



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF THE

ISLAND OF ALDERNEY

HANSARD

The Court House, Alderney, Wednesday, 18th May 2022

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Alderney website www.alderney.gov.gg*

Volume 10, No. 4

Present:

Mr William Tate, President

Members

Mr Bill Abel
Ms Annie Burgess
Mr Ian Carter
Mr Kevin Gentle
Mr Christian Harris
Mr Rhys Jenkins
Mr Boyd Kelly
Mr Graham McKinley OBE
Mr Alexander Snowdon

The Greffier of the Court

Mr David Knight

Business transacted

Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting held on 11th May 2022	3
Billet d'État for Wednesday, 18th May 2022	3
I. The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2022 – Approved	3
II. Sale of States Assets – Approved.....	4
III. Amendment to the Committee Rules of Procedure – Open Meetings – Approved	7
IV. Amendment to the Code of Conduct for States Members – Approved.....	13
V. Questions and Reports – One Report and Four Questions	14
Report by ORE Catapult Development Services Ltd – Sources of power supply for the Island	14
Primary Care – Update	20
AEL subsidy support – move towards renewable energy.....	20
Encouraging the public to stand for public office – Plans for the November elections.....	21
Guernsey States of Deliberation – Update from the Alderney Representatives	23
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.12 p.m.</i>	26

States of Alderney

The States met at 2.30 p.m. in the presence of Mr Roy Burke, a representative of His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor of the Bailiwick of Guernsey

[THE PRESIDENT *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Greffier

ROLL CALL

The Greffier

Convenor's Report of the People's Meeting held on 11th May 2022

The President: May we start with the report on the people attending the People's Meeting. Ms Burgess, you were the Convenor.

5 **Ms Burgess:** Yes, thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

Obviously myself, the Convenor, assisted by the Treasurer. States Members were eight, the President, Mr Tate, gave his apologies, minutes secretary, public were 13, press was two and also Mr Roberts gave his apologies.

10 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.

Billet d'État for Wednesday, 18th May 2022

I. The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2022 – Approved

Item I.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve "The Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2022"

The President: Item I, Mr Greffier, please.

15 **The Greffier:** Item I, Mr President, is the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021
(Commencement) Ordinance, 2022. The States of Alderney is asked to approve the Gambling
(Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021 (Commencement) Ordinance, 2022.
Proposed by Mr Kelly, seconded by Mr Harris.

20 **The President:** And there were no comments on this Item?

Ms Burgess: No comments, thank you.

25 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
Mr Kelly.

Mr Kelly: Thank you, sir, Mr President, Members.

I will not read out verbatim the letter that has been published in the Billet concerning this
Commencement Ordinance. I will, however, remind Members that on 17th November last year
we approved amendments to the Gambling (Alderney) (Amendment) Law, 2021, which were
30 imposing tougher penalties for offences under that legislation.

Members will be equally aware that any change in law requires the approval of the Privy
Council; because of this no commencement date was added. This commencement date has to be
established by Ordinance, hence the matter before you today for that date to commence
tomorrow.

35 I therefore ask Members approve this Ordinance.

The President: Thank you very much indeed. Anything to add, Mr Harris?

40 **Mr Harris:** Thank you, sir, fellow Members. Nothing to add to Mr Kelly's summary.
Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody else wish to make any observations about this Item? That being the case, that
will be approved.

II. Sale of States Assets – Approved

Item II.

*The States of Alderney is asked to approve the sale of the Old Slaughterhouse at La Corvee
through a sealed bid process, on the basis that a sale would only be agreed if best value could
be justified.*

45 **The President:** Item II please, Mr Greffier.

The Greffier: Thank you.

The Sale of States Assets. The States of Alderney is asked to approve the sale of the Old
Slaughterhouse at La Corvee through a sealed bid process, on the basis that a sale would only be
50 agreed if best value could be justified.

Proposed by Mr Abel, seconded by Mr Kelly.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Ms Burgess, the People's Meeting.

55

Ms Burgess: Thank you, Mr President and fellow States Members.

60

The following points were made: 'There is nothing included in the Billet to show the location of the Old Slaughterhouse, the Land Registry information should have been included.' 'Is there any issue with access to the building?' 'Could the States please check the Land Registry and clarify whether the Old Slaughterhouse is zoned for agriculture/farming or industrial?' 'Is the purpose of selling States assets to raise capital and if so where will the money go?' 'Why is this Item only concerned with the Old Slaughterhouse when there are other assets which also need to be dealt with?' 'Does the States know what the building is worth and expected to raise?'

65

The following comments were then made by the Convenor, Chairman of the General Services Committee and other States Members: it was agreed that the Land Registry information should have been included in the Billet; the Old Slaughterhouse is a building within a building and as such access is via private land; if the decision is made to sell the Old Slaughterhouse then an advertisement regarding the sealed tender process will clarify and provide all relevant information; the plan is to deal with the sale of other States assets in due course; the States has had a valuation of the Old Slaughterhouse but this will not be made public as it would affect the sealed tender process.

70

Thank you.

75

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Abel.

Mr Abel: Thank you, Mr President and colleagues.

80

With regard to the law, every sale of States assets must be approved by the States unless and until a resolution of the States provides otherwise.

The Policy and Finance Committee, at its meeting on 28th March 2022, considered the recommendations and the report submitted by Mr Boyd Kelly, Chairman of the General Services Committee.

85

The report detailed a number of very visible properties standing empty and at risk of deteriorating further. The General Services Committee recommended the sale of these properties, which were considered as being of no practical use to the States or requiring major capital outlay, and that the money gained from the sales of the properties should be invested in replacement, fit-for-purpose housing stock, such as sheltered, social and essential worker houses.

90

The Policy and Finance Committee resolved after considering all the properties highlighted in the report, to recommend to the States of Alderney a sealed bid process for the sale of the Old Slaughterhouse at La Corvee, on the basis of agreeing a sale only if best value can be justified.

Mr President and colleagues, I ask that the States of Alderney approve the sale of the Old Slaughterhouse at La Corvee through a sealed bid process, on the basis that a sale would only be agreed if the best value can be justified.

95

Thank you, sir.

The President: Thank you, Mr Abel.

Anything to add, Mr Kelly?

100

Mr Kelly: No, I have the pleasure of seconding, sir, but reserve my comments until after this debate.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody else want to comment on this Item? Mr Snowdon.

105 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President, yes, just a little bit on this Item, if that is okay.

I have had contact a while ago from interested parties and I have actually made sure that it was okay to mention today. My understanding was – and I would like some clarification about this – the Slaughterhouse was part of Mr Main’s estate where they have the whole yard and at the time the States of Alderney was struggling to achieve a slaughterhouse and I believe the land –
110 actually we have the title deeds here – was sold from Mr Main to the States of Alderney. And apparently there was an agreement if the States of Alderney did not need the Slaughterhouse anymore it would be offered back at market value, first refusal to that Main family.

I just wanted clarification; are we still honouring that agreement? Is that agreement in place? And what is the situation with that agreement? Because I think if that was the situation, when it
115 was agreed back in 1996, I would like clarification if that agreement is still in place.

I do support this going out for sealed tender, but I would just like the reassurances whether that agreement is in place or not in place because obviously if that agreement is in place it should be offered to that person that initially sold that with the condition to the States of Alderney.

