



**OFFICIAL REPORT**

**OF THE**

**STATES OF THE**

**ISLAND OF ALDERNEY**

**HANSARD**

**The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 16th March 2022**

*All published Official Reports can be found on the  
official States of Alderney website [www.alderney.gov.gg](http://www.alderney.gov.gg)*

**Volume 10, No. 2**

**Present:**

**Mr William Tate, President**

**Members**

Ms Annie Burgess  
Mr Ian Carter  
Mr Kevin Gentle  
Mr Christian Harris  
Mr Rhys Jenkins  
Mr Boyd Kelly  
Mr Graham McKinley OBE  
Mr Steve Roberts  
Mr Alexander Snowdon

**The Greffier of the Court**

Mr David Knight

**Business transacted**

Tribute to former States Member, Tony Llewellyn .....	4
Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting held on 10th March 2021.....	5
<b>Billet d'État for Wednesday, 16th March 2022 .....</b>	<b>5</b>
I. Chief Pleas – Chief Plea of Rosemary Hanbury regarding Government Reform .....	5
II. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 14) Regulations, 2021 .....	7
III. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2022 IV. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022 – Items noted.....	7
V. The Public Functions (Transfer and Performance) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2021 – Approved .....	9
VI. Amendment to the Alderney Beneficial Ownership (BO) Law and the Companies Law – Approved .....	10
VII. The Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021 – Item not annulled .....	11
VIII. Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2022 – Approved .....	13
IX. Change to the Rules of Procedure for States Committees – Approved .....	14
X. Code of Conduct amendment – Approved.....	16
XI. Questions and Reports – Nine questions for verbal reply and no reports.....	20
Guernsey States of Deliberation – Update from the Alderney Representatives .....	21

ACRE – Update and regulator obligations.....	23
Runway drop-in – Whether well received .....	24
Alderney-Guernsey ferry service – Start and end dates .....	25
The Nunnery – Accommodation .....	26
Ukraine – Funding support from the States.....	27
The Alderney Ambulance Service – Update.....	29
States’ vehicles – Introduction of dashcams.....	30
Alderney Maritime Trust – Update .....	31
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4 p.m.</i> .....	33

## States of Alderney

*The States met at 2.30 p.m. in the presence of Mr Roy Burke, a representative of His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

### PRAYERS

*The Greffier*

### ROLL CALL

*The Greffier*

### Tribute to former States Member, Tony Llewellyn

**The President:** Mr Greffier, before we commence the business of the States I would like to say a few brief words about Tony Llewellyn, a former States Member, who unfortunately died at the end of January of this year. This tribute would of course normally been paid in February but there is no meeting so, albeit sometime later, I think it is still very important that we recognise the contribution that he made to the Island.

He was described in a media piece as a good friend of Alderney and I think that very properly describes the contribution he made. He served on the States from 2008 until 2013, when unfortunately he had to resign for health reasons. He was a chartered engineer by profession, having worked in the construction industry for over 40 years. Of course, with that background he was an incredible asset to the States of Alderney and he was able to bring all his professionalism to bear on important projects on the Island, such as the drainage system and anything where he could actually use his skills.

Unhappily, our paths rarely crossed but I was aware of the contribution he made, and so rather than me say some words which would be pertinent I thought I would quote, with his consent, the words of a former long-serving States Member, Louis Jean, who also wrote in *The Alderney Press*, and what Mr Jean said about him was this, 'Tony was a good friend of Alderney and I was fortunate to work with him as a colleague. We shared similar views and we would often talk. He was a very approachable man with a good sense of humour. He was able to reach out to people in a way that projected a fair and wise view across the subjects on the Billet. He never played to the Gallery, and was the same in Committee, making well-thought-out contributions. He will be remembered with affection.'

And I am sure that we all share those sentiments. So could I ask you please just to stand so that we can acknowledge his contribution with a minute's silence.

Thank you.

*Members stood in silence.*

**The Greffier:** Mr President, Members of the States, thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Greffier.

**Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting  
held on 10th March 2021**

30 **The President:** If we can now move to deal with the Billet and before Item I, Mr Snowdon, you were the Convenor at the People's Meeting, could you please give us details –

**The Greffier:** The roll call, Mr President.

35 **The President:** Oh sorry, I do apologise.

**The Greffier:** My apologies for interrupting, sir.

**The President:** No, no, my apologies for getting in front of myself.  
40 Mr Snowdon, you were almost on your feet to give us the attendance figures at the People's Meeting.

**Mr Snowdon:** I was Convenor, sir. I was assisted by the Chief Executive and Head of Finance. Eight States Members, excluding the Convenor were at the People's Meeting, two members of  
45 the public, two members of press and one member of staff.  
Apologies were given from yourself and Mr Roberts.

**The President:** Thank you.

I think it is fair to say, Mr Snowdon, there was another event that evening to which a lot of our  
50 community attended, which perhaps explains why there were only two people at the People's Meeting.

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, sir. Thank you.

55 **The President:** Thank you.

## Billet d'État for Wednesday, 16th March 2022

**I. Chief Pleas –  
Chief Plea of Rosemary Hanbury  
regarding Government Reform**

**The Greffier:** Item I, Mr President, is Chief Pleas. We have a Chief Plea and it has been received by Mrs Rosemary Hanbury with regard to governance.

**Mr Snowdon:** Sir, sorry. Do you want me to read out the Convenor's Report, which is Item I  
60 beforehand or just the one sentence?

**The President:** No. There were no comments.

**Mr Snowdon:** Okay, thank you.

65 **The President:** Mrs Hanbury, the floor is yours.

**Mrs Hanbury:** Mr President, and Members of the States, this is my final plea to the States of Alderney to reorganise our failing mechanism of government. It follows a similar request in September 2020, when many of you were yet to be elected.

70 This December we will be electing five new States Members, yet the present States has just about settled in and is just beginning to bring their decisions to be ratified. You can change this by resolving to hold elections every four years. Decision making is handicapped by the unwieldy P&F Committee on which all Members can serve. As a consequence, meetings are long and indecisive. You could change this by limiting the duration of every meeting, perhaps to an hour, and by  
75 reducing the number of participants on Policy and Finance. The other Members will be responsible for specific matters which they will then bring direct to States meetings. This will also reduce the burden on the Chairman of P&F who must at present make all the proposals which have already been discussed by you *in camera*. It is has been an exhausting job for our present Chairman and his predecessor, as I am sure you would admit.

80 Also during this year's States Meetings – which have been almost devoid of resolutions, new resolutions – very many questions have been asked by the Alderney Representative at the end of each session of the States concerning the progress of projects. Unfortunately these replies were not open to debate. Already you have Members responsible for leading specific projects, such as policies for States properties, many of which have now been empty for years – why? Good  
85 Governance, that committee has been deliberating for about four years I think. Finance, Harbour, Air links, etc. You have a lot of groups.

Can the Chairman of these groups not propose their Committees considered opinion in States meetings? Then these questions would be not only answered but debated and decisions made. You could change this arrangement.

90 States Members cannot be experts in all they survey. One solution is to hand over the item to another body. Already the Water Board and Alderney Electricity have part independence, with good results. The Connaught Home is superintended by Governors, the Wildlife Trust looks after our land and habitat with great success. The Housing Association has revolutionised States properties. The Gambling Commission has been of huge benefit. The Land Use Plan was improved  
95 and developed by professional consultants who have given variable guidelines for the next 20 years. You can use this path for other projects.

The States speaks about open government and tries hard to involve the public but the buck stops with you and that is why you have been elected. The most important thing you can do now is to take charge of the way Government works and make the appropriate changes for the States  
100 and the Civil Service, without any further public consultation. You are the only people who can make the changes that this States so badly needs. The electorate looks to you, our chosen people. We have about four months for you to bring the changes in and to excite and encourage new candidates to come forward.

105 By the way, the plebiscite must go. It is you only who should elect your representatives in Guernsey. Do we need two? The electorate has already had its say, so please change this.

Sadly, there is much criticism of our States Members. It is not an easy task. It commands considerable commitment, as you already know. But you are also our friends and neighbours and you deserve a private life as well. Maybe the population could respect this and refrain from expecting you to be on duty all hours. This you cannot change, but we can.

110 Finally, as this is my swansong, may I remind you that all of this independence, as a separate member of the British Commonwealth, is our heritage and must be cherished by you and those who succeed you.

Thank you, sir.

115 **The President:** Thank you.

Well, Mrs Hanbury, I for one would be extremely disappointed if this was the last occasion when you shared your wise words with us. It is important that members of the community take advantage of this opportunity and hold us all to account, and so I hope that it may not be your final call.

