there were no comments on this Item.

**The President:** Okay, thank you very much.

Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this?

530 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, this Item is simply a tidying-up exercise to ensure the categories of property in Alderney's Occupier's Rate Ordinance are identical to those applied by

Guernsey and the tax on real property. As part of its recent revisions to the structure of this tax, the States of Guernsey have changed the categories.

535 There are no amendments to any of the Occupier's Rates charges approved in October. This Item is unrelated to the move to combine TRP with Occupier's Rates, although ensuring that the categories in the two Ordinances are identical will assist in the merger, when and if it is finalised.

With these thoughts in mind, I must commend this legislation to the Chamber.

Thank you.

540 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.  
Mr McKinley, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr McKinley:** Yes I do sir. May I speak briefly now, sir?

545 **The President:** You can either second it and say nothing and reserve your right of reply or you can second it and speak later.

**Mr McKinley:** I reserve my right to reply.

550 **The President:** Are you going to second it, though, and reserve your right?

**Mr McKinley:** I second it, indeed, sir.

**The President:** Okay, thank you very much.

555 Does any other Member wish to speak on Item V? Very well, Mr McKinley, do you wish to use your right of reply?

**Mr McKinley:** Thank you, sir.

560 Very briefly, I understand that the financial relationship with ourselves and Guernsey is still under some discussion, although it seems to have dropped a little bit in the priorities at the moment, but I believe it will be raised again within the next year or so. At that time, it may well be that we will take control of some of our own taxes, such as TRP, excise tax and other such things.

565 Just to say that, as I understand from this, there are no further increased charges. It is purely a tidying up exercise, so there are no increased charges with this. It is as simple as that.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

570 Mr Dent, seeing as you have only had a proposer and a seconder, I presume you do not wish to exercise, because you have nothing to reply on?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, I have nothing to add.  
Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

575 Monsieur Greffier, as we have had somebody speak on this, we will have to put this to the vote, please.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

580 The States is asked to approve the Occupier's Rate (Level for 2019) (No. 2) Ordinance 2018.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

FOR	AGAINST	ABSTAINED
Mr Tugby	None	None
Mr Birmingham		
Mr Jean		
Mr Roberts		
Mrs Paris		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Dent		
Mr Snowdon		
Mr Dean		
Mr Gentle		

**The Greffier:** Ten votes in favour, sir, the motion passes.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
In that case could we move to Item VI please?

#### VI. Declaration of Members' Interests – Item approved

*Item VI.*

*The States is asked:*

*To approve a revised wording for Rule 22 (3) in the Rules of Procedure:*

*'The President and all members shall, within one month of the commencement of their term of office and by 31st January in each year thereafter, make and lodge with the Greffier a declaration of all immovable property interests and business interests in Alderney, or any other islands within the Bailiwick or elsewhere in the World owned by themselves or their spouse.'*

*The following revised wordings should also apply to Schedule 1 – Section 1, Immovable Property Interests; Section 2, Employment; Section 3, Directorships; Section 4, Shareholdings/material Interests in Companies; and Section 5, Spouses' Interests:*

*Where these words are found: 'in Alderney or any other Islands within the Bailiwick' they shall be replaced with, 'In Alderney or any other islands within the Bailiwick or elsewhere in the World.'*

585 **The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

Item VI is Declaration of Members' Interests. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee and the States of Alderney are asked to approved the revised wording for Rule 22 (3) in the Rules of Procedure, as set out in the Billet.

590 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes sir.

595 It was clarified that this did not included membership of certain organisations such as the Masons.

Mr Dent stated that this was just an extension of the current requirements to a worldwide status.

600 It was noted that penalties for incorrect declaration would come under the Code of Conduct – with a maximum penalty of suspension from States duties for three months (two consecutive States Meetings).

It was stated that it could be difficult to obtain the spouse's interest if they withheld permission.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.

605 Mr Dent, I believe you wish to propose this?

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, sir.

610 Mr President, colleagues, currently the Rules of Procedure require States Members to declare annually their Bailiwick-wide property and other business interests. Some Members have, however, voluntarily declared their worldwide interests. As Alderney may shortly be negotiating commercial deals with institutions beyond the Bailiwick, it has been deemed time to reconsider whether the current requirements are sufficient.

615 This amendment to the Rules of Procedure will extend the requirement of Members to declare their worldwide interests. In my view this is an important change commensurate with our position in the wider world.

Thank you.

**Mr President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dent.

620 Mr Snowdon, I believe you wish to second this?

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President.

625 Yes, I would like to second this, thank you. I would just like to add I did sort of find out a little bit about this and I strongly support this. I am not quite sure why it was not supported fully when it was put last time in the Bailiwick.

The only thing that concerns me a little bit is I would like a bit more clarification what happens if someone fails to actually declare something. It was saying a two-three month ban from States Meetings, I believe, but obviously there might be other action taken from another department, I presume. We had a bit of contact on that.

630 Also, I would like to know, when we complete our forms how long are they kept for by the court, basically, so when we do those submission are they kept the whole time we are in office and is it seven years after we leave office, are those interests kept? I am happy, you can keep mine as long as you want, but I would just like to know how long they are actually kept, please, declaration of interest forms? But I do very much support this.

635 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

Does any other Member wish to speak on Item VI? Mr Jean.

640 **Mr Jean:** Just to say, sir, that I believe this is very important. I think it is important that if any of the Members have interests, worldwide or elsewhere off Alderney, it should be declared. I think it is important and it is right and especially in line with this day and age that people have to know transparently and honestly and openly that that is being done by all the Members. Very important indeed. It has my support.

645 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

650 Does anybody else wish to speak on this? In that case, I would just like to say a few words. I very strongly support anything which raises the bar with regard to good governance on the Island. To clarify some of the questions that are asked by Mr Snowdon with regard to the code of conduct, any declaration of interest is dealt with as a code of conduct issue and will be dealt with under such code of conduct. Breaches of the code of conduct are not in themselves criminal acts.

Breaking the law, and if a law is broken this would be dealt with by the criminal justice System, and there is actually a clause in the code of practice which actually covers this. It says:

If the Chairman who considers that the initial evidence on the panel, in the course of its investigation, has cause to believe that a criminal offence may have been committed, he or the panel, as the case may be, shall immediately suspend the proceedings, consult the Greffier and, if so advised, refer the matter to the Chief of Police. The investigation shall not be resumed until either judicial proceedings have been concluded of the Chief Officer of Police has certified to the Chairman that he has no further interest in that matter.

That is how those issues would be dealt with, so I hope that clarifies that a little more for you.

655 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President.

Thank you for that clarification. Just the other thing about how long the forms were kept?

**The President:** As far as I am aware, this is what I replied to you, the declarations of the individual are held for the term that individual is serving.

660 Now does any other Member wish to speak on Item VI?

**Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow States Members, I had a member of the public come to see me and one of the Members' declaration of interests is actually missing. I wonder if I could ask a question of the Greffier, would that be possible? It is a bit embarrassing.

665

**The President:** I think what you do is take that outside of the States Meeting. It is not relevant to this. If you are talking about something which could be a code of conduct issue then it is not the place to raise it here, you would raise it in the normal manner.

670 **Mr Dean:** Thank you.

**The President:** Does anybody else wish to speak on Item VI? Mr Dent, do you wish to exercise your right of reply?

675 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, thank you.

I would just like to add something and I thank you for clarifying the matter that I too had been asked about this matter. I think Mr Snowdon has, perhaps inadvertently, in fact, identified a weakness in our Rules of Procedure and the inadequacy of the penalties and perhaps when we do a revisit to the code of conduct this is something that we might consider, including how long the forms are kept.

680

**The President:** Monsieur Greffier, could you put Item VI to the vote, please?

685 **The Greffier:** Yes, sir. The States is formally asked to approve the revised wording to Rule 22(3) in the Rules of Procedure, as laid out in the Billet.

*A vote was taken and the results were as follows:*

<b>FOR</b>	<b>AGAINST</b>	<b>ABSTAINED</b>
Mr Tugby	None	None
Mr Birmingham		
Mr Jean		
Mr Roberts		
Mrs Paris		
Mr McKinley		
Mr Dent		
Mr Snowdon		
Mr Dean		
Mr Gentle		

**The Greffier:** Ten votes in favour.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

## VII. Annual Reports of the States Committees 2018

*Item VII.*

*(i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee.*

*(ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee*

*(iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee*

690 **The President:** We now move to the next Item, Item VII, which is the annual reports. Would you care to introduce them please, Monsieur Greffier?