Thank you.

120

The President: Thank you.

Does anybody else wish to speak on this Item? Mr Gentle.

Mr Gentle: Thank you, sir, colleagues.

125 Very briefly, paragraph four of the letter in front of us says, ‘of no practical use to the States’.

Thank you.

The President: Any further observations? Mr Kelly.

130 **Mr Kelly:** If I may, sir, thank you.

Mr President, colleagues, may I first of all commence by apologising to colleagues and those members of the public who read the Item because in addition to naming the room I should have recorded the Land Registry number, AY2011. My excuse is because the potential sale has been discussed along with other assets so often that I regretfully made a presumption of assuming
135 knowledge, and for that I apologise. I deliberately called it a ‘room’ rather than a building because that is exactly what it is: it is an end room of a building, owned by a local company, who sold it to the States in 1996, and I will come on to my colleague’s comments shortly.

It has no parking space, although access to it is allowed with a condition, or one of the conditions being that in the event of the roadways being soiled by cattle travelling to the premises
140 the roadway has been cleared as soon as reasonably practicable.

Members will be aware that this is one of three lots of property that I and my Committee have been trying to sell. Not, and I emphasise *not* to reduce the property stock we hold, but to gain capital to increase the housing stock, as Mr Abel correctly mentioned, in the areas most needed. That is sheltered housing, housing for essential workers and assisting those not able to pay the
145 ever increasing property costs in Alderney.

All of these properties, along with AY2011, have been unoccupied for far too long, in one case 18 years. Colleagues, this room has been empty for a number of years. As Mr Gentle says, there is no practical use for it, but it may be of use to others as a store or to add to the property adjoining it.

150 Going on to the history, yes, I am aware that an agreement, or I have been told there was an agreement made in 1996, by the current owner of the property to sell it to the States and that a senior Member of the States and the owner of the property have an agreement that when the States finished with it it would be sold back to the owner of the property at the price that the States paid for it. That was in 1996. We are aware – I am not going to mention it in public, sir, that
155 would be wrong, for lots of reasons – of the price that was paid. The General Services Committee

has discussed it, has sought advice from our strategic financial advisor and we were advised to work out the price paid plus interest, if you like. Negotiations took place between a chief executive, a temporary chief executive, and an assistant temporary chief executive with the owner of the property but unfortunately no agreement was made. It would still have had to come to the States anyway, sir, because we are selling the property.

I hope that the family of the previous owner of the property will want to negotiate with us and put a sealed tender in like everybody else because it is part of their building, to be frank.

I have nothing further to add, sir.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Does anybody else wish to speak? You do not wish to exercise your right of reply, Mr Abel?

Mr Abel: No, thank you, sir.

I think Mr Kelly has covered the issues well, thank you.

170

The President: Thank you very much indeed. I think I can assume, unless I am told differently, that this has the approval of all the Members? Yes, thank you very much indeed.

III. Amendment to the Committee Rules of Procedure – Open Meetings – Approved

Item III.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve:

(a) the amended section 6 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to the preparation of agendas for Part A (open) meetings and Part B (closed) Committee meetings;

(b) amendment to section 9 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to named voting and clarity around which Committee the Rules of Procedure for States Committees are applied to;

(c) the amended section 17 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees relating to members of the public being permitted to attend and observe open meetings of States Committees;

(d) section 23 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to a Committee convening a subcommittee or working party for any matter which falls within the mandate of the Committee and the rules and procedures to be followed;

(e) the Emergency Procedures under the provision of Section 55A of the Government of Alderney Law, 2004 in relation to remote meetings; and

(f) the Rules of Procedure for States Committees - Part B Protocol.

The President: Then please, Item III.

175

The Greffier: Item III, Mr President, is the amendment to the Committee Rules of Procedure – Open Meetings. The States of Alderney is asked to approve: (a) the amended section 6 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to the preparation of agendas for Part A (open) meetings and Part B (closed) Committee meetings; (b) amendment to section 9 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to named voting and clarity around which Committee the Rules of Procedure for States Committees are applied to; (c) the amended section 17 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees relating to members of the public being permitted to attend and observe open meetings of States Committees; (d) section 23 of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees in relation to a Committee convening a subcommittee or working party for any matter which falls within the mandate of the Committee and the rules and procedures to be followed; (e) the Emergency Procedures under the provision of Section 55A of the Government of Alderney Law, 2004 in relation to remote meetings; and (f) the Rules of Procedure for States Committees – Part B Protocol.

185

This is proposed by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Gentle.

190

The President: Ms Burgess, the People's Meeting.

Ms Burgess: Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

195 Sir, the following points were made: 'Why will parts of the meeting still be closed to the public?'
'The public vote States Members in and yet cannot hear all of the debate.'

200 The Convenor and other States Members commented as follows: some items cannot be discussed publically because of commercially sensitive information and data protection issues which must be considered. Sharing some information could unfairly affect the outcome of any decision to be made; the sections that will be closed to the public will be the exception rather than the rule.

Thank you.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Mr Carter.

205

Mr Carter: Thank you, Mr President, colleagues.

210 This is a technical set of proposals to the Committee Rules of Procedure to allow full Committee meetings of the States, specifically P&F and GSC, to take place in public, as this States Meeting does and the Building and Development Committee does as well. This will allow them a six-month trial to be put in place.

215 Effectively there are two key areas: firstly, it allows for the public to attend those meetings to see the mechanics of Government taking place which plan and develop policy and practice of Government, which is in line with the Island Plan's objectives under governance, specifically to put in place a mechanism to maximise public scrutiny of States of Alderney Committee decision making whilst ensuring appropriate levels of confidentiality are maintained for commercial and personnel sensitive issues.

220 The second aspect is that of explicitly stating that votes taken should be named votes unless the Committee decide by voting that it should not be a named vote, hence the public can see, through Committee minutes, if there is a split vote on an issue who has voted in favour, who has voted against and who has abstained.

225 A consequence of this proposal is that the agenda for a meeting does have to be split into two, A and B, as there are areas of commercial sensitivity and personnel sensitivity which would not be appropriate to be brought into the public domain. For example, the commercial tendering or procurement exercises that go on from time to time regarding States services for the public. The rationale for putting an item into the confidential part of the meeting is exactly as it is currently, where confidential items do not have their minutes in the public domain. And it should be emphasised the placing of any item on to the part B or confidential area is the exception rather than the rule.

230 Agenda setting continues in exactly the same way, with the Chair or Deputy and Deputy in conjunction with advice from the civil servant in setting the agenda. Public attendance will follow the same guidelines as we currently have in this Chamber and in BDCC meetings, where it is attendance to watch and not participate in the meeting and good order and decorum is maintained and expected by the President in this forum and the chairs of the Committee.

235 Some will say that by moving to public meetings of this nature Members cannot express themselves fully. I would contend there is nothing I would say in a closed Committee meeting that I would not be happy for any member of the public to hear.

Some others tell me that this will give a soap box, as near elections people will start electioneering and hence not lead to good decision making. I think we have a very informed and intelligent electorate and press who would see this for what it is and the electorate would make

240 their decisions appropriately, based on what they know about those standing and whether they
have delivered on their manifestoes. They would not be making judgements on a speech heard in
a Committee.