120 I did take the liberty of contacting Mr Gentle when I was told of your Chief Plea, the Chair of the Good Governance Group, and he would be delighted to meet with you next week so that he can give you an update to where he and his group have arrived and also no doubt address those concerns that you have shared with us today.

125 **Mrs Hanbury:** Thank you very much, I look forward to it.

**The President:** Thank you.

**Mrs Hanbury:** If I can get up the stairs somehow.

130

**The President:** We can always make arrangements.

**II. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 14) Regulations, 2021**  
**III. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2022**  
**IV. The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022 –  
Items noted**

*Items II-IV*

*The States of Alderney is asked to note “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No.14) Regulations, 2021”.*

*The States of Alderney is asked to note “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2022”.*

*The States of Alderney is asked to note “The Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022”.*

**The Greffier:** If we can take Item II please, Mr President, together with Items III and IV.

135 So Item II, the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (No. 14) Regulations, 2021; the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2022; and finally Item IV, the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022.

The States of Alderney is asked to note these Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) provisions. They are proposed by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Snowdon.

140 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, we are going to take all these together. Item II I think is the only item where there was any comment.

**Mr Snowdon:** Would you like me to give the comment, sir?

145 **The President:** Yes, please.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you.

150 It was raised why these Items were being presented given that it had already been announced  
by the CCA that all COVID regulations would finish on 17th February. It was confirmed that these  
regulations were already in force and we were following the process. They must be in place before  
the States for a resolution not to annul. They are therefore already out of date.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

155 Now, Mr Carter, in the absence of Mr Abel, you as the Deputy Chair of the Policy and Finance  
Committee will be proposing these three Items.

**Mr Abel:** I will. Thank you very much, Mr President.

160 Mr President, Mr Burke, colleagues, this is, as directed by the Greffier, taking all three together.  
These following regulations are emergency regulations which were made by the Civil  
Contingencies Authority under Part 3 of the Civil Contingencies (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2012.  
They are made on the occurrence of an emergency, within the meaning of the Law, in the  
Bailiwick, arising from the urgent need to prevent, control or mitigate the spread of the virus and  
the disease caused thereby, COVID-19. It was made a notifiable disease for the purposes of the  
165 Public Health Ordinance, 1936 on 10th February.

So Item II, the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey)  
Regulations, these Regulations revoked and re-enacted with modifications the regulations  
previously made by the Civil Contingencies Authority in respect of the coronavirus pandemic.

170 These Regulations came into force on 22nd December 2021 and had temporary effect only in  
accordance with the provision of section 16 of the Law.

Item III, the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey)  
Regulations, 2022, these Regulations revoked and re-enacted with modifications regulations  
previously made by the CCA in respect of the coronavirus pandemic.

175 These Regulations came into force on 19th January 2022 and had temporary effect only in  
accordance with the provisions of section 16 of the Law.

180 And finally, Item IV, Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of  
Guernsey) (Amendment) Regulations, 2022. These Regulations amended the Emergency Powers  
(Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations, 2022 and removed  
provisions in the Regulations related to the compulsory wearing of face coverings. They also  
removed the provision in the Regulations in respect of sittings of the Court of Appeal. With the  
exception of the revocation of the provision in respect of the Court of Appeal, these Regulations  
came into force on 26th January and have had effect only in accordance with the provisions of  
section 16 of the law.

185 The revocation of the provision in respect of the court of appeal comes into force on  
7th February 2022, which was when relevant amendments to the Court of Appeal (Guernsey) Law,  
1961 came into force.

190 Hence Mr President, colleagues, the States of Alderney is asked to note the Emergency Powers  
(Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Regulations and amendment, Items II, III  
and IV 2021-22 and that the Emergency Powers (Coronavirus) (General Provision) (Bailiwick of  
Guernsey) Regulations and amendment, Items II and III 2022 cease to have effect on 17th February  
2022.

Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Carter.

195 I suspect nothing to add to that Mr Snowdon?

**Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir, and thank you to Mr Carter for the detailed presentation.



**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Does anybody wish to make a contribution on any of these three Items?

200 Duly noted, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Mr President, thank you.

**V. The Public Functions (Transfer and Performance)  
(Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2021 –  
Approved**

*Item V.*

*The States of Alderney is asked to approve the draft Projet de Loi entitled “The Public Functions (Transfer and Performance) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2021” and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Royal Sanction thereto.*

**The Greffier:** Item V is the Public Functions (Transfer and Performance) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2021. The States of Alderney is asked to approve the draft Projet de Loi entitled the Public Functions (Transfer and Performance) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, 2021 and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Royal Sanction thereto.

Proposed, in the absence of Mr Abel, by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Snowdon.

210 **The President:** Mr Snowdon, I think there was a comment at the People’s Meeting on this Item.

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

A question was asked as to who had scrutinised this piece of legislation on Alderney’s behalf before it was presented to the States of Alderney for approval. It was stated it had been reviewed by Members. There is a requirement for the States of Alderney to approve any piece of legislation if a law is passed in Guernsey which either names Alderney or an Alderney Committee.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

220 Mr Carter.

**Mr Carter:** Mr President, Mr Burke and colleagues, this law, although perhaps focusing on the way in which functions can be conferred on different levels of government in Guernsey. For example, the Constable or the Douzaine does have a defined function for Alderney and the States of Alderney. It is an enabling law which gives the States of Alderney the ability to assign or transfer a specific function assigned to it through a Bailiwick Act and if for some reason a specific named Committee of the States of Alderney were named in that Act the States of Alderney could, by ordinance, change the Committee to suit what is best for Alderney.

This hence gives flexibility to the States of Alderney to be responsive to changes in the most appropriate manner and not to be constrained. It thus acts in the best interests of the Government and also expeditious function.

The Policy and Finance Committee considered this legislation at its meeting of 21st February and resolved unanimously to approve the draft Projet de Loi entitled the Public Functions (Transfer and Performance) (Bailiwick of Guernsey) (Amendment) Law, and that this Item is now placed before you for your consideration and, I hope, passing.

**The President:** Thank you.  
Mr Snowdon, anything to add?

**Mr Snowdon:** No, but happy to second again, thank you, sir.

240

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Any other contributions? Well then that Item is duly approved.

**VI. Amendment to the Alderney Beneficial Ownership (BO) Law  
and the Companies Law –  
Approved**

*Item VI.*

*The States of Alderney is asked to approve “The Beneficial Ownership and Companies (Amendment) (Alderney) Law, 2022” and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Her Royal Sanction thereto.*

**The Greffier:** Item VI, Mr President, the Amendment to the Alderney Beneficial Ownership (BO) Law and the Companies Law the States of Alderney is asked to approve the Beneficial Ownership and Companies (Amendment) (Alderney) Law, 2022 and to authorise the Bailiff to present a most humble petition to Her Majesty praying for Her Royal Sanction thereto.

245

Again, proposed by Mr Carter in the absence of Mr Abel and seconded by Mr Snowdon.

**Mr President:** And one comment I think, Mr Snowdon, from the People’s Meeting.

250

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

A member of the public asked what Alderney processes are in place if there is a concern raised regarding a company or associated person in Alderney. It was stated the Guernsey Financial Services Commission provides oversight for the Bailiwick. The legislation also enables the Greffier to require additional information which will assist the scrutiny of the registration with companies on Alderney.

255

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you.

260

Mr Carter.

**Mr Carter:** Thank you, Mr President.

Mr President, Mr Burke and colleagues, in advance of the Moneyval evaluation – Moneyval being a compliance exercise which was put in place to ensure, in effect, worldwide public confidence in the Bailiwick’s financial services – work has been carried out in liaison with the Director of Financial Crime Policy in the States of Guernsey in relation to what information the Alderney Company Registry should obtain from Alderney companies. As part of this review, it has been examined as to how our current laws can be updated to further strengthen our system, and to signal a firm commitment that the Alderney Company Registry is playing its part in the fight against the prevention of money laundering and the funding of terrorism. The drafting of an amending Alderney Beneficial Ownership Law and Companies Law has been identified as being an important part of this ongoing review.

265

270

275 The Beneficial Ownership and Companies (Amendment) (Alderney) Law, 2022 is based on changes to the Guernsey law which were agreed by the Legislation Review Panel earlier in January this year and which is to be lodged for agreement by the States of Guernsey imminently.

The amendments to the Alderney Beneficial Ownership Law relate to section 1 of the Beneficial Ownership and Companies (Amendment) Law and are in line with the draft Guernsey law to amend their Beneficial Ownership Law.