**The Greffier:** Item VII this evening, Annual Reports of the States Committees for 2018. On 4th May 1977, the States resolved to instruct all Committees to prepare an annual report, that report to be debated at the December States Meeting. Three reports, from the respective Committees  
695 have been included in the Billet and published accordingly, sir

### (i) Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. We will take these reports one at a time. Convener, were there any comments on the Annual Report of the Policy and Finance Committee at the People's Meeting, please?  
700

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, indeed there were.

Fort Tourgis – Mr Dent clarified that the States is aware of guarantees from the developer and Dutch Government which will be in place if the project goes ahead.

705 It was noted that members of the public still have not received additional information requested regarding stamps and coins because this is considered to be confidential.

It was noted that 'health and education' should be included in the wording describing the benefits of the swimming pool.

710 Mr Dent advised that the 1948 Agreement is primarily a financial agreement with the scope to include economic affairs in future. Reviews to this agreement have been done previously without any big event to cause it.

It was suggested that there should be a wider promotion of the Billet when annual reports are included, to attract more people to attend the People's Meeting.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
715 Mr Dent, would you like to introduce this Report, please?

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, colleagues, I do not intend to go through this Report. It is a fairly lengthy document, but I would ask that it is noted in the deliberations.

720 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Does anybody have any questions for Mr Dent as a result of the Report? Mr Snowdon?

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President.

725 Sorry, I have not given these to Mr Dent already, but just a couple of questions. Do we know what tenders have been submitted for the PSO, back at the beginning of December? Much interest at all?

730 I think you refer to the 12-mile limit a little bit. It seems to be that is going with a Bailiwick approach, is it not, with Guernsey? However what sort of process are we going to look at trying to get the seabed back for Alderney's interests, for our 12-mile limit, though it is being pitched as a Bailiwick one?

Fort Tourgis, you referred to the guarantees in place from the Dutch Government. Are those guarantees now in place?

Shall I give you a bit of time to write them down?

735 **Mr Dent:** How many more have you got?

**Mr Snowdon:** Not many more. The 1948 Agreement, any progress with an independent chair for this? And is there any update on the Tidal Energy Group, which I can probably answer a question if there is anything you wanted on that?

740 Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** Right, on the PSO, there has been no announcement on the tender of any sort and so there is nothing I can say on that.

745 On the seabed, we have made it very clear in our discussions that we believe that there needs to be a clear line drawn between Alderney's waters and those of Guernsey. At the moment the talk, and I think the UK's interest is in drawing a line around the Bailiwick waters. Obviously there are time constraints on this but, as I say, our position is very clear and we have made this known to our colleagues in Guernsey.

On Fort Tourgis. Sorry, could you repeat your question so that I might answer it?

750

**Mr Snowdon:** Of course, Fort Tourgis, do we have the guarantees in place from the Dutch Government, I think you refer to in your Report?

755 **Mr Dent:** No there is absolutely nothing, as yet, on paper, but we have been led to believe that negotiations are continuing and you will be the first to know as soon as we actually hear of anything.

760 In regards to the independent chair for the review of the 1948 Agreement, we have been pressing for that. We have had one meeting with those in Guernsey and I reported to P&F. We basically set out our various positions. It was a very informal discussion and as far as I know nothing has proceeded since that date. So that is where we are stood. Were there any other questions?

**Mr Snowdon:** Just the Tidal Energy Group; I do not know if there is anything you want to say on that.

765

**Mr Dent:** If you ask me the question, I will ...

**Mr Snowdon:** Any updates on the Tidal Energy Group since you wrote your Report?

770 **Mr Dent:** The Tidal Energy Group has obviously met since we made the Report and it is continuing its information-gathering exercise. There is very little more to say, except that the new States, in January, will obviously appoint, or reconfirm, or do something with the membership and that is where we stand.

Thank you.

775

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

Does any other Member have any questions for Mr Dent, as Chairman of P&F?

**Mr McKinley:** Please, sir.

780 These Reports, which clarify the works and decisions of the Principal Committees of the States here, in the interest of openness and transparency could I ask how these Reports will be made available to the public? They are here in the Billet, at the cost of £2.25, but is there any way in which they could be put in the *Press* or the *Journal*, to say what we have achieved over the last 12 months?

785 They are too long, I think, to go into any of these publications, but I do think they should be made available to the public.

Thank you sir.

**Mr Dent:** Mr McKinley, yes, I am all for it. I am not quite sure how we would achieve it. I am not sure the *Journal* would want so much of their space taken up with such turgid stuff, but it will appear in *Hansard*, it will appear in the deliberations and it is here on the Billet. It is up to those who wish to publicise it to publicise it as best they can.

I will think further about your question in the coming days.

795 **The President:** Just for the edification of the Members, it is also available in the Library. It is also available in the Public Office and it is also available online. So it is available in hard copies in the Library and the general office and online if people want to get it online.

**Mr McKinley:** Thank you, sir.

800 I just think that information should be made available to the public so they can find it. (**The President:** It is.) Good, thank you, sir.

**The President:** Mr Jean, you have some questions for the Chairman of P&F?

805 **Mr Jean:** I am very grateful for your clarification regarding the publishing of the Reports.

The one point I would like to make, most of the others have been fairly well covered, is the work on the airfield. One of the things that was revealed last week in the Guernsey States was that Deputy St Pier said that the Dorniers were one mistake of Aurigny and that they were unsuitable for the Alderney operation.

810 I would like further consideration to be given towards the 21st century airfield in the light of that. We need to open this gambit up so we can get it to work properly for Alderney. Unfortunately there are so many problems with it now, I would like it considered.

Thank you, sir.

815 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

Would anybody else like to ask questions? I would remind Members they are supposed to be asking questions about the contents of the Report. Anybody else like to ask the Chairman of P&F any questions about his Report? No. Thank you very much indeed.

We move onto the next one.

## (ii) Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee

820

**The President:** Mr Roberts, were there any comments on the Annual Report of the Building and Development Control Committee, please?

**Mr Roberts:** No sir, there were no comments on this Item.

825

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Birmingham, would you care to present the Report?



**Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow Members.

830 As with the Chairman of P&F, it is not my intention to read out the Chairman's Report in full. It is there for all to read in the Billet, online and from the various sources that the President has expressed. But I would of course request that it is noted in the deliberations of the Meeting.

I would however just quickly like to express my thanks to certain individuals for their assistance over the year. That is including Sam Osborne in the planning office, Laura Baines as committee minutes secretary and Mark Bristow for undertaking the on-Island building regulations work.

835 I would also like to place on record my thanks to the Members of the Arup team for their fantastic support of the Land Use Plan process and also to our good friend John Young, the now Environment Minister in Jersey, for his assistance in helping steer the project of planning reform. Without them the improvements in the Island's planning regime would not have been possible.

840 I would also like to extend thanks to the other Members of the Committee, Messrs Dean, Roberts and Snowdon, for all their support during the year. In Mr Roberts' case, despite his express wishes and repeated attempts to escape the Committee over the last two years, he has remained part of the team until the very end of this States.

845 Of course, fundamentally, the reason for him remaining was because the BDCC would not grant him planning permission for his escape tunnel because, as he now knows, mining is classed as development under the 2002 Building and Development Control Law as amended! I thank him for his steadfast support.

850 Other than that, I would like to wish the next holder of the position known as the poisoned chalice good luck and finally, to quote Vinnie Jones in the film *Lock, Stock and Two Smoking Barrels*, it has been emotional.

**The President:** Thank you very much.

855 Does anybody have any questions for the Chairman of BDCC? Nobody has any questions? We have a question. Mr McKinley.

**Mr McKinley:** A very simple question that involves Fort Tourgis. I know that we are waiting for the decision to be made by the Dutch company, and indeed the Dutch Government, but I think a lot of people on this Island would be very interested to know what the process will be that follows that? The BDCC will then obviously have to look at it and see whether or not they agree with the plans. Could he just outline very briefly –

865 **The President:** Could I just remind Members we are supposed to be asking questions about the contents of the Report? That is what this process is about. The Report has been presented and you are fully entitled to ask questions on the contents of the Report. That is what we are here for. I cannot see anything in there about Fort Tourgis.