Likewise there is perhaps potential for private meetings to take place outside of the Committee
meetings. This can happen now. Maybe I am naïve, I just do not have time for even more meetings,
245 but I cannot give any assurance that that would not happen.

Other concerns have been expressed to me of what would be the dress code. I would hope
that members of the public would understand, especially for those of who are still working, there
may not necessarily be time to put a tie on but that working clothes are quite acceptable. What
you want, as the public, is people to make good decisions made on their particular judgements.
250 The physical arrangements for those meetings are being worked on by the Civil Service and it is
fair to say at the moment we do not have a feel for attendance or what that would be like.

Today, here at a full States Meeting, we have eight members of the public. Who knows? It
could become the show in town, we might have 50, we might have a hundred, we might have
none. We will see. And that is why it is a six-month assessment to see what we need to do, hence
255 we are gauging from experience what will be required. After those six months meetings, which
will start in June, we will then seek feedback from our Members, from the Civil Service and from
the public as to how we want to proceed.

Named voting is an area that has not been explicitly stated before in our Rules of Procedure
but is common in many jurisdictions. It allows the public to see what their representatives actually
260 think when making a decision, or indeed if they do not make a decision by abstaining. So it leads
to a greater degree of transparency for the general public to see where those elected make their
decisions, and once again supports the Island Plan.

So in conclusion, through my own experience of this approach in English local government over
10 years ago, it did not scar me as a person, although some of you may think it has. I think you are
265 a resilient lot, I think you are capable of doing this and I do not think it ever influenced the way I
expressed myself in those committee meetings nor the decisions made. The public gallery soon
merges into the background and that shared desire to make good decisions in the public service,
for the public good, is what actually is the important aspect of the meeting.

There will be, no doubt, as we try this new system, times where things may go slightly awry,
270 there will be times of reflection, but I feel that by bringing this step forward and so making sure
that the same mechanism is used as BDCC and full States that is a step forward for the public
benefit and likewise by formally recording votes by Members by name.

Hence I would ask you to support this move towards greater transparency of decision making
and local democracy and support the six-month trial which reflects on an aspect of the Island Plan,
275 as stated before. We have a plan. The public have been consulted and we now need to deliver on
that plan.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Carter, I think as far as the mathematics of the attendance are concerned,
280 we have probably got four members of the public present.

Mr Carter: I am more sort of generalist. One, two, three, four, five, six, seven. One left. And if
we are talking about ... they are the public.

285 **The President:** Yes, they are. *(Laughter)* But it should be accurate for the purposes of the
record. The President's wife attends to support the President but there are, as far as I can see,
four members of our community who have chosen to come and be part of the meeting this
afternoon and one – and I am sure it was not disrespectfully – left during your address.

290 **Mr Carter:** I will bow to your better knowledge of who the public are than I have, but we will agree to differ.

The President: Mr Gentle, you are going to second this.

295 **Mr Gentle:** I am, sir, and I would like to reserve my right to speak.
Thank you.

The President: Ms Burgess.

300 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

I have not really got any more to add, and thank you to Mr Carter for his comments. I am literally standing up because I want to support it and I welcome this.

305 I think, having feedback for the last few years that I have been in the States of Alderney I have noticed that, even though we do publish our minutes, there is quite a gap between understanding the process of debate and how a decision is made to reading it neatly and concisely put into minutes. So I think if you have particular concerns on a subject for the day, attend, listen to the debate, understand it fully. I think that is something I really welcome. I do applaud the fact that we are saying it out loud that the sections that will not be open to the public will be the exception rather than the rule, which I again agree.

310 But I really have nothing much to add except to say that I fully support this because I would like to see more debate, I would like to see the public understanding more of the process and sometimes the difficulties in making a decision. I also welcome having our names attached to our vote. I am very proud to be standing here supporting our Island and I am also very proud to put my name to a decision that I am doing that I believe is in the best interests of the Island I love.

315 Thank you.

The President: Mr Harris.

Mr Harris: Thank you, sir, fellow Members.

320 Firstly, I want to thank Mr Carter for his excellent words. If I was not convinced beforehand I would be after that, so thank you, Mr Carter.

325 It has always been a hope of mine that we would bring the public along on the ride with us as the local Government because, perhaps not in this room, but outside of this room we are still members of the public as well. So we are all in it together. I think this is great; I think we need more openness and transparency, we need more involvement from our community to see how the process works. And with potentially the vain hope that some of them might want to get involved a little bit more when it comes to election time. It is good to open the doors to the public and let them see what is happening within our organisation so I am very grateful.

Thank you.

330

The President: Thank you, Mr Harris.
Mr Kelly.

Mr Kelly: Thank you, sir, colleagues.

335 I am now in my sixth year as an Alderney States Member and over those years a few things have remained constant: a lack of knowledge by some people on the Machinery of Government and what we actually discuss; the fluctuating quality of speeches and unfortunately preparation by the occasional Member; and the time taken to inform the people we serve of what was discussed during the Committee meetings.

340 I strongly support the proposal and resolution and thank Mr Carter for raising it as hopefully these issues will in some ways assist to inform, sharpen the pencils of Members, and allow the people of Alderney to hear what their elected Members discuss, although I understand at times it may be a cure for insomnia.

345 As Mr Carter stated, confidential matters are not suitable for open debate and this is not a way of hiding matters but of protecting personal and commercial information as we do at the moment with confidential annexures. Again, Mr Carter highlighted that it will not be easy, mistakes will be made, as they are at present, but I honestly and fervently believe, and we are all apparently an open government, this pilot scheme must be trialled and I would ask Members to support.

350 Thank you, sir.

The President: Thank you, Mr Kelly.
Mr Snowdon.

355 **Mr Snowdon:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow colleagues.

Firstly, I just want to say thank you to Mr Carter for bringing this to the table, and I will be supporting it today. However, I just want to touch on a couple of issues.

360 We did seem to have concerns with the Law Officers in Guernsey about opening it up so I think it is relevant that we do touch on that. I think there were concerns that if we get members of the public and media in the room, they may be using social media to tweet or put on Facebook, as conversations are going and resolutions are going, it was actually making sure that what they may be uploading on to media outlets is actually correct with what is happening at the meeting and the outcomes of the meeting as well.

365 One thing I do also want to touch upon is that – and I think Mr Carter has hopefully touched upon it quite well because we do seem to be choc-a-block with meetings the whole time at the moment for some reason. But anyway, what I do not want to see, and I am sure it will not happen, but with a future States or something or we may get this situation where you have items that come on the P&F agenda or the GSC agenda and then suddenly there are these conversations at someone's house or with some people down at a special room where that conversation is not actually happening in that committee meeting. I do not really know how you can stop it happening because obviously it is going to happen with some important things that Members feel they want to lobby on in particular. But I think we just need to make sure that that debate actually tries to happen in that committee meeting as much as possible.

370 I think there was also – and hopefully I will be corrected in the summing up from Mr Carter – a touch from Guernsey being a bit concerned that we may be debating or highlighting issues that they have on their agendas which are obviously coming to us for endorsement or comment but technically those are confidential until they decide maybe to take a Policy Letter to the States of Deliberation if required. So it is basically how we are making sure that we were not breaching anything with that situation. I would just like clarification we have got the legal privilege for these
375 Committee meetings so we would be able to say whatever we want within reason.