280 Amendments to the Alderney Companies Law are in section 2 and these amendments give the Registrar specific functions and information-gathering powers which reflect the amendments in the Guernsey Law to the commercial laws for legal persons to ensure consistency across the Bailiwick legal framework. The information-gathering powers for the Registrar under the Alderney Companies Law are currently very limited because of the Alderney Companies Law dating back to 1990 and it is therefore out of step with the more recent expectations of the oversight functions to be exercised by the Registrar.

The Registrar's current information-gathering powers are therefore severely restricted. The amended law will confer a more robust approach to the Registrar's information-gathering ability in order to combat and deter money laundering and the funding of terrorism.

290 The amended Alderney Beneficial Ownership Law and Companies Law will significantly boost the registry's ability to emerge well from the forthcoming Moneyval evaluation.

The Policy and Finance Committee considered the amendments and the amending legislation at its meeting of 24th January and again resolved unanimously to approve this particular law. Hence this Item is placed before you for your consideration and, I hope, approval.

Thank you very much.

295

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Snowdon, you are seconding this proposition?

**Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir. Nothing to add, thank you very much.

300

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed. Does anybody else wish to add anything to this? No, well, that being the case that will be duly approved, Mr Greffier.

**The Greffier:** Thank you, sir.

## VII. The Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021 – Item not annulled

*Item VII.*

*The States of Alderney is asked not to annul "The Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021".*

305 **The Greffier:** Item VII is the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021. The States of Alderney is asked not to annul the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021. Again, in the absence of Mr Abel, proposed by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Snowdon.

**The President:** Thank you.

310 And nothing from the People's Meeting, Mr Snowdon?

**Mr Snowdon:** No comments on this Item, sir.  
Thank you.

315 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
Mr Carter.

**Mr Carter:** Thank you again, thank you, Mr President, Mr Burke and colleagues.  
As raised previously in a letter from the Alderney Gambling Control Commission (AGCC) to the  
Chair of the Policy and Finance Committee in October 2021, one of the Financial Action Task Force  
320 recommendations was that any sanction available to Regulatory Supervisors for any Anti-Money  
Laundering/Combating the Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT) failings must be dissuasive, effective  
and proportionate to deter money laundering and/or the financing of terrorism. The current  
maximum financial regulatory penalty was £25,000, which the AGCC believed was not in  
compliance with the Financial Action Task Force, FATF, as their acronym, recommendations.

325 It was proposed that the maximum regulatory financial penalty be increased from £25,000 to  
£250,000 or 10% of turnover, whichever is the greater, and that the criminal penalty for money  
laundering/terrorist financing offences be increased to five years imprisonment or an unlimited  
fine. It was noted that in practice any money laundering/terrorist financing offence would be dealt  
with under the Proceeds of Crime Laws in place in the Bailiwick which carries greater punishment.  
330 However, the penalty for these types of offences in the eGambling legislative framework should  
still be compliant with the FATF recommendations.

The AGCC, whilst reviewing these penalties, carried out a review of all penalties in the  
legislation to ensure that they remain proportionate, effective and dissuasive. It was further  
proposed that the penalties for the minor offences be increased to mirror the maximum penalty  
335 of the Court of Alderney which is 12 months imprisonment or a £10,000 fine.

The States of Alderney approved the amendment legislation, the Gambling (Alderney)  
(Amendment) Law, 2021 and the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Ordinance, 2021 at its  
meeting of 17th November 2021, where it was also noted that the AGCC would subsequently  
approve the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations 2021 which put into effect the  
340 increased penalties.

So Mr President, colleagues, the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021 were  
made and came into force on 26th November 2021. Hence I would ask you that the States of  
Alderney is asked not to annul the Alderney eGambling (Amendment) Regulations, 2021.

345 **The President:** Thank you.  
Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir, thank you.

350 **The President:** Thank you.  
Does anybody want to comment on this one? Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir.

355 Can Mr Carter please explain to the public – with these fines going up substantially to a quarter  
of a million pounds – exactly where that money goes to?

**Mr Carter:** I am afraid not, simply because I do not know. Maybe could I ask the Greffier, who  
may have a greater knowledge of the fines process? I am afraid that is outside of my knowledge,  
and as the comment before from our Chief Plea, we cannot be experts on everything.

360 **The President:** Well then, Mr Greffier, can you help?

**The Greffier:** Fines go, as far as I am aware, into the general pot. But as for regulations fining  
from other companies, if it goes to a criminal matter the sentence is therefore a higher matter

365 that would then go to Guernsey because of the five years and so therefore I suspect the fine would  
then go to the Guernsey general revenue.

**Mr Carter:** I hope, Mr Roberts, that is an answer. As I said, we cannot be experts on everything,  
I apologise.

370

**Mr Roberts:** Thank you, Mr Carter.

**The President:** Anybody else? No, in that event then those Regulations are not annulled.

### VIII. Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2022 – Approved

*Item VIII.*

*The States is asked to approve The Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2022.*

**The Greffier:** Item VIII, Mr President, the Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2022.

375 The States of Alderney is asked to approve the Speed Trials (Alderney) Ordinance, 2022,  
proposed by Mr Kelly and seconded by Ms Burgess.

**The President:** Mr Greffier, I think there needs to be a minor amendment to the date of  
commencement of this Ordinance.

380

**The Greffier:** Sir, in the Ordinance it has the commencement as in the January States Meeting.  
However, it did not make it before the January States Meeting, so the commencement of the  
Ordinance merely needs to reflect today's date, and therefore it will commence from today.

385 **The President:** I do not think we need to go through the formal amendment process, Mr Kelly.  
I think I can say that this is *de minimis*, as we lawyers would say, and therefore we can simply  
amend the date on the Instrument.

**Mr Kelly:** As ever, sir, I bow to a lawyer.

390

**Mr Snowdon:** Sir, would you let me say there was no comment on this Item?

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Over to you, Mr Kelly.

395

**Mr Kelly:** Thank you, sir.

Mr President, Mr Burke, fellow Members, I would ask my colleagues to approve the Speed Trial  
Ordinance in order to facilitate the three-day Sprint and Hill Climb event from 15th to 17th  
September this year. It is, as Members will be aware – or it has been, usually – an annual event,  
400 although last year it was cancelled due to issues surrounding the pandemic; hopefully, those will  
not arise this year.

A member of our Civil Service has been tasked with contacting the organisers well in advance,  
to ensure they supply full ambulance cover, therefore not imposing on our own ambulance  
service, and ensure all our emergency services are satisfied with the organisation.

405 It is a very successful event. At a seasonal shoulder time it brings Guernsey tourists to the Island, it allows competitive speeding on the routes described and also facilitates the closure of these roads. I would therefore ask my colleagues, please, to approve the speed trials.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

410 Ms Burgess, I think you are seconding this Item.

**Ms Burgess:** Yes, thank you very much. I am happy to second it and I am pleased to see this application coming from the Guernsey Kart and Motor Club.

415 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody wish to make a contribution? Mr Harris.

**Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir.

420 Fellow States Members, just a brief comment, really. It is great to see such a longstanding event return after the difficulties presented by COVID. It brings money and people to the Island, so it has my full support, and of course I thank everybody involved for bringing it to Alderney.

Thank you, sir.

425 **The President:** I suspect Mr Harris speaks on behalf of you all. That being the case, if there are no further contributions, we can say that that Ordinance is approved.

### **IX. Change to the Rules of Procedure for States Committees – Approved**

*Item IX.*

*The States is asked to approve that Rule 19 in the Rules of Procedure for States Committees be removed and the sequential numbering of the Rules be amended accordingly.*

**The Greffier:** Item IX, Mr President, is a change to the Rules of Procedure for States Committees.

430 The States of Alderney is asked to approve that Rule 19 in the Rules of Procedure for States Committees be removed and the sequential numbering of the Rules be amended accordingly – proposed by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Kelly.

**The President:** Nothing from the People’s Meeting, Mr Snowdon?

435 **Mr Snowdon:** Nothing to report on this Item, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Again, over to you, Mr Carter.

**Mr Carter:** Thank you.

440 Mr President, colleagues, Policy and Finance Committee resolved, on 21st February 2022, to recommend the Rules of Procedure be changed, hence that Rule 19 be removed in its entirety.

The rationale for this is that currently the Rules of Procedure as set out in Rule 19 say that:

All Committee meetings and Committee minutes shall remain confidential until such time as the minutes have been published.

445 The current Rule does not, therefore, provide for Committees to allow non-confidential details of decisions made to be released to the media for the purpose of public information until those minutes have been published. This current practice causes delay in reporting Committee decisions and is detrimental to the public perception of the States.

450 This proposal is the initial component of further revision of the openness of Committee meetings which have been developed in detail. Hence I am asking the States of Alderney to approve that Rule 19 in its Rules of Procedure for States Committees be removed and the sequential numbering of those Rules be amended accordingly.