**Mr McKinley:** Obviously no interest will come to the States in that case, thank you sir, or to the people.

870 **The President:** Does anybody else have a question on the Report? Mr Jean.

**Mr Jean:** I would like to congratulate Mr Birmingham. He has been Chairman of this Committee for some years, quite some time. You have been responsible for helping to open that Committee up, people able to sit in at meetings.

875 I have not agreed with all of the things. I certainly did not agree with the Arup process, which I felt was a bit much, but it is a fine thing to have done and it is a fine thing to have opened the Committee up to the public. You have done a lot of good work and you should be congratulated for it and I certainly am grateful to you for some of the things that you have done. Well done, thank you very much.

880 Not only that, in the main, trouble-free. You have held the poisoned chalice. It has not burned your hand. You have done extremely well. Well done.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

Mr Snowdon, questions on the contents of the Report, please.

885

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President.

I would just like to say to Mr Birmingham it is a very good Report he has put together and it has been a pleasure working with you and all the best for the future.

Thank you.

890

**Mr Dean:** Mr President, fellow States Members, I am going to get told off now! I would also like to thank Mr Birmingham for his stewardship of the Building and Development Control Committee over the last few years. He should be proud of the commitment and time he has given to the States and, at times, it has been a poisoned chalice for him, I am sure. But certainly, from the BDCC point of view, it has been a pleasure to work with him over the last few years.

895

Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Dean.

Does any other Member wish to ask questions of the Chairman of P&F, with regard to the contents of the Report? This does not include Aurigny, Mr Roberts! *(Laughter)*

900

**Mr Roberts:** What are they, sir? I would just like to thank Mr Birmingham for working as tirelessly as he has with Mr Young. You have been an inspiration. You drank from the poisoned chalice and you survived it. I think you are the only one that has. Well done.

905

**The President:** Thank you very much Mr Roberts. Does anybody else wish to ask questions of the Chairman of BDCC with regard to the contents of his Report? No? In that case we will move on to section (iii), which is the Annual Report of the General Services Committee.

### **(iii) Annual Report of the General Services Committee**

910 **The President:** Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes indeed there were, sir.

Mrs Paris advised that a full survey has been carried out on the Old Connaught and Fire Station, and GSC will be looking at the options for taking this project forward in 2019 within the new Committee.

915

Mrs Paris advised that GSC are awaiting a detailed report of the Sonar Survey on Fort Doyle Outlet; however, the seabed state is in good condition for possible extension of the sewage pipe. It was noted that this project is included in the priority list of works for 2019.

It was noted that the sewage sign at Fort Doyle has been vandalised.

920

Mr Dent advised that a Tidal Energy Group has been set up and is in the process of gathering information.

Mrs Paris was thanked for her Chairmanship for the last two years, and her hard work within GSC.

Thank you.

925

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr Roberts.

Mrs Paris, would you care to introduce your Report, please?

**Mrs Paris:** Thank you, sir.

930 Mr President, fellow States Members, I would like this Report noted in deliberations. I am sure  
you have no more desire to go through it line by line than I have. However, we are at the end of a  
year of hard work and some success and I would like to draw your attention to several major  
achievements, very quickly.

We have at last convinced Treasury of our case for additional resources in order to speed up  
935 the process of getting projects underway and I have to say I am very envious of the next chair of  
General Services, who should be able to make significant progress on the projects contained  
within really quite an ambitious Budget for 2019.

The renovation of the Nunnery is complete and it is now home of the ABO and the Field Centre,  
the income from which supports the observatory's activities. This, I think, has been a landmark  
940 project, which we should all be proud of and I hope it is going to be the first of many.

We have carried out the renovation of arguably our most important building on-Island and  
found a use for it, which enables access to the public in the future. This sits very well with the  
principles expressed in the Land Use Plan and I hope it will provide some impetus to pursue the  
renovation and reinvigoration of some of our other buildings.

945 The road resurfacing work, which was delayed in 2017 by the trenching work carried by AEL  
and the Water Board was completed this year. And a word here to remind ourselves of the size  
and the scale of the Water Board improvements to our supply. They have been quietly getting on  
with a vast project.

The Waste Strategy has taken huge steps forward in 2018, with the recent changes in  
950 legislation on the transshipment of waste, we are now in a position to be able to send our non-  
recyclable waste to Jersey. This will be disposed of in a much more economic and environmentally  
friendly way and it will generate power for some Jersey homes.

Although it is still in its early stages, the extension to Connaught Care Home has taken a big  
step forward this week, with the application for planning permission, which has been put in by  
955 General Services. I wish this project well with the new Committee.

Finally, although not strictly a General Services responsibility, I would like to mention the  
Breakwater, as the Committee have worked very hard to establish a good working relationship  
with the Guernsey Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure. Lines of communication are  
now excellent and dialogue over the maintenance programmes for the Breakwater and the  
960 gradual handover of Fort Grosnez is ongoing and I know Members of the Committee will be very  
pleased to continue on this.

So it only remains for me to thank everyone who has had a hand in this year's achievements  
and to wish you all every success for the future.

Thank you.

965

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed to Mrs Paris. Does any Member have any  
questions for Mrs Paris, as the Chairman of the General Services Committee, with regard to the  
contents of her report? Mr Snowdon.

970 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow colleagues.

Firstly, well done for all your hard work over the years. A couple of questions, if that is okay? I  
know you refer to the old Connaught and plans for the old Connaught. I am not quite sure what  
those plans are that you are referring to in your Report.

975 With regard to a matter that came up at P&F recently, the property development company,  
have GSC had any input on that? That might come after of before your Report.

You are talking about the Fort Doyle sewage here. Has there been water testing around that  
area and also at the Longis has there been any water testing down there? Just well done with the  
Nunnery and everything that GSC has achieved, but who is actually running the Nunnery at the  
moment. Is it the States or the charity?

980 Thank you.

**The President:** Mrs Paris, would you care to answer those questions?

985 **Mrs Paris:** Certainly. The old Connaught, we are about to receive the detailed survey of the building. Such information as we have had is not particularly good news and I think it is going to be a very urgent matter on the General Services agenda.

The property development company, nothing further to report currently.

990 Fort Doyle, I am not completely sure how much testing goes on there. I know the plant at Longis was tested on a regular basis and currently it is the AWT who have the lease on the Nunnery, on a rolling monthly basis.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mrs Paris.

995 Does any other Member have any questions for Mrs Paris as the Chairman of the General Services Committee, with regard to the contents of her report? Mr Birmingham.

**Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

1000 Firstly I would like to thank Mrs Paris for her hard work over the last five years. It has been absolute pleasure serving with you on the States. Just one quick question, regarding the waste transportation to Jersey. Do we have any ideas, yet, of the potential financial savings that this might bring to the Island?

**Mrs Paris:** Thank you, Mr Birmingham. It has been a pleasure to work with you, as well.

1005 Financial savings, no, I am afraid not quite at that point, but quite substantial, we think. Guernsey have made us a better offer than their original offer, so we are not quite there in the negotiations yet, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

1010 Mr Jean, questions to the Chair with regard to the contents of her Report, please.

1015 **Mr Jean:** Mr Birmingham, you took the words right out of my mouth. I have been fascinated and pleased, delighted, about the Nunnery project, and I would like to thank you for that. I also would like to ask you if it is running well, if it is going well? The other question I would like to ask, regarding the waste is, I cannot really ask a question about benefit to Alderney about waste, because you have already answered that, but the thing for me is do you think it will be better than the previous arrangement?

1020 I think it is a fairly obvious question and I probably know your answer, but I would enjoy to hear it, because I think that this is such a good move and I would like to congratulate you on your chairmanship, as well.

Thank you very much for all you have done for us.

**Mrs Paris:** Thank you very much, Mr Jean. I appreciate that.

1025 I think it would be fair to say that we are having a few teething problems with the Nunnery. We have a lot of separate diverse interests. Obviously the nature of the building and it being open to the public, the access to do digging and discover more about the Roman site. Were I staying on the States, what I would very much like to push is, instead of keeping digging and finding incredibly interesting things and then covering them up, that we actually find some money to keep them exposed in a safe and useful manner so that we can actually have it as part of our heritage.

1030 I must say, as a job, it sounds absolutely heart-breaking to me that you spend hours and hours digging something up and then spend hours and hours putting the soil back on it.

So yes, this is a new project for all of us. We have to balance the separate interests and hopefully come out with the right balance of how the building is used.