380 Also the data protection stuff, which seems to be now the big thing, for data protection there seem to be breaches practically for anything in my view, it is just making sure that we are okay with the data protection side of stuff.

385 But I would actually really like to make the point that we should be putting a lot more into this Chamber from those Committees. We should be debating in *this* Chamber, this is actually the States of Alderney where the business should be endorsed and approved in public as we do, and although I welcome this and I think it is a good move, I do actually think that I would not want to weaken this Chamber down. I think we do need to try and ensure that we get more into this official Chamber from that Committee business.

390 So I do support this and one way to get more members of the public and the community engaged may be to go the whole hog and put it on YouTube as well, see what happens.
Thank you.

The President: Mr McKinley.

395 **Mr McKinley:** Surprise, surprise.
A very quick question. I fully support the idea of open meetings but where are they going to be held? There is not going to be much room in the Anne French Room, particularly for a P&F meeting. Should it be held here or in the Island Hall? If we have a good attendance we will not fit
400 them in the Anne French Room.
Thank you, sir.

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

405 **Mr McKinley:** I am done now.

The President: Thank you.
Mr Gentle.

410 **Mr Gentle:** Thank you, sir, colleagues.
I am delighted to second this ... It is the individual who actually pushed for named voting, I am particularly pleased to see that in there. And I think, as Mr Harris said, we own our votes. If you are going to vote one way be prepared to put your hand up and say, 'I voted that way, I might have been wrong but at least I voted.'

415 All I can ask is please support this. Let's show the people out there how it works.
Thank you very much.

The President: Mr Carter, you have a right to respond.

420 **Mr Carter:** Thank you very much.
Thank you, colleagues, for the supportive comments here. With regard to some of those issues of practicalities, yes, Mr McKinley, the Civil Service are trying to work out how we best do stage the said meeting. And that, as I said, we do not know whether it is going to be two men and a dog turning up nor, as I say, the entire Island. And I am sure, depending on the topic or agenda item,
425 that ebb and flow of numbers will be something that we would have to manage and it is something that will be difficult.

With regard to social media I think that is something once again that in terms of this meeting or BDCC meetings there is guidance, the guidance that we have should be common across all meetings. And the agenda setting process will take into account those issues whereby in effect a
430 decision made here could be potentially before a decision made in Guernsey so that is something that they would be looking for from the advice being given and it is something that is quite agreed. As regard to filming it, let's take a step of just opening the door to start with. You can stick a camera in the door perhaps later.

435 So from that perspective I hope I have perhaps reassured you on some of the issues. It will be a challenge, ladies and gentlemen, and as I have said, I have no doubt we will make the odd error to start with, but if for six months we actually learn and we develop I hope this is something that we can adopt throughout and continue with, so please support this.

Thank you.

440 **The President:** Thank you.

Well, I have not heard a dissenting voice so can I assume that everybody fully supports this proposal? Thank you.

**IV. Amendment to the Code of Conduct for States Members –
Approved**

Item IV.

The States of Alderney is asked to approve the amendment to section 6.2 of the Code of Conduct for States Members to read “Members must not disclose confidential information received in undertaking their public duties to anyone else and must abide by such practices as are agreed from time to time by the States or its Committees to maintain confidentiality, including (but not limited to) the provisions of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees relating to items on Part B (closed) of agendas of meetings of the Policy and Finance Committee and the General Services Committee.”

The President: Item IV, please.

445 **The Greffier:** Item IV, Mr President, is the amendment to the Code of Conduct for States
Members. The States of Alderney is asked to approve the amendment to section 6.2 of the Code
of Conduct for States Members to read, ‘Members must not disclose confidential information
received in undertaking their public duties to anyone else and must abide by such practices as are
450 agreed from time to time by the States or its Committees to maintain confidentiality, including,
but not limited to, the provisions of the Rules of Procedure for States Committees relating to items
on Part B, closed, of agendas of meetings of the Policy and Finance Committee and the General
Services Committee.’

This is proposed by Mr Carter and seconded by Mr Gentle.

455 **The President:** And there were no comments at the People’s Meeting, Ms Burgess?

Ms Burgess: No, sir.

The President: Thank you.

460 Mr Carter.

Mr Carter: Thank you, Mr President.

This is what one might call a ‘consequential effect’ of passing the previous piece of legislation
or the previous recommendation. Effectively it ensures that those meetings which have Part A
465 and Part B as now defined, that the Code of Conduct applies within those meetings. So it is an
entirely consequential addition to the Code of Conduct to ensure that the Code of Conduct applies
in those new Rules of Procedure.

I do not think I can say anything further about that other than you agreed the first part, I would
be challenged if you do not agree the second part.

470 Thank you.

The President: Anything to add, Mr Gentle?

Mr Gentle: Sir, no, there is nothing at all I can add to Mr Carter’s statement.

475

The President: Thank you very much indeed.

Would anybody like to speak to this Item? It sounds as if you are not going to be challenged.

480 **Mr Carter:** That is a relief, as I am not sure what I was going to say.
Thank you.

The President: Well, I think I can say it will be approved.
Thank you.

V. Questions and Reports – One Report and Four Questions

Item V.

The following Report was summarised by Mr Abel: Progress on the ORE Catapult Development Services Ltd study to assess a hybrid mix of options for the Island's short-, medium-, and longer-term sources of power supply.

Three questions from Mr Snowden for the Chairman of Policy & Finance Committee:

- (1) Would the Chairman be able to provide any updates regarding Primary Care?*
- (2) Please could the Chairman outline the situation around AEL subsidy support and the need for the island to move towards renewable energy?*
- (3) Do the States have any plans about how to encourage members of the public to stand for public office in the forthcoming November elections?*

One question from Mr Gentle for the two representatives on the States of Deliberation:

- (1) Could our two Alderney Representatives briefly summarise any matters of importance to Alderney that may have been debated recently in the Guernsey States of Deliberation and any Guernsey matters that may concern Alderney?*

Report by ORE Catapult Development Services Ltd – Sources of power supply for the Island

485 **The President:** Item V.

The Greffier: Item V, Mr President, is Questions and Reports, first we have a question from Mr Snowden to the Chairman of the Policy and Finance Committee.

490 **Ms Burgess:** Apologies, can I just also state that at the People's Meeting they had not been registered as yet so there were no Questions and Reports received to inform to the public.
Thank you.

495 **The President:** Thank you very much indeed.
I am just wondering, Mr Greffier, whether it might be appropriate for Mr Abel to deal with his Report before we deal with the Questions? (*Interjections*)

The Greffier: I think for expediency it would be appropriate, Mr President, yes.

500 **The President:** Yes, it has been very helpfully reproduced for us and I think, Mr Abel, it is probably appropriate if you present your Report before we move to Questions, if Mr Snowdon and Mr Gentle are happy with that?

Mr Snowdon: More than happy, sir.

505

The President: Thank you very much indeed.
So it is a Report which you wish to present to the States.

Mr Abel: That is correct, sir, thank you.