I urge you to support this. Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

455 Mr Kelly, you are going to second this one?

**Mr Kelly:** Yes, sir, I have pleasure in seconding this but I reserve my right to comment, if I may.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

460 Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

I do support this, because I think we need to try to get more out into the public domain through whatever means we can. However, what concerns me is that we are actually making this Rule happen because of a shortfall that seems to have occurred.

465 I am happy for people and States Members to correct me later on but my understanding is that the agenda is meant to be on the website the Friday before a Committee meeting takes place, draft minutes should be published within two weeks, and at the moment our minutes seem to be taking over a month to get into the public domain.

470 Obviously this speeds up statements from the States of Alderney being able to go into the public domain, which is absolutely fine, but I am concerned that our minutes are taking such a long time to get into the public domain that that topic might have actually disappeared. The public who are really interested in lots of different things that we discuss in our different Committees are not getting access to those minutes straight away to see what the topics were that were discussed, how Members voted and what happened with it all. I think this actually highlights another thing: that we need to get on top of our minutes, if we can, and make sure that they can go out at the correct time, which used to be a lot faster than it is now.

475 So although I support this Item today, I think this is, as I said, a shortfall, because we are not actually getting the minutes out, but we are now going to say, 'Well, the minutes are not out, but we are going to put some press releases out with something about it – but you are not allowed the minutes yet.' I think we need to try to come up with a way we can get these minutes out a lot more efficiently into the public domain, so the public can understand what their elected Members are doing on their behalf.

480 I will be supporting this and I thank Mr Carter and Mr Kelly for bringing it forward today, but I think we do need to address how we get minutes out a lot quicker moving forward.

485 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

Does anybody else wish to speak on this Item? Mr Roberts.

490 **Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir. The minutes certainly seemed to come out a lot quicker before.

It is just a short comment, actually, that we need to find a way to get these minutes – I will echo what Mr Snowdon has just said – out quicker.

I am glad to see the back of this Rule. Well done to Mr Carter. Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
495 Does anybody else wish to ...? Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** If I may, sir. Like Messrs Snowdon and Roberts, I share their concern about the lateness of the minutes – is that the Royal ‘we’? – but surely that is a matter for the Civil Service, and I am sure the Chief Executive will have that matter in hand.

500 I support this change of Rules. In fact if there is anything I am slightly disappointed in, it is that it did not go with Rule 17 too, because I would wish Rule 17 – to use a rugby term – to be kicked into touch too, to enable open meetings to take place. As the Chief Plea was just mentioning we should be going towards more openness and open Committee meetings should allow members of the public to hear what we have to say.

505 So I am disappointed that Rule 17 is not here with the amendments, but I will happily support this Proposition to amend Rule 19.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.  
510 Does anybody else wish to speak?  
Mr Carter, do you want to exercise your right of reply?

**Mr Carter:** Yes, please.

515 I would also support Mr Snowdon and Mr Roberts in terms of minute taking and getting minutes into the public domain or into our domain should be seen as an activity that is timely, and though I am very aware of pressures currently on the civil servants, this is something that one tries to maximise, to make it as speedy as possible.

Likewise, the move towards completely open Committee meetings is something that has currently been somewhat slowed by Law Officer comments, where we have to consider that. I would hope to be bringing to the next States Meeting that particular move forward; hence the comment in the proposal that this is the first step in a series of provisions to be opening up at Committees.

Thank you.

525 **The President:** Thank you.

I think we can say there is a consensus again here, so that application to remove Rule 19 will be approved.

#### **X. Code of Conduct amendment – Approved**

*Item X.*

*The States is asked to approve the amendment to the Code of Conduct for States Members by adding sub Paragraph 12.5.*

**The Greffier:** Item X, Mr President, the Code of Conduct amendment.  
530 The States of Alderney is asked to approve the amendment of the Code of Conduct for States Members by adding subparagraph 12.5.

This is proposed by Mr Carter and it is seconded by Ms Burgess.

**The President:** And there was a comment at the People’s Meeting, Mr Snowdon?



**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

535 A member of the public stated that in their opinion the Code of Conduct Panel and process had  
been a concerning matter, damaging to States Members and impacting good governance. They  
asked when a review was taking place. Mr Snowdon stated the Good Governance Group will be  
presenting their findings to the Policy and Finance Committee soon. However, a Channel Islands  
Commissioner had formed part of these proposals to ensure complete independence. In the  
540 meantime, this amendment was seen as a step in the right direction.

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Carter.

545

**Mr Carter:** Thank you, Mr President.

Mr President and colleagues, Mr Burke. At the Policy and Finance Committee meeting on  
21st February 2022, an issue was raised with regard to membership of a Conduct Review Panel  
under the Code of Conduct for States Members.

550 The Code of Conduct requires a panel of three Members to be selected by the President to  
convene to hear a complaint. This constitutes a Conduct Review Panel. Subsequently a further  
three Members may be required to hear an appeal against the original decision made by that  
Panel. Hence there need to be at least six people who are not conflicted regarding the complaint  
and also who are present on the Island at a convenient and timely moment for the hearing of the  
555 initial complaint, and then potentially three other panel members for a possible appeal.

Currently, paragraph 12.4 of the Code of Conduct allows the President, following consultation  
with the Chair – or his Deputy – of the Policy and Finance Committee, to appoint temporary  
Members if it is found that he cannot convene a panel from the existing membership for any  
reason.

560 At present, the Code also requires that a person appointed to the Panel has to be on the  
Alderney Electoral Register. It is therefore a possibility that the situation could arise, through  
potential conflicts of interest, for the need to appoint additional people to the Panel, particularly  
in the event of an appeal, and if this were not possible we would be in a democratic deficit and  
the process could not take place.

565 To ensure that such a democratic deficit is not encountered and to provide greater flexibility,  
it has been recognised that the President should have the ability to appoint, *in extremis*, panel  
members from the Guernsey Code of Conduct Panel – people who are already versed in similar  
procedures – on a needs-only basis. However, to do this there would need to be an amendment  
to the current Alderney Code of Conduct Panel procedures to include people who, by definition,  
570 will be on the Guernsey Electoral Roll.

Whilst initially this might seem a great deal of work for a situation which may never arise, to  
wait and see if it proves necessary would inevitably involve a significant delay in any complaint  
that did arise if this option were not available, and it would not be in the best interests of justice  
being undertaken expeditiously.

575 The Policy and Finance Committee resolved to revise the Alderney Code of Conduct for States  
Members to enable the President, in an extremely difficult situation, to appoint members of the  
Guernsey Code of Conduct Panel to an Alderney hearing of the appeal panel. Hence I would ask  
you to revise the particular paragraph to insert 12.5 to say:

In the event that the President is unable to appoint a hearing panel from the existing members, he may, with the  
agreement of the secretary to the Guernsey Code of Conduct Panel, appoint temporary members from the  
Guernsey Panel having consulted with the Chair or the Vice Chair of the Policy and Finance Committee.

580 States Members, I would ask you to approve that amendment to the Code of Conduct by  
adding that paragraph 12.5 into it.

Thank you.

**The President:** Ms Burgess, you are going to second this one?

585 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President and colleagues.

I am very happy to support this because I have witnessed the stress that the Code of Conduct process can place on those who are involved in it. When the person receiving the complaint feels those on the Panel are too well known to them, it is very difficult. So I support this measure to provide greater flexibility for the President when potential conflicts of interest do arise from only being able to appoint the Panel, as Mr Carter said, from the Alderney Electoral Register. To alleviate this problem, of course, we have been able to appoint members from the Guernsey Code of Conduct Panel, who we have already said are versed in similar procedures. To me, it seems very sensible and a good way to support and help the process going forward.

590  
595 However, I do feel I need to say that, looking forward, I do think we need to make changes and move away from the Code of Conduct Panel system as a whole. The Good Governance Group which is formed through Policy and Finance have been looking at this and it has been pointed out to us that the use of an independent commissioner is now the norm and is the model used in all the main government assemblies. We also have been advised recently in the Good Governance Group, and it is relevant to this conversation, that the States Assembly & Constitution Committee in Guernsey have decided to move away from the Code of Conduct Panel system and to look at use of an independent commissioner. I think this could be beneficial to Alderney, and although there are always difficulties when looking at this subject, I believe an independent commissioner approach far outweighs the disadvantages and will address a number of issues associated with the panel system.

600  
605 However, as I said at the beginning, right now I support the greater flexibility this matter gives the Code of Conduct Panel system we now have, and I hope my colleagues will support this.

Thank you, Mr President.