1035 The waste, yes, I never thought I would say this, but I think the waste has been a very exciting thing this year, actually, and Guernsey have gone down a completely different route as to what to do with their waste that Jersey have gone down and I have to say we are simply hoping to be as economic as possible in getting rid of our waste whilst being as environmentally friendly as possible with it as well.

1040 I would like to thank our technical services officer for the huge number of hours he has put into this project.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mrs Paris.

1045 Does any other Member have any questions for Mrs Paris, as Chairman of the General Services Committee, with regard to her Annual Report? Mr Dean.

1050 **Mr Dean:** Yes, I notice the breakwater is in the Report and it does not really come under the responsibility of General Services, but I would like to thank Mrs Paris for actually getting the Guernsey civil servants and the States Members from E&I around the table and that initiative has worked really well, rather than sending emails and letters backwards and forwards. Actually having them around the table to discuss the issues we have had with it, I think the actual work that has been done on the breakwater this year has far exceeded what has been done in previous years.

1055 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean. Was that a question?

**Mr Dean:** Would the Chairman not agree?

**The President:** Thank you.

1060

1065 **Mrs Paris:** Yes I would. I think it has been a most useful approach and hopefully one that we could perhaps continue to use in other areas in terms of our communications with other Committees in Guernsey. I have to say we have had our differences of opinion with the Environment & Infrastructure Committee, but because our relationships are quite close, it is possible to actually sit down and for them to tell us which way is up and for us equally say back what we think, in a pleasant and polite manner. It seems at the moment to be working very well indeed.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mrs Paris.

1070 Does that conclude the questions for Mrs Paris as Chairman? Good. We will move rapidly on before people change their mind!

**VIII. Health and Social Care Delivery and Regulation –  
Debate without Resolution**

*Item VIII.*

*The States is asked:*

*To debate the subject ‘Health and Social Care Delivery and Regulation’ without resolution.*

**The President:** Could we please move to Item VIII, Monsieur Greffier?

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

1075 Item VIII this evening is Health and Social Care Delivery and Regulation. A letter has been received from Mr Dent, as Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee, and the States are asked to debate the subject ‘Health and Social Care Delivery and Regulation’ without resolution.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Monsieur Greffier.

1080 Mr Roberts, as Convener, were there any comments on this Item, please?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, there were a few.

The term ‘wellbeing’ instead of ‘Social Care Delivery’ is a better term which covers all aspects of people’s lives.

1085 It was suggested that the States of Alderney talk with the Hospital, Connaught Care Home, and all child care provisions on Island so that all sections are included and their employees are treated equitably.

It was noted that usual time allowed for a debate without resolution is five minutes per States Member. The President clarified why the ‘debate without resolution’ was introduced.

1090

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Right, Mr Dent, bearing that last comment in mind, would you care to rise and propose the debate?

1095 **Mr Dent:** Mr President, thank you. I will be speaking, as I think have intimated, for a few minutes longer and I beg your indulgence on that matter.

Mr President, colleagues, as the covering note in the Billet says, over the last two years there has been a series of initiatives by Guernsey that could or should be impacting the way health and social care are delivered in Alderney. Amongst these have been the Independent Review of Health and Social Care Need Provisions in Government, which is the Wilson Report; the health target operating model, the KPMG Report; the Committee for Health & Social Care policy paper at the end of last year on the transformation of health and social care; the most recent papers on the regulation of health care and the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment for older people.

1100 Health and social care are of course transferred services and, as such, although we are consulted, we do not control. While we have welcomed many of the proposals, a consistent theme to our responses has been the need for our Island to be provided with bespoke solutions befitting our remote location. The one size fits all policy is not always appropriate.

1105 We have emphasised that while we recognise that equal levels of service may sometimes be difficult and in some cases even inappropriate, it would be best for both our Islands if the services we received were tailored to our circumstances.

1110 Specifically, we need delivery methods adapted for our small population and the difficulties of travel. Usefully, I detect an increasing willingness from those in Guernsey to find the bespoke five solutions I have just spoken of. My aim is to encourage this type of thinking and to stimulate public awareness and a willingness to engage, not to be shy.

1115 The talk has, of course, not all come from Guernsey. Alderney has been driving certain aspects of the debate. Over the last two years we have, for example, regularly expressed serious concerns about the deteriorations in our emergency medevac services.

1120 Tonight I have listed some key principles and institutional issues. My colleague, Mr McKinley will, I believe, speak on some of the more practical, in-your-face challenges and our current direction of travel in these areas.

So let me start with what we must do if we are to move sensibly forward. We need to recognise that we need a simple policy document, setting out the principles we agree on. A foundation, as it were, on which solutions can be built. I suggest four principles.

1125 These would be: first, support for the concept of safeguarding patient care and for the necessary regulation. We should recognise that this should not be over-burdensome.

Secondly a focus on proportionality. This is fundamental. The solutions for Alderney should recognise our unique situation and small size.

1130 Thirdly, recognition that the solutions must reflect the different risks that life on Alderney brings with it and indeed to recognise the different appetite for risks that those living here may have.

Fourthly, recognition of the Alderney balance between voluntary, private and public sector provision. Our voluntary services are becoming increasingly fragile and there is a danger that burdensome regulation and costs could lead to failure. We must not get into a situation where regulation is a barrier to service delivery.

1135 Next, some institutional issues. I think we need a more formal, less *ad hoc* consultation process. We have identified our business programmes and process for providing feedback. I think we need, during consultation, more information on costs. Not just financial costs but the social and public costs of the options before us. I think we need information on the governance or the advisory roles of Alderney institutions or the States of Alderney might have. I am aware that there are already quarterly governance meetings between HSC and Guernsey and the Mignot Memorial Hospital and the Island Medical Centre and that there are established key performance indicators that are the basis for much of the reporting.

And I think we need information on the opportunities for any parallel work, for example to promote learning and efficiency and, with others, for example in Jersey and the United Kingdom.

1145 If I could now move onto my third item, the outcomes. We need to know what potential there is for Bailiwick-lite options, which could be applied in Alderney without the rigour of any wider regime applied to Guernsey. If I might just give one example? Our ambulance service is not a full paramedic service, so perhaps it should not be regulated as such? On the other hand, they are emergency medical technician-qualified, which in itself implies the need for some regulation, if only to ensure the quality of service is maintained.

1150 I need now to touch on the one really big issue we still need to resolve. Guernsey, which has of course responsibility for health and social care needs, with of course our input, needs to clarify its position in regards to the extent that primary health care should in Alderney be a business or a service. Guernsey then needs to inform us and ask our advice in regard to what it is doing, if anything to take us down the most appropriate of these two roads.

We need to understand whether we and the Committee *for* Health & Social Care, should be encouraging competition or accepting the clear economies of scale the single service provider brings. We need to know whether there are, or can be, bespoke hybrid solutions that would work for us.

1160 At this point I must note that the Island Medical Centre has a contract with the Committee *for* Health & Social Care to provide round-the-clock services in the Mignot Memorial Hospital; *de facto* in many aspects of its operation, the IMC is therefore already a service provider. I think we all know and respect, in other aspects, it is and probably must be a business.

1165 As a simple outsider, and as an economist who normally sees advantages in competition, I want the Committee *for* Health & Social Care to convince me that we will end up in a situation that is sensible.

1170 So tonight I am not arguing passionately for either or any of these routes. There are clearly advantages to both the business and service models and indeed to the hybrid model if it can work. I simply want someone with the right background to recommend an appropriate, clear way forward, that we as an Island can all buy into.

Two years ago I was hopeful this question was about to be addressed. As with most difficult questions I am now finding that, at least when it is talked about in public, it has been pushed into the longer grass. If I am to be honest, when something is not broken then I think we should be very reluctant to fix it.

1175 Two years ago, many people thought the system was broken. Have we now changed our minds? The bottom line, the delivery of the highest possible quality care at both the Mignot Memorial Hospital and from our own GPS, must of course be our priority.

1180 At this point I was going to move onto what many of you, the consumers of all these health care facilities, would consider the real issues: visiting consultants, medevac, pregnant women, the recruitment of additional GPs and other medical staff, and alcohol, tobacco and drug misuse.

My colleague Mr McKinley, who for the last two years has been our spokesperson on health matters and represents us on CareWatch, has however kindly agreed to speak on these matters.