510

Mr President, colleagues, I had hoped to actually have air time on this as well but unfortunately I am told that the air time has gone tech at this particular time, if I can use those words. But, Mr President, I would like to summarise the Report because it is quite extensive, and cover the major points if I may, sir.

515

The Report is entitled, 'Progress on the ORE Catapult Development Services Ltd study to assess a hybrid mix of options for the Island's short-, medium-, and longer-term sources of power supply.' The purpose of this Report is to inform the States of progress on delivering the energy goals of the Island Plan and in particular the preliminary conclusions and options of the recently commissioned study. This first Report to the States is to initiate dialogue both within the States and with the community on energy supply options and the possible impacts of proven renewable technologies and possible trade-offs of these impacts on the cost of energy and the sustainability of the Island's economy.

520

The mandate of the Policy and Finance Committee's Energy Group is based on the energy goals set out in the Island Plan, which are: to reduce energy costs for individuals and organisations; to increase the amount of clean energy used, in other words, reducing the carbon footprint.

525

The priorities and initiatives of these goals are: the development of a strategy and projects to develop the use of tidal and solar energy resources with associated storage technologies to reduce the Island's dependence on fossil fuels; develop a strategy and practical ability to encourage and allow the use of green energy by households; in the light of the energy strategy developed for the Island how AEL through its activity can align to allow renewable domestic energy sources to input into the grid to reduce costs for all energy users on the Island.

530

In November 2021 the Energy Group, in the development of Alderney's energy policy and strategy options, with approval and funding from the Policy and Finance Committee, tasked all capital development services to assess the potential hybrid mix of power supply and storage technologies which exist or are being developed and which could lead the Island's strategic energy objectives in the short, medium and long term and would meet the Island's objectives of: minimising the cost of energy; reducing or mitigating energy supply risks, and; minimising or eliminating the use of carbon emitting energy sources.

535

These reports have been received from Ore Catapult and presentations and discussions have been held with the Energy Group. The work done by Ore Catapult Development Services has met and exceeded the objectives agreed with the Energy Group and costs for the work are within budget.

540

The Energy Group in its presentations and discussions with the May Policy and Finance meeting provided the following preliminary conclusions. Short term: there are significant benefits to the use of land-based wind turbines; the indicated cost of energy produced by a wind turbine is projected to be approximately 50% or less of the current fuel cost component, which as I wrote this I put 20p against it, at the current time it is 24.6p, to give you some idea, and this is in terms of the bills we receive and based on the higher current oil prices, which at the current time are staying at a level which is high for the Island and any further increases will obviously impact on bills going forward.

545

550 The siting of wind turbines is to be investigated, its visual and environmental impact assessed and consultation with the community on this option is needed.

Although solar arrays will not have a large impact on overall costs, this is a relatively low investment cost and their use will contribute to reduction in household costs and our carbon footprint. This is an area which is being advanced by AEL. It is likely that some form of storage will
555 be required when introducing renewable energy supplies to the AEL grid.

Another area that is needed to be reviewed in terms of the short term is improving insulation, particularly for older houses, and that needs to be investigated.

In the medium term we will consider further expansions to solar arrays, we will consider increased storage and the other area that we are starting work on at the current time is the use
560 of solar-thermal panels for hot water and the use of ground or air-source heat pumps to replace or to complement central heating and the need for heating oil.

In the longer term there is a global push to develop hydrogen as the energy source of the future. Progress and development of hydrogen options will continue to be monitored and evaluated. However, the current cost of producing hydrogen and the very large size of any storage
565 may negate its use in the foreseeable future for Alderney. Tidal power costs are in excess of current fuel cost component costs even at the current price of fuels.

Discussion on the way forward, electricity tariffs: AEL have highlighted that the current setting of electricity tariffs as determined by the Concession Law, under which it operates, is no longer fit-for-purpose and new tariff charges which better reflect the costs of distribution are needed.

570 Revision to the Concession Law is also needed to better reflect AEL's role as a States' owned enterprise and not as a 'concessionaire'. AEL's concession falls due to be renewed in the next two years and various options need to be considered.

As regard to tidal power, the cost of tidal power by tidal turbines is estimated to be in the region of 25p to 30p for larger tidal turbine units. At the present time this level of energy cost
575 would increase the cost of energy for the Island. However, discussions are being held with potential tidal power developers to install appropriately sized units to supply power to the Island's grid. To encourage this, expressions of interest are planned to be issued to tidal power developers and it is expected that there will be some interest. It is key for the Island to display the potential of its tidal resource now and into the future.

580 The Energy Group will continue to monitor developments in tidal energy and in particular those projects in the Raz de Blanchard on the Normandy coast. Developments from the TIGER project should make tidal power a cost effective option for the Island's future energy mix and also open up the Island's potential energy resource.

Heating oil: the energy of a litre of heating oil is equivalent to approximately three times the energy produced by the use of diesel oil in generating electricity. This ratio highlights the difficulty
585 of moving to an all-electric Island based on current electricity costs.

The Island Grid: currently, the internal distribution grid in St Anne is not robust and is unable to distribute significant levels of electricity to reduce the use of heating oil as lower cost renewable energy is available.

590 AEL, as part of the next steps for the study, will be evaluating the internal distribution grid upgrade and the relative costs.

The role of the Energy Group going forward: there is sufficient knowledge to be able to develop the energy policy for the Island and enable the objectives of the Island Plan. The Energy Group will continue to work with AEL on the development of our Island strategy and AEL will operationalise
595 this strategy. ACRE needs to be operational to deal with potential renewable permits for both land and marine based projects.

As regard to carbon footprint, there is a normal report produced called 'Greenhouse gas emissions report' and from our side in order to monitor our greenhouse gases emissions the Island will be developing an annual report which follows global guidelines. The report will set the

600 baseline against which any renewable project can be evaluated, not only for its cost impacts but also its reduced emission levels.

I would like to take this opportunity to thank all members of the Energy Group: Alex Snowdon, Kevin Gentle, Les Stewart, Laurence Page, Matt Birmingham and James Lancaster for their input and support, it has been invaluable.

605 Thank you, Mr President.

The President: Thank you.

Would any Member like to offer a personal opinion on the Report or alternatively, and/or in addition ask any question? Mr Carter.

610

Mr Carter: Thank you, Mr Abel, for that Report, it is certainly food for thought.

I just want to ask how will we work with other islands particularly and learn from them? In that there are many islands that are a long way further down the renewable energy path than we are and how can we, rather than reinventing the wheel here, ensure that whatever we do do is going to be effective and, with our small resources, money spent wisely?

615

Thank you.

The President: Mr Abel.

620 **Mr Abel:** Thank you for that question, Mr Carter.

In terms of the work that Ore Catapult Development Services have done, they have done a very large literature review of all the various options and all of the various uses of renewables and the types of renewables across smaller islands and the globe and that has been taken into consideration as far as our assessment is at the moment. Those two reports, which are just needing a final tidy up, will be released to States Members shortly, I think there are about two hundred odd pages plus.

625

Thank you.

The President: Does anybody else ...? Mr Snowdon.

630

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, President.

Firstly, I would just like to say thank you to Mr Abel who has put a tremendous amount of time and late nights into all of this work for quite a number of months actually.