**The President:** Thank you.

610 Mr Gentle, you would like to speak?

**Mr Gentle:** Thank you, sir.

Mr President, Mr Burke, colleagues. Like Ms Burgess, whilst I am in total agreement with this proposal it is imperative that as we go forward we look to completely change the system that we currently have in place, a point made and agreed with at the People's Meeting.

615 Alderney must be minded to go down the same path as Guernsey. To get to the stage that Guernsey has got to so far, the Law Officers have done a lot of work, so it would make perfect sense for Alderney just to jump on board.

620 As reported in the *Guernsey Press* just last week, a panel and commissioner for Jersey, Guernsey, Alderney and Sark is entirely possible. It was also reported that it would go before the States of Deliberation in June, so our two colleagues here will be hearing it before we do.

As Ms Burgess has already stated, though, the Good Governance Group are working towards hopefully making this a reality as we await an expected letter from the States Assembly Constitution Committee (SACC) to affirm the intention to move to a Commissioner of Standards, dispensing with the panel system in place today and having it all in place for next year.

625 Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you.

Mr Snowdon.

630

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

I do support getting the Guernsey Members involved in this because I think, unfortunately, over the years in Alderney it seems that the Code of Conduct has actually been weaponised. We have people in our community who kindly come forward and sit on that Panel, but it is very hard  
635 when we all have connections to all sorts of people on the Island. How they have the independence ... I am sure they do try to do it, but it is just that we are all very well connected.

What I would just say regarding Guernsey is that I think that is an important move forward. Mr Gentle, thank you for highlighting the different aspects which are coming up. However, not so much with the Panel but with the whole Code of Conduct there have been major problems in  
640 Guernsey where again the Code of Conduct becomes politically weaponised against Members; and then, before you know it, it has gone out to the media and it has actually done the damage in the media before any outcome of any Code of Conduct Panel has actually taken place.

If you take Mr Gentle's comment, I think taking a step forward our Good Governance Group, or whoever the States of Alderney wants to appoint to represent them, needs to talk with the  
645 Guernsey equivalent and the Jersey equivalent, as you say, and actually look at the Code of Conduct which we are following. Is it fit for purpose? Does it have support from those Members? Is it actually looking at coming to the right outcome – training, education if needed, support if needed? Obviously, if there was a serious Code of Conduct it needs to be taken forward. However, I just feel that too many of these Codes of Conduct are, unfortunately, weaponised; and then I  
650 think potentially Members may feel that they are gagged from talking too much for the fear of getting a Code of Conduct, when actually those Members, as long as they are talking in the best interests of the communities they are representing, should feel confident to raise whatever they want to raise without having this dark cloud of the Code of Conduct potentially being thrust upon them.

So I welcome this move but I think there is quite a lot more work to be done with the whole of the Channel Islands. I think actually looking at the Rule Book is what needs to be done urgently and then hopefully move forward. So I will support this today – and thank you for listening to my comments.

660 **The President:** Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** Mr President, Mr Burke, colleagues, firstly I think we ought to thank the Members of the existing Panel and members of the public who have served on this Panel, and I would personally defend them, despite being the subject of a Code of Conduct myself. I would personally  
665 thank them and defend them from the criticism being levelled against them by some people in bias, and totally unacceptable and totally unfounded. However, in support of them, before I go into the criticism, I must say that the criticism is not aimed at them but more at the system. Members will be aware that I was tasked by the Good Governance Group to draft an amended version for Members' consideration and therefore, to hear that Guernsey was forming a  
670 Commissioner for Public Standards was music to my ears and one I fully support, sir.

Thank you very much.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody else ...? No.

675 If you choose to exercise your right to respond, could I just make the point that this is your Code of Conduct as Members; this came before the States and was debated and passed in the States. So, if there is to be change, then of course that is a matter entirely for you, but until such time as there is that change, then the Code of Conduct will be administered in accordance with your Rules.

680 Mr Carter, do you want to add anything?

**Mr Carter:** Only to really summarise some of the comments that have been made –

**The President:** Yes, please.

685 **Mr Carter:** – which really is to say that the point of this amendment is simply to give you, as the convener of those Panels, that added flexibility and not to put you into a difficult position or even an impossible position which could then reflect on the reputation of the States of Alderney.

I fully support what Mr Kelly has said, in terms that those people who serve on panels of this nature are often ‘unthanked’ – and it is a thankless task, or can be – and I would thank those who do sit on those panels.

690 Lastly, I would see this as just very much a staging post to what will hopefully be a very different system that will be in place by, I hope, this time next year, where we will see a system that will give confidence to all in what it is actually trying to do.

Thank you. Please support this amendment.

695

**The President:** Thank you.

I did not hear any voices against, so I think we can say that this amendment will pass and that additional paragraph 12.5 will be added to the Code.

### **XI. Questions and Reports – Nine questions for verbal reply and no reports**

*Item XI.*

*The following questions have been received:*

*One question from Mr Gentle for the Alderney Representatives in the States of Deliberation:*

*(1) Could our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise any matters of importance to Alderney that may have been debated recently in the Guernsey States of Deliberation?*

*Five questions from Mr Snowden for the Chairman of Policy and Finance Committee:*

*(1) Does the Chairman have any updates about the future of Alderney Commission for Renewable Energy (ACRE) and what is happening with the obligations the regulator may need to perform?*

*(2) Will the Chairman give his view and opinion about how the recent runway drop-in was received by the public and P&F?*

*(3) Does the Chairman have any details he could share about the Alderney-Guernsey ferry service, including start and end dates?*

*(4) Could you explain what is happening with the accommodation available at the Nunnery?*

*(5) Would the Chairman like to outline the funding support from the States to the Ukraine appeal and his views about local fundraising from Alderney's community, such as the recent concert?*

*Three questions from Mr Snowden for the Chairman of the General Services Committee:*

*(1) Could the Chairman update members and the public about the current situation regarding our Ambulance service?*

*(2) Is the States likely to introduce dashcams in all States of Alderney drivable machinery and vehicles?*

*(3) Would the GSC Chairman be able to explain what happened to the Alderney Maritime Trust, which I believe safeguarded and protected wrecks in our waters?*

**The Greffier:** Thank you, Mr President.

700 Item XI, Questions and Reports. If we can deal with them in the order of submission: a question received by Mr Gentle to the Alderney Representatives on the States of Deliberation

**The President:** Before you start, Mr Gentle, can I just say I think we all know what the provisions of the Rules of Procedure say about this. The person who asks the question has the opportunity of asking a supplementary question. Any other Members can then ask a question and then the matter will be dealt with. So, if you do wish to ask a question, would you please make it very clear to me, rather than me having to continually ask people – and that will hopefully move the process forward much quicker.

Mr Gentle.

**Guernsey States of Deliberation –  
Update from the Alderney Representatives**

710

**Mr Gentle:** Thank you, sir, colleagues.

Could our two Alderney Representatives please briefly summarise any matters of importance to Alderney that may have been debated recently in the Guernsey States of Deliberation?

Thank you.

715

**The President:** Who would like to go first?

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, sir, please.

720

**The President:** Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** The meeting on 16th February was a very short meeting indeed. There was not a lot to do with Alderney.

725 There were some questions from Deputy Gollop and Deputy Queripel to the Employment & Social Security and the Policy & Resources Committees which did not really relate to Alderney at all, and then there was a raft of legislation following: the Electricity Law of Guernsey, which did not really involve the Alderney Reps, so we tried to keep out of it because Guernsey Electricity is not really our call to interfere with their particular ... and then the schedule.

730 The biggest thing of all on there was the Sexual Offences (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2020 and the Commencement Ordinance, 2022. There was an amendment from Deputy Meerveld and Deputy Dyke to change that, where the onus of the complainant, if there was alcohol involved, was changed, and Deputy Meerveld was against that change. That is the biggest change that is coming forward and it is going to change it in the end because that amendment actually failed and it was voted the other way. I am pleased to say that the Alderney Representatives voted the right way.

735

There was nothing else on there – it was a very quick meeting – and nothing outstanding. We are looking forward to the upcoming GST debate, of course, and also we are looking out for the runway. So two huge, massive debates coming up.

740 Relations with Guernsey: we met with Policy & Resources; we met with, I think, every Committee at some point in that day, because they all want to talk to you and you want to talk to them, obviously. We retain a good relationship. Relationships with Guernsey, in my view, have never been better and it is staying that way, and I think Alderney is really going the right way in Guernsey.

Thank you.

745 **The President:** Thank you, Mr Roberts.  
Mr Snowdon, what would you like to add?

**Mr Snowdon:** Just to add that one thing of interest coming up at the next States is establishing a Development Agency, which is something we may be able to dovetail into if that is passed. I am  
750 not sure if it will be, but if it is passed by the States and Policy & Resources are putting that forward, it may be worth us having those conversations to see if we can have some benefit out of that in exactly what they are doing.