1185 Before I sit down I would like to make a quick reference to the recent workshop about the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment for Older People. It was a shame the event was not attended better, but for those that did attend, there was an opportunity to discuss the bespoke solutions that I talked about at the beginning of my speech.

1190 The matters considered included investigations of the options for making planes to and from Alderney more accessible, investigations of the wider availability of key laboratory tests, developing a district nursing service, co-ordinating appointments in Guernsey, more visiting consultants, particularly geriatricians, ophthalmologists and rheumatologists, finishing the swimming pool and gym, researching the issues surrounding means testing for off-Island escorts, investigating opportunities for sheltered accommodation, investigating the opportunities for greater physiotherapy support, investigating opportunities for more staff accommodation or more rental properties for health and care staff, and developing more user-friendly video conferencing.

1195 Finally, two weeks ago, I discovered that some home care visits had to be paid for in Alderney. In Guernsey they are free. I must ask the question why?

Thank you.

1200 **The President:** Thank you Mr Dent.

Mr McKinley, I believe you wish to second this?

1205 **Mr McKinley:** Yes please, sir, if I may speak now. As States Members will know and as Mr Dent has said, I am the States Member responsible for Health and Social Care and I also have sat on the newly formed CareWatch committee, which sits every month in Guernsey and if you want to know more about that committee, the details are available on the Guernsey Government website.

I will now outline what I think most of you will consider to be the real issues. I am bringing this up tonight to thank enormously Dr Sally Simmons for the advice that she has given and the information.

1210 First, flights for medical appointments. I think Mr Jean and I, certainly over the last four years, have probably been on about 40 or 50 7.40 a.m. flights down to Guernsey in the morning and we have noticed the problems that those going down to Guernsey for medical appointments are having, in the case of aircraft technical problems, in the case of weather problems, in the case of pilot shortages.

1215 There are only two flights in the morning, one at 7.40 a.m. and one at 11.40 a.m., so anybody going for an appointment before 12.30 p.m. has to catch the 7.40 a.m. That quite often is the first flight that is delayed. The problems then occur that they cannot get down there, the appointment



is cancelled and they have to make a re-appointment and, under the new Data Protection Act, that is really quite difficult to do.

1220 They have to go onto a computer and quite a lot of these people are elderly people and not as computer literate as some of the younger people around. So, to do that on a computer is extremely difficult. They have to re-book their appointment, re-book their flight and, indeed, a number of them have decided instead to go down the night before and pay for their own hotel rather than having to go through the problems that would be associated with flight delays. So that is the first issue.

1225 The second issue concerns visiting consultants. We are gradually getting more consultants visiting from Guernsey. There is no sense in sending lots of people down each morning to Guernsey on a plane, to see one person, when that one person could come here. Rheumatology is a prime concern. People with this condition find it very difficult getting in and out of a Dornier.

1230 The Island Medical Centre would also like to see a cardiologist come here. There are many referrals to that service. And a psychiatric nurse for those who suffer from mental problems. It has to be cheaper to bring a specialist here, rather than sending six-odd patients or so down to Guernsey?

1235 Thirdly, medevacs. There is a clear risk of someone dying as a result of an accident or illness, because we cannot get them promptly off the Island if the weather conditions and other issues prohibit this. I think we all realise that by choosing to live here, we accept some of that risk. The Island Medical Centre has undertaken a formal risk assessment on this and we have been recorded by HSC as being in a high-risk situation.

1240 The GPs from the Island Medical Centre have, on two occasions this year, used a retrieval team from Guernsey to take critically ill patients to Guernsey. This has worked well and it means we keep our two GPs on-Island. However, as everyone knows, this is not possible at night when Aurigny do not have the medevac capability. So no overnight, locally based, medevac capability, apart from the RNLI, whose main role is of course saving people's lives at sea and I should thank them enormously for what they have done over the last years, to help us in this respect.

1245 Not all patients are able to travel by air. For example, those with acute psychiatric problems. Many people are concerned about this but the number *per annum*, has been very small. The trouble of course is that people do not look at the numbers. They only look at the human impacts. The doctors at the IMC, knowing that this matter may never be completely resolved, would like to think that now, with better trained doctors and nurses on-Island, they are in a better position to care for the seriously ill on-Island for that bit longer. This is possibly cold comfort for some, but it is something we should continue to work on and improve.

1250 With the current highly skilled GPs on the Island, the doctors of the Island Medical Centre are better able to recognise when someone is seriously ill and does need to go urgently. Helicopters are, of course, the option after Aurigny, but they are incredibly expensive. Perhaps there could be an advantage in closer links with the French coastguard in this respect? I do not think anyone has seriously considered this as a long-term option, but it may be worth pursuing at least initial talks. With Brexit looming, perhaps we should be looking for firmer ties with France?

1255 I understand that the Island Medical Centre have had brief discussion with Capital from Exeter, who provide both Jersey and Guernsey with medevacs to the UK. The runway here, however, needs to be extended and widened to accommodate the King Air aircraft. This is something we can consider once the current long-awaited project to rehabilitate our runway has been given the final go-ahead.

1260 The Jersey-based charity Channel Islands Air Search has also been in touch with the Island Medical Centre and are keen to have something running next year.

1265 Fourthly, expectant women. I raised this issue at the most recent CareWatch meeting last week, indeed. The Island Medical Practice has had qualitative discussions with the head of the midwifery service. They anticipate having a joint GP/midwives clinic at the Island Medical Centre, rather than at the Mignot Memorial Hospital. This should allow integrated care with the GPs here, keeping up to date, should the midwives be absent because of travel or other difficulties.

1270 Travelling to Guernsey for a delivery well before a due date naturally causes some women concerns, especially about the costs. Having said that, I have been told that accommodation is free, meals are provided free at the hospital, and the women can be safely induced and delivered in the Princess Elizabeth Hospital.

1275 Despite this and the midwifery team do understand that leaving behind a partner who has to work and another child, possibly in school, is difficult. They are therefore talking to Aurigny about special arrangements for getting them to Guernsey, if necessary by removing someone already booked so that a pregnant lady, who is either in early labour or with complications, can get there at short notice.

1280 It must be remembered that having a baby here is fraught with difficulty. There are no practising midwives and although our GPs have had training in obstetrics, they do not regularly have the opportunity to keep these skills up to date. Nor do they have the medical indemnity to cover the deliveries, either on-Island or within the Bailiwick.

1285 On-Island births happen so infrequently it is difficult to maintain these skills. Employing an Island midwife, although seemingly the obviously solution, is not necessarily the preferred way forward.

Fifth, recruitment of another permanent GP. If the Island Medical Centre could recruit a third or fourth practitioner, these would ease the burden on the current GPs. But the practice also needs to make it an attractive proposition with affordable housing and we are told that GPs with families simply cannot afford to live here or have concerns about education for their children.

1290 The Island Medical Practice have been placing adverts in order to attract the right sort of GP to the Island for nearly a year. To date, although they have had about 20 responses, only a handful have shown any interest. The problem is in fact twofold: finding GPs willing to settle and finding those with the requisite skill sets for a remote practice. Actually one of the doctors has now recently bought a house here, which is very good news.

1295 Many candidates are additionally put off by the requirement to work on call for 24 hours a day – totally unacceptable and illegal in other jurisdictions. Last year, in fact, many of the Island Medical staff were working on call 168 hours a week; that is 24 hours a day. This cannot continue.

1300 Finally, and a slightly sensitive issue now, alcohol, tobacco and drug misuse. I have saved this to the last. I no longer smoke, but I should probably drink less and it is difficult for me to admonish others for doing something that I do myself – not too excessively, I hope. Having said that, it is a clear concern of the GPs on the Island.

1305 They estimate – this absolutely amazes me – that 5% of our Island population are known alcoholics. About 90 people. This is a very high proportion, given a population of 1,800 registered with the Island Medical Centre. The Island Medical Centre tell us that, as doctors, their professional advice tends to fall on deaf ears and that, for example, there is only rarely a prosecution for drunk driving or illegal use of drugs.

1310 The GPs, with support from Health in Guernsey, clearly believe that the States should do more to control this aspect of our lives, simply because it is damaging health. They have seen too often young men and young women dying before their time. Cancer they note, moreover, is often associated with over-indulgence and alcohol, tobacco, obesity and other drugs.