635

I think it is just important if we touch on, as Mr Abel has highlighted, in the short term the guidance from the professionals that have been giving us advice is that we do move to wind turbine on Island. And I think it is important to address that obviously there will be public consultation if that does take place or when that does take place and obviously environmental impacts because at the moment we have got – and Mr Carter will correct me if I am wrong – but I think it is in the Island Plan quite a lot how we want to move to a green Island. But to be able to move to a green Island we do need to take certain steps. I know there may be concerns with erecting a wind turbine on the Island but I think it is to give that reassurance that the States will very much, and AEL I am sure, be engaging with the community to make sure that it is acceptable that if we want to move to a green island in the short term this looks like the only way, with support from solar as well to achieve that.

640

645 So if we do not take these steps and we wait potentially for tidal energy, that is not going to happen in the short term, and I am not quite sure how long we wait with the amount of oil going up and other situations, unfortunately the cost of living crisis, that we do need to try and take these steps. However the community does need to understand the potential impacts of bringing that on the Island and we need to have that conversation to see if that is acceptable or if it is not acceptable. If it is not acceptable I still think there are probably other items that we can look at. I

650

do not know whether, floating wind, that it might just be too expensive to actually look at floating wind for that situation.

655 The Report is very good that Mr Abel has put together. I would also like to touch on ACRE which is in the report as well. I think it is important we try and ... I am not sure if 'get a grip of' ACRE is the right word, but we need to try and sort out how ACRE is moving forward because I think it was quite rightly set up but it seems a bit stagnant at the moment and I think we do need to look at how we address the move forward with ACRE.

660 And I think just touching on another subject matter ... I am not breaking anything confidential I do not think, but the Fab Link project has not come into any of the thinking here because we do not see that as powering the Island so that is why that is not in this Report, if there were any questions on that one.

665 But once again I would just like to thank Mr Abel for the tremendous amount of hard work he has put into that. And maybe if he could just clarify regarding the mention in the short term of a wind turbine that we will obviously look at a public consultation and input and importantly regarding the planning side of it, it will hopefully input into the Land Use Plan when that review does take place.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Abel.

670

Mr Abel: Thank you, Mr Snowdon for the ... With regard to the wind turbines, certainly when we first started off with our exercise to look at renewable options for the Island, we initially felt that the wind turbine would become quite an emotive issue for the Island, and again when we consider the benefits of a wind turbine and in actual fact when you look at some of the big arrays I suppose in the North Sea and even some of the ones that are land based, the multiplier in the UK is five times in terms of the energy benefit of a wind turbine. But again, we do not have one of those huge things, which I think is about 212 metres in diameter and stands nearly 300 metres high and I would probably get sort of swatted into the Atlantic with one of those! But we are looking at turbines which are a bit more fit-for-purpose. They are still relatively high, they will stand probably at 40 metres to the tip. The siting of those needs to be such that we can minimise the visual impact. To get rid of the visual impact is not easy with units like that and also a wind turbine does make noise, and again the siting is quite important with that.

685 But as Mr Snowdon has raised, also in terms of the Land Use Plan and the Building Development and Control Committee rules in terms of large projects, as this probably will be one of those, even though it will be more a cost-per-unit based, rather than capital based, it will have impacts and we will have to consider how it is now taken through the major projects process and engaging with the public on taking those forward and what sort of meetings, consultations and reviews are needed going forward. So it is quite a significant process that we have to follow. In actual fact today we have had somebody in terms of wind turbines here on the Island having a look and advising us and providing a lot more information than we previously understood, and that has been very helpful.

695 In terms of ACRE, yes, we do need to get it up and operational otherwise we cannot issue a permit for solar arrays which are land based, because that is also covered in the renewable energies. And also if we wish to encourage tidal developers to come into our seas, if I can use that, we also need it in place to issue permits for that. In terms of the tidal side we have also surprisingly had some interest shown by developers and I am hopeful that we can attract them by the expressions of interest process to come in and hopefully spend their money rather than our money delivering some options for us going forward.

700 With regard to Fab Link that gets debated time after time. As part of Catapult's work I, with a group, got them to look at whether the original concept that Fab Link put on the table was actually deliverable. And as I have said a couple of times in these States, the options that they put on the

705 table for Fab Link back in 2015, was it, are just not deliverable. You cannot plug into a high voltage DC cable without extensive inverter stations times two plus also a large AC yard to be able to pull out AC from DC. These are huge cables and lots of power. It could not have been delivered as we were led to believe in 2015. And again, I have now got some expert advice on that.

But thank you for your question, thank you, Mr President.

The President: Thank you. Anybody else? Ms Burgess.

710 **Ms Burgess:** Thank you, Mr President, fellow States Members.

Thank you very much to the working group on this. You can see the amount of work, we have certainly seen how often you meet and the length of debate on this. Obviously I would welcome all the things to do with renewables. I see this Island as a place to make good for the future.

715 However, I do have concerns and I just want assurances that very early on in the process the public will be brought in for discussion when we are looking at wind turbines as a solution going forward in the future, just because of the actual physicality of the size of the Island.

We are an island that has only so much land that will be of use, that will be in the correct position for something like the proposal and, unlike other areas where they put their turbines on land, there is a lot of consideration able to be given because of the size of the areas, let's say 720 agricultural or the side of a motorway, you quite often see them as you are driving along. Obviously Alderney just does not have that consideration. We do not have areas that are out of sight, out of mind or to the side or to the left, whatever.

725 So my concern, and I would just like reassurance, is that the public are very much going to be at the very *early* stages of that discussion. Whereas I am supportive, I do have concerns just because of our physicality and size.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Abel.

730 **Mr Abel:** If I may, Mr President, thank you.

Certainly that is a very good question and it obviously is a concern to Members as well as to the public. Part of the next steps, having completed this Report and tabled it at this States Meeting is for both the Energy Group and Alderney Electricity to have a drop-in session to talk through the various options.

735 We do need to look at some visuals, if you want to call it that, with regard to both the situation of wind turbines, because there probably would be more than one, and also with regard to solar arrays which may either be down at the Glacis as had been originally put into the Land Use Plan, as I understand it, as an option. But also it may be that with the wind turbine it may pay us in terms of the cost of the infrastructure to install it to also bring solar panels in and around those 740 units.

The units take up about 40 square metres we were told today because they basically will be stayed units because we do not want them to have huge poles, as you recall it that you can see around the countryside. Basically the reason for that is we actually cannot get a crane on the Island to lift those sort of things and put them into position, so some of the practicalities will come out 745 as we look.

750 But again, the predominant wind for us is actually in the south and south-southwest. I think about 85% of the wind comes from that area with the majority from the other areas really coming from the north and northeast. Our wind profile is very much like an arrow, a bit up in the northeast and a very large portion down in the southwest. So the obvious place for us to look is towards the southern and western part of the Island, above Corblets, adjacent to what we refer to as the pigs area or towards the Guns. And again, that is close to the RAMSAR site and we also have many other challenges to that. But that is probably a lesser impact.

755 However, this whole conversation needs to be taken to the public to get some support and to understand the limitations and then, moving forward, we would then have to go through the major projects process to get overall agreement on the Island.

But thank you for the question.

The President: Does anybody else wish to make a comment or ask a question? No.