I think it is really important to highlight the recent public drop-in – and, I think, special thanks to the Civil Service from Guernsey Ports for coming over and spending that time with us. That was  
755 a very good presentation of all the different options, and also the support given to Aurigny on the day as well. But I think it is worth just highlighting that the options will be presented to the States Trading Supervisory Board (STSB) and then they will make a recommendation, which obviously we do not have any knowledge of until they make that recommendation. That will go to Policy & Resources and if that recommendation is alternative to the current £12.2 million approved for the runway upgrade, then it will very likely have to go to the States of Deliberation for debate. That is just the process for that one, but I think sincere thanks to the Civil Service and Aurigny for spending that day with us in Alderney, which I think went down quite well.

The important one to those who are listening now, unless anything else has happened, and hopefully it has not happened: the tax presentation tonight should be going ahead, with the team  
765 coming by boat, fingers crossed, at seven o'clock. That is hopefully going ahead and I would encourage Islanders to go to that tax presentation, which will touch on different topics and also potentially GST, which ... I think the States of Alderney is currently against GST coming into the Island, but it is very important that the community goes and listens to members of Policy & Resources and Deputy Peter Roffey, so they understand the financial implications that the Bailiwick are currently in. So I just wanted to raise that one.

770 One final point is that, as Mr Gentle knows, we have got the DPA – Development and Planning Authority for the States of Guernsey – are hopefully coming to our next open planning meeting, so members of the public can say hello to them as well.

Thank you.

775 **The President:** DPA, Mr Snowdon?

**Mr Snowdon:** Development and Planning Authority for the States of Guernsey – our equivalent to the Building and Development Control Commission (BDCC). They are coming over to watch one  
780 of our open planning meetings, which I am sure will be interesting.

**The President:** Thank you.

**Mr Gentle:** Sir, I thank Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon for their answers.  
785 This is more of a rhetorical question, but I am sure Mr Roberts would agree that if we could swing Guernsey Electricity prices in Alderney we would be voting in favour down there.  
Thank you.

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.

**ACRE –  
Update and regulator obligations**

790 **The President:** I do not think there are any other questions, so now, Mr Snowdon, we move to you and your questions to Mr Carter in his role as Vice-Chair of the Policy and Finance Committee.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you to Mr Carter ... I think it was Mr Abel who unfortunately is not here today so thank you to Mr Carter who will be answering these.

795 The first question is: does the Chairman have any updates about the future of ACRE and what is happening with the obligations the regulator may need to perform?

Thank you, sir.

**The President:** Mr Carter.

800

**Mr Carter:** Thank you, Mr Snowdon.

Members will be aware of the current situation, but unfortunately it is a confidential matter, so no public update can be given at this time. However, once clarity has been established in a range of areas related to ACRE, I would seek to make a public statement.

805

**The President:** Thank you.

**Mr Snowdon:** Without putting Mr Carter on the spot, hopefully that will be in the near future – fingers crossed, depending what the Committees want to do, but hopefully something will happen in the near future because time is ticking a bit.

810

**The President:** Thank you.  
Mr Roberts.

815

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, please, sir.

I hope this does not compromise you in any way, Mr Carter, but can you tell the public how large the boat is and how do you see the service growing?

**Mr Carter:** Can you repeat the question? I did not hear it.

820

**Mr Roberts:** How large is the boat and how does he see the service –? *(Interjections)*

**The President:** I think that is a different question, Mr Roberts.

825

**Mr Roberts:** I do beg your pardon.

**The President:** All in good time.

**Mr Roberts:** I have got my sheets mixed up!

830

**The President:** It can happen. *(Interjections)*  
Anybody else want to talk about ACRE? No, okay.

**Runway drop-in –  
Whether well received**

**The President:** In that case, your second question, please, Mr Snowdon.

835 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

Please will the Chairman give his view and opinion about how the recent runway drop-in was received by the public and P&F?

Thank you, sir.

840 **The President:** Mr Carter.

**Mr Carter:** Thank you for that question, and really it is an opportunity for me to – as you did – thank the States of Guernsey for sending their team across to us and our own people for the organisation behind it; and likewise Aurigny and also for all States Members, some of whom were there for the entire eight hours or it seemed perhaps longer, on their feet, and managed to garner a great deal of information from the public in terms of their thoughts.

845 I think with the 300 people or so who came through, it gave them, in that format, a very good opportunity to have individual conversations with specialists and with experts in their field – so you had a pilot who was able to talk to the chief pilot from Aurigny, or you had a very experienced runway engineer he was able to talk to the engineer who was actually potentially in the plan. So I think the actual engagement was very good in terms of numbers. One would hope always that there would be more.

850 The only slight disappointment was perhaps after five o'clock in the evening, when one might have hoped for more people who had perhaps been at work in the day to have dropped in, but there was not the quantity coming through at that stage. But I think in terms of that engagement it was a very positive event for all concerned. Certainly the feedback from Aurigny, from ourselves as P&F and also from those Members of the Guernsey Ports Authority, they were very positive about the fact that they felt it was time extremely well spent from their perspective.

855 In terms of, I suppose, the straw poll-type feedback from those series of meetings, there seemed to be a lot of support for option C, which is the lengthening of the runway with potential changes to the terminal, but in terms of how we get to that point, that is in the hands of others. And as Mr Snowdon has pointed out in his report from the States of Guernsey, we have the STSB, we have P&R and finally the States of Guernsey who will be deciding those particular options for us. What we will do ... and again, through the good offices of Mr Roberts and Mr Snowdon and their lobbying in Guernsey, we will no doubt try to get as much support as we can for the option that is best for the Island and will future-proof it for the next however many years.

865 I hope that answers your question, Mr Snowdon.

**The President:** Thank you very much indeed, Mr Carter.

870

**Mr Snowdon:** Yes, thank you, sir.

Would Mr Carter agree that obviously the funding of the PSO potentially will not be in place at the end of the time of the PSO and that one plane at the moment is serving the Island, so therefore it is essential some new transport model is looked at for air links?

875

**Mr Carter:** Yes.

**The President:** Very succinct, Mr Carter, thank you.

Does anybody else have a question for Mr Carter? Ms Burgess.



880 **Ms Burgess:** I do apologise because it is going to be one of those questions that is ...  
Does Mr Carter agree that it was particularly successful for the Members coming over from Guernsey to go to our school, to include the younger generation, as we were talking a lot about future-proofing? And would you agree we were thankful for them taking that initiative?

885 **Mr Carter:** Yes, absolutely. Mr Le Ray, who took on years 10 and 11 at the school – and I think he came out of it upright and breathing, which is the key thing – he certainly enjoyed his engagement with those young people.

To give information to the younger elements within our community is very useful because I hope that they will say to their mums and dads, 'This is what I think we could be doing.' From that  
890 perspective, it was a very positive morning.

**The President:** Thank you – and no apology necessary, Ms Burgess.  
Mr Gentle.

895 **Mr Gentle:** Sir, am I allowed to make a statement, as opposed to a question?

**The President:** No, you are not. You will have to ask a question.

**A Member:** Would you agree ...?

900

**Mr Gentle:** Yes. *(Laughter)*

**The President:** Thank you, Mr Gentle.  
Anybody else?

905

**Mr Gentle:** Would you agree that the feedback received by P&F did not include myself as Chair of BDCC?  
Thank you.

910 **Mr Carter:** Yes, I would, because that obviously is a key point in terms of the potential Chair of the Building Development Committee; that means that there is no conflict. So yes, I would agree absolutely with that.

**Mr Gentle:** Thank you.

915

**The President:** Thank you. I think that is everybody.

**Alderney-Guernsey ferry service –  
Start and end dates**

**The President:** Now the ferry service, Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Thank you, sir.

920 Does the Chairman have any details he could share about the Alderney-Guernsey ferry service, including start and end dates?

Thank you, sir.

925 **Mr Carter:** The operation of that ferry service will be available between Guernsey and Alderney for 2022. The operator has been selected as a result of a competitive tendering process, which was undertaken by the Economic Development Committee. When that contract has been signed by both parties, the States of Alderney in conjunction with the successful operator will make an official announcement relating to the start and end dates, frequency of service, etc. So at this point I cannot answer directly the question you have asked I am afraid. I am sorry.

930 **Mr Roberts:** Thank you. Would Mr Carter agree that hopefully this is in the very near future again, because it is essential with the tourism season coming up that hopefully if there is a service in place everybody knows about it?

935 **Mr Carter:** Yes, I would. I think if I had my way I would be carrying the contract from place to place and making the person sign. But I am not.