1315 The Island Medical Centre notes also that dealing with alcohol, drug and tobacco-related problems is a drain on our resources. The practice are therefore suggesting that publicans and off-licences should be encouraged to refuse to sell to people known to abuse alcohol. A blacklist, that some have told me we used to have here on this Island. The practice believe that legislation to enforce this would be widely appreciated.

Finally, the practice are aware that we also have a number of habitual drug users – mostly cannabis – and are aware of cannabis being supplied to school-age children. It is my view that many of the problems stem from it being illegal and therefore not properly controlled or regulated.

1320 Mr President, colleagues, I have spoken at length and for this I apologise. I do not however apologise for bringing these important issues to your attention.

Thank you sir.

**The President:** Thank you Mr McKinley.

1325 Does any other Member wish to speak in this debate without resolution? Mrs Paris.

**Mrs Paris:** Thank you sir.

There are a great many aspects of our health provision that are currently under scrutiny and I think Mr McKinley has given us a lot of thought to be undertaken with what he has said.

1330 As I leave the States, I would like to gather again some facts about one particular area where I have some expertise and this is medevac. I worked as a director of a medevac company and, for some years, we held the Guernsey and the Jersey medevac contracts. Sometimes our patients here in Alderney are not stabilised patients, they are emergency patients. Unlike the patients medevacked out of Guernsey.

1335 Our doctors here are wonderful and trained to cope with aspects of care, which simply would not be in the skillset of the GPs in the UK. But nevertheless we still have patients who need to be treated in a more sophisticated environment than we have here and time can be of the essence. We talk of the golden hour after certain sorts of accidents or events and that is a very important time for treatment to start.

1340 If our medevac service is based off-Island, this eats into that crucial time, just in order to get here. Fifteen minutes' flying time from Guernsey, about 40 minutes from Exeter, where Capital is based. This makes no allowance for the time it takes, of course, to scramble the crew.

1345 If you have a road accident in Guernsey, I guess you would not be very impressed to be told you had to wait for an ambulance to arrive from, say, Jersey, would you? Then of course you have the really big question. Will the medevac aircraft be able to land here when it is needed? Our runway, as we know, we have problems with. As a result, our landing minima are high – 300-foot cloud base, and 900 metres of visibility. We all have tales to tell of the number of times the weather causes delay, even whole days, which are lost to flying. Landings in Alderney are also restricted by cross-wind limitations due to the narrowness of the runway.

1350 However, for an aircraft already here, one that is based here, the minima for take-off are much less onerous than that for landing. The Guernsey landing minima are much better than ours – 200-foot cloud base and 600 metres visibility, because their runway is better equipped than ours.

1355 So basically to get out of Alderney and to get into Guernsey with a patient is possible in much worse weather conditions than those applying to merely getting into Alderney. Do not be misled into thinking that our runway is too short for all medevac aircraft. There are small, relatively economic aircraft, which can land here on our current runway size, operate single crew, and are easy to load a stretcher into.

1360 We could pursue the idea that the Guernsey medevac contract should be based here in Alderney. It would be faster for them than bringing an aircraft in from the south coast and so we could just be there in quarter of an hour, to take their stabilised patients wherever they needed to go and, of course, the aircraft would be available here for our emergency services.

1365 One last thought, I have heard the argument that, because we have such a small number of critical medevacs here, it is disproportionately expensive. Crudely, then, what price an Alderney life? This is not a decision we want taken purely by number-crunchers in Guernsey and I hope our two new representatives in the States of Guernsey will mark my words when this comes up in Guernsey.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you Mrs Paris.

1370 Does any other Member wish to speak on this debate? Mr Roberts?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes please, sir.

1375 Much of this I have had to throw away, actually, because Mrs Paris and Mr McKinley have covered a lot of it. If I go over a bit of the ground, I apologise, but I have thrown half of my speech away.

I agree that a one-size fits all policy is not always appropriate and Guernsey's trousers do not often fit us, as with TRP. Our levels of service are obviously more difficult due to our geographic position. I myself, in recent years, have received wonderful medical care from the Bulstrode ward in Guernsey and I would like to thank them. They are absolutely wonderful.

1380 Yes, we do not have much control over our services and how they are presented in Alderney. The biggest health care problem on Alderney is getting our patients' medical appointments on a given day. One person, reportedly, had five tries to get a right day with his consultant. Another had three tries to get an MRI scan, because he could not get a flight.

1385 These delays could result in a cancer going undiagnosed for a period that takes it into a life-threatening level. This is going on to this very day. One plane doing everything a.m. delays everything, including medical appointments.

1390 Now to medical charters. Only have an accident or be ill between certain hours, please, or you will have to wait until the morning, by when you may have passed on. Imposed on us not by the HSC, but by an airline management that seems to hold lives on the backburner and, seemingly, ignored by some politicians in Guernsey. Note, I say some. Many really do care, they really do. I got that when I went down twice.

1395 It is those who care that can force change and I hope in my new role to Guernsey I can expose this first-hand; the danger this leaves our sick and elderly in. All on a daily basis. We need a locally based aircraft with 24-hour cover to supply this need, as we used to have, to supply the insurance that no one will lose a life because of this failure.

There is much to be said for going back, changing plan B back to plan A. Guernsey market is returning to a market. They made a mistake and now they are turning the clock back. No shame in that; that is good. Maybe we should think along the same lines? It could be achieved. The staff at both hospitals are brilliant and second to none.

1400 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.

Does any other Member wish to speak in this debate? Mr Jean.

1405 **Mr Jean:** So much has been covered, and so well-covered, and I am grateful. But I have just got a couple of small points I would like to bring up. One is we talked about the inaccessibility for elderly people to get onto the Dorniers when they are seeking medical treatment, and it is really quite difficult for them.

1410 I think that the States of Alderney could, with a grant, or look to raise funds, and this idea was not my idea, have a Merlo-style lift made, with a small electric motor, that the disabled person could stand in and would actually lift up and then could be pushed into place at the top of the steps so that they could then walk into the plane.

That might be a very good thing to do. Obviously, to do that, we would probably have to look to a small engineering firm with a design ability, perhaps in England. I think that might be something that would be worth doing.

1415 I am also concerned about another aspect in Alderney. I have talked about this before and it has been a regular theme of mine. I am concerned about not just older people. I do not want to just bracket it up to say senior citizens. I also want to include single persons of working age, or retired people with no partner to help them share the cost, because if you have a situation, it is very difficult here now for some people to pay all of these bills.

1420 One of the things I was thinking about, was how they have these food banks in England. Interestingly you could not have that here, you just could not have it. The people could not enter the food bank without it being known. It would be difficult.

What I am trying to say is that way should be looked to try and target and help these people in a very discreet way, because this is such a small community. But I believe that there are people

1425 out there and I always have, who suffer from food poverty, struggle to pay the rent, the higher electricity and the higher oil costs that we pay here. But if it is a pensioner, they actually have to exist on the same amount of money as places that are cheaper to live in.

Those are the points I would like to make. Is there anything else I have got here? As I say, I truly believe it. For me, it would be in-work and out-of-work poverty and people with a lot of children and working families. That is quite a range of people and, slowly, the struggle can get too much. How we target to try and help them, I do not know, but I think it is something we should put our minds to along with the lift for this plane, which I thought was a particularly good idea, if we could source the design for it.

Thank you sir.

1435

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

Does anybody else wish to speak in this debate? Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow colleagues.

1440 Just to say excellent speeches tonight, I think you covered a lot of ground. Just to add, I did talk to the doctors some time ago, but it does seem that we do need a list of blood donors on-Island. If you do have that serious emergency; where you can get that blood, in a serious accident, maybe, or someone giving birth that we did not know about, there does need to be blood available. I hope we can forward with that because I would have thought it was quite easy to get a blood donors' list and hopefully people would be putting down their name to give maybe a pint, if required, in an emergency.

1445

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

1450

Mr Birmingham, you wish to speak on this?

**Mr Birmingham:** Yes thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

I would just like to echo Mr Snowdon's comments there. I think Mr Dent's and Mr McKinley's very informative speeches have raised a lot of issues that I think the people of the Island will be glad to hear being brought forward.

1455

I think what it highlights, more than anything else, is the importance of one single thing: communication. If you look at medevac, for example, that became a problem because of a lack of understanding of the existing arrangements that were happening in Alderney and no particular understanding of where that then developed with the Dornier acquisition programme.