**Primary Care –
Update**

760 **The President:** In that event, we will now turn, Mr Snowdon, to you. You have some questions for Mr Abel.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, sir.

Would the Chairman be able to provide any updates regarding Primary Care?

Thank you.

765

The President: Mr Abel.

Mr Abel: Thank you, Mr President, thank you, Mr Snowdon.

770 With regard to Primary Care, the Governments of Alderney and Guernsey are working together on Primary and Emergency Care and, as you would expect, this is a commercially sensitive issue at this time and I cannot really comment further.

However, I would like to thank all parties for their hard work and the co-operation that has been shown in moving this forward.

Thank you.

775

The President: I am assuming there are no further questions for Mr Abel on this? Then your second question please, Mr Snowdon.

**AEL subsidy support –
Move towards renewable energy**

780 **Mr Snowdon:** Please could the Chairman outline the situation around AEL subsidy support and the need for the Island to move towards renewable energy?

Thank you.

A Member: We have just been talking about that!

785 **The President:** A classic example of rhetoric (*Laughter*) perhaps.
Mr Abel.

Mr McKinley: Don't do it all again, please.

790 **A Member:** Maybe he is going to read all five pages again, Graham!

The President: Mr McKinley, please.

Mr Abel: Mr President, thank you, Mr Snowdon.

795 It is a little bit of a repeat so I am not going to cover all five pages of the report again, just to
be helpful. But I think it is worth a comment, just to remind people that in light of the increased
oil prices some months ago that it now stands, or it did at about five o'clock this morning, it stood
at \$112.20 for a barrel of oil this morning, which is the highest I have seen for quite a while.

800 In mind of that, the P&F Committee and AEL have had discussions with regard to containing
the costs of electricity. The recent press release from AEL and the States of Alderney provides
more detail on the outcome of those discussions but it is important to understand that the
subsidy, as you refer to it, is actually not a subsidy by the States of Alderney but more a reduction
in AEL profits for reinvestment needed for ongoing major maintenance and upgrading works.

805 It is important to understand that the reinvestment funds for ongoing major maintenance and
upgrading works cannot be contained indefinitely and it is speculated that in the coming months
oil suppliers will be increased to cover cutbacks in oil supplies from Russia and that the price of oil
will drop – very much speculation. But overall there is certainly a willingness for both AEL and
ourselves and the States to look at containing the cost of electricity which is more straightforward
than containing the cost of oil but overall we can only do that for a certain period of time before
we start to make our electricity company unviable going forward.

810 Thank you, Mr President.

The President: Supplementary Question? No. Thank you.
Does anybody else have a question?

**Encouraging the public to stand for public office –
Plans for the November elections**

815 **The President:** Then your final question please, Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you.

Do the States have any plans about how to encourage members of the public to stand for public
office in the forthcoming November elections?

Thank you.

820

The President: Mr Abel.

Mr Abel: Mr President, Mr Snowdon, thank you for the question.

825 It allows me to reflect on my neighbour if I can, Mr President. When I look back nearly two
years and consider my motives and those of my colleagues to stand for public office, it is based
on a commitment to do what we can to improve things for the Island and the community.

830 It is easy to criticise but hard to get things done. The majority of Members do not have
significant working in Government experience and the COVID situation over the last few years has
been a significant challenge, not only for Members but also for our hard working Civil Service. It
takes time to understand the needed processes and to gain traction to move things forward. In
addition, the need to resolve legacy issues is also something that I had not expected.

835 It is important the States consists of a broad membership from across the community and the
job does require significant time. The pay cannot be the incentive to join the States. It can be a
difficult task and subject to extensive criticism by self-professed experts and some from the past
who have left legacy issues behind and can now solve everything.

However, the Island continues to run. Our support and working relationship with Guernsey is good, and although connectivity is still not as we would like there is momentum for a sustainable future option to be in place.

840 You asked what are the States doing to encourage people to stand and also to vote. At the present time this is under discussions and options for drop-in sessions with briefings by both community chairs and the Civil Service are being planned. The start of open meetings for the Policy and Finance and General Services Committees from June, will also allow prospective States Members to understand some of the processes required and the nitty-gritty that these Committees need to consider. The Building and Development Control Committee is already an open meeting.

845 The current Members of the States are happy to discuss the role with all interested and committed people from the community and I would hope that some of those paper media experts and Facebook warriors will come forward to be considered as future States Members.

Thank you, Mr President.

850

Ms Burgess and another Member: Hear, hear.

The President: Mr Snowdon.

855

Mr Snowdon: Just thank you for the response.

The President: Does anybody else want to ask a question for Mr Abel? Mr Carter.

860 **Mr Carter:** Just perhaps what interaction we might have with Jersey in terms of their promotion of the way of encouraging people to stand? Whether that might be a way forward as well, to learn from another Island, and likewise our nearer neighbour, Guernsey, how they have encouraged people to stand. Would that be something you would consider?

865 **Mr Abel:** It is something certainly that we will consider. We have had a little bit of discussion on it but I would not like to say, Mr President and colleagues, that I am fully conversant with the options. I think maybe Mr Carter can add to that or another Member can add to that, but it is certainly something we will consider going forward.

Thank you.

870

The President: Mr Harris, you have a question.

Mr Harris: Thank you, sir, fellow Members, thank you to Mr Abel for his statement there, I agree with pretty much most of it.

875 But would Mr Abel agree that despite the foibles of standing for local government it is an honour and a privilege to serve your Island.

Thank you.

880 **Mr Abel:** Mr President, Mr Harris, certainly that is a very great consideration and I think it was echoed by Ms Burgess just now. I think it is something at the front of us all and I would agree, it is a privilege to stand here and represent the Island.

Thank you.

The President: Mr Gentle.

885

Mr Gentle: Mr President, colleagues.

In relation to Mr Snowdon's question about people standing for election, you mentioned about people voting. Is it possible for you to find out if an audit of the current electoral role is being undertaken?

Thank you.

890

The President: Mr Abel.

Mr Abel: Mr President, Mr Gentle, thank you for the question.

895

At the current time that is very much in the agenda for the Civil Service to take forward in terms of reviewing the current electoral roll and bringing it up to date, and that certainly is needed before the elections later on in this particular year and it is an item that has been discussed.

Thank you.

Guernsey States of Deliberation – Update from the Alderney Representatives

The President: In the absence of any further questions, we now have a question from Mr Gentle that he will no doubt amend slightly.

900

Mr Gentle: Mr President, sir, colleagues.

Could the remaining Alderney Representative briefly summarise any matters of importance to Alderney that may have been debated recently in the Guernsey States of Deliberation and any Guernsey matters that may concern Alderney.

905

Thank you.

The President: Mr Snowdon.

Mr Snowdon: Thank you, Mr President and thank you, Mr Gentle, for asking the question.

910

I think it is probably important to start with the Aurigny situation over the Easter weekend break. We submitted a question to the States of Deliberation obviously about the Dornier service, which was not running at all and the responses I think were encouraging but also there needs to be further work improving that model of service. So the answer is basically they have agreed to review the service, Aurigny, and look at the shortcomings in the service, that will be reported back to STSB, Deputy Peter Roffey is in charge of that one.