**The President:** Thank you.  
Now you have a question, Mr Roberts.

940 **Mr Roberts:** Thank you, sir, I would just like to thank Mr Carter for his work on this actually. Could he tell me or tell the public how large is the boat and how does he see the service growing through this coming season?

945 **Mr Carter:** I think that is a bit political for me in terms of how it is growing because that is down to the operator. As to how big it is, probably about the length of this building I suppose, probably a bit shorter. (*Interjection*) I do not know, I am sorry, but I would guess it is about 12 metres.

950 **Mr Roberts:** I meant in carrying capacity, sir. I should have rephrased my question, I meant passengers.

**Mr Kelly:** A point of order, sir, if Mr Carter is able to answer that question – and I am not sure if he is or not – but if he is able to answer that question that might identify the boat concerned and therefore until the contract is signed perhaps he cannot answer that. It is a suggestion, sir.

955 **The President:** And a very sensible one. I think we all have to be very mindful of the confidentiality of agreements until such time as they have all been properly executed. So I think you have helped your colleague very well there, Mr Kelly.  
Thank you.

960 **Mr Kelly:** I aim to assist, sir.

**The President:** Are there any more ...? No, next question, please.

#### **The Nunnery – Accommodation**

965 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.  
Could you explain what is happening with the accommodation available at the Nunnery?

**Mr Carter:** Yes, the accommodation at the Roman fort heritage site, the Nunnery, is administered by the States of Alderney and then late last year the States of Alderney and the P&F

970 Committee decided to invite expressions of interest from parties in the Channel Islands and further afield with regard to leasing that property to generate income for the States, and to have a positive impact on the community of the Island.

This is being considered during 2022 and during the interim the accommodation is being used short term to house ambulance staff, who are key workers, visiting the Island on a rotating basis. It is expected that this period will be for around six months, after which the use of the accommodation will be again coming under consideration.

975 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

Just one supplementary question, if that is alright, regarding the options which you are taking forward. It is potentially being used for housing at the moment, will that be potentially one of the options that could be looked at, as well as other options? But that one is not off the table is it?

980 **Mr Carter:** I am afraid I am not in that group but I would urge that to be something that is considered. But I am not part of that group, I am afraid.

985 **The President:** Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Would the Deputy Chair not agree that the Nunnery could be ring-fenced for tourism and places for accommodation related to tourism? They are sorely needed in Alderney. Could those ideas not be then drawn from places like Whitegates and the old Connaught over and above and ring fence this for tourism? It is something that is really needed for the Island.

990 **Mr Carter:** I think I would leave it for the group who has actually got the expertise to make those decisions. So I do not think I could comment.

**The President:** No? Then your final question, Mr Snowdon, please.

#### Ukraine – Funding support from the States

995 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President.

Would the Chairman like to outline the funding support from the States of Alderney to the Ukraine appeal and his views about the local fundraising from Alderney's community, such as the recent concert?

1000 Thank you.

**Mr Carter:** Yes, I think obviously it does not make any sense what has happened in Ukraine and what Russia has done. And I think that is the added empathy that this Island has for the plight of refugees, given the Island's history, is one that members of the community do really appreciate. As a result of that sort of shared social history amongst many of the families on this Island, there is that direct experience of being wrenched from one's home and not knowing when you might return; hence this community I think shares perhaps both those inward facing feelings of outrage, horror, sadness and those range of emotions that we would not expect to see in 2022.

1005 The one emotion that perhaps has come through from the community is that of giving. Giving and support. I think in terms of responding to your question, the reaching out as far as it can to support those who are absolutely in dire need. In this respect I feel that Alderney punches well above its weight. It is giving to charity. It is giving to heartfelt causes and I think we have seen that in abundance over the last three weeks.

1015 Several organisations on the Island have held collections and events. I am aware the Rotary Club raised £1,500; a concert last Wednesday at St Anne's raised over five and a half thousand; Age Concern collecting practical necessities to be taken to the border of Ukraine for use. And there will be many other organisations and individuals who have done a tremendous amount of work, giving support, if it is just simply listening to someone on the end of a telephone, that will have happened in the last three weeks by members of this community.

1020 The Bailiwick donated half a million pounds of its reserve fund, and that does include ourselves through the fiscal arrangement, we contributed to that. The P&F Committee, we have voted that Alderney makes a contribution of £15,000, which is like a pro rata of that half million and that supports the President's Appeal.

1025 I think perhaps if you will indulge me, my thoughts about the last three weeks. I think there is a saying that there are decades where nothing happens, and there are weeks where decades happen, and perhaps that is what has happened these last three weeks. Thirty years since the Berlin Wall came down, a peaceful European continent where we disagreed but perhaps dealt with things with discussion and negotiation. On 24th February that stopped.

1030 I do not believe, I am afraid, that this war will be short lived. So giving now we may be still giving next year. Several people have approached me to say: are we in the same situation in terms of the UK as being able to offer, 'I have a room', 'I have a house I am willing to house people in.' I do not have an answer to that and I think we would need to talk to Guernsey, and no doubt Guernsey will need to keep in touch with the UK, as they represent us internationally.

1035 So in summary, Mr Snowdon, I think the Alderney community, as always, in a situation of this magnitude have responded outstandingly in the last three weeks; and I think through the States Appeal, the President's Appeal that that commitment for a more sustained giving and those longer-term needs will, I am afraid, be necessary and will be possible.

1040 Finally, perhaps I would say that the Deportees Service in May, that may perhaps have a memorial, a somewhat more poignant feeling given the number of Ukrainians who have worked and died here. Let's hope that we do not, at that stage, still have those pictures on our televisions that we are seeing today.

Thank you.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir. I thank Mr Carter for his very detailed answer and powerful speech.

1045 Just one supplementary question regarding Ukrainian refugees into peoples' homes, I believe this was discussed at the Bailiwick Council recently. Is there any indication if Guernsey will, hopefully, take people into peoples' homes who are willing to participate; and if Alderney will take part in that or not? Was there any outcome at the Bailiwick Council when that was, I believe, discussed a couple of weeks ago?

1050 Thank you.

**Mr Carter:** It certainly was discussed but with, at that stage, no resolution in any shape or form. It was a very open discussion but without any 'where are we going?' Mr Le Tocq, who was the Chair for that meeting, I am not aware that he went away tasked to do anything and I think that was two weeks ago now, so things have moved on. I think we will have to wait, but you may have more information, sir.

1060 **The President:** My understanding is that Guernsey is in discussions with the Home Office at the present time as to how it might be possible for us to be included in the scheme, whereby people who live here could offer their homes. I think that is obviously a complicated conversation and not one I suspect to which there will be an answer overnight.

But my sense is that if it is in accordance and in line with the law, as far as the Home Office is concerned, then hopefully that would also allow us to offer that same facility. I think we have all

1065 been contacted over the last few days and inundated with offers of accommodation. If we can respond to that then I am sure as a Bailiwick we will.

I say that because I was also with Mr Carter at that meeting so I hope that just clarifies the position. I think we will just hope that this happens quickly.

I think that is your questions to Mr Carter concluded.

### **The Alderney Ambulance Service – Update**

1070 **The President:** Now, I think it is for Mr Kelly.

**Mr Snowdon:** You are right, sir, thank you. Would you like me to start?

**The President:** Yes please.

1075 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you.

Could the Chairman update Members and the public about the current situation regarding our Ambulance service?

Thank you, sir.

1080 **Mr Kelly:** Thank you Mr Snowdon, Mr President, Mr Burke and colleagues.

The Civil Service continues to work closely with St John Ambulance Guernsey who are providing an excellent level of support and coverage. This has been achieved together with the unfailing dedication of our Chief Fire Officer, Mark Gaudion, and the ambulance volunteers.

1085 We have been working through a number of options to create a sustainable service in the long term and not all of those have been successful. In the short term, we will continue to be supported by a combination of external agencies and St John Guernsey. We have been in close communication with the Civil Service in Guernsey and the relevant Deputies to assist us as we go forward; and we are fortunate, sir, that we have Mr Snowdon, who is uniquely placed on the Health Committee, to assist us with seeking support and to join us in being responsible for  
1090 ensuring a fit-for-purpose service in the future.

**The President:** Thank you.

1095 **Mr Snowdon:** Nothing to add but to thank Mr Kelly for his answer.  
Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Roberts.

1100 **Mr Roberts:** Yes please, sir.

Can the Chairman please give an update on just how much per year the new system being envisaged will cost us? What has been the monetary cost since we changed the ambulance service over, and how much has Alderney lost?

1105 **Mr Kelly:** I do not call it a loss, sir. I do not call it a loss, Mr Roberts. I cannot tell you how much it is going to cost, it is like saying how long is a length of string? I say that not flippantly because at the moment we have been through a health authority on the mainland offering us an ambulance service, and that fell at the 11th hour, after the people had come over.