1460

One point that Mr McKinley raised was about a blacklist. Now I am a designated official, I am on a licence. The blacklist that we used to have was a voluntary scheme but it did work quite well. Where I think the problem has been the LVA as a body, over the last 10 years particularly, has rather collapsed in power. When you look at the business side of the Island, many licensed premises have closed and I think it might be that we need the LVA, maybe, to reform.

1465

Funnily enough myself and another licensee had been discussing matters around the LVA, particularly looking at a potential review of the licensing laws. Certainly something like a more formalised blacklist scheme, as part of that, would I think be sensible.

But I would like to particularly thank you two gentlemen for your speeches. They have been very informative.

1470

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Birmingham.

Does either Mr Tugby or Mr Dean wish to speak in this debate? Mr Tugby.

1475

**Mr Tugby:** Just a quick one, sir. After hearing about the drugs, I would like the customs and police to be much more vigilant on that particular issue, because they are very easy to get hold of in Alderney and it needs to be really addressed.

The other night, I know, a person went into the toilets of a public house and there was a young lad sniffing in there. It is things like that which really do need to be addressed. I know a number of people who do use it and it is really upsetting, because it does have a dramatic effect.

1480 Plus some of the alcoholics, basically, are having major problems. I said to one the other day, 'Have you got a death wish?' because I see how much he is deteriorating and it is really upsetting. But I think the police and the customs must be much more vigilant. I know of one, who claimed his wife bought him the drugs, because there was less chance of her being stopped. It is things like that that need to be addressed.

1485

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Tugby.  
Mr Dean, do you wish to speak on this?

1490 **Mr Dean:** I too would like to thank Members for their speeches tonight. They have been very informative. One thing that has certainly come to light, okay there are some major issues, but there are also some small issues that we, together, as a States, could actually implement straight away, and that is something that we should be looking at in 2019. Maybe having like a joint working group and actually get some doctors on the group, some of the States Members here and some of the relevant people in Guernsey and we can actually address some of those things straight away, rather than let them deteriorate any further?

1495

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dean.

Mr Gentle, do you wish to speak in this debate? Very well, Mr Dent would you wish to exercise your right to reply in this debate, shortly and succinctly?

1500

**Mr Dent:** Mr President, I shall be very brief, and I would just like to thank everyone who has come to the meeting tonight, because I think we have heard some very important views. We should, perhaps, have had this discussion some time ago, but we have clearly shown a great deal of unanimity in our thinking and I think there are a number of clear messages that we can now take to Guernsey and indeed when we discuss matters in Guernsey, a lot of things are fairly clear.

1505

Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

### **IX. Questions and Reports – Three questions tabled**

**The President:** We now move on to Item IX, please, Monsieur Greffier.

1510

**The Greffier:** Thank you sir. Item IX this evening is Questions and Reports. I understand you received three questions?

**The President:** I did indeed.

1515

**Matters of importance raised in Guernsey meetings –  
Question by Mr Dent to Alderney Representatives in Guernsey**

**The President:** The first question is from the Chairman of P&F, Mr James Dent, to the Alderney Reps. To which Representative would you wish to address your question first?

**Mr Dent:** If I could possible address it to Mr Jean?

1520

**The President:** Please do.

**Mr Dent:** Could you briefly summarise matters of importance to Alderney that were brought up during the latest States of Guernsey and many prior or subsequent dealings with Guernsey politicians or officers? I would be particularly pleased if you would highlight your actions in regard to the Committee *for* Economic Development policy statement States of Guernsey Air and Sea Route Policy Development.

1525

Thank you very much.

**Mr Jean:** Thank you and thank you this time for giving me the questions, unlike last time.

1530

In my notes or my speech to the Guernsey States, I talked about the notes for ATR acquisition and why was the company not being given access to the bond. I talked about seating for the ATRs and also the quoted losses again on the Alderney route. I had the opportunity on two occasions to get up and challenge those, which was actually met with quite a degree of satisfaction, in that more people are beginning to take notice.

1535

Not only more people, more of the Deputies are doubtful about the figure themselves and in one of the speeches, from Deputy Neil Inder, he really rapped it out and it was quite good.

I also had an opportunity during the debate, during Deputy Gavin St Pier's speech, to get up and tell him the situation, when he was trying to verify that the Alderney accounts were at the figure that they were and that he had seen them, by Deloitte Touche, and got up and said that was not the situation and I said we had not seen the accounts, without having to sign a non-disclosure agreement, and those Members in Alderney that had were not satisfied that these were a very edited version of the accounts and not what I wanted to see, that I wanted to see the nuts and bolts and all.

1540

I go again, if I may, if you will indulge me, to Deputy Inder's comments. He talked of the £3 million loss being used to beat Alderney constantly, with no proof. He said we cannot see the working management accounts and he could not support these proposals as long as there was such a lack of transparency, and constantly the Guernsey Government pays out millions of pounds of taxpayers' money, the losses just never stop.

1545

He went back and referred to the *Hansard* reports of 2014, talking of the concerns raised by the Alderney Pressure Group. He talked of the purchase of the Embraer jet and the statement from Aurigny at the time that the airline would come into profit with the purchase of this plane.

1550

Deputy Dudley-Owen also gave a good speech, along similar lines, talking of promises made and broken, and that she could not support the proposals, and again complained that she could not see accounts.

1555

The Deputies, she said, should be able to see the Aurigny management accounts, even if they have to sign a non-disclosure agreement to enable them to do so. She drew attention to the millions already given to Aurigny.

An opportunity also occurred for me to talk about ferries when Deputy Trott was on his feet, talking about the Guernsey solution to a Guernsey problem. That was that they look and explore the buying of a ferry, as a back-up plan, in case there are problems when Condor, which is due to be sold eventually, wanting to carry on in Guernsey. What they want to do is put in place a contingency plan which he called a solution to a Guernsey problem. I got up at that point and I

1560

1565 said would he agree with me that it perhaps should be a Bailiwick problem and not just a Guernsey one and perhaps Alderney could be included in these discussions over ferries.

1570 Deputy Soulsby raised some interesting comments. She talked of referring to remarks about the Dorniers, because Deputy Inder pointed out that Deputy Soulsby, in her speech, having looked at the 2014 *Hansard*, had expressed concern about the ability for the medevac and she was assured that the planes were suitable. So I moved to Deputy Soulsby and that is what she said. She said that Deputy Inder referred to her remarks and she had indeed looked them up on the Dorniers and she had been assured they were suitable for medevac. She is not keen on supporting the proposal, she said. 'I need to know from Deputy Ferbrache why I should and he will have to be pretty persuasive.'

1575 Now, yes, both the managers from Aurigny were in the gallery and the remarks were very interesting. The main theme of these speeches was critical. This went on through the day and onto the next day and Deputy St Pier got up and was full of praise for Aurigny, congratulating them on the purchase of the Embraer jet. Everything had gone smoothly and the management of Aurigny, in his opinion, is a thankless task. He thanked them for everything the airline had done for Guernsey and pointed out that the manager of Aurigny, Andrew Haining, and Mark Darby, were 1580 both in the gallery to listen to the debate.

He said he was proud of Aurigny's service and achievements for Guernsey and that the only mistake they had made – and we have all heard about it – was the purchase of the Dorniers to service the Alderney route.

1585 I asked to see the Aurigny management accounts published, again. Deputy St Pier said: 'We have seen the Aurigny accounts, published from our accountants.' I rose to my feet saying we had been offered to see Aurigny management accounts but had to sign a non-disclosure agreement not to talk about them. I had refused to do this but those in Alderney who had, and had seen the accounts, felt that these accounts were very much an edited version. I said, 'I want to see the full version, nuts and bolts.'

1590 Deputy St Pier resumed his speech with no further comment regarding my observations on the management accounts and I will just check to make sure but I think that is all I have got to say. Yes. Thank you, I hope that is satisfactory.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Jean.

1595 Mr McKinley, would you wish to add anything to the response given by Mr Jean?

**Mr McKinley:** Mr President, if I may, sir, please.

1600 When we talked about the economic enabler and the ferry option, you may know and have seen on the television that the Condor ferry is possibly up for sale and there is talk of Guernsey actually taking it on. One of the strong points that Mr Trott made was that we should perhaps include in the Alderney route. Well, if we include the Condor, or anything of that size, on the Alderney route, we will not be able to harbour it here, so we would need a much smaller ferry. That is one thing.