915

Also, we pushed for States of Alderney engagement with that one, which I think has been agreed and also the outcomes when that review is put into the public domain hopefully that we can see – well, we probably know what went wrong – but see how it does not happen again, is I think the gist of the debate that we had down there with the questions and answer session.

920

But I think it does highlight another question because quite a few Deputies – I think as you know because I sent you the recording of the meeting – raised concerns about what is the new model and what are we moving towards. And I think it highlighted the importance of moving towards the longer runway and getting more information out about the longer runway as potentially the option we move towards. Because, as we know, we get hopefully 20,000 extra seats, fingers crossed, to sort out the medevac situation but also I think we need to highlight that the current situation is we have got a two-plane model service, which I would consider broken, costing a £2 million PSO subsidy, which is a tremendous amount of money for a service that really is not good enough, unfortunately. So I think it is essential that we do – and I think the Members in charge of STSB, and hopefully this will go to Policy & Resources and get the endorsement regarding the runway to date – that we do move to this new model.

925

930

935 However, as we go back to the debate we have just had on different issues, we need to make sure there is public engagement and public understanding of this situation. I am going to be quite frank now, to be honest, because I think we are in a really tricky situation if that does not happen. I think if we move to a private operator that may run and then disappear we could be in a situation where Aurigny pull out and we have basically no air services.

940 There are tremendous pressures in Guernsey, as we have seen with the tax debate, on the financial funding subsidy across the board. But for the funding for Aurigny they have got an understanding as a Resolution from the States of Deliberation to try and break even with the service for the whole of the Bailiwick. This has not been achieved but the new Aurigny strategy and management has tried to put a plan of action in place for this to be achieved. Obviously there will be further costs with the runway extension but I am not quite convinced that the cost that we are hearing from, whether it be social media or interested parties in Guernsey, is quite the right cost. So I think we need to wait for the tendering process to come back and hopefully it will be shared with the States of Alderney and also the community in how we move forward and that debate can take place.

945 But I think it is absolutely essential that we understand the amount of money that is being put into this service and if Aurigny pull out and the States of Guernsey is not offering that support, I worry and I worry quite a lot that it will maybe look to the States of Alderney to provide subsidy support and to be quite frank we cannot afford it.

950 So they are, I think, the main answers regarding the outcome, hopefully. Mr Abel, I am sure, will follow up with Deputy Peter Roffey about how that review is getting on and how we are going to input into that review and take things forward regarding that subject matter.

955 Also, as we know, the GST Tax debate is coming to the last quarter, Quarter 4, we understand to the States of Guernsey. I think we have all been very vocal about the need for ... Well, actually in part the support that we have not got for GST as we are concerned about the impacts on food costs and also the energy costs for our Island. I know we have done it in a States of Guernsey debate, we have also done that in nearly every single meeting that we have had with Policy & Resources representation that we are very concerned about that impact on to the Island.

960 I think they are listening, but I am not quite sure we have resolved how to move forward with this one. However, I think it is important that they try and look at other taxations and we have tried to highlight that and I understand that they are looking at a corporation tax review that will hopefully be with that tax debate when it does get presented to the States of Deliberation. It will be presented hopefully to the Chamber and maybe the recommendations from Policy & Resources may change, maybe they will not. But I think it is important we keep engaging on that one.

965 Just to touch on another point which is sort of connected to your question. It was encouraging to see Policy & Resources coming to talk to us yesterday. I think it was a beneficial meeting, productive talks, and I think it is clear that both Governments want to work together, which I think is good. And I think we are still hopefully, the Bailiwick, after staycations, still well connected. Obviously we have different challenges and different goals but I think that is important that we both listen to the other sides.

970 So that is a brief of the situation. I have gone a little bit off because your question allowed me to (*Laughter*) but hopefully that answers and I am happy to answer any other questions you may have.

975 Thank you.

The President: Do you have a question, Mr Gentle?

Mr Gentle: I do, sir, thank you.

980 Thank you very much, Mr Snowdon, for keeping us entertained. You mentioned that it is thought that the current two-plane model is possibly broken, and I think I have asked this question

previously, but are you able to tell me/us when the States of Deliberation might actually be having this in front of them to debate? The runway, sorry to debate? I think that came out in English!

The President: I think Mr Snowdon understood.

985

Mr Snowdon: Yes, I think we are actually in a very vulnerable situation. I have highlighted the two-plane model is broken and the fear is that we go down to no planes again in the future. We have got the summer season coming up and it simply is not good enough.

990

So it is important we engage with Aurigny to understand their back-up plans and I think they are willing to come and talk to us and get round the table and actually understand what happens.

I think that unfortunately the last situation was tricky because their back-up plans could not be implemented for various reasons. But, fingers crossed, those back-up plans could be put in place if needed, touch wood it does not. But we only have two planes at the end of the day.

995

So going back to your question, my understanding is that STSB has made a recommendation for option C to be taken forward. They have made that recommendation for it to go out to tender, which should be hopefully happening now if not already, and I understand that it will be going to the Policy & Resources Committee in Guernsey because it needs their endorsement, if they are going to endorse it, and I hope they will. I am sure they will look at the business case and make sure their numbers add up. If they are going to endorse it we would expect a Policy Letter, fingers crossed, going to the States of Deliberation in September or October this year.

1000

Thank you.

The President: Any further questions? Mr Carter.

1005

Mr Carter: Two questions: the Education Committee presented their report to the States of Deliberation in Guernsey and they mentioned there the development of the Education Law. Could Mr Snowdon tell us how he thinks Alderney will be involved in that?

And secondly, there was a vote taken on the COVID response review and again, how will Alderney be involved in that?

1010

Thank you, sir.

Mr Snowdon: Regarding education, I think it is important that ... I think the President for Education did actually very well with the question and answer session and I think it is actually important that we engage. I know we have got our elected person with Mr Jenkins and I am sure that we can try and get the Education Committee over to see how we can engage further and also consultation through our P&F Committee with the Education Committee, so I think that is absolutely essential.

1015

I am sorry to ask you, but what was your second question?

1020

Mr Carter: The COVID response review, there was a vote taken at the end as to what format that should take and should work and in it they mention consultation with Alderney. Can you explain what or do you know how that might take place? Because our risk profile is very different to Guernsey's.

1025

Mr Snowdon: Yes, so I think the person who has got the most engagement with this, and has actually done a sterling job, is Mr Abel during the COVID response. The CCA stepped up to the plate, performed highly with that but the problem being that we did not really have the insight of what the CCA was doing with that time. So I think moving forward the States of Alderney, through Policy and Finance, needs to carry on communicating with the way forward with all of this but I think it is essential that also ... The CCA worked, the problem being I am not quite sure if the scrutiny was there but the question being in an emergency do you have time for scrutiny? So I

1030

1035 think in answer to your question, in short, Policy & Finance will have to further engage with this
and I believe we already have engaged with this, but engage with this further. But also thank you
to all the people on the CCA who took us through that very challenging time and again, to Mr Abel,
for the time and dedication he put in on our behalf.

Thank you.

The President: Any further questions?

1040 That being the case, I think that concludes the business for this afternoon so, Mr Greffier, if
you would please, would you close the meeting.

PRAYERS

The Greffier

The Assembly adjourned at 4.12 p.m.