1110 We have been through St John mainland helping us, and that fell over at the 11th hour. We have been through an external agency to help us but that fell over at the 11th hour. It keeps myself and the civil servant dealing the matter, genuinely awake at night, because every plan we make, every plan that is made, falls at the 11th hour.

1115 The current costing is on the table, I cannot tell you how much it is going to cost because hopefully – in my personal view, not that of the General Services Committee but my personal view – is that St John Guernsey can actually run our ambulance service. It will be a cost of, I worked out roughly, just over 2p a day, per person. I will rephrase that – £2.64 per person, per week. *(Laughter)* Slightly different!

1120 I would rather pay £2.64 per person, per week than reverting back to a previous system we have had. That is in no way a criticism of the men and women who have served on the previous system because I had the honour of serving with them and I am very grateful for the service they have done. But since that system folded we have had two reports saying that we do not have a fit-for-purpose ambulance service. We are striving to get one.

So I cannot give you the cost because it is a length of string.  
Thank you, sir.

**States' vehicles –  
Introduction of dashcams**

1125 **The President:** Next question please, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

Is the States likely to introduce dashcams in all States of Alderney drivable machinery and vehicles?

1130 **Mr Kelly:** The simple answer: no, sir.

**Mr Snowdon:** A supplementary question if that is alright, sir?

1135 **The President:** Yes, please.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you to Mr Kelly for his answer, but I believe the General Services Committee were looking at it to take that forward. Maybe I have not got the latest minutes from the General Services Committee is probably the answer, but the last minutes show that was being taken forward.

1140 I would just like to ask Mr Kelly, obviously hopefully insurance would potentially be lower for our vehicles having that facility in place. Also we would be able to keep an eye on that equipment. We have got a lot of expensive equipment that we have bought for all the different services so in one way don't you think we have a duty of care to make sure that those vehicles are looked after the best they can be?

1145 Thank you.

**The President:** Mr Kelly.

1150 **Mr Kelly:** I am not sure which one to answer first, sir.

**The President:** Take your pick!

**Mr Kelly:** Okay, very good, sir, thank you.

1155 In relation to the General Service minutes, my apologies, they are out, although they are entitled March, although they should be entitled February. But the minutes *are* out and the minutes *will* show that we discussed the matter, both in relation to tracking vehicles, a vehicle tracking system, and dashcam cameras. The cost involved to have bullet-proof cameras to prevent unauthorised taking of vehicles, to stop them being removed, was extortionate. It was far more than the insurance premiums we would save.

1160 You can get a little one which is super-duper. But if I was a thief the first thing I would do is take out that camera and chuck it in the bin. To have one that beams back via the ether to a recording system would be extortionate. So, no, we are not looking at it. It was dismissed.

**The President:** Thank you.

### Alderney Maritime Trust – Update

1165 **The President:** And I think now, your final question, Mr Snowdon.

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir.

Would the Chairman of General Services be able to explain what is happening with the Alderney Maritime Trust, which I believe safeguarded and protected wrecks in our waters?

Thank you.

1170

**Mr Kelly:** A slightly long answer, Mr President, if I may, and one for which I know you have an interest in.

1175 On 2nd December a meeting of the trustees was held and chaired by the Trust Chairman, our Honourable President. There were five trustees present, one was present by phone and we had one apology, that is seven in total out of what should be nine trustees. The final item on the agenda was the future feasibility of the Trust. After a lengthy discussion, including a presentation by a former trustee, the trustees present unanimously agreed that the Trust would be wound up and the Chairman agreed to present a report to the General Services Committee.

1180 On 7th December you gave, sir, a verbal report to that Committee. It was advised that the Trust in its present form had run its course and a number of the requirements of the 2003 Trust deed had lapsed. The General Services Committee agreed with the decision of the trustees.

1185 On 24th January the Policy and Finance Committee were advised that the President, as Chair of the Alderney Maritime Trust, had made his presentation to GSC as a result of which Policy and Finance endorsed the trustees view that the Trust should be formally disbanded and the assets gifted back to the States.

1190 P&F endorsed the following resolutions from the December GSC meeting: for the President's office to advise the trustees; for any diving requests on the Elizabethan Wreck to be made to the Harbour Office going forwards; and for the Estates, Environment and Infrastructure Manager to investigate and confirm any inventory of artefacts in storage in liaison with the Alderney Society, which he has done.

1195 I am happy to report that a meeting has been recently held with the Trust's archaeological expert, who is also a trustee and who has been involved in the Trust for many years. It is now hoped that, within short order, a meeting on Island will be held with him and local stakeholders to discuss whether there is a realistic opportunity or prospect of further diving on the wreck. Obviously external funding would have to be sought. It would be helpful to bring together the different parties involved, past and present, and look at the future potential for any further dives.

1200 The funding climate, as you will appreciate, is very difficult at the moment, which might provide a insuperable barrier but given the importance of the artefacts to the Island it is a step worth considering. I assure Members and the public that the GSC will protect the Elizabethan Wreck, and in fact any others that have yet to be discovered. I would like to thank all of those involved to date: the divers, the trustees, the trustee co-ordinator and volunteer helpers.

Thank you, sir.

1205 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, sir, a supplementary question. Thank you to Mr Kelly for answering that initial question.

1210 The Elizabethan Wreck is meant to be the same standard as the Mary Rose, in our waters. It had a website, it had the whole Trust, it is all set up, ready to go. It has done really well over the last few years. It has actually raised external money from universities and everywhere else. To move that back to the States of Alderney and disband the Trust without any other takeover for that Trust and the work that was being done, I am just very concerned about this matter. I feel that we are basically putting it in the bin; and then we have got to try and find the funding to restart it.

1215 We had something that was actually fit for purpose, that was running, that was operating, which was looking after that wreck – and other wrecks in our waters – and now we are actually putting it back to the States of Alderney. Would you agree that this is a concerning matter and we should sort this out pronto and actually look at re-establishing the Trust somehow in the future?

1220 **Mr Kelly:** The Trust was not fit for purpose, to be frank. It had stopped being fit for purpose, for various reasons. From the minutes I have gone through, the money required to raise anything else from the wreck, such as the keel, is in terms of hundreds of thousands of pounds. That is a serious amount of money for charities or for universities to try and fund, and one that we cannot fund.

1225 Nature has protected the wreck at the bottom of the sea. We are protecting ... Any divers going down there have to go through us, and once they have been approved to go down to the wreck, any artefacts recovered will revert to the States of Alderney; and the Alderney Society are taking it on board.

1230 I agree it is of concern that we have a historical wreck out there, and if I had a few hundred thousand pounds in my pocket ... No, I wouldn't! If I had a few hundred thousand pounds *spare* in my pocket I might spend it on bringing up the keel but as I have not, and I am afraid the States of Alderney have not, and it would appear that universities do not have it at the moment, then unfortunately all we can do is make sure that no salvage divers go down and steal our artefacts.

I hope that answers your question.

1235 **The President:** Mr Roberts.

**Mr Roberts:** Yes, thank you, Mr Kelly, for that precise answer.

Could he tell me where the artefacts are at the moment and who is looking after them and protecting them – the artefacts that have already been discovered?

Thank you.

1240 **Mr Kelly:** The artefacts that we have on Island are being preserved by the Alderney Society at the moment. The trustees did have a shed/store in the harbour that unfortunately they no longer have, it was given over to another body. Fortunately all the artefacts that were in there and all the property that was in there has been listed by the States – I can never remember his title – the States Works Manager, and those artefacts have been taken to the Museum.



As I said earlier in my speech, one of the things we are trying to do is get all the interested parties on the Island back together because there has been, shall we say, a difference of opinion, which some of us are trying to smooth out.

1250 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Mr McKinley? No.

Perhaps I might be permitted for just simply confirming what Mr Kelly has said. I have agreed to keep in touch with our archaeological trustee. I have spoken to him recently. At the moment I am putting a meeting together in May where we will have everybody who is concerned, and  
1255 what we will be looking at principally is whether there is a realistic prospect of being able to dive on the wreck again, and if so, how that might be funded and what sort of trust would we need to do that. So it is really just a question of updating the trust, but everybody is still very conscious and we are mindful of the importance of it and we will do everything we can to maintain that.

If that helps, Mr Snowdon?

1260

**Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, President, yes; and thank you, Mr Kelly.

**Mr Kelly:** I am grateful, sir, thank you.

1265 **The President:** I think unless there is any further business to conduct that concludes today. If you would like to close the meeting please.

**PRAYERS**

*The Greffier*

*The Assembly adjourned at 4 p.m.*