1605 The other issue that he has raised on several occasions and other States Members down there have raised, and I think that the two pending reps down there should understand, there is a feeling that we should actually be relying more on a ferry rather than an air link between here and Guernsey and it was made very clearly by some of the Deputies down there. That is all of our flights to and from the UK should actually go via Guernsey, so the lifeline link that we have been pushing like crazy, and continue to push, and obviously our two pending Deputies will do exactly 1610 the same, it is a lifeline and it has to be absolutely clear on that. But there is a feeling amongst some Deputies that it is not.

Enough on that, and enough on the ATR purchase. There were a couple of other things, which were of interest. One is Deputy Roffey raised a Requête on the issue of drugs which are not available in the Channel Islands or in the Bailiwick, which are available on the National Health in



1615 the UK and patients going to the UK from here were unable to use those drugs, because of their relationship with the NHS. He wanted that to be changed.

In fact his Requête, I understand, would have not included Alderney. That was what we were being told. However Deputy Soulsby, head of Health & Social Care, brought in an amendment, which allows that to be debated this year and hopefully, by the end of next year, and again the two Deputies going down will be part of that debate, bring that to us, so that we will be able to get health drugs from the National Health, at a cost possibly of up to £5 million a year for Guernsey.

The other issue that was discussed was the Vienna Convention and whether vehicles from the Channel Islands should be allowed to move to or travel around Europe. Obviously that applied only to Guernsey. The Guernsey Law is that they are now going to have an MOT before they go there and they will be able to do so. That does not apply to Alderney, so I think we are going to have to consider our own Law in due course and perhaps consider cars going via Guernsey for an MOT before they go onto France, because I do not think we would be able to afford to have an MOT here, or anybody to do an MOT, but who knows? Perhaps we could.

1630 The other point that I would raise, although it was not a point on the Billet, we had to leave early on the Friday afternoon to catch our plane back, because there was no way in which we were going to get back here, with the stormy weather due on Saturday and Sunday. As it was, we therefore missed eight Items on the Billet, because the ATR purchase debate went on for a long time, with one States Member speaking for 75 minutes.

1635 I think we need to continue to press, particularly in wintry conditions, for the representatives from here to be able to go down to Guernsey the night before so that they do not miss the start of the debate and that there should be some way in which they can stay on, if necessary, again being funded by Guernsey, if they are likely to miss important subjects, which are relevant to Alderney. It is very difficult, with the air links at the moment, to do that. Also, Deputy Gavin St Pier has said quite clearly he is not prepared to pay for it, but we should consider it.

1640 That is all I have to say, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mr McKinley.

1645 Does any Member have any secondary questions for either of the Guernsey Reps, as a result of the responses they have given? You want to ask another question?

**Mr Dent:** Yes.

**The President:** Please go ahead.

1650

**Mr Dent:** I would just actually like to say they were very useful reports and I hope everybody agrees with me that they were both very useful reports. As a point of information, I did give Mr Jean the questions earlier.

1655 **The President:** Mr Dent, I asked if you had any more questions. Thank you.

**Mr Dent:** My apologies.

**Important ongoing projects and current challenges –  
Question by Mr Dent to the Chairman of the General Services Committee**

1660 **The President:** Right, we move onto the second question, which is once again from Mr Dent, this time to the Chair lady of General Services Committee, Mrs Paris. Mr Dent would you care to stand up and ask your questions?

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, Mr President.

Would the outgoing Chair of GSC briefly indicate the most important ongoing projects and the current challenges that her Committee has? Thank you.

1665 **Mrs Paris:** Thank you, sir. Thank you for the question. I think our highest level problem is actually to turn the policy into action. That is really caused by lack of human resource at the civil service level, to get on with a lot of things. Although, it was said in my speech, we hope to have more help next year, I do not think it will solve the problem but I see it, certainly, easing the situation.

1670 In terms of practical projects, the new Connaught, the old Connaught, very urgent that one, coastal erosion, especially Corblet's Wall, car parking in the town centre and what we are going to do with the Butes Centre, I think would be my wish list, whatever you would care to call it.

1675 In a more general way, because I know really this is a list for the new States to think about, I have always seen Alderney as a fairly small boat out in fairly rough seas; with a lot of people sitting in the back of the boat and shouting 'row faster'. But States Members are in an incredibly privileged position because they have an oar, and they can row. All I can say is, 'Keep rowing!'

**The President:** Thank you very much, Mrs Paris.

1680 Does any other Member have a secondary for Mrs Paris, as a result of the response which she has just given to Mr Dent's question? Good.

#### **Important projects and conflicts of interest –**

#### **Question by Mr Dent to the Chairman of the Building and Development Control Committee**

**The President:** Right we now move onto the third question, which is again from Mr Dent, the Chairman of P&F, this time to the Chairman of BDCC, Mr Birmingham. Would you please rise and put your question?

1685

**Mr Dent:** Thank you, Mr President.

Would the outgoing Chair of BDCC briefly indicate the most important projects that his Committee is progressing and what the entailing conflicts of interest that go with chairing this Committee are? I would like to say I have enjoyed working with both yourself and Mrs Paris over the last two years.

1690

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Dent.

1695 **Mr Birmingham:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow Members. As I highlighted in my Chairman's Report, the most important project that needs progressing by the BDCC is the completion of the reform of the Planning Law. A little history: the initial review of the Law by Arup, in association with the Law Officers, highlighted the need for change. The problem was how to achieve such a complex task.

1700 So the approach that was decided upon was to amend and alter what we could within the powers available to us under the current Law, try to put in place a series of evidence-based policies that would provide a bedrock on which to place new Projets de Loi, which would then address those matters that could only be dealt with by the creation or removal of powers.

1705 We are at the point that the next series of reforms can only be achieved by a new Projet and, initially, that will need a wide-ranging public consultation, which I believe should be the priority of the next BDCC.

1710 Regarding conflicts of interest, well if you sit on any States Committee and you support any development work being undertaken by that Committee, and you sit on Building and Development Control, you are conflicted. It is as simple as that. How you deal with those issues, with a limited number of States Members, is the question.

The best solution, of course, would be that Members are not put in that position of conflict in the first place. But, in a way, that continues to highlight the problem and the need for governance reform, because this is due to the simple practicalities of making unconflicted, transparent decisions in a small organisation. It is very difficult to do when you have limited numbers.

1715 Every commercial proposal that requires a development brought to a 10-man Policy and Finance Committee, conflicts every Member of that Committee that then sits on BDCC to rule on the planning considerations, either for or against the proposal, it does not matter – unless they recuse themselves from any discussion of that development in the first place on P&F. Likewise, the same is now true for General Services.

1720 I have explored options, such as bringing co-opted members onto BDCC, but there was insufficient support from other States Members for that proposal, although I believe that may be the simplest method for dealing with some of these issues.

1725 However, where there are clear conflicts on BDCC, where a number of States Members' responsibilities are in conflict, it may be that using the power that exists under the Law to transfer a decision-making process to officer level, specifically the head of Guernsey planning, might be the best solution. That would at least deal with matters of conflict. But I am pretty sure that some people would not like that idea, either.

I wish I could come up with a simple solution. It is a problem of a small government and limited numbers.

1730 But for myself, the reason I stepped away from Policy and Finance was because I saw it as a conflict when there were discussions pertaining about some very weighty planning issues. I really could not be in that room because, as far as I was concerned, it was causing a conflict. I hope that maybe some governance reform groups, in the future, might come up with a better solution than the one to the one that we have at the moment.

1735

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Birmingham.

Does any Member have a secondary question for Mr Birmingham, as a result of the response, which he has given to Mr Dent's question? No.

That will be the end of the formal proceedings for this evening.

**Good wishes and thanks to outgoing States Members and Alderney Representatives;  
Congratulations to new Alderney Representatives in Guernsey;  
Season's good wishes**

1740 **The President:** It just falls upon me to thank very much our outgoing States Members, Mrs Paris, Mr Birmingham and Mr Tugby, for all the hard and loyal service they have given to the States over the last years. It is very much appreciated.

1745 But also, I would like to congratulate the new Alderney Reps, Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon, on taking up their position, and we would also like to give our sincere thanks to our outgoing Reps, Mr Jean and Mr McKinley, for all the hard work that they have done while they were in office.

It purely remains to me to wish a very happy Christmas to everybody and Alderney, and a very prosperous New Year to all of them. Would you please bring the proceedings to a close?

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 7.48 p.m